











~~H~~  
~~K~~ THE  
*CALCUTTA REVIEW.*

VOLUME LXII.

1876. *No 424*  
*15.*

EDITED BY E. LETHBRIDGE, M.A.

*No man who hath tasted learning but will confess the many ways of profiting by those who, not contented with stale receipts, are able to manage and set forth new positions to the world: and, were they but as the dust and ashes of our feet, so long as in that notion they may yet serve to polish and brighten the armoury of truth, even for that respect they were not utterly to be cast away.—MILTON.*

CALCUTTA :

THOMAS S. SMITH, CITY PRESS, 12, BENTINCK STREET.

BOMBAY. MESSRS. THACKER, VINING & CO.

MADRAS: MESSRS. HIGGINBOTHAM & CO.

LONDON. MESSRS. TRUBNER & CO., 8 AND 60, PATERNOSTER ROW.

052

261

4-1

A

Corporate Collection Public Library

to 7893 Date 5 8 75.

# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

---

N o. C X X I V.

---

## CONTENTS.

	AGE.
ART. I.—THE FISHERIES OF SOUTHERN INDIA	239
„ II.—THE STRUGGLE FOR EXISTENCE OF THE ENGLISH PRESS IN INDIA.	
1.—Life of Lord Metcalfe. By Sir J. W. Kaye.	
2.—Thornton's History of the British Empire.	
3.—Memoirs of a Journalist. By J. H. Stoequeler	
4.—The (Calcutta) Statesman, 1877.	
5.—"Men whom India has known." By J. J. Higginbotham.	
6.—Life of John Thomas. By the Rev. C. B. Lewis.	
7.—The Indian Year Book. By Dr. Murdoch.	
8.—The Calcutta Review, June, 1864	276
„ III.—INDIAN NOTES. ... ... ...	275
„ IV.—PILGRIM MEMORIES.—( <i>Independent Section</i> ) Pilgrim Memories. By J. S. Stuart Glennie	27
„ V.—TRANSPORTATION FOR LIFE	295
„ VI.—THE LOGICAL DOCTRINE OF THE PROPOSITION	307
„ VII.—ORIENTAL SCHOLARS	324
„ VIII.—PATTANI ( <i>Putnee</i> ) TENURES	330
„ IX.—CENTRAL INDIA IN 1857 ...	365
„ X.—AMONG THE CONTINENTAL JAILS ...	390
„ XI.—LORD MAYO, FOURTH VICEROY OF INDIA. A Life of the Earl of Mayo, Fourth Viceroy of India. By W. W. Hunter, B.A., LL.D., of Her Majesty's Bengal Civil Service, London : Smith, Elder and Co., 1875 ... ... ...	411
„ XII.—THE BLACK PAMPHLET ... ... ...	411

## CRITICAL NOTICES :—

## 1.—VERNACULAR LITERATURE :—

Pánini.—By Rajanikanta Gupta. Calcutta: G. C. Ráy and Company. Samvat, 1933	...	...	...	ix
Karnárjuná.—By Baladev Pait	...	...	...	ib.
Sambandha Nirnaya. By Lalmohan Vidyánidhi. Calcutta: New School-book Press	...	...	...	ib.
Anubikshana. Edited by Haris Chandra Sarmi	...	...	...	x
Gymnastics. Pts. I and II. By Haris Chandra Sarma.	...	...	...	ib.

## 2.—GENERAL LITERATURE :—

Seringapatam Past and Present. A Monograph. By Colonel G. B. Malleson, C.S.I., Author of The History of the French in India. Madras: Higginbotham & Co., 1876.	...	...	...	...
Milton's Paradise Lost. With Notes for Indian Students. By John Bradshaw, M.A., Senior Moderator in History, Literature, and Law, Trinity College, Dublin. Madras: Addison & Co., 1876	...	...	...	xi
Essays on the External Policy of India. By the late J. W. S. Wyllie, M.A., C.S.I., H. M's India Civil Service: some time Acting Foreign Secretary to the Government of India. Edited, with a Brief Life, by W. W. Hunter, B.A., LL.D., H. M's India Civil Service. London: Smith, Elder & Co., 1875.	...	...	...	xii

---

THE  
CALCUTTA REVIEW.

---

NO. CXXIV.

---

ART. I.—THE FISHERIES OF SOUTHERN INDIA.

BY THE LATE J. A. BOYLE, MADRAS CIVIL SERVICE.

THE name that the first European settlers gave to the South-Eastern shore of India—‘ La Pêcherie ’—the Fishery, marks very clearly what they found to be the distinctive occupation of the coast-dwellers. The shallow, tepid sea of Manaar teems with fish of every form; while as soon as the coral reefs are passed, the deep waters outside are the home of the finest of tropical fishes, the seer, which, at its full size of forty pound’s weight, rivals in quality and daintiness of flesh the most highly-prized fish of colder seas.

There are indeed very few species of fish that are of any real value, for the seer and the pomphret and the mullet make up the list of edible fishes in the Englishman’s sense; though a local villager will eat anything from a skate to a hammer-headed shark.

There is an air of desolation and barrenness about these tropical seas that can hardly fail to strike those who sail them. Scarcely a gull or kittiwake breaks the silence of the sea or the burning expanse of sky. Now and again a porpoise—*wongei* or Roller, as the Tamilians call him—heaves his great barrel-form above a wave, and rolls on again into deep water: or a shark’s fin shows his dreaded presence, as he makes the lesser fishes flee before him. Miniature sword-fish dart hither and thither through the blue waters as it seems with no more resistance than an arrow through the air.

But above, the signs of life are rare; and one misses sorely the merry swallows and the chattering gulls to flit above the ship and dash into the water, and to remind us of life above the dead and barren sea.

Rich treasures, however, lie buried five fathoms deep; for there the sea has its pearls, and there it hides those chank or conch shells, which carry good fortune as a gift of the gods, and are some

times worth their weight in gold. Thus, the fishermen of this coast have been tempted more than others to learn how to win its treasures from the sea. And ages of toil have given them supreme skill in the search, whether for living or dead prizes, for fish or shells.

They are, therefore, born fishermen from the time when they crawl out of their mother's arms to paddle in the last ripples of the surf, to the day when their poor breath has all been spent in toiling in and beneath the sea, and they no longer have strength to dive or haul the net, but can only sit at home and weave nets for their sons to cast.

No spoil is too little for them, as no toil is too great. You will see a whole village empty itself of men and boys, who will each arm himself with a funnel-shaped basket, and, carrying a smaller crate round his waist, will proceed to pounce down on any unwary fish that he sees in the shallow water.

This is the simplest, but the most exciting form of fishery. The fishers spread in a long thin line right across a shallow river's mouth, when the tide is low, and walk slowly up-stream, keeping their baskets above their heads ready to strike.

Then as each man sees a tiny fish darting in fright through the shallow water, he skilfully follows the ripple of its course and dashes the hollow basket down upon it as it swims.

To catch sight of the prey, to strike down upon it, and with the free hand to draw it up through the funnel open at the top, and drop it into the basket at his girdle, are actions that succeed one another almost before the untrained eye can trace the darting fish. The hits and the misses, the rivalry and excitement of the sport, breed a constant flow of fun and laughter, which gives to this kind of fishery a popularity that its tiny prizes could hardly secure for it on other terms.

At other times the big net of the village is taken out and laid down by two boats about half a mile from shore. This must be where the ground is smooth and shelving, and free from rocks or coral reefs. Starting from the centre of the arc furthest from land, each boat lays the net round the semicircle, and at last lands the end ropes upon the beach.

Then the fun commences ; men and boys, singing as they work, slowly drag the great net to shore, twisting and coiling it as it comes, so that it will be taut and ready for use again to-morrow. The strain is great and the hauling heavy ; and they are all eager for the end, when the belly of the net comes up and shows its various treasures, struggling against their fate, and battling to regain the deep waters from which they have been drawn so stealthily.

These fisher people have many wiles by which to compass their game. One would think that the poor fish were the wisest and

wariest of creatures instead of the most foolish, by the number of stratagems that man takes to ensnare them. Their love of light costs them their liberty, when on dark nights they follow the torches in the fishers' boats and, leaping madly at the blaze, fall helpless into the enemies hands. They fall, too, by their terror, when a long line of boats advances with a clattering of planks and beating of boards, which the fish tremble to hear above and around them, and, rushing forwards to escape, are caught by the opposing nets held by another line of their fisher-foes. If they lie in the wash of the waves in shore, the cast line of the wading angler takes them. If they keep in the deep water they are caught by the far-encircling net, which they only discern when it is too late, and the choice lies between a death by stranding in the shallows and by strangling in the meshes. The best and most successful fisher of these seas is, however, not the native of this coast, but the visitor from the island of Ceylon. Hardly a happy experiment in the science of boat-building distinguished the early efforts of the Singhali savage. He found the right shape for a fast-sailing canoe to be that of the rudely-hollowed palmyra-tree: but to make it ride more safely under a wide sail, he threw out from one side an out-rigger of a simple beam, bound to the boat by slightly convex ribs about fifteen feet long. Thus securely balanced his slim canoe walks the water like a very thing of life, and under a fair breeze scuds so fast, that no fish, even the oldest and most prudent, can resist the bright bait that trails behind and flashes through the water without a warning sound. This the big Seer-fish sees and covets; to covet is to follow, and to follow is to die; and so the richest prizes of the sea fall, to the simplest of all fishers in the rudest of all craft.

If any one can afford to laugh at civilisation, its complex machinery, and its manifold wants, that man is the fisherman of La Pêcherie. The sea is his home; and the barren sands that the sea throws up yield to him without an effort all that he wants to support his life. The palmyra tree and the cocoa-palm alternate in fringing the shore. Either would enable him to live, the two together give him luxury. They will feed him with their fruit and juices, clothe him with their pliant and warm fibres, house him with their boughs and leaves, float him across the sea on his "Kattamaram" or bound tree; and he will drag fish from the deep with net or line, woven from the same fibre. There is something almost ludicrous in the simplicity with which these coastmen live. They never suffer from famine; for the sea food never fails for long, and the small store of salt fish that the commonest prudence bids them keep, suffices to protect them from rare intervals of adverse winds and ill success at sea. They are therefore, quiet, contented folk, anxious for nothing so much as to be let

alone, which, owing to the unattractiveness and inaccessibility of their homes is a wish generally gratified.

The most remarkable feature about them is perhaps their religion. Christians and Roman Catholics they are, almost to a man; and the vitality of their faith, though now opposed to little trial, has been in the past proved by the seductions, if not the persecutions, of the Lutheran Governors of the Dutch settlements of Tuticorin, and the other ports on the mainland and Ceylon.

It is recorded that when the Paravas and other fishing tribes of the coast were urged by the Dutch Missionaries to desert the old for the Reformed Ritual; their answer was so practical as to be more baffling than a thousand puzzles of casuistry. They asked for positive demonstration that the new Creed was more powerful than the old. 'Begin' they said, to their would be converters, 'by raising a dozen or so of dead men to life. St. Francis Xavier revived five or six dead men on this coast. Do you cure all our sick, and make these seas more rich in fish than they now are, *et nous verrons*. From such a test the worthy Lutherans recoiled and the result is that the fishermen are still members either of the Goanese or Jesuit Catholic Church.

Perhaps the most note-worthy sign of their creed is the strictness with which they renounce all work on the Sabbath. And thus, by the teaching of Portuguese Missionaries, a Semitic festival has been engrafted on Dravidian Custom !

The interest, however, and importance which attach to the ordinary fisheries of this coast are small compared to those of the two special fisheries, first of chank shells and second of Pearl oysters.

No better account could be given of these industries than that of Father Martin, the resident Jesuit of the Ranniad Mission, 170 years ago. The Dutch, he says, who were then in occupation of Tuticorin and the neighbouring ports, derived handsome profit from the two fisheries of pearls and chanks.

'Le Xauxus sout de gros coquillages semblables a ceux qui on a coutume de peindre aux mains des Tritons.'

These are, we presume, the 'wreathed horns' that Wordsworth desired to hear the 'old Triton' a-blowing; but it is a dismal sound enough, as it echoes from the dim chambers of some pagoda about night-fall.

Apart from their classic connection with Tritons, the chanks have a Hindu legend of their own, which tells how when Sagara was fleeing from Indra, he hid himself in a chank shell beneath the sea; and ever since men have been searching for it; and when a shell is found that curves on the reverse line from left to right, the happy possessor has a treasure indeed, for this may be perchance the very shell that sheltered the Deity.

The chanks are found along a small stretch of coast from Trichendur to Pamben, but the main points from which the fishery is worked are Kilakarei in the Rannad territory, and Tuticorin on the South in Tinnevelly. They lie scattered here and there along the bottom in from two to five fathoms of water, so that the divers have to plunge from their boats and grope over the bottom till their hands have gathered as many shells as they can bring to the surface. To hold the shells they carry a bag tied round their neck and cases have been known in which the diver in his eagerness has filled his bag so full, that he could not rise to the surface and has thus fallen a victim to his skill and courage.

Twenty chanks are a very good haul for one plunge; and it may be thence presumed that the shells are not quite so colossal in size as the pictures of Classical Tritons with "wreathed horns" would lead us to expect. In fact a chank is a small voluted shell about six inches long, and with a diameter ranging from two to four inches. The fish is of course alive in the shell when gathered, and the death and decomposition of the fish, which have to take place before the shell is fit for the market, render a chank store-room any thing but a pleasant spot.

Father Martin's description of the fishery in 1700, shows that the management has not changed at all down to the present day. It is now, as it was then, a strict monopoly, in Rannad of the Zemindar, and in Tinnevelly of the Government. Yearly leases of the fishery are the commonest method of management; and the rents paid along the whole line now amount to £1,500, of which the Tinnevelly fishery yields £1,000. The strictness of the monopoly under the Dutch is expressively indicated by Father Martin, who says that it would have cost a native his life to sell a chank shell without permission. The market was then, as it is now, Bengal and Upper India, but it has to be treated very carefully, and soon resents a too liberal supply of shells by a fall of price that renders the fishery unremunerative.

The maintenance of a Government monopoly over such a mere trifle as a fishery of £1,000 a year, is not very creditable to the liberality of the Indian Government. To the poor fishermen and divers the removal of the monopoly would be a signal boon. They cannot of course afford to lie out of their money for months or even for years while the distant market slowly absorbs the precious shells. And the result to them of the monopoly is that they are bound hand and foot to the merchants, who buy up the chanks and put them into the market gradually as the demand arises.

The fishing season lasts from October to March, after which date the breezes and currents from the S. W. stir up the sand and

make diving impossible. The diver therefore has six months' work followed by six months' idleness ; during which interval he cannot keep himself from his previous earnings, because he may not store shells, and he is too drunken and improvident to store money.

He is therefore content to be fed by the merchant all the year round ; and becomes, in consideration of constant rice and unfailing arrack, a very bond slave to his master. The master may be a kind master, sometimes he is a harsh and exacting one, but to either master the diver is a slave ; and slavery means debasement, and loss of all motive to industry and improvement. The monopoly removed, slavery would cease. The diver with his boat would soon become, if he was not at once, master of the situation. If he struck for higher pay, none could tempt the shells from the deep instead of him. He could and would doubtless store during the off season such shells as would bring him food ; and he might gradually grow into the petty trader, and free himself from the bonds that now keep him down. The fishermen are almost all of one brotherhood, all Paravas by caste ; and the power of combination that caste organisation supplies, would be powerful to contend against the capitalists with whom Government now deals. Whether the results would be purely good or not, matters little. The fact remains that the Madras Government (all unknowingly it is true, but none the less undoubtedly) for a poor monopoly of £1,000 a year, condemns a large class of fishermen to slavery and helplessness and poverty. A small price this to pay for the emancipation of a man. How much more should it ungrudgingly be given, when it will buy the freedom and prosperity of a whole trade. Of the monopoly in Ramnad it is useless to speak. In that favored land the only free thing for the use of which the people pay nothing is the air of heaven ; and that would doubtless be taxed, if it could be dammed up and sluiced out like tank-water. There is a rent on land, and a rent on water ; a rent for grass, and a rent for trees. A man cannot light a fire without paying rent for the firewood ; nor build a house without paying successive fees for the bricks and the mortar and the stone, and the thatch. If he steals away to a desert island off the coast, and fills his boat with firewood, the zemindari agent sees him and extorts a fee. If he digs up coral from the distant reefs and brings it ashore to build a poor wall, the fee-hunter overtakes him and doubles the cost. It is therefore natural that the sacred shells should pay their rent, for a few thousand rupees are a rich prize to a landlord, who is careful to extort annas. But that a liberal Government should follow the fisherman to sea, and seize its dues from the struggling diver, is an error of policy, no less than a neglect of common humanity ; which would probably be rectified, if only it were understood.

Another of the strange things that this sea yields, is the sea slug or "attei," a dreadful looking creature like a flattened sausage, but tough and mottled and generally repulsive. These Vampire slugs are about 9-12 inches long and 3 or 4 broad; and are gathered from the same ground as that on which the chanks lie. They are exported, after being dried, through Ceylon to China, where with birds' nests and puppies and similar delicacies they are greatly relished by Chinese epicures.

As the Chank bears a generally bad character as a depredator, and is numbered among the most active enemies of the Pearl Oyster, it may well be that it shares with the omnivorous Chinaman the pleasure of eating sea slugs.

And if an additional reason were wanted for the removal of the restrictions now placed upon the chank fishery, it is supplied by this object of protecting the far more valuable oysters. The ordinary objection to such a course lies in the alleged danger to the oysters themselves of indiscriminate fishing and diving. But under efficient supervision there need be nothing indiscriminate in the prosecution of this industry. Obviously it would be as easy as it would be wise to prohibit diving over banks on which were oysters approaching maturity; and on other banks the divers, who are themselves most keenly interested in the success of the Pearl Fishery, would have no temptation whatever to touch anything but the chanks and attei. Apart from the evil of the present monopoly in pauperising the fishermen of the coast, and making them the dependants of moneyed strangers; the chanks, if they are vermin of the sea, are now nourished and fostered in the game-preserve by the monopoly of their fishery. From two points only of the whole coast, Kilakarei and Tuticorin, is this fishery now worked, simply because there live the renters, and there only are the shells stored; while as the divers can only work at a short distance from their homes, it is only in the immediate neighbourhood of these ports that the chanks are systematically gathered. Thus along all the intervening banks for about fifty miles of sea these poachers and pearl destroyers are allowed to multiply and work their wicked will undisturbed. If the fishermen worked (as we should wish to see them work) with a yearly boat license of fifty rupees the fishing villages along the coast would share in the industry, and would act as the game-keepers of all the oyster banks on the coast. To suppose that they would be constantly damaging and plundering the Pearl oyster beds, is to suppose first, that the supervision of the fishery has lost all its keenness; and secondly, that the fishermen would not be the first to recognize and to pursue their own best interest in a flourishing oyster-preserve. Both of which suppositions are as improbable as they are gratuitous. Thus the relinquishment of this miserable monopoly

would not only be no loss, but a very real gain. It is probable that the boat licenses by increasing the prosperity of the fishermen and thus gradually enabling them to put more boats into the trade would not for long, if it did at first, result in a loss of Revenue to Government ; as the licenses themselves would bring almost as much to hand as the present sales by auction and if there were only a slight and perhaps no loss of Revenue there would be indirect gain, from two sources, of the best and most permanent kind.

First to the fishermen, in the freedom of their industry ; second to the Pearl Fishery in the clearing of the banks of the poaching chank.

The one will help to raise the divers of La Pêcherie from an indigent, indolent and drunken crew, dependent on the promises of capitalists and without a motive to frugality and thirst, into independent boat owners, with money in their hands, a store of shells on shore, and good boats at sea.

The other will (if naturalists do not malign the chank) prevent that wicked mollusc from doing as much harm as he now does to the poor oysters that are as tender and helpless as they are valuable. These are arguments for the abolition of the chank monopoly which seem to us of some weight. What arguments there may be per contra we have tried, but have still to learn.

Of the Pearl Fishery of Southern India the literature is considerable, and its chronicles begin with the first records of Indian travel.

Nor has the subject lacked hitherto its 'vates sacer' ; for Mr. Clements Markham has not only collected much of the history of the subject ; but has also by his personal activity and interest in their prosperity proved himself the good genius of the poor oysters.

If those molluscs have hitherto shown themselves incapable of gratitude towards their patron, and declining to secrete pearls for the public, have too often and too long succeeded in secreting themselves and their interesting family altogether : the prize is still worth trying for ; and there is nothing to show that success is unattainable.

So ancient is this Pearl Fishery that the author of the "Periplus Maris Erythraei" speaks of it as an established industry, worked in his time by galley-slaves, who were stationed at Kolkhi, then an appanage of the Pandian Kingdom of Madura, and probably the residence of a prince of that house. Certain errors of topography and description have gathered round Mr. Clements Markham's account of this early fishery, which may as well be corrected.

They are contained in this paragraph : "The head quarters of the fishery were then, and indeed, from the days of

"Ptolemy to the 17th century continued to be, at Choyl or Kayal "or Sael (as Barbosa has it) literally the 'temple'. This place is "according to Dr. Vincent, the Kora of Ptolemy, the Kholki of "the author of the Periplus, the Coil or Choyl of the travellers "of the middle ages, and the Ramana Koil (Temple of Rama) "of the natives. This would place it on the sacred promontory "of Ramanad, or the Island of Rameswaram. But it is more "probable that the true locality which was the head quarters of "the Pearl Fishery from time immemorial is to be found at "or near the modern salt station of Coilnopalam, on the coast "between Trichendur and Tuticorin." By a confusion of names and places, several different towns, separated by many miles of coast, are here identified as one and the same.

Ramana kovil, or the temple of Rama, stands on the Island of Rameswaram, which lies not less than one hundred miles to the north of Kolkhi the old fishing station of the Periplus and Ptolemy.

Both these places, however, are different from 'koil, or choyl' more accurately identified as 'kayal', 'the backwater', which lies in front of and around the site of old Korkhi. The similarity between the Tamil words 'kôvil', a church or temple, and 'kayal' an estuary or backwater, renders this confusion natural; but the identification of the old sites is interesting, especially to one who knows the features of the coast; as he can thereby realise a picture of the old world that lies 17 centuries behind him. Then, as now, the Pearl banks dotted the coast from the sandy island of Rameswaram southwards to the mouth of the Tambraparni river. But the fishing centres were probably fixed both at the northern and southern extremities, at Rameswaram, and at Korkhi.

Physically the coast has changed somewhat since those distant days. The 'kayal' or backwater which then washed the banks of old Korkhi, and received just below the town the wide and winding mouths of the river, now lies, a dry and barren swamp, above the reach of the sea, and only flooded twice a year by the river's freshes.

Korkhi (kolchoi), the modern 'Korkei,' now stands well inland, and can scarcely hear the echo of the distant surf. The sailors of the Periplus steered their small craft over the bar of the Tambraparni, and anchored off the town of Kolchoi; where the slaves were kept, who fished the pearls for the Pandian King. The bank on which they gathered "these treasures of an oyster" still carries a precious nursery; but of the palace of the prince or of the prisons of the felon-divers not a crumbling ruin remains.

As for the 'Sael' of Barbosa, it can hardly by any freak of mispronunciation have been got out of Kayal or kovil. But most pro-

bably the old Portugal trader refers to a Ceylon fishery, for he writes in 1500 that "near the island of Coulam there was a pearl bank, which was fished by people from a city called Saël, belonging to the King Coulam." If 'Sael' baffles conjecture, 'Coulam' must surely be 'Colombo'; which is still the name popularly used in Southern India to designate the whole island of Ceylon.

So the chronicle is carried on from century to century; Greeks and Venetians, Portuguese and Dutch, succeed one another in an unceasing stream of treasure-seeking traders. The fabled wealth of India, a fable which still clings to the country like a Nessus-shirt, in spite of chronic famine and general poverty, never ceased to attract the jewel-hunters of Europe, who found what they sought along the shores of "La Pêcherie."

Mr. Markham has gathered from the narratives of these old travellers a considerable store of information; but as it is rather of the Pearl Fishery as it is, than as it has been, that we wish to speak, it will be enough to note the account given by one, whose careful description, Mr. Markham has not noticed.

Cæsar Fredericke was a Portuguese jeweller, who wandered from Bussora to Kurrachee, and thence to Goa, and so to Vijayanagar, the capital of the then dominant dynasty of Hindu Rayar. Courage was not wanting to him, nor cunning both to bear and to forbear. After a brisk trade in gems at Vijayanagar, the mart of diamonds and rubies, the bold merchant started for the coast, and was on the road stripped and robbed of every thing he possessed, and even wore and carried, except his simple bamboo walking stick. Yet was he no beggar, though naked; for the stick contained the whole of his jewel store and so he made his way to the coast again, where his magic wand made him wealthy. From Goa he passed southwards, and came round to the eastern coast to trade in pearls, and thus he describes "the fishing for pearls."

"The sea that lieth between the coast which descendeth from Cao Comori to the low land of Chilas, and the island Zeilan, they call the fishing of pearls; which fishing they make every year beginning in March or April, and it lasteth fifty days; but they do not fish every year in one place, but one year in one place and another year in another place of the same sea. When the time of this fishing draweth near then they send very good divers, that go to discover where the greatest heaps of oysters be, under water, and right against that place where greatest store of oysters be, there they make or plant a village with houses and a bazar, all of stone.

"The fishermen are all Christians of the country, and pay a certain duty to the King of Portugal, unto the Churches of the Friars of St. Paul, which are on that coast. All the while that they are fishing there are three or four Fustes armed, to defend

the fishermen from robbers. It was my chance to be there one time, in my passage, and I saw the order that they used in fishing which is this. There are three or four barks that make consort together which are like to our little pilot boats, and a little less ; there go 7 or 8 men in a boat ; and I have seen in a morning a great number of them go out and anchor in 15 or 18 fathom of water, which is the ordinary depth of all that coast. When they are at anchor, they cast a rope into the sea, and at the end of the rope they make fast a great stone, and then there is ready a man that hath his nose and his ears well stopped, and anointed with oil, and a basket about his neck or under his left arm ; then he goeth down by the rope to the bottom of the sea, and as fast as he can, he filleth the basket, and when it is full he shaketh the rope, and his fellows that are in the bark haul him up with the basket ; and in such wise they go one by one, until they have laden their bark with oysters, and at evening they come to the village, and then every company maketh their mountains or heaps of oysters, one distant from another, in such wise that you shall see a great long row of mountains or heaps of oysters, and they are not touched until such time as the fishing be ended ; and at the end of fishing every company sitteth round about their mountain or heap of oysters and fall to opening of them, which they may easily do, because they be dead, dry, and brittle. And if every oyster had pearls in them it would be a very good purchase, but there are very many that have no pearls in them. When the fishing is ended, then they see whether it be a good gathering or a bad. There are certain experts in the pearls whom they call Clitiny, which set and make the price of pearls according to their carats, beauty and goodness, making four sorts of them. The first sort be the round pearls, and they be called aia of Portugal, because the Portugals do buy them. The second sort, which are not round, are called aia of Bengala. The third sort which are not so good as the second, they called aia of Canara, that is to say, the kingdom of Bzenegar (Vijayanagar). The 4th and last sort, which are the least and worst sort, are called aia of Cambaia. Thus the price being set, there are merchants of every country which are ready with their money in their hands, so that in a few days all is bought up at the prices set according to the goodness and carats of the pearls."

The only error that marks this description is the exaggeration of the depth in which the divers work. They seldom go beyond ten fathoms and the banks lie for the most part in from 5 to 10 fathoms of water. Otherwise his account of a pearl fishery is as accurate today as it was three centuries ago.

Of the Dutch *regime* a good account is given by Père Martin, Jesuit Missionary of "La Pêcherie" in 1700. The fishing tribes

of the coast, converted to Christianity by Xavier, were the spiritual children of Father Martin ; who had both a keen eye to observe and a ready pen to describe the pursuits of his disciple-fishermen.

Unlike the Chank fishery which they strictly monopolised and managed by their own agents, the Dutch left the pearl-oyster fishery open to all who chose to engage in it. Licenses were given for boats without restriction, the fee for each being sixty crowns. The number of boats engaged is stated at six hundred ; so that the probable income to the Dutch Company could not have been less than £10,000 a year. Captain Hamilton writing of the same period estimates this revenue at £20,000, but this is probably an over estimate, as the first English fisheries of 1822 and 1830 yielded a profit of £13,000 and £10,000 each.

Those were the 'palmy days of the drama,' where the boats were moored so close together that the divers fought for the precious shells along the deep sea-floor. Strange stories linger of deeds done beneath the sea. They tell of a diver who was robbed by a rival of shells which he had gathered : and who avenged the fraud by concealing a knife in his girdle at the next plunge, and stabbing the thief to the heart as he groped along the coral reefs. No eye saw the deed, and the corpse and the blood stained water alone bore witness to it. Another hated diver was, they say, doomed to a more dreadful and no less secret death. They seized him at the bottom of the sea, and tied his long beard to the branching coral-stalks, and left him thus to struggle and drown.

These may be the fables of the fishery ; but pearls doubtless have the same power to urge men to evil that gold has.

Father Martin had a very low opinion of his disciples' diving-power, when he wrote that they could only plunge seven or eight times a day. A good diver will descend at least one hundred times and gather at each plunge about thirty shells.

Then, too, success was secured by propitiating the blessing of Heaven, and holy Mother Church received her share of the sea's treasures from her faithful disciples ; while each crew of Hindu divers devoted to the shrine of Rama at Rameswaram, or of Subramaniaswâmi, at Trichendur, the two most famous temples of the coast, the first fruits of their pearls. The gems may still be seen, all smoke-tinted and ruined in the jewellery of the temples. Upon these offerings depended the fortunes of the fishery, so that the worthy Father records with sad earnestness, that when the fishery failed in 1709, the heavy change was directly attributed to the resentment of heaven at the omission to see sufficiently the local churches.

Now, alas, the evil has gone so far that not the most munificent endowment of the pagodas can restore the yearly fishery, and

rationals have of late years been found to point to more material causes, shifting sand-banks, mud-bearing currents and the like, as a more complete and satisfactory explanation of the disappearance of the oysters from their old haunts. The failure that began in 1709, has become almost permanent in 1870. Not a pearl has been gathered since 1866, and hopes alone are entertained that a fishery, on a small scale, may be possible about three years hence.

Financially this Indian Pearl Fishery is a mere bagatelle ; with out going so far as to say that it costs more than it yields, it may safely be said that as a source of revenue to the Government of India, it is beneath notice. In 1861 the fishery yielded £22,000 ; in 1862 the nett receipts amounted to about £12,000, while against this income must be set a yearly expenditure of about £600, on the establishment which supervises and protects the Fishery, together with cost of vessels, etc., supplied for the same service.

Apart, however, from finance, Pearls and Pearl Oysters have a sentimental and poetical surrounding, which like the so-called sentimental reasons against direct taxation, no Finance minister can overlook. It would be as poor-spirited to abandon a Pearl Fishery which has lived for twenty centuries, because the two sides of the account will not quite balance, as it would be mean for the thrifty heir of a free-handed country squire to sell his father's silver pheasants, or to send his favourite old cob to the hammer, or to let one wing of the old manor-house to a new hotel company. The McCullochs and Humes of rigid economical principles denounce his sentimental regard for his father's pets and his tender feelings for the family mansion ; but the world will admire him if he refrains, and denounce him, if he yields to the stern teaching of economy. Thus too the Indian Government, amidst all its financial sorrows, with an "inelastic" land revenue, and a little cloud (of Income tax) ever on the horizon, though now 'no bigger than a man's hand,' may still be allowed their little luxury. Conceive the situation of the upright Secretary who after writing from the India Office a peremptory order for the immediate abandonment of the Pearl Fishery, were to go home and tell his wife and daughters what he had done. What would figures avail against the battery of arguments to which he would be exposed ? Feminine arguments are above figures and beside facts ; but here the victim would be exposed to most practical reasoning, drawn from the cost of bridal jewellery and the absolute need of pearl necklaces !

Thus it would now be as unfair to expect a modern Finance minister to abolish the Pearl Fishery, as it would have been unreasonable in Cleopatra to present Antony with a bill for the gem which he swallowed in vinegar.

The Pearl Fishery is of the things that must and will be ; which being so, it may not be out of place to notice what prospect there is of its recovery and financial success.

It is only of late years that any body has understood the most elementary facts about the Pearl Oyster. The scientific observations of Dr. Kelaart in Ceylon formed the basis of the knowledge that now exists ; and the principal facts which he established are that Pearl Oysters are not stationary, as was supposed, but can walk about, like men and women, except that each has only one leg, that they are very hardy creatures, not particular to salt water or brackish, deep sea or shallow estuary ; that they are gregarious and go from place to place, in search of food, or to avoid offensive mud or currents of fresh water. Another noteworthy fact is that your large steady Oyster who has lived all his life in one place, leading a calm aldermanic existence, getting his food regular, and with no carking cares to fret him, is pretty sure to secrete never a pearl, but to fill his shell with his own fat flesh and nothing more valuable whatever. Sweet indeed are the uses of adversity, for it makes Oysters secrete pearls, (the connexion of adversity with a pearl oyster is thus far closer than with Shakspear's toad).

As Dr Kelaart writes "Pearls are generally found in oysters that have been retarded in their growth, and displaced in early life from their position." What a theme for a poet ! "Torn from home and all its pleasures," sobs the poor young oyster, as he floats hither and thither in the strong currents of the Indian sea ; and to console himself sits him down within his solitary shell and weeps pearly tears. This however is the poetry of Pearldom. The fact is that a pearl is a grain of sand, or an injured egg in the spawning oyster, round which gathers the pearly secretion or 'nacre' which gives it all its beauty.

The effect of Dr. Kelaarts' observations was to found a belief that artificial supplies of Pearl Oysters might be secured by their collection in nurseries, and their careful conservation from inimical influences. A nursery was accordingly proposed by Captain Phipps, the Superintendent of the Tinnevelly Pearl Fishery, in 1863 ; it was commenced in 1864 and completed in 1865. A bank was selected in the middle of the shallow harbour of Tuticorin, and upon it an enclosure was made by walls of loose coral supported by palmyra piles. The walls were 150 yards long and enclosed a space about 6 feet wide to a height of  $10\frac{1}{2}$  feet. Within this space, in about 5 feet water, the Oyster spat and fry were deposited upon the rough coral, where they were intended to grow to maturity and to be thence transferred to the Pearl Banks in deep sea.

The carefully matured proposals of Captain Phipps were accord-

ingly sanctioned, and the nursery with no less care constructed. The young oysters were first found, a matter of no little difficulty, and then placed in their new home to live at ease, and grow like Topsy in careless idleness.

But alas! an oyster can no more be compelled to grow than a horse to drink. The ungrateful young molluscs resented this interference with their freedom. They sighed, like the caged linnet, for their freedom; and in short they could not be persuaded to do any thing but die.

The nursery moreover was not only a failure as a home for oysters; but the suspicion arose that this solid obstruction to the waterway, was fast silting up the harbour of Tuticorin. This apprehension was proved afterwards to have been greatly exaggerated, if not wholly groundless; but there was no reason for continuing a project, which was for its own purposes futile, and in other subjects dangerous. So orders were given for the destruction of the nursery, of which nothing now remains but the heads of some piles that still stand up above the sea. Of the cause of this failure no clear comprehension has been formed. Perhaps the shallow waters of the Tuticorin harbour carried too much mud and silt in suspension, which was precipitated within the still waters of the enclosures to the disgust of the dainty Pearl Oysters, that love a clean bed of sand and coral. But whatever the causes that combined to defeat the experiment, of the failure there can be no doubt; and in the face of it future proposals of artificial breeding are unlikely to find favour.

It may however be doubted whether this failure is by any means conclusive to condemn the feasibility of the project. Perhaps in deeper water and in a less confined enclosure a place might be found to suit the whim of the oyster. But the present policy is one of non-intervention. The oysters are left alone to their own sweet will, with only an occasional domiciliary visit, to see that they have not made a moon-light flitting. The little steamer, the 'Margaret Northcote,' which dances about from one Pearl Bank to another, is now the only outward and visible sign of watchful supervision that is taken of the Fishery in posse. It would be adventurous to prophesy when the supply of oysters will suffice to reward an actual Fishery, as these creatures have an awkward way of slipping off their banks into deep sea, where no diver can reach them.

No attempt has hitherto been made by deep-sea dredging to visit and spoil these remoter treasure-houses, but it might be worth considering whether, if the wayward oysters persist in frequenting the deep sea where divers cannot follow, efforts to systematically fish a Pearl Bank by deep-sea dredging might not prove more fruitful of result than elaborate breeding pro-

jects. If the Challenger can drag marvellous lobsters and hitherto unconceived monsters through two miles depth of sea, there would seem to be nothing chimerical in a proposal to find oysters by dredging, and then to fish them by dredging. If the Pearl-Fishery is to be made a success, the oyster must be found; and if they have deserted their old feeding grounds and taken to deeper waters, we must go further a sea to find them. There are also undoubted changes in the coast, since the days when the voyager of the *Periplus* visited it and saw the convict divers of Kolkhi gathering pearls from the banks hard by.

The common theory is that the fishery has been ruined by over-fishing. But there are many defects in this explanation. In the first place it is inconceivable that a diver would burden himself with useless half grown shells, when full grown oysters only would reward his toil, and it is therefore extremely improbable that any but old oysters were removed from the banks. But banks of full grown oysters cannot be over-fished, for the simple reason that the life of the Pearl Oysters is so short that if he be not removed by the diver, his own thread of life will literally snap or in other words his "byssus" or cable will give way, and he will die off the rock. There is also no reason to believe that young oysters are at all injured by being displaced from their resting place, and thrown back into the sea to find a new home. Dr. Kelaart has established by actual observation and experiment, that young oysters habitually change their home and can with perfect indifference be moved from place to place for purposes of artificial culture.

As a matter of fact moreover it is distinctly stated that the old fisheries were conducted on careful considerations of profit and loss. That immature banks were not fished at all; and that a fishery was only established when a trial haul showed that, the supply of fully grown oysters and of pearls was certain to produce a fixed percentage of profit on the expenses of the fishery. It is therefore extremely doubtful whether the often repeated charge against the Portuguese and Dutch that they killed the goose that laid the golden eggs has any more solid foundation than jealousy of their success and annoyance at our failure. It may therefore be doubted whether any amount of science or care will induce oysters to behave with propriety and come like Hotspur's spirits from the vasty deep when we call them. Whether or no Mr. Clements Markham's humble aspiration, to ensure from the Pearl Fishery "a regular annual return of £10,000 a year at least to the Indian revenue," will be answered favourably is of no great moment. The probabilities appear to be that the balance sheet will in future present by no

means so favourable an appearance. In any case a revenue of £10,000 is of no great moment to a Finance minister who deals yearly with fifty millions, and to avoid disappointment and misunderstanding, the preservation of the Pearl Fishery had better be regarded as the pardonable luxury of an Imperial Government.

If Dukes are allowed to have Deer-forests, surely a fishery of pearls is a pardonable, and perhaps an appropriate luxury for our Indian Empire, itself the brightest jewel, the purtest pearl in England's Crown.

## ART. II.—THE 'STRUGGLE FOR EXISTENCE' OF THE ENGLISH PRESS IN INDIA.

- 1.—*Life of Lord Metcalfe.* By Sir J. W. Kaye.
- 2.—*Thornton's History of the British Empire.*
- 3.—*Memoirs of a Journalist.* By J. H. Stocqueler.
- 4.—*The (Calcutta) Statesman, 1875.*
- 5.—“*Men Whom India has known.*” By J. J. Higginbotham.
- 6.—*Life of John Thomas.* By C. B. Lewis.
- 7.—*The Indian Year Book.* By Dr. Murdoch.
- 8.—*The Calcutta Review, June, 1864.*

**I**N 1780, *Hickey's Bengal Gazette*, the first Indian newspaper, was established, eight years before *The Times* was started in England. There has been some discrepancy in the year assigned for the birth of Indian journalism. So high an authority on matters journalistic in India as Sir John William Kaye, in a footnote to the chapter on the liberation of the Indian Press in his “*Life of Lord Metcalfe*,” (vol. ii. p. 134) says of *Hickey's Gazette*, that it was “first published in 1781.” Dr. Murdoch, in the “*Indian Year Book for 1861*” calls the first newspaper in India *Hickey's Calcutta Journal*; and, also, says it was commenced in 1781. Evidently there is a double mis-statement in the last-quoted authority. There was a *Calcutta Journal* in Bengal, but it did not see the light till 1818. Incidentally, and in the absence of the veritable “first copy” of Mr. Hickey's paper, the question of date may be considered set at rest in one particular, and both Sir J. W. Kaye and Dr. Murdoch are shown to be in error in assigning the year 1781 as that which witnessed the birth of the Indian Press. The Rev. C. B. Lewis, of Calcutta, in his “*Life of John Thomas*,\* the first English Missionary in India, makes two quotations from *Hickey's Bengal Gazette*, evidently at first hand. One is an extract from the letter of an indignant citizen, respecting the evil sanitary effects of a badly-kept Portuguese burying-ground in the heart of the city of Calcutta, and is dated March, 1780. Again, another correspondent, writing in June of the same year, commenting upon the depravity of social life in Calcutta, is quoted by Mr. Lewis.† It may, therefore, be considered that 1780 (if not, indeed, an earlier

\* Macmillan & Co., London. 1870. † *Idem.* p. 32.

date) and not 1781 has the honour of having recorded in its annals the birth of the newspaper press of India; which, as has been stated, was not many years after this means of expressing public opinion and recording the national life had been in vogue in England.\* This is an instance of how little behind the current thought and practice of the home country Anglo-Indians of the eighteenth century were, as the same community is almost abreast with the best of English social life, intellectually, at the present time.

After a start had been made in Calcutta, Bombay followed by having a newspaper; but so slow was the spread of journalism in India, that only about five papers existed at the beginning of this century, after a lapse of twenty years from the time of starting. It is a truism to say that the newspapers of the eighteenth century will not bear comparison with those of the present time. But, making every allowance for this, the reader who takes up a copy of the diminutive sheets of any year *ante* 1800, and even subsequently, wonders how anybody could have found them entertaining. A few items of local news, followed by a letter here and there from a critical citizen or an aggrieved ratepayer, and both preceded by a very small number of advertisements, with about five-sixths of the remainder of the space occupied with extracts from continental and English papers, represent the contents of the Indian journal of that period. To the resident behind the Mahratta ditch, however, the *Gazette*, or *Chronicle*, or *Journal*, was of very great interest, and as much a stride on the nation which existed before they were started, as the excellent English daily papers of the present time are compared with the infant broad-sheets of nearly a hundred years since. But the journals of those days in Calcutta were not very peculiarly profitable to their proprietors. They could not strike root because of the general corruption in tone and life which prevailed. Besides, the general apathy, of civilians and military alike, for anything but shaking the pagoda tree and gathering the fruit, made it almost impossible for Anglo-Indian newspapers to be successful. Consequently, until the end of the century, and for twenty years after, only a few newspapers existed, and they in the Presidency towns. Powerful for evil socially, they seem to have counted for little or nothing in the higher and nobler matters which, at all times, concern the body politic. The authorities ignored the existence of the papers except to show in how little esteem they were held; the public cared nothing for what they contained beyond the highly-spiced personal (often prurient) details which formed

---

\* Grant's *Newspaper Press*, Vol. I. *passim*.

such delectable subjects of conversation at the heavy dinner-parties and hard drinking which were then the fashion. The history of the *Indian World*, a newspaper started in 1794, by an Irish-American named William Duane, showed the contempt with which newspaper editors were treated in those times. Mr. Duane had made all arrangements to sell his paper on January 1st 1795; and though he was not assailing the Government at that period, opportunity was taken to show him how heavily the hand of the ruler could smite. On the 27th of December, 1794, he was requested by the Private Secretary of Sir John Shore, Captain Collins, to call at Government House. Duane, conscious of no particular offence, thought this was an invitation to breakfast at the Governor-General's table, given because he was about to leave the country, and was prompt in answering the summons. The following discussion ensued, at Captain Collins meeting Mr. Duane in the ante-room:—

Captain COLLINS:—I am glad you are so punctual, Mr. Duane.

Mr. DUANE:—I generally am, Sir. I hope the Governor-General is well.

Captain COLLINS:—He is not to be seen and ——,

Mr. DUANE:—I understood I was invited by him.

Captain COLLINS:—Yes, Sir, but I am directed by the Governor-General to inform you, that you are to consider yourself a State prisoner.

A number of soldiers, at a given signal, burst upon the scene and with drawn bayonets surrounded Mr. Duane, who saw through an open door the Governor-General and two members of the Supreme Council sitting on a sofa.

Mr. DUANE:—I did not think, Sir John Shore, or you, Sir (turning to Captain Collins) could be so base and treacherous as to proceed, or even to think, as you do.

Captain COLLINS:—Silence, Sir. (To the soldiers): Drag him along.

Mr. DUANE (to the soldiers):—Softly, my friends, I shall go along with you. (To Collins): What is to follow next, Collins, the bowstring or the scimitar?

Captain COLLINS:—You are insolent, Sir. (To the soldiers) Drag him along, you pig-eating scoundrels.

Mr. DUANE:—You are performing the part of Grand Vizier now, my little gentleman, and these are your mutes. Calcutta is become Constantinople, and the Governor-General the Grand Turk.

Under strict guard, strongly armed, Duane was kept in Fort William for three days, and then taken on board an armed Indiaman and conveyed to England, where he was set free without a single word of information and explanation. His property in India, of which he never received a pice, was worth about fifty

thousand dollars. He afterwards went to Philadelphia, became Editor of the *Aurora*, and made that paper intensely anti-British.

The British Empire was at stake when Lord Wellesley landed at Calcutta in 1798. It was a question whether the French or the British should have domination over the land. Considering the efforts that were necessary to make the British position sure, one is tempted to condone almost anything that those in authority felt constrained to do. Consequently, when the Marquis of Wellesley thought that the supreme interest of the country he was sent to govern, demanded that he should let no intelligence be published which would be likely to yield advantage to the enemy, surprise cannot be very great that a censorship of the Press should have been created. At all risks the enemy must be beaten and the Empire saved. The Press was thought to be a great danger, if unfettered, and it was put in leading strings. New duties were imposed upon an old office, and a Secretary of Government had to perform, in addition to other duties, those of a Censor of Newspapers. The mistake was not so much, considering the times, in a censorship being established for a certain occasion, but that a measure, adopted for a particular set of circumstances, should have been kept in force when those circumstances were changed and the necessity no longer existed. When warfare with the French was being carried on, undoubtedly the greatest caution was necessary in the publication of facts liable to be turned to account by the foe. It was far otherwise in regard to conflicts with purely Asiatic States, in fighting with Burmah and in expeditions into Afghanistan. But the bureaucracy, which sat as a night-mare on the diffusion of knowledge and the spread of liberal thought in India, had too inflated a sense of its own importance and too feeble a grasp of the right use of power to allow so potent an instrument of torture as the censorship of the Press to pass from their hands willingly. It was not, however, that a censorship only was established to keep journalists in awe. To support it, and to enforce obedience to the excisions made by the pen of the censor in the printed "proofs" submitted to him, penal laws of great stringency were enacted. Amongst other things, leaving out of consideration the Judges of the Supreme Court, the sole medium for carrying out the law in a properly-constituted country, the Governor-General was vested "with the power of transmitting to England, in the most summary manner, any European subject of Britain whose conduct may be deemed in any way hostile to Government, the Governor-General so acting, however, being on his return to England, liable to an action at the instance of the individual, should he have been aggrieved." At this time the great India Bill—which was surely preceded by the greatest amount of

enquiry ever known, for the author of "Our Indian Empire" says that 15,000 printed pages of folio foolscap were presented to the Houses of Parliament by the various Commissions appointed—had not been passed; and non-officials were permitted to settle in British India only on license. A license was also necessary before a newspaper could be started, and this the applying editor or publisher was told was liable to withdrawal, whilst the person responsible would be deported if any of the Press regulations were broken.

The successors, for many years, of the Marquis of Wellesley had, all of them, a poor opinion of the Press, which was kept shackled with the greatest severity. They had not the excuse of the great Marquis who, having established the Censorship because he was at war, made the conflict yield success; while otherwise, he endeavoured to do much for literature and learning. He founded Fort William College, only, however, to find the Court of Directors emasculate the project as soon as it was laid before them. He also made the proceedings of the Supreme Court public. There were not, at this period, many journals to keep in order,—three or four in Calcutta, two in Bombay, and, probably, one or two in Madras. In 1792 Hugh Boyd, one of those reputed to have written the Letters of Junius, a repute which he ever strove to maintain without actually avowing the authorship, had started the *Madras Courier*. The old Indians, hating the "interlopers" who criticized their public acts and rendered getting wealthy by means not always honourable somewhat more difficult, were consistent throughout. They did not merely object to English newspapers, but also to any enlightenment whatever. An historian, already alluded to, says:—"It was our policy in those days to keep the natives of India in the profoundest possible state of barbarism and darkness, and every attempt to diffuse the light of knowledge among the people, either of our own or the Independent States, was vehemently opposed and resented." An illustration of this is gathered from the records of the Hyderabad Residency, and is told by Sir J. W. Kaye ("Life of Lord Metcalfe," vol. II., pp. 136, 137) as follows:—

Captain Sydenham, who then represented our interests at the Hyderabad Court, wishing to gratify a desire expressed by the Nizam to see some of the appliances of European science, procured for him three specimens in the shape of an air-pump, a printing press, and the model of a man-of-war. Having mentioned this in his demi-official correspondence with the Chief Secretary, he was censured for having placed in the hands of a native prince so dangerous an instrument as the printing press. Upon this the President wrote back that the Government need be under no apprehensions, for that the Nizam had taken so little interest in the press, that he had not even made a present to the compositors who had come round from Madras to exhibit the application to practical purposes of the implements of their craft.

But he added, that if the Government still felt any uneasiness about the presence of this dangerous instrument of civilization at the Court of the Nizam, he could easily obtain admission to the Toshakhana (Treasure House) and there so cripple the press as to ensure its never being in a fit state to do duty again !

This feeling, which specially characterised Lord Minto's Government, and for fifteen years after was the ruling idea of the permanent officials, John Adam giving expression to it by the severe measures he subsequently carried out, has been well characterised as a "chronic disease" and "hypochondriacal day-fears and night-mares."

With the advent of Lord Hastings a more favourable turn was given to the free expression of thought, and Anglo-Indian journalism showed itself capable of better things than had hitherto marked its career. Things too high for the scandal-monger, too great to be grasped by his understanding, became the subject of editorial comment ; while officers who had 'grievances to ventilate and civilians (especially the "interlopers") who had theories to air or malpractices to expose, found the columns of journals read by the Governor-General, who avowedly looked to them for somewhat of guidance, a good medium, which they did not fail to largely avail themselves of. So heartily did the Marquis of Hastings display the liberality of opinion which he possessed, that he hailed the appearance of a vernacular newspaper, started by the Rev. Dr. Marshman, with the greatest pleasure. He personally thanked the Serampore Missionary for its publication, wrote also an official letter of thanks, and ordered a large number of copies to be sent to the Native Courts. A considerable change this from the fear which Lord Minto and his Council felt and expressed with regard to the printing press at Hyderabad ! It must have been very galling to that good man but narrow-minded official, John Adam, who was then in Calcutta.

Into this liberal atmosphere came an adventurous—in many respects a typical—Englishman, James Silk Buckingham, born at Flushing, Cornwall, in 1784. He executed important commissions for the Pasha of Egypt in 1813, and afterwards made several abortive attempts to trade with India, not possessing a license from the East India Company. Pleasing the Pasha of Egypt was easier work than fighting the covenanted servants of "Jan Kumpau Bahadur," and consequently Mr. Buckingham proceeded again to Egypt ; having received a firman from the Pasha he returned to India overland through Syria, Mesopotamia and Persia, dressed in Turkish costume and speaking the Arabic language. He seems to have reached Calcutta safely, but lived in obscurity for a time ; at least nothing more is heard of him until 1818, when he established the *Calcutta Journal*. An ardent Radical, Mr. Buckingham soon startled the propriety of the officials, who were greatly

incensed at his boldness and effrontery. The Rev. Dr. Marshman thus writes of the *Journal* :—“ It was the ablest newspaper which had ever appeared in India, and gave a higher tone and a deeper interest to journalism. A knot of young men in the public service, of brilliant talents, headed by Mr. Henry Meredith Parker, ranged themselves round the paper, and contributed by their poignant articles to its extraordinary success and popularity. The editor, availing himself of the liberty granted to the press by Lord Hastings, commented on public measures with great boldness ; and sometimes with a degree of severity which was considered dangerous. But the great offence of the *Journal* consisted in the freedom of its remarks on some of the leading members of Government. They had been nursed in the lap of despotism, and their feelings of official complacency were rudely disturbed by the sarcasms inflicted upon them. Madras, as a rule, had been unfortunate in its Governors ; no fewer than six of them had been recalled—one of them unjustly—and, with the exception of three or four, the rest had been very second-rate men. One of these, Mr. Hugh Elliot, then filled the chair, to the regret of the public ; and the *Journal* affirmed that he had obtained an extension of his term of office, which was announced to the community in a circular with a black border. This innocent pleasantry was registered among the offences of the paper.” On the other hand, the anonymous author of “The Law and Constitution of India” (published recently) gives the following version of the career of the *Calcutta Journal* under Mr. Buckingham’s editorial control :—

Through the kind offices of a few friends Mr. Buckingham started the *Calcutta Journal* with the ostensible object of making it a ‘Journal of Science and Literature’ interspersed with the news of the day ; but, in fact, to indulge his spleen against anybody and everybody to whom he imagined he owed a grudge. As the current topics of the day were neither interesting nor important enough to engross his entire attention, he had the effrontery to advertise openly, that with a view to offering a ‘piquant’ fare for the edification of his readers, he would ‘pepper and salt’ his paper so as to suit their tastes and render it more palatable. The extraordinary way in which he went to work to make his bill more attractive was noticed at once. He began by printing the grossest libels, not only against public bodies, but also against honest citizens, and he even dragged the names of their families into print for the gratification of his evil propensities, till the evil culminated in his bold attacks upon the Government of India itself. He combined in his person the censor of public morals and the ‘controller of Government.’ The latter epithet he assumed through a misconstrued expression of the Marquis of Hastings. His Lordship had, a short while before, told the people of Madras, in his reply to their address, ‘that it was salutary for supreme authority to look to the control of public scrutiny.’ A better handle for Buckingham’s purpose could scarcely have been offered. He declared that these words ‘deserved to be written in letters of gold,’ and he was not slow in taking advantage of this opportunity. His audacity led him to commit himself beyond the bounds of ordinary prudence, and he was at last

threatened by Government ; but he always avoided its vengeance by having recourse to abject apologies, only to repeat the offence on a future day and submit himself to fresh indignities. The example thus set by an Englishman was not lost upon the native community, who started several newspapers in unison with the *Calcutta Journal*, and by the time the Marquis of Hastings left the country in 1823, these 'controllers of Government' had brought affairs to a pretty uncomfortable pass by disseminating feelings of disloyalty throughout the length and breadth of the land."\*

The writer of the foregoing may have been, perhaps was, one of those "old Indians" who hated the Press with a great hatred. Certainly Sir J. W. Kaye does not agree with the last quoted authority, but rather bears out what Dr. Marshman had written. On page 137 of vol. ii. of "The Life of Lord Metcalfe," the biographer (referring mainly to the *Calcutta Journal*), says :— "The acts of Government were now for the first time canvassed with equal boldness and talent, and its officers censured or ridiculed in the columns either of bitter editors or still more bitter correspondents. Now it was that the vehemence of 'Brutus' and the virulence of 'Cleophas' made many a galled jade wince in the high places about Chowringhee. Perhaps the assailant and the assailed sat side by side at the breakfast table on which the unct sheet were lying ; for 'Brutus' was not improbably a rising member of the Civil Service, and 'Cleophas' a liberal-minded Major on the general staff. Lord Hastings watched the progress of the freedom of expression ; perhaps learned some useful lessons from it ; and contented himself with quietly exhorting an editor to restrain his intemperance and to keep himself within convenient bounds." All this while the Censorship Act remained unrepealed, and the penal clause of the measure which provided for deportation lay ready to use ; but the Marquis of Hastings was too wise a man to avail himself of any of these things.

Early in 1823, Lord Hastings left Calcutta for England ; and John Adam, Senior Member of Council, became acting Governor-General. Judged by his acts Mr. Adam's reputation does not stand high, especially with Anglo-Indian journalists. It is more than probable that he was greatly dissatisfied with the manner in which the Marquis of Hastings had acted towards the Press. Thoroughly penetrated with the idea that the continuous domination of the British in India depended upon the natives being kept in a state of ignorance, and officials dowered with despotism, responsible only to the Court of Directors in Leadenhall Street, he mourned over the licentiousness of the public journals. Consequently, no sooner had he acquired supreme power than he put in force the long-suspended regulations against the Press ; indeed, further

---

\* *Statesman*, Calcutta, 1875.

orders were promulgated. Dr. Marshman describes them as "completely extinguishing the 'freedom of unlicensed printing.'" Mr. Buckingham's corps of writers, however, changed not their tone nor moderated their censures; neither did the Editor think the remarks were too forcibly expressed for a professedly liberal journal. The same outspokenness, therefore, continued to characterise the *Calcutta Journal* as prior to the departure of Lord Hastings; until at length John Adam would stand it no longer, but stretched forth his hand, and Mr. Buckingham was forcibly expelled from the country.

The circumstances which led to the expulsion of the Editor of the *Calcutta Journal* were disgraceful to the acting Governor-General. Dr. Marshman, a witness of what happened, says that the senior Presbyterian Minister in Calcutta, "who was a zealous partisan of Government, had set up a rival Tory paper, and indulged in invectives against Mr. Buckingham which, when indicted in the Supreme Court, were pronounced to be libellous. Not only was no check placed upon him by the Government, but he was nominated to the well-paid office of Clerk to the Stationery Department." The *Calcutta Journal* ridiculed the incongruity of a union of offices, which obliged the reverend gentleman to employ himself in counting bundles of tape and sticks of sealing-wax when he ought to have been composing his sermons or visiting the members of his congregation. In fact, Mr. Buckingham published the following article:—

During the evening of Thursday, about the period at which the inhabitants of this good City of Palaces are accustomed to sit down to dinner, an appendix to the Government *Gazette* of the morning was issued in a separate form, and coming in the shape of a *Gazette Extraordinary*, was eagerly seized, even at that inconvenient hour in the hope of its containing intelligence of great public importance. Some in whose bosoms this hope had been most strongly excited may perhaps have felt disappointed; others, we know, drew from it a fund of amusement which lasted them during the remainder of the evening.

The Rev. Gentleman, named below, who we perceive by the index of that useful publication, the Annual Directory, is a Doctor of Divinity, and Moderator of the Kirk Session, and who, by the favour of higher powers, now combines the office of parson and clerk in the same person, has, no doubt, been selected for the arduous duties of his new place from the purest motives, and the strictest possible attention to the public interest. Such a clerk, as is here required, to inspect and reject whatever articles may appear objectionable to him, should be a competent judge of the several sorts of paste-board, sealing-wax, inkstands, sand, lead, gum, pounce, tape and leather; and one would imagine that nothing short of a regular apprenticeship at Stationer's Hall would qualify a candidate for such a situation. All this information, however, the Rev. Gentleman, no doubt possesses, in a more eminent degree than any other person who could be found to do the duties of such an office; and though at first sight, such information may seem incompatible with a theological education, yet we know that the country abounds with surprising instances of that kind of geniis which fits a man in a moment for any post to which he may be appointed.

In Scotland, we believe, the duties of a Presbyterian minister are divided between preaching on the Sabbath, and on the other days of the week visiting the sick, comforting the weak-hearted, conferring with the bold, and encouraging the timid in the several duties of their religion. Some shallow persons might conceive that if a Presbyterian clergyman were to do his duty in India, he might also find abundant occupation throughout the year in the zealous and faithful discharge of more pious duties, which ought more especially to engage his devout attention. But they must be persons of very little reflection indeed, who entertain such an idea. We have seen the Presbyterian flock of Calcutta take very good care of themselves for many months without a pastor at all; and even when the shepherd was among them, he had abundant time to edit a controversial paper (long since defunct) and to take a part in all the meetings, festivities, addresses, and flatteries, that were current at that time! He has continued to display this eminently active, if not holy, disposition up to the present period, and, according to the maxim, "to him that hath much (to do) still more shall be given, and from him that hath nothing, even the little that he hath shall be taken away," this Rev. Doctor, who has so often evinced the universality of his genius and talents, whether within the pale of divinity, or without it, is perhaps the very best person that could be selected, all things considered, to take care of the foolscap, paste-board, wax, sand, gum, lead, leather, and tape of the Hon'ble E. I. Company of Merchants, and to examine and pronounce on the quality of each, so as to see that no drafts are given on their treasury for gum that will not stick, tape short of measure, or inkstands of base metal.

Whether the late discussions that have agitated both the wise and the foolish of this happy country from the Burrumpooter to the Indus, and from Cape Comorin to the confines of Tartary, have had any influence in hastening the consummation so devoutly wished, we cannot presume to determine. We do not profess to know anything of the occult sciences, and being equally ignorant of all *secret* influences, whether of the planets of heaven or the satellites of earth, we must content ourselves, as faithful chroniclers of the age, with including in our records the important document issued under the circumstances we have described.\*

It can scarcely be conceived that for so mildly satirical an article as the foregoing, the extreme penalties of unjust laws would be carried out; yet within two months of the date of publication of the satire, Mr. Buckingham's license had been withdrawn, he was forcibly placed on board an East Indiaman bound for China and England, and banished the country. The ostensible cause of the deportation was puerile and unworthy of the attention of a high official, or indeed, for the matter of that, any official whatever. The action taken betrays a littleness of mind and a meanness of spirit on the part of Mr. Adam which are hard to reconcile with a glowing tribute to his character penned by Sir Charles Metcalfe a few years subsequently, when he, himself, had done an act with regard to the Press which differed as much from John Adam's procedure as light differs from darkness. Sir Charles Metcalfe thinks that, in 1835, Mr. Adam would have seen "eye to eye" with himself in the matter of the liberation of news-

papers from State control ; but he gives no reason for an opinion, the expression of which most men will ascribe to high-souled generosity rather than to strict justice.

Mr. Stocqueler's description of the offence which led to Mr. Buckingham's deportation differs in some respects from those already alluded to. Writing in 1870, Mr. Stocqueler was evidently drawing upon his memory for facts, so that for precise details his narration is not so valuable as Dr. Marshman's account, which was written at (or soon after) the deed was consummated. Mr. Stocqueler says :—

" Buckingham was the bold dragoon who leaped over the bayonets of the infantry square of ancient prejudice, sacrificing himself to the public interests in his rare moral hardihood. The absurd press regulations, which prohibited reflections on any of the acts of Governors, Military Commanders, Judges, Bishops,—or, in fact, any one in office—lest they should disturb the harmony of society, he derided and defied ; and when it was announced that a tyrannical Madras Governor was to hold office for a further term of one year, he published his paper with a mourning border. This was a crime of the deepest dye committed during the interregnum following upon the rule of Lord Amherst [*sic*, Lord Hastings] and preceding that of Lord William Bentinck, it gave Mr. John Adam, the *locum tenens* of the Governor-Generalship of India, an opportunity of venting the spite of the old Qui Hye civilians. He ordered Buckingham's presses to be seized, and his person arrested and sent on board a ship bound for China, and thence to England. Buckingham's daring, therefore, cost him his property and liberty, but it cleared the path for his successors, for such an atrocious piece of tyranny would not bear repetition."

Further, to show the spirit of fear engendered by this state of things, an incident mentioned by Mr. Buckingham in the House of Lords on August 28th, 1835, will bear quotation. Commenting upon the state of affairs in India, as regarded the liberty of the press, Mr. Buckingham said :—" When some numbers of the *Quarterly Review* reached India, containing amongst its announcements, stitched in at the end, the prospectus of a new work on India, entitled the *Oriental Herald*, the bookseller to whom they had arrived was so terrified lest this prospectus of a publication from England, about to call in question the measures of the Indian Government, should subject him to the penalties of Mr. Sergeant Spankie's Act, that every one of the forbidden sheets was torn out, before the *Quarterly Review* itself could be exposed for sale."\*

While the supreme authorities at Calcutta were striving to gag the press by measures of brutal severity, the Bombay Government were acting similarly towards the Editor of the *Bombay Gazette* ; in his case the license for the paper was not withdrawn.†

\* *Calcutta Review*, June 1864, p 170. appearance of the paper, if withdrawn at all, could only have been

† The license for the *Calcutta Journal*, judging by the subsequent

Mr. Farr, the Editor, was deported and the authorities were appeased. Mr. Stocqueler, who was in Bombay at the time, and who says that the two journals then existing in the city, were "composed almost entirely of selections from the English papers," remarks that the article which led to the deportation of Mr. Farr was one personally offensive to Sir Edward West, the Recorder, and was written to please "a clique of discontented barristers." The Recorder invoked the protection of the Government, and the banishment of the responsible party followed. Mr. Stocqueler says (page 49 of his *Memoirs*) :—"If the Editor had acted from a sense of public duty I do not believe Sir Edward would have troubled himself about the matter, for he was a warm advocate of the freedom of the press, and at a somewhat later period refused to register a law controlling the press, which had been concocted at Calcutta and sent round by the Governor-General."

To return, however, to the crusade of Mr. Adam against the Editor of the *Calcutta Journal*. Though under sentence of deportation, Mr. Buckingham would not be silenced during the days that yet remained to him in India; he wrote an exceedingly powerful article entitled "Transportation without Trial," in which the acting head of the Government was, most deservedly, severely handled. He also took the opportunity of pointing out that though he was to be silenced, the tympan of his old Caxton press was not to remain quiescent, but that he would be succeeded by a gentleman equally zealous with himself in endeavouring to obtain the liberty of the press. Furthermore, his successor could not be so summarily disposed of as he was. The gentleman thus referred to was an East Indian (Mr. Sandys) and instead of being liable to deportation at the will of the Governor-General was only amenable to the judges of the Supreme Court and a Jury. The *Journal*, under Mr. Sandys' management, became more abusive of Government than it had ever been before, until Mr. Adam was again incensed, and a measure was passed through Council rendering it compulsory on journalists and proprietors of newspapers to take out fresh licenses; these licenses were liable to be revoked, without warning, if those in charge of the journals committed a breach of any of the rules framed for regulating the Press. This induced caution, and John Adam gave place to Lord Amherst without any further serious conflict with the papers. Lord Amherst, unthinkingly or otherwise, for a time allowed things to take their own course, without any "jockeying" on his part. This was, as has been urged, probably not a little due to the fact that most of the "principal ministerial functionaries in the Presidency had naturally fallen into the ways of John Adam," which is a correct surmise no doubt, as it is more than probable that the inclination of the Indian official of 1820, and a few years subsequently, was

such as to predispose him to the course of things which Lord Amherst permitted to drift on.

Of Mr. Buckingham more need not be said here, save that on his arrival in London a liberal subscription was raised for him, that he there established the *Oriental Herald*, was M. P. for Nottingham for five years, and that towards the end of his life the East India Company granted him a pension as amends for the injury done by the deportation in 1823. Before that was done he had been (says Sir John Kaye) "a continual running sore in the flesh of the East India Company and the British Parliament."

It is gratifying to know that the Rev. Mr. Bryce's appointment as custodian of red tape and sealing-wax, when made known at home, was condemned by his own Church, and revoked by the directors of the Honorable East India Company.

Two different stories are told of the peace and quietness, the virtual freedom, which the Press of Calcutta, and with it that of the other presidency towns, enjoyed during the latter part of Lord Amherst's tenure of office. On the one hand it is urged by the biographer of Sir Charles Metcalfe, that when "Lord Amherst began to think more for himself, the natural mildness of his disposition revolted against the oppressiveness of the old Toryism of Calcutta, and the restrictions which had been imposed upon the free utterance of opinion were gradually relaxed." The anonymous author of "The Law and Constitution of India," however, gives the matter a much more melodramatic *denouement*. As paraphrased in the *Statesman* (Calcutta) he says :—

"There was an appearance of amicable reconciliation being effected between the ruler and the journalist, but such hopes proved delusive, for Mr. Sandys associated himself with one Mr. Arnott, who was even more notorious than either Buckingham or his successor. A paragraph reflecting strongly on Lord Amherst's administration was the last straw that broke the camel's back. The Government being swayed by an honourable consideration for the rights of the proprietors, did not withdraw the license which would have acted prejudicially on their interests, but instead, ordered Mr. Arnott out of the country. As an East Indian was not immediately available he was directed to find security for quitting the country by a certain day. On declining to comply with this requisition he was arrested by the orders of the Governor-General, and made over to the tender mercies of the Town Major for detention in Fort William till a vessel was ready to start. Arnott, who was wise in his own generation, relied on the animosity which existed between the judges of the Supreme Court and the highest authority in the land to effect his release, which he succeeded in accomplishing to his own satisfaction. He applied for a writ of *Habeas Corpus*, which was immediately granted. On being brought before this tribunal, he was heard by his counsel and, in defiance of Government, was discharged from custody. The Chief Justice in a lengthy judgment declared that his Court was supreme in every sense of the word, and that the Governor-General, though he was permitted by an Act of Parliament to send away some individuals, and to arrest them for that purpose, had no power to imprison them; for, that the words of the Act

were "to arrest" and not "to imprison"; that to imprison and to arrest were not the same thing, and that the statute being penal must be strictly interpreted."

Though the sword of Damocles, in the shape of the unrepealed restrictions on the Press (they were only "relaxed" by Lord Amherst) yet hung over Indian newspapers, they now (1828) entered upon a course of the greatest freedom, with such generally good results that Lord William Bentinck is reported to have subsequently said, after he had been a few years in India, that he had learned more from the newspapers than from all the other sources of information open to him. When it is borne in mind how many avenues for obtaining knowledge are open to an Indian official,—whether as Governor of a Presidency, or as supreme ruler, the admission is one of the most flattering testimonies to the Press that could possibly be made. But it is very probable that Lord William Bentinck referred more to the side-lights thrown upon the acts of officials, and similar details, than to precise and original information of the country and of the people. Still he might mean both, for while the Indian newspapers of that period were all ablaze with letters of remonstrance on "burning questions," the amount of actual information contained in them was also very great. As a liberal politician Lord William Bentinck strongly desired to carry such measures as were in accordance with the wish of the people, and went so far as to encourage by advertisement, merchants, indigo and sugar planters, and some of the superior tradesmen of Calcutta to communicate with him on matters financial, fiscal, and commercial.\*

The Court of Directors of the old Company not infrequently did stupid things, but they certainly deserve credit for the far-sightedness which led them to send to India an enlightened statesman like Lord William Bentinck as Governor-General when so unpopular a measure as "half-batta" was to be introduced. If, in addition to the carrying out of this change, the Press had been held tight and gagged with the regulations then existing, a revolution would possibly have occurred amongst the Company's own military servants. Not long before this period Lord Byron had written—

"Kill a man's family and he will brook it,  
But keep your hands from his breeches pocket."

Of course, it is not easy to estimate how much the military officers of the Company would have borne before they became disloyal, but certainly the abolition of "full-batta" and the substitution of "half-batta,"—the contention being that "full-batta" was intended for a time of war and not of peace,—"stirred up a

---

\* "Stoequeler's Memoirs," p. 71.

sudden flow of mutiny." At that time the majority of subscribers to Indian papers were military men, and the conductors of the journals were nothing loth to take up the view of the question which was adopted by the majority of their constituents. Lord William Bentinck was merely the instrument by which this obnoxious measure was to be carried out; yet, in the columns of the newspapers he was attacked with great fury, and could not have been more soundly rated if he had been the author of the reduction. Wise man as he was he little heeded the hard words, but allowed the excited feelings of those whose batta was to be reduced to find relief in the expression of their indignation, contempt, and scorn. The biographer of Lord Metcalfe, who has done full justice to the noble conduct of Lord William Bentinck, shows, however, how even that Governor-General's confidence forsook him; and when, in 1830, the final order of the Directors, to carry out the obnoxious measure was received, he considered whether he should, or should not, put a ban upon discussion. He decided that circumstances would justify his doing so. But, be it borne in mind, this decision was come to, not from any fear of the remarks which might be made of himself, personally. As a friendly reviewer says, "Principle was principle with him, whether it hurt him or not." His object in seeking to check discussion was to shield the Court of Directors from the invectives which he knew would be poured forth.\*

This proposed action of Lord William Bentinck brought forth a remonstrance from a Member of the Governor-General's Council, Sir C. T. Metcalfe, a civilian of thirty-five years' experience, and yet, marvellous to relate, a man of broad thought and freedom of opinion. He had all along been opposed to the manacling of the Press. Writing from Camp Bhownger in March 1825, he had said:—"The real dangers of a free Press in India are, I think, in its enabling the natives to throw off our yoke. The petty annoyances which our Governments would suffer I call rather inconveniences. The advantages are in the spread of knowledge, which it seems wrong to obstruct for any temporary or selfish purpose. I am inclined to think I would let it have its swing if I were sovereign-lord and master. He regretted the Governor-General's contemplated action in checking free and full discussion, and drew up a Minute on the subject, which, from its wise arguments and cogent reasoning, must have had some effect upon the mind of Lord William Bentinck.

As Vice-President of the Council, Sir Charles Metcalfe continued to maintain the opinions he had so unflinchingly avowed; and two years after reiterated them with point and effect, in declining to prosecute an editor in Calcutta, who had inserted

\* *Calcutta Review*, June, 1864.

a letter in his paper, charging the then Governor of Bombay with nepotism and kindred sins. Lord Clare (the Governor) had written personally to Lord William Bentinck, asking him to withdraw the license of the peasant journalist, and to undertake a prosecution, if a most ample apology was not tendered. The Vice-President of Council, upon whom the onus of carrying out the task would have devolved, remained inexorable.

Meanwhile the English-speaking public of India were taking great interest in the subject of Press emancipation; notably were the residents in Calcutta much exercised in mind about it, for by the journals of that city the penalty of infraction of the law had been most severely felt. The sneer, even now-a-days, is not infrequently indulged in, that there is no public opinion in India. But the people of Calcutta, nearly fifty years ago, showed that as regarded the freedom of the Press, there was, indubitably, a strong body of opinion. It is even urged that the community of 1830-35 were "impatient" for a satisfactory solution of the subject,—the Reform agitation in England sending a ripple of its wave to the distant Eastern shores of Hindustan, an indication of the far-reaching effects of moral and political movements. A petition was presented to the Governor-General in January 1835, asking that the Press Regulations formulated and "worked" by John Adam (who had, prior to this, been buried at sea off Madagascar, on his way home while suffering from an attack of dysentery) might be repealed, and newspapers not continue liable to be treated with great severity at the caprice of an official who, from private motives perhaps, might wish to put the law into practice. A satisfactory answer was given, it being stated that the matter would soon receive attention. But before action could be taken, Lord William Bentinck had left India, a country he had ruled wisely and well, to encounter calumny from masters who ought to have treated him better than they did, instead of leaving him to die of a broken heart at Malta, and only have his character completely cleared from suspicion after his death. Certainly, journalists in India have great reason to hold his memory in affectionate regard, and to place it next to that of Metcalfe, who actually did "the deed of good."

The successor to Lord William Bentinck as Governor-General was not ready at once to take up office, and Sir Charles Metcalfe stepped from the Vice-President's seat at the Council Board to the central chair. He determined that his long cherished opinions regarding the Press should now find full fruition. Looking round the Board he would find one sturdy henchman at least, in Thomas Babington Macaulay, whose ardent Liberalism, and whose almost deification of Milton, the eloquent advocate of free and unlicensed printing, made it certain that he would help to strike off the

shackles which bound the expression of opinion in India as though it were an evil thing. Lord (then Mr.) Macaulay spent five years in India, ostensibly to codify the laws, which he scarcely attempted, not altogether, however, from fault of his own. During his quinquennial period, he drew the munificent sum of £75,000. The author of "Our Indian Empire" asks what the great Whig historian did for his pay. He had a hand in conferring freedom on the Press, which should count for a great deal, although it is stated that the Council generally "was ripe for immediate legislation."

The work was at once done. Sir J. W. Kaye gives a succinct summary of the legislation as follows:—"In April, the draft Act for the future regulation of the Press was drawn up and duly published. It declared the repeal of the Press Regulations of 1823 in the Bengal Presidency, and those of 1825 and 1827 in Bombay. It enacted that the printer and publisher of all periodical works within the Company's territories, containing public news, or comments on public news, should appear before the magistrates of the jurisdiction in which it should be published, and declare where it was to be printed and published. Every book and paper was thenceforth to bear the name of the printer and publisher. Every person having a printing press on his premises was to make declaration thereof, and for all violations of the provisions of the Act, penalties of fine and imprisonment were decreed. But, beyond the necessity of making these declarations, there was no other restriction upon the liberty of the Press." Calcutta was greatly delighted at what had been done, and a public meeting, in which to express the gratification that was felt, was held; at this meeting all classes of the community were represented. An address to the "liberator of the Indian Press" was adopted, in which it was particularly pointed out that the result was the more to be valued seeing that the freedom conferred was the gift of Sir Charles Metcalfe, rather than of any one else. "For," said they who prepared the address, "Your experience is that of a whole life passed among the people of India, in its most remote and warlike provinces, and its most turbulent times. This renders your testimony most valuable of all." A man of generous sympathies, Sir Charles Metcalfe's heart beat warmly in response to this tribute of popular gratitude, and he wrote a very long and able reply. It would repay attentive perusal by those Anglo-Indian journalists of the present time, who crying loudly for a Government censor to exercise authority over, and to make excisions in the articles for, the Native Press, which would be as galling and as inefficient as was the similar censorship over the English Press in times gone by. The geniality of the tone, as well as the sterling merit of the contents of this letter, quite captivated the hitherto officially-contemned and scorned inhabitants of

Calcutta, and never was ruler in the Eastern dominions of Great Britain so loved and honoured by the people he ruled as was Sir Charles Metcalfe at this time, and deservedly so. Daniel Wilson, the Bishop of Calcutta, specially wrote to the acting Governor-General to express his admiration at the whole transaction, but particularly to tell of the pleasure he had felt in reading Sir Charles Metcalfe's letter in reply to the address. This was no mean compliment when all the proclivities of Bishop Wilson are taken into account. But, of course, there was some shading to a picture which seems, so far, to be composed of pleasing tints alone. The Directors in Leadenhall Street did not approve the policy of freedom, but they did not dare to command that backward steps should be taken; they preferred the less manly course of showing their displeasure by subsequent harsh treatment of Sir Charles. Nearer the scene of action, too, there were not wanting detractors who insinuated that the object of Sir Charles Metcalfe was merely a bid for popularity, and that, in times past, he had agreed with, even if he had not justified, some of the arbitrary measures which had been carried out against journals and journalists. Dr. Marshman, in the *Asiatic Journal*, wrote in defence of "the liberator," but admitted that Sir Charles might have approved the deportation of Mr. Buckingham, as some writers to the papers had said that he did. This drew a letter from the Governor-General to the Missionary, a pleasing epistle, in which he denies the charge, and playfully twists his champion for admitting it. He allows that he admired the bravery of John Adam in doing an unpopular thing unflinchingly, but he certainly thought the action ill-judged. The Act was passed in April, May, of 1835; on the 15th of September, in the same year, it came into operation. The people of Calcutta worthily recognised the greatness of the deed, and in honour of one good action did another, by building the public Library called the "Metcalfe Hall," and placing in it a bust of the man who made the expression of opinion in India quite free.

It was not alone in Calcutta that delight was manifested the freedom which had been given, but all over, India meetings were held, addresses were adopted, and congratulations poured in upon the acting Governor-General. It is worthy of remark that this great reform was won for India by Anglo-Indians, that it was not the result of agitation in England, but the out-come of stern, unflinching determination to express opinion by a few, and the enlightened views held by one whose life was spent in India. It was well that the various communities of the land hastened to express their gratitude for what had been done; for, as has been already remarked, against Sir Charles Metcalfe the anger of the Court of Directors was aroused. They

chose to ignore the splendid services which he had rendered them, conveniently forgot that they had recommended him to the imperial authorities for the Governor-Generalship, so that when the Governorship of Madras became vacant, and they themselves could have crowned the more than a generation of good and zealous toil by giving him the post, they passed him by. More than that : they brought great pressure to bear upon Lord Auckland, who took office as Governor-General, and ended the interregnum, to induce him to revoke the edict of Metcalfe, and again render the Press subject to a Censorship and to the other penalties which the ingenuity or malignity of bureaucracy had devised. But it was of no avail : the hand of the dial had been put on and there was no turning it back. The sequel has altogether justified the prescience of the great man who spoke, and the Indian Press was free. A great deal has been said by the defenders of the Court of Directors, notably by Mr. Thornton in his "History of the Indian Empire," about the fact that Sir Charles Metcalfe knew he was only occupying the office of Governor-General for a short period, and that, so far as was known at the time, a Tory was on his way out to take the supreme position. Consequently, so important an Act as one to sweep away the laws which Mr. Adam had used, and further, had buttressed, that they might be made stronger, ought not to have been brought forward at such a time. But, precisely the same thing occurred with regard to Mr. Adam's penal statutes, which were to be held sacred : he was acting as Governor-General when he took upon himself the extreme measure of deportation. Yet the historian who ascribes mean actions to Lord William Bentinck and interested motives to Sir Charles Metcalfe, does not blame the dragooning of the Tory official of ten or twelve years previously. The splendour of the deed that was done in 1835, however, is not dimmed by such aspersions. The annals of Indian administration contain the records of many great men ; but there are few greater in all the qualities that constitute highest and noblest manhood, by combining a high ideal of statesmanship with a heroic performance of duties, than Sir Charles Theophilus Metcalfe.

W. DIGBY.

### ART. III.—INDIAN NOTES.

IT has often afforded amusement to the public, and perhaps instruction, for some minds of a sombre tone to sound, from time to time, "Notes," mostly of alarm, on Indian subjects. The Note on the Political Situation in India, in Macmillan's *Magazine* for July, is one of these alarms, and it is both loud, long, and broad. "In all parts of the country," says the writer, "there is dissatisfaction, in many disaffection." Those dissatisfied are all grades of Government servants, European and native, civilians and soldiers. Missionaries also, for a reason somewhat inconsonant with their generally accepted character, help to swell the category. Mahratja Sindia's territory absorbs the principal and most undisguised section of the disaffected. Gwalior, his chief town, is graphically described, as "an island in the midst of a turbulent Mahratta sea." Our police system is radically "unsound, our garrisons are insufficient, our houses are scattered, "our public buildings are built on leasehold, our plighted word is a doubtful promissory note. In short, our internal administration is a failure, and our foreign policy hateful—

"Oh miserable change ; is this the man,  
That invincible Samson, far renowned,  
The dread of Israer's foes, who with a strength  
Equivalent to angels, walked their streets,  
None offering fight, who single combatant  
Duelled their armies ranked in proud array ?"

Of no country in the world does the political history present more markedly distinct eras than that of India. The successive waves of Aryan invasion from Central Asia drove the aboriginal tribes up to the table-lands, and settled over the richer soil of the plains. Distracted by internecine wars among its satraps, and enervated by the climate, the Aryan settlement (except in Rajputana) fell an easy prey to Afghan and Mughul, the latter to fall in turn before an obscure tribe of Western India. Both Hindu and Musalmán are striking examples of the development and decay of all such empires, formed by conquerors. First the occupation of the richer territories, followed by a gradual progress towards fixity of abode, and the construction of cities. A division into satrapies, internal commotions among provincial governors, and their contests with the reigning house, preliminary to disintegration of the empire, and its dissolution or annihilation by a foreign power ; invariably mark, to the last scene, the history of their course. The Mughul Empire was virtually at an end with the death of Aurangzeb. Already Sivaji

"the mountain rat," had extended the dominion of a tribe of shepherds in the mountains of Berar, from the western littoral of the peninsula to Orissa on the east, and from Agra in the north to the Carnatic on the south. Almost every part of Hindustan and Bengal was subsequently plundered. In 1748, the Mahrattas exacted the *chauth* from the Emperor Ahmad Shah. They had previously, in 1742, overrun Bengal with 80,000 cavalry, and carried off an immense booty. In the succeeding year the incursion was repeated. To be weakened or distracted was to be the prey of Mahratta free-booters. The Mahratta confederacy was no more than a precarious combination of plunderers, arising from the dissolution of all government, and the existence of universal anarchy. It was a military republic with a revenue drawn from the *chauth* and the *Mulk-ghiri*. A power of so sudden a growth and of such a character could not cohere; it contained no single element of permanency. It grew up almost side by side with our own, and fell assunder before our superior weight and sounder organization. The only principalities which have survived the decay of their contemporary Aryan dynasties, and the shock of Mughul and Mahratta, are those of Rajputana. This survival they owe mainly to the sterility of their soil, to the less enervating character of their climate, and to their own chivalry and independent pride. But the history of India, its powers and principalities, from 1707 to 1803, is a dull and monotonous catalogue of murder and devastation, followed by famine and disease. We inherited universal anarchy.

The above slight retrospective sketch is necessary to an appreciation of the political difficulties which have beset us, the power now dominant over Hindu and Musalmán, Mughul and Mahratta. We have tasked ourselves to re-create vigor and intelligence, out of the relics of nationalities, and the fragments of their civilization, science and literature. Our success has been small, but there can be no reasonable doubt that the first gradation has been gained. In our own territories at least, the people have increased in wealth. The jute trade of Bengal, and the cotton trade of Berar, may be cited among the many industries which have brought material prosperity to the doors of the smallest cultivator engaged therein. The known universal wealth of Central India and Madras, as yet undeveloped, must tend to enrich the country still more. It cannot be said, with reason, that the people have become poorer under our rule, and it cannot be denied that their condition, generally, has very materially improved. It seems puerile to have to point out that security of property cannot exist without stability of Government; and that thus the people have the strongest interest in the preservation of the existent. Consequent upon this increase in wealth there has been, and is, in spite of social

obstacles of great aggregate power, an increase in intelligence. Apart from the venerated sanctity of custom, one of the greatest of these obstacles is the almost utter dearth of any reciprocity of sentiment between the governors and the governed. The intellectual and moral supremacy of the former, resulting in a scientific policy, at variance, in some instances with native prejudices and lines of thought, and above the standard of the most advanced native minds, has widened the gulf. The native intellect is not yet vigorous enough to grasp, and not generous enough to appreciate, a policy at once sound, provident and liberal. This measure, it suspiciously argues, contains some deep recondite scheme, veiled under its fair professions. Can any, can the most superficial thinker, expect a race, foreign, mysterious and dominant, to be otherwise than unpopular under such conditions alone? And when to these are added religious and social customs so widely diverse, as to possess not the slightest point of approach, one cannot help suspecting that the foreigners do actually possess some great and recognised qualifications for popular rule. In fact, indeed, we are not more unpopular in India, than Britons are in Canada, among the French Canadians. In India we are disliked, but with no active resentment; we are misunderstood, but we are respected and feared. The growth of a full mutual understanding must inevitably be slow. But in every province of the empire a silent unseen power is at work, to the resultant action of which it would be difficult to assign direction, or limit. In every province the education of the people question has of late years been earnestly and warmly taken up. The results are, on the whole, encouraging; and with this infiltration of sound intelligence through the community, there will grow up a loyal acceptance of the administrative conclusions of the Paramount Power. Meantime let us watch and work on; shutting our ears to false prophets, and not confounding inevitable dislike with blood-thirsty disloyalty.

Disaffection is often asserted to exist, in fact too often and too openly to be wise. But no real cause is cited such as would explain the widely spread existence of such an attitude; and the assertion is mostly put forward as a conclusion reached without the premises being stated; or as a conclusion formed on insufficient evidence. The writer of "Political Notes" has laid himself open to this last charge. His opinions are formed, apparently, from observations made in and about Gwalior, the chief town of Sindia's territory, peopled very sparsely by Mahrattas. The *lushkur* or camp contains, of course, the army of the Prince, Mahrattas mostly as might be expected. But the Mahratta race are not by any means numerically large in

any part of either Sindia's or Holkar's dominions north of the Narbadda. Thus the simile of "an island in the midst of a turbulent Mahratta sea" is somewhat far-fetched. The more so, as the *lushkur* is on the S. W. only, and our own contingent on the N. W. In 1800 the condition of the Mahratta States was as bad as it could be. Offices and the collection of the revenue were farmed to the highest bidder. The administration was one of rapacity, corruption and instability. In 1835 little or no improvement was apparent. The Governments were then described as grinding military despotisms, protected from external enemies by the subsidised forces. The plunder of foreign states was impossible, so the Mahratta soldiery, true to its instincts, turned its talents to the plunder of its own merchants and husbandmen. In the midst of this "turbulent sea," lived the chief, in daily dread of mutiny and assassination. By a show of force, in the guise of his army, he maintained himself, and, perhaps, retained supremacy among the many clans besetting him. Within the last forty years has no change for the better taken place, and if so, to whom is the credit thereof due? Regarding our retention of the Fortress of Gwalior it must suffice to state, that no one who has read the record of our kaleidoscopic relations with the Sindia's, from 1803 to 1844, can question the policy of our action. It is no doubt unpleasant to meet with "haughty stares, open dislike, lowering brows, and muttering lips." But surely it is hasty generalisation to conclude the existence of universal disloyalty and treachery, among the thirty six millions of people, of all races, castes and creeds, inhabiting the Feudatory States; because the early risers of a city of 50,000 persons (say Mahrattas) omit to *salaam* and appear to be insolent. Was it not possible that the scowlers saw only in the European a member of the same race as that officering the adjacent contingent, by the force of whose presence the Mahratta soldiery and others ran riot among them.

It is stated that Sir Dinkur Rao has given up speaking English, because the policy of the British Government is unjust to his "country." This diastic resolve, (by no means Nestorian) somewhat out of proportion, in this prosaic age, to its basis, sounds like a Tory village politician of fifty years ago, refusing to drink the brew of a Winc distiller. "The people would rather have legal "decisions from an English Magistrate than from one of their own chiefs" is an assertion "laughed to scorn." The dogma, that natives prefer tribunals presided over by their own countrymen, has been generally received in proof that they obtain justice from their countrymen and not from us. But, identity of race apart, such is by no means the reason of their preference. A solution of the apparent enigma is contained in a conscientious answer to the question—Which courts do poor men prefer, and why? Again—

"rather have justice (*sic*) from a young Englishman fresh from college, than from chiefs like Vizianagram or Jeypore?"—sneeringly ask the people in these "Notes." But how came such a sneer? How many of the two hundred millions under our own administration ever heard of either of those chiefs? What do they know of their system of "justice," or whether they in person decide litigation, or by whom, or how? Two things are clear. There can be no appeal from an injustice done by either; and wherever, in our districts, there is one court presided over by a native and another by a European Magistrate, the man seeking justice against a real wrong betakes himself to the latter, without a sigh for the judicial systems of either Vizianagram or Jeypore. "Our police system is radically unsound." "Men not measures" is a salutary and reasonable rule of administration where the standards of education and morality are high; and when the importance of the measures sanctions the outlay. But in India the standard neither of education nor of morality is high, and therefore, it is unreasonable to expect the members of a force, drawn from the people, to develop a higher standard than their countrymen in the same condition of life. The only fair test of police work is the test of comparison. In the Lower Provinces there were, in the course of the year 1813, five hundred and five dacoities in which thirty-one persons were killed. In the year 1862 there were 71 dacoities in which 6 persons were killed. These figures carry their own moral.

Without categorically examining our position relative to the different Native States under our protection, it must suffice to say that imperial and not local interests must shape our policy. Our Feudatories should understand, and the sooner and more fully the better, that so long as their internal administration and their attitude and bearing towards ourselves are compatible with the conditions of their charters, and with good faith, they will be preserved intact. There is, perhaps, a small minority of thinkers who apprehend that a combination of our Feudatory vassals may succeed in disturbing the repose of the empire. To such I recommend the reply of a late civilian who, when asked by a native gentleman what he liked best in the country, replied, that of all things he preferred the small melon called *phoot* (disunion)!

It is unnecessary to continue. We are all agreed that the beneficent results of our rule might be more marked; that the interest on our outlay has been small. But that the country is seething with disaffection, that there is danger of murderous reprisals on our "isolated homes" in revenge of wrongs unwittingly inflicted by the State—is a picture hung in too dark a shadow, and with a deformity of outline, which thinking men will unanimously reject. We are slowly threading our way through

a dense and tangled scrub, with here and there a tree of majestic growth. If we stand still the deadly malaria will stifle us—if we go wrong we must be lost or dashed over the precipice. But with charity and truth, strength and good courage in our hearts, we hope at last to gain the fair land shining in our front. Meantime let us have no physicians who tell us that our entire organism is most dangerously affected, that they cannot detect the nature, or give the true diagnoses of our diseases, and that they are unable to prescribe any remedies for our cure.

J. E.

---

## ART. IV.—PILGRIM MEMORIES. (*Independent Section.*)

*Pilgrim Memories.* By J. S. Stuart Glennie.

**T**HIS is a somewhat remarkable book. The author is a Scotchman who has travelled far both physically and mentally, and who after beginning life as a Calvinist, has ended by finding even the attenuated creed of Mr. Buckle to be more than he can subscribe to.

The book is entitled *Pilgrim Memories, or Travel and Discussion in the birth-countries of Christianity* with the late Henry Thomas Buckle. The first of these titles is rather misleading, and induced an Edinburgh bookseller to think that the work was a publication of the Religious Tract Society and to recommend us to go to their office in search of a copy. There was not much of the pilgrimage about Mr. Glennie or Mr. Buckle; and if we could use the word in its primitive signification, "Miscreant," that is, "Misbeliever," *Memories* would be a fitter title for the book. It contains very little description of scenery, and the incidents of travel recorded are neither numerous nor romantic. The interest of the book is of another order, and lies chiefly in the discussions which were carried on between Mr. Buckle and the author, and which were often far removed from the countries through which they were passing. The book thus recalls to mind Boswell's *Tour to the Hebrides*, in which we have very little of descriptive and very much of Dr. Johnson's remarks. It also reminds us of the brilliant pages of *Eothen*, the plan of which was to give the subjective results of Eastern travel rather than to describe the country and its inhabitants. Here, however, the resemblance between *Pilgrim Memories* and *Eothen* terminates; and there is as little similarity between the thoughts of Mr. Kinglake and Mr. Glennie, as there is between the sparkling epigrammatic sentences of the one and the laboured and involved periods of the other. Mr. Glennie's book is, however, the abler and deeper of the two, and the one which inspires most respect for the author. *Eothen* is, if we may be allowed the anachronism, the work of a Saturday Reviewer to whom nothing is new or true, and who has no sympathy with his kind unless, perhaps, with that very small section of it which can boast of a patrician origin and an education at Eton. Almost the only enthusiastic passage which the book contains is a somewhat ludicrous endeavour to throw oneself back among the gods of Greece by conjuring up the not very sublime or elevating image of the Cyprian Aphrodite.

Mr. Glennie appears to have commenced his travels in the end of 1861, and it was on 9th January 1862 that he fell in with Mr.

Buckle at Syene on the Upper Nile. Mr. Buckle was then travelling in Egypt for the recovery of his health which had been impaired by over-work. Subsequent events showed that his nerves had been shattered by excessive literary labour almost beyond recovery, but he seems to have been ignorant of his danger and to have thought himself much better than he really was. It is melancholy to find him writing only eight months before his death, "I feel in better health and spirits than at any time during the last three years. Especially I am conscious of an immense increase of brain-power, grasping great problems with a firmness which at one time I feared had gone from me for ever. *I feel that there is yet much that I shall live to do.*" In a similar spirit he wrote in another letter, "I feel very joyous and altogether full of pugnacity, so that I wish some one would attack me, I mean speculatively. I have no desire for a practical combat." Being in such a frame of mind it is no wonder that Mr. Buckle invited Mr. Glennie to accompany him in a journey through Arabia and Syria. Nor need we be surprised that the latter gladly accepted the offer. For Mr. Glennie, too, was full of pugnacity and quite as ready to attack as Mr. Buckle was to be attacked—a perfervid Scot. Mr. Glennie had, in adopting heterodox opinions, become not merely indifferent to popular religion but violently antagonistic to it. It is true that, as regards Christianity, there was not much room for dispute between the pair, but Mr. Buckle professed Deism and a belief in a future state, while Mr. Glennie seems to have doubted both of these tenets; and in addition to these points of difference there was an inexhaustible field for discussion in Mr. Buckle's denial of the efficacy of moral causes and ascription of all progress to the influence of the intellect, and in his heresies about the Scottish nation. Whether the arrangement by which the two became fellow-travellers was likely to be beneficial to one in Mr. Buckle's feeble state of health, is a question which we would rather not discuss, certainly the *prima facie* view is that it was likely to be injurious. What Mr. Buckle seems to have especially required was freedom from excitement; and we think that it must have been rather trying to his strength to have had to fight his battles o'er again, and to contest the leading positions of his book with so pertinacious an opponent as Mr. Glennie proved himself to be. On the other hand we must remember that Mr. Buckle wished for an opponent, and that if Mr. Glennie had not made his appearance, he would probably have sought out some other antagonist. There is no doubt also that Mr. Buckle would have drooped in the absence of intellectual society, and that his premature death was mainly due to over-work in England. The physical fatigue also which he had to undergo in riding across the desert, &c., was greater than he could stand;

and unhappily it is the characteristic of a disease such as his to oppose itself to curative methods. For what he mainly suffered from was over-excitement of his nervous system ; but this very over-excitement prevented him from applying the proper remedy, that is, rest, and continually urged him, as Mr. Glennie has pointed out, to undertake tasks beyond his strength.\*

Leaving, however, the question of the physical results of Mr. Buckle's journey to the consideration of medical men, we proceed to our proper task of reviewing Mr. Glennie's book. Nearly all books of much value or purpose contain one or two leading ideas to which everything else is subordinated ; and though there have been many works of genius which have not conformed to this principle, yet the most of such have been written in pre-scientific ages and we suspect that they have been injured by the omission. The want of a distinct moral purpose is referred to by Dr. Johnson as the great blot in Shakespeare's plays ; and though it may be unfashionable to quote Dr. Johnson or to say anything in disparagement of Shakespeare, yet we humbly venture to think that the criticism is a just and valuable one.

The leading idea enforced in Mr. Glennie's work is a sufficiently remarkable one. It is that travel in Eastern countries, or as he prefers to call them, the birth-countries of Christianity, destroys a belief in the divine origin of the religion instead of giving it additional strength. In his view, then, a pilgrimage to Palestine has the same disenchanting effect on the modern Christian that a visit to Rome had on Martin Luther. There is a difference, however, in the character of the exorcisms. Luther was disenchanted by the spectacle of the moral corruption of Rome ; whereas what impresses the modern traveller in the East is the evidence of the extreme naturalness of the rise and progress of Christianity, so that he is compelled to feel that there is no knot in the matter which a God need be called in to untie. The first illustration which Mr. Glennie gives us of this result is in his meeting with a Mahomedan *fugir* or religious mendicant on the banks of the Nile. He found that Sheikh Selim, as he was called, was fully believed by many persons to have the power of working miracles, and that "a whole cycle of legends had already sprung up about

\* It is to be feared that Mr. Buckle was partly a victim to over-smoking. The American, whose reminiscences are published in the appendix to Mr. Glennie's book, gives an instance in which Mr. Buckle became suddenly ill in the midst of a smoking party ; and a Chess-correspondent of the *Illustrated London News*, gives it, as his opinion, that Mr.

Buckle diminished his vitality by over-smoking. On this head he tells an anecdote which he had from Mr. Buckle himself. A medical man, whom Mr. Buckle had consulted, asked him how many cigars he smoked daily. Mr. Buckle said eight, and then his doctor bluntly told him that he was driving to the devil in a carriage and eight.

him." The inference naturally drawn from this is, that "narratives of miracles are records, not of actual facts of nature, but of uncultured states of mind." And Mr. Glennie adds that "by the pressing home of such a fact as this, a mine is driven under the very foundations of the Christian faith."

The fact that Mr. Gleunie found a residence in the East inimical to a belief in Christianity, is personally interesting to ourselves, for we well remember that our first year in Bengal had a similar result. It is true that we came to our conclusions, in part at least, by a different road. What primarily influenced us was the spectacle of so many millions of men living without the knowledge of Christianity and apparently not much the worse for the want of it. We had been taught that Christianity was the very bond of society, and that where it was wanting, immorality became rampant and civilization fell to pieces. It was, therefore, a great shock to us when we observed so many millions of people living in ignorance of, or even in hostility to, Christianity, and yet not wholly given over to sin, and indeed acting in many important respects exactly like Christian communities. We found them eating and drinking and yet not gluttonous or wine-bibbing, marrying and giving in marriage, rearing their children, affectionate one towards another, cultivating the soil, practising their trades, observant of the laws, charitable to the poor, &c., and yet entirely without the possession of what we had been told was the one thing needful. Naturally, we think, we came to the conclusion that Christianity was less important than we had been told it was, and that it was possible to stand up and live without it. Further experience, however, of India helped us precisely in the way which has been indicated by Mr. Glennie, by showing us how natural were many of those precepts of deism which had been ascribed to a divine origin. When, for example, we first saw the Bengali ryots threshing out their corn by the aid of bullocks, and observed that the latter were unmuzzled, the first impression was that here was a corroboration of the Pentateuch. But further reflection led to a quite opposite conclusion for, if the practice was so natural as to be in use all over India, it was clear that there was no need for a divine precept in order to introduce it among the Jews.

At page 88, Mr. Glennie writes thus of the effect of the desert journey on him, "and as we journeyed, there went before us by day the Sheikh of our Arabs to lead us the way; and by night we were given light by a pillar of fire, which had its base in our camp-fires, and its capital in the zenith-stars. Nor did it seem likely that the Israelites had other guidance by day and other illumination by night. Nay, that men—not at home and following as in a dream where everything is possible, the

forty years wanderings of the Israelites, but following through actual deserts the very track of these wanderings, as (so far at least as Sinai) we so probably do that men should in these days, and here, literally and truly believe, that the Israelites had such other day-guidance and night-illumination as is affirmed in the Book of Exodus, seemed almost incredibly marvellous ; and that, not believing that the Israelites had such supernatural day-guidance and night-illumination, they should pretend to believe it, or refraining from not (?) distinctly saying that they do not believe it, should permit it to be understood that they do believe it, seemed—Oh, men otherwise truthful, manly and honourable, do permit this to be understood, and, as it should certainly seem, falsely understood ; and it would appear wiser, therefore, to endeavour to explain this to oneself by the complexity of human motives and character, than to give vent to expressions, however apparently justifiable, of indignation and contempt."

In a similar spirit he writes at page 90 "except to those utterly blinded by priestly education, or by selfish interests, few things, I believe, tend more to make such stories as those of Exodus utterly incredible than the mere natural desert-journey itself."

The first discussion which Mr. Glennie held with Mr. Buckle was on the subject of spiritualism, and it is, with one exception, the least satisfactory in the book. Indeed, when we opened the book at this place we almost gave up in despair, so difficult was it to understand the author's meaning. But we persevered, and we would strongly advise our readers to do the same. Mr. Glennie's style is generally somewhat heavy and lumbering ; though his descriptions are often graphic and his language, in one or two remarkable instances, rises into genuine eloquence. But he seems to be at his worst in this chapter on spiritualism, perhaps from the nature of the subject, and perhaps, too, because he is at the beginning of his task and has not burned out his smoke. At any rate we have here murkiness and confusion in abundance, and some of the paragraphs are almost chaotic in their want of form.

Passing over this discussion we come to an interesting description of Mr. Buckle's appearance as an Eastern traveller. "Mr. Buckle's Arabian costume was an old black dress-coat which, he himself said his valet would not have worn, a double-breasted cloth waistcoat, and winter trousers, all over thick flannel under-garments ; a wide-awake with an ample *puggery* crowned his spare stooping figure, covered his bald head, and shaded his unshaven face. And he further endeavoured to protect himself from the sun by a constant white umbrella and an occasional black burnous. I was much amused, says Mr. Longmore, with his costume. He still wore the old swallow-tailed black coat I had seen with him

previously ; but instead of the decorous white shirt which had always previously formed part of his dress, he now wore a flannel shirt of Rob Roy tartan, that is, black and red check. This garment he seemed very proud of, and told us it was one of a parcel he had ordered out from England, flannel shirts having been recommended to him as the only convenient wear in the desert. His measure had not been very accurately given, and the long gaudy sleeves of the shirt protruded ever so far over his wrists, and beyond those of his clerical-looking coat." Mr. Glennie remarks on the weakening effect of Mr. Buckle's attire owing to its warmth producing excessive perspiration, and observes that the most remarkable thing was the irony of it all. "No man spoke more than Mr. Buckle of the laws of health, believed himself to have so due a regard for them, or made more of the morality of the observance of such laws." Certainly Mr. Buckle was in himself a rather unfortunate illustration of the practice which he advocated in his review of Mill's *Essay on Liberty*. There Mr. Buckle insisted much on the propriety of allowing eccentricity full scope in the matter of dress and suggested that valuable knowledge may often be lost by casting ridicule on peculiarity of costume. It may be so, but after all it appears to us that there is some sense in the worship of Mrs. Grundy, who is often only another name for propriety, and that the wisest course in such matters is to do common things in the common way. Mr. Buckle had much better have meekly followed the practices of other travellers than have given the reins to his individualism and excited a separate costume for himself.

The two travellers commenced their desert journey at Suez and their first stage was to the Wells of Moses. From thence they proceeded to the mountains of the Sinai range or, as Mr. Glennie calls them, the Alps of the Tîr ; and here they had an interesting discussion on the subject of Mr. Buckle's treatment of Scottish history. Mr. Glennie, of course, took up the view that Mr. Buckle had treated the Scotch somewhat unfairly and had given a one-sided representation of their character. But we do not think that Mr. Glennie's mode of defending his countrymen was very successful. The line of argument he adopted was that all the Scotch were not zealots for their religion and that there was a profane section of the people, and, as Mr. Glennie characteristically expresses it, "a remnant which had not bowed the knee to Moloch." But we think it must be admitted that this remnant was very small in numbers, and that it was still weaker in point of influence. It was a remnant composed chiefly of sensual indifferentists who had not sufficient activity of mind or moral earnestness to be interested about religion or about anything else out of themselves, and it could, therefore, only effect the national mind as a

drag does the wheel of a carriage, that is, it could impede its progress but it could not alter its direction. All the pith and marrow of the Scottish character belonged to the Presbyterian majority ; and Mr. Buckle was, therefore, quite correct when he said that he had spoken in his writings of the mass of the people, and had nothing to do with the characterising of a "remnant." Mr. Buckle erred, we presume to think, not so much in neglecting the consideration of the sceptical remnant, as in not allowing sufficient merit to the fanatical majority. In the first place he exaggerated their fanaticism, or at least, made it too conspicuous by leaving the rest of their character in shadow. He quoted astounding passages from the serious writings of ministers and others—passages written when, as the Scotch expression has it, the authors had their sabbath-day faces on, and this he concluded then represented the normal state of their minds. But it is perilous to judge a man's character by what he says in moments of excitement. In spite of their rigid notions and the ascetic tone of their sermons, there has always been a strong sense of humour and love of fun among Scotch ministers. No class indeed is more famed for the number and excellence of its anecdotes, as Dean Ramsay's book sufficiently proves. John Knox himself was by no means altogether a gloomy man or one who had spiritualised away all his manhood. He loved a glass of claret, he married a young wife, and could not endure his mother-in-law's religious despondency, and his sympathies were wide enough to admit of his having a strong love for a rough soldier like Kircaldy of Grange.

On the whole, however, we think that Mr. Buckle's treatment of the Scotch contains much that is true and valuable, and that all Scotchmen, who are real lovers of their country, should feel indebted to him for the pains he has taken with the subject. Foreigners seldom speak ill of a country without good reason, and it is much better that we Scotchmen should listen to their attacks and endeavour to profit by them, than that we should shut our ears or indulge in useless ebullition of temper. We are sure it is much better that we should be censured by Buckle, albeit a little sharply, than that we should listen to such self-glorifications as used at least to characterise St Andrew's dinners. And the study of Buckle is also much more wholesome than the cant which clergymen occasionally indulge in, about Scotland being a highly favoured land, and about our being wanting in gratitude to God for our many blessings, and the dangers we are consequently in of having our candlestick removed. No doubt we should be proud of our country, but that is no reason why we should insult other countries by claiming to be more enlightened or more highly favoured by God than they, or why we should blink facts or deny that both our country and our people want the light and warmth of the South.

Further on in the discussion Mr. Glennie makes a better defence for his countrymen than that which we have already referred to. He now takes higher ground and, instead of urging the existence of a dissentient remnant, he points out with great truth that the excesses of the Covenanters were the logical result of their creed. His words on this subject are worth quoting, especially as Mr. Buckle admitted that there was some force in them. "I think," says Mr. Glennie, "that the Scottish Covenanters and those of like mind, cannot be truly represented and fairly judged, if it is not seen that their intolerance, asceticism and bigotry was the necessary consequence of their Christian creed, in men of logical mind and passionate elevation of feelings. Hence, however, their creed may be denounced as false and pernicious, the men themselves are, I think, to be treated with all the honour, and even sympathy, that is ever the due of clear thought, and self-sacrificing devotion. For it was the same passion of feeling and logic of thought which have given Scottish thinkers their place in the history of European philosophy, that making Scottish believers thorough-going in their Christian doctrine, gave them their place in the history of Christian fanaticism."

...            ...            ...            ...            ...

"And hence it is, that I think Covenanters, and those of like mind, should not be contemned as a mere monkish rabble or vilified as 'tyrants and torturers,' but rather honoured as noble, though pitied as tragically beguiled souls. But if passion and thorough-going logic—while these have been uninstructed by the facts of nature and of history, and confined within those Christian theories which have latterly shown themselves no less pernicious than false—have led to bigotry and intolerance; that same passion and logic, rightly instructed, will, one may hope, if Scotsmen still retain any distinctive natural character, make it impossible for them to be long-stayed in such a half-way house as English Broad Churchism with its fond sentimentalism, and foolish incoherencies, and will carry them on even to as forward a place, it may be, in the presently coming, as in that first stage of the modern Revolution called the Reformation."

It is natural enough after this outburst that Mr. Glennie should avow (page 221) that, as it was his fate to be brought up a Christian, he reckoned it a piece of good fortune that he was brought up in belief of the admirably logical system of Calvinism. We cannot say, however, that we agree with him. His remark is somewhat in the same spirit as Comte, when he congratulates France on having escaped "*la halte trompeuse*" of Protestantism, which, by the way, France did not do except by the abnormal process of the expatriation of many of her people. But we do not

see that there is any real ground for congratulation in either case, Broad Churchism and Protestantism may be only half-way houses, but surely if we have to make a toilsome and dangerous journey, it is better to commence at the half-way house than to have to undertake the whole journey. And hence we should think that if 'a child of the age' is going to make his progress to Positivism or to the Religion of Humanity, it is better that he should start as a Broad Churchman or a Unitarian than that he should do so as a Calvinist. Mr. Goldwin Smith well says, "Let us beware of revolutions" and surely the best way to avoid them is to slope the path from one stage of civilization to another, and such in effect is the work now being done by Broad Churchmen.

Great transitions, such as that from Calvinism to the Religion of Humanity, are apt to leave ugly scars and other marks of conflict, and, we think, we can see them in some passages of Mr. Glennie's book. The remembrance of Shorter Catechisms, of gloomy views of religion, and of unutterably wearisome Sundays, too often embitters the mind of the Scottish sceptic and prevents him from parting with his old faith without rancour, or with a tender regret for the loss of its associations.

It is a melancholy circumstance, we have often thought, that there is so little about the Scotch Churches or their services which can endear them to the young, or pleasantly entwine themselves with the recollections of our childhood. Even those Scotchmen who are most devotedly attached to their Church must, we think, admit that their love for it only began after they had grown up. Other countries have organs, peals of bells, ivy-mantled Church-portals, stained-glass windows, &c. In Scotland there is nothing for the most part but hideous churches and a bare and wearisome service.

The only other religion which is equally barren of ritual is Mahomedanism, as practised in Bengal, and we should fancy that Mahomedan boys and girls have little love for their faith. They probably, however, have not much active repugnance to it, for they are not obliged, we believe, to listen to long discourses or to fast.

The third chapter of Mr. Glennie's book is entitled the Mount of God, and is, to our thinking, the most eloquent and interesting in the whole volume. It is not a record of discussion, for Mr. Glennie felt that the place was too solemn for conversation. It was rather a place in which to commune with one's own heart and be still; for the travellers were now on Mount Sinai, and face to face with those peaks which seem even still to overshadow the world. "At the Mount of God the question of miracle is seen in its innermost core. Through the janglings about texts, and subtleties about that meant by them, one passes, not without something perhaps of the rudeness of contempt, to the essential

question : Is that testified to by miracle, itself miraculous ? For if a Law or a Faith testified to by presumed miracles, have nothing in its own nature miraculous ; have, the former nothing in its commandments, the latter nothing in its doctrines, different, not only in form, but in kind, from other systems of Law and of Faith ; then the incidental miracles must certainly be set down to that ' primitive culture ' which we know to be universally characterized by miraculous narratives." The author then proceeds to discuss this question and finds that there is nothing miraculous in the precepts of the decalogue or anything essentially different from what man has been found capable of discovering for himself. He is led, then, to consider the vast amount of evil in the world and its bearing on the existence and attributes of God. Finally he puts to himself the question :—Is the existence of an uninterfering personal God indeed credible ?

" As we put the question behold a dread spectre gradually rising from the shadowy plain beneath us, till suddenly it towers as high as the Mount of God itself, and the last rays of sunset illumine with a fiery glow the horror of its naked visage. For a moment we take in our hands the veiling fictions of optimism. But no ! We dare rather behold the dread spectre in its nakedness than cast upon it transparent lies which would produce but an intolerable sneer. And evil unveiled confronts the uninterfering personal God who overshadows us now on Horcb. About its feet in the great plain, and thronging in from every glen of Sinai are innumerable chorusses of blasphemy. Their voices are like to, but far more terrible, than the winds, the lightnings, and the thunders of the Descent of God. For this is the Insurrection of Man. Weird-like shrieks and wailings of ghostly hermits, saints, and martyrs who have found the Heaven that lured them from earth but mockery ; the future joy for which they abandoned present delight, a bitter cheat ; the heavenly love for which they endured the crucifixion of earthly love, but dust. Fierce lightnings of the Prometheus-song of the poets and prophets of justice ; the wrath, scorn, and defiance of Titanic revolt ; cries ringing with the sublime accents of the willing self-sacrifice of that Divine Love which takes on itself the suffering of others, in order to assure for others the downfall of throned injustice. Continuous thunders of nations, of outcasts, felons, and unfortunates, wretches born or fated to misery, struggling for existence with famine and disease, and when successful, victorious only through infamy ; of some the voices loud in echoed laughter-peals of blasphemy ; the greater part, numbers without number, lifting the sad, hoarse voices of soulless slaves, with a pathetic patience, nay with some still ever thankfulness—more intolerable surely in its bitter though unconscious irony of blasphemy—more intolerable, surely, than

aught else, to their Creator—lifting the sad, hoarse voices of soulless slaves but in one tremendous ever-repeated burden,—like, save in the rolling depth of its thunders, to that with which the gladiators of the Amphitheatre greeted, ere they died, the divinity of a Caesar, '*Morituri te salutant.*'

Leaving these thoughts the author consoles himself with the prospect of the New Ideal (Religion of Humanity ?) which shall one day give guidance, joy, and beauty to life ; and which will accord with the highest results of science and the most general conception of law.

From Mount Sinai the travellers proceeded on to the Gulf of Akaba, and on the way they had an interesting discussion on the subject of style. It is amusing to find each of the disputants standing up for what he was conscious was his own strong point. Mr. Buckle's style is excellent, and hence we find that he "set everything on style, attached the greatest importance to its cultivation ; and declared that it so influenced men that that alone would preserve one's fame" Mr. Glennie on the other hand being conscious that he himself was addicted to dreamy meditation, and that he had somewhat neglected the art of expression, insisted on the superiority of ideas to style, and drew a parallel between the brooding student and the working or literary one to the advantage of the former. Mr. Buckle's remarks on this subject are worth quoting. "He liked thinking, he said, but seldom gave himself up to it. He read in order that he might think, rather than thought in order that he might read, and advised me to do the same." Further on Mr. Buckle expatiated on the masterly qualities of Macaulay's style, and the "jargon" as he called it, of Carlyle. Perhaps this last view is likely to provoke less criticism at the present time than it would have done some years ago. We suspect that Carlyle's style like all other mannerisms has had its day ; and that many who in their youth greatly admired it and founded themselves upon it, are now willing to admit that Carlyle's mode of writing is essentially un-English, that it is jerky and affected, and that his thoughts when disinterred from their mountains of verbiage and extravagance, are after all not unfrequently commonplace or incorrect. There is indeed something ironical in Carlyle's present position in the world of letters. No one has denounced clothes more than he, or insisted more strongly on the duty of exhibiting the naked truth, and yet no one has been more indebted than he to the wrappings of mysteriously-sounding phrases. With these he has veiled his thoughts and made them for a time look vast and deep ; but they have been inevitably made to look smaller by the strong sun-beams of advancing truth and shown to be after all, but "two-forked radishes with heads fantastically carved."

Mr. Glennie is possessed with the idea that he has discovered a new law of history, and he has devoted a chapter, entitled "The Shore of the Sea of Coral," to an exposition of his views. This is to us the most unintelligible part of the book; and it is a consolation to find that the exposition puzzled Mr. Buckle, who is candidly introduced as saying "I do not follow you, I confess." Mr. Glennie's supposed discovery relates to a development of the principle of the conservation of energy and a new conception of causation. The result of his meditations has been, he says "The definition of the conception of law or of the scientific conception of causation, as the conception, not merely of uniformity of sequence, but also of mutuality of co-existence or mutual determination." Whereon Mr. Buckle very naturally observes "You must expect to have this received with a good deal of questioning." A little further on Mr. Glennie defines causation as a differential relation between co-existent things. We are not metaphysical enough to be able to do justice to Mr. Glennie's views, but as far as we understand them, they do not appear to contain anything which is really novel, and this also appears to have been Mr. Buckle's opinion. Indeed, it seems to us, that all Mr. Glennie has done, has been to enunciate the principle of the conservation of energy in new and not very intelligible language. However, it is but fair to state that Mr. Glennie appears to have reserved the full exposition of his views for another book which we have not seen, and which is entitled "In the Morning-land, or the Law of the Modern Revolution."

Mr. Glennie is of opinion that the principle of the conservation of energy, as enunciated by him, will effectually shut the mouths of "miracle arguers," as he styles them, by showing that the cause of all phenomena whatever, must be found in the system of things and not in any personal agents outside of that system. But we cannot think that such reasonings will ever have weight with those who refuse to be convinced by the ordinary arguments against miracles. The strongest argument against belief in miracles seems to be, that there is no need to believe them, inasmuch as that there is nothing extraordinary or miraculous in the religion which they are supposed to avouch. If the doctrines of Christianity and its success can be explained on natural principles, then its miracles may certainly, as Mr. Glennie himself has remarked, be set down to "the primitive culture which is universally characterised by miraculous narratives." And we observe that Mr. Matthew Arnold grounds his disbelief of miracles on this argument of "primitive culture," and declares that it is lost labour to be arguing for or against them.

The last discussion which the travellers held took place on "the Battle-field of Armageddon;" and, as if there had been

something in the influence of the place, it was the only one in which the disputants had something like a quarrel. Mr. Glennie anticipates that the progress of the Modern Revolution will be marked by sanguinary battles, and that possibly the plain of Armageddon may be the scene of the final struggle. We trust, however, that if any battle ever takes place again in Armageddon, it will be such a bloodless one as that waged between Messrs. Buckle and Glennie. The travellers traversed the Holy Land together and finally parted company at Damascus. There are some graphic descriptions of scenery in the part entitled Lebanon, and some interesting remarks on the non-fulfilment of prophecy as regards Tyre; but we think we have now said enough about Pilgrim Memories. It contains many interesting traits of Mr. Buckle's character, though some things which were mentioned in the notice published by Mr. Glennie shortly after his friend's death, have been wisely omitted from this book. The impression produced is not altogether favourable to Mr. Buckle, and shows that he was by no means exempt from the peculiarities of a solitary student. We learn that music was to him but noise, that he had a contempt for poets, except two or three, that he considered vice to be better than ignorance, and that he was a somewhat effeminate traveller. On the other hand the passion with which he clung to a belief in immortality testifies to the strength of his affections; and his undertaking the troublesome charge of two boys on a tour in the East, appears to prove a fondness for children. He died at Damascus on the 29th May 1862, and was buried in the Protestant cemetery there, thus adding one other to the many interesting associations connected with the most ancient city of the world.

H. BEVERIDGE B.C.S.

---

## ART. V.—TRANSPORTATION FOR LIFE.

“CERTAINLY the politic and artificial nourishing and entertaining of hopes, and carrying men from hopes to hopes, is one of the best antidotes against the poison of discontentments; and it is a certain sign of a wise government and proceeding when it can hold men’s hearts by hopes when it cannot by satisfaction, and when it can handle things in such manner as no evil shall appear so peremptory but that it hath some outlet of hope.”

In this profound axiom of Bacon’s there lies hid, it may be affirmed, though it be at so great a depth as rarely to obtrude itself upon our notice, the main axis upon which our entire penal system now both rests and revolves. Hope, which “springs eternal in the human breast,” has ever been a more powerful agent and motive power than fear, though its influence had, perhaps, been but imperfectly recognized and availed of in punitive discipline until public attention was forcibly drawn to the disgraceful state of our English prisons, about a century since, by the exertions and disclosures of Howard and others. Experience, which has uniformly and consistently demonstrated that a blank and hopeless despair can but tend to generate and foster evil resolutions and courses, has proved that it is to hope alone that we must turn would we seek to examine the mainspring and source of all permanent reinforcement and reformation with our criminal classes.

On the terrible sufferings formerly incurred in our jails, those “cemeteries of pain,” as they have been termed, space will not permit that we should dwell, the subject being perhaps, moreover, somewhat beyond the limits and scope of this present article; but some conception may be attained both of the change which has come over public opinion, and of its advance to the more enlightened views of the present day upon the causes and treatment of crime, when it is stated that scarcely a century has elapsed since our laws showed the enactment of a death penalty to be still in force for no less than 200 different offences, whilst men were hung for the theft of a pair of shoes, of a skein of thread, or for the crime of arson, equally with the most cruel and brutal murderers. It was only, in fact, so recently as the year 1841, that the punishment of transportation for life was by law substituted for the penalty of death in cases of rape, forgery and embezzlement, which had previously been capital offences. The English Government having in the session of that year introduced and carried a bill upon the subject, in modification of that “for the

abolition of capital punishment in certain cases," introduced by Mr. Fitzroy Kelly.

It may fairly be contended that the march of enlightenment, advancing with the rapid spread of education during the past few years, has alone sanctioned and permitted the entertainment and expression of views in regard to both the causes and treatment of crime, which have allowed the accord of due weight and consideration to the disturbing influences and action of moral evil upon the intelligences of mankind, or that Equity, which has been fitly termed "the right witness that considereth all the particular circumstances of the deed, the which also is tempered with the sweetness of Mercy," has been able to raise her voice to press her claims with any fair meed of success. It is not that the subject of crime and criminals has not been fairly and fully considered by the Legislature from time to time; for, as pointed out by the writer of a recent article in one of the Magazines, since the days of the Plantagenets upwards of 14,000 Acts of Parliament have been passed for penal purposes alone. But the difficulties requiring to be contended with are great, the interests involved are vast, the awakening to more enlightened views is so recent, the horror of crime so deeply rooted a sentiment, that the advance is necessarily gradual, and it is felt that, as real progress requires to base its foundations upon long protracted tests and trials, all tentative and experimental action should be cautiously avoided, lest it should prove that in steering clear of Scylla, we founder upon Charybdis.

It is still not infrequently assumed that men, capable of the commission of crime (more particularly of crimes of passion) must necessarily be of essentially lower and more brutal natures than those by whom they are surrounded, and that they are in consequence so little sensitive to the moral distress which incarceration in a jail inflicts on men of higher organizations, that we are wholly wrong when we attempt to calculate the deterrent effects of punishment upon them by any consideration of what would be our own sufferings under similar given circumstances. Few who have given earnest attention to the subject, however, but will affirm that no error could be greater or more fatal to all progress in dealing with these matters, than that which would classify all criminals alike in one universal category of men whose moral natures have sunk so low as to be insusceptible of reclamation or of mental reinforcement.

"Export the criminals and paupers" \* advises a correspondent

---

\* The annual return of pauperism persons in receipt of relief from the in England, on New Years Day, rates.  
1875, shows no less than 817,822 In-door paupers ... 155,655.

of one of the papers of the day, writing under the stimulus of the recent discovery of a heinous crime. "Export the criminals and paupers to an inaccessible island † and in three generations they would be nearly extinct, and the remnant would have sunk to the level of Australian savages; while at home the breed would hardly be renewed. For a race of this sort, the whip and the cat are fitting and effectual punishments, perhaps the only punishment that can be said to be really fitting and effectual, and no sentiment of pity or of weakness for them mingles in our objections, &c."

The award of punishment by imprisonment or restriction of personal liberty, to be worthy of the name in its present acceptation, however, implies in its infliction, a dual and far different signification. First, in that it offers a deterrent example of retributive suffering imposed on the offender and exacted by the law for an infraction of its provisions (enacted for the mutual protection of society); and secondly, that it ensures a probationary restraint, imposed primarily for the benefit of the community, but also for that of the offender himself, and which will admit of the latter's mental rehabilitation and reinforcement justifying his eventual return (purged of his fault) to the society from which his crime had necessitated the ordeal of his temporary banishment—

Our greatness will appear then most conspicuous, teaches Milton:—

When great things of small,  
Useful or hurtful, prosperous or adverse,  
We can create : and in what place soe'er  
Thrive under evil, and work ease out of pain,  
Through labour and endurance.

If then we so contrive our punitive discipline as to either ignore or allow no scope for the principles and hopes of explanation, and refuse to consider the powerful influences to regeneration incited by hope, shall we not be wilfully putting from us a means ready to our hand, at once the most cogent factor which could be brought to bear upon those whom we desire to influence. *Cor ne edito*—“Eat not the heart,” urges the parable of Pythagoras, and setting aside the revolt of all natures † against the petty vexations and minute oppressions inseparable to prison rule, which chafe and mortify even the least sensitive natures, there can be no doubt but that to doom a criminal “to feed on

Out-door " ... 662,167  
This would give 1 in 28, or 3·6 per  
cent. on the entire population accord-  
ing to the census of 1·71.

have been accepted in its integrity in this disposal of our poverty-stricken and criminal classes by this writer.

and criminal classes by this writer. ¶ The number of punishments for petty prison offences in convict prisons in England alone in 1872, was 25,613 and in 1873, was 21,865.

ashes" which is the inevitable sequence and result of the elimination of all hope, is but to prostrate and relegate him to a reckless despair. Whilst to afford him the opportunity and encouragement of earning, through steadily progressive stages of labour and trial, the means not only of mitigating the severity, but the *duration* of his punishment, is to work upon and stimulate the strongest influences of moral amendment of which he is susceptible. In his address to the International Penitentiary Congress of 1872, Lord Carnarvon, than whom there is, perhaps, no more earnest or devoted advocate of penal reforms, strongly presses this point and urges, that all systems of penal discipline should provide for, first, real and unquestionable severity of punishment both in amount and kind, and secondly, reasonable opportunity of moral reformation, that to come short of the first is to come short of justice to society in its first and simplest conditions, whilst to fail in the latter is to withhold from the prisoner that which is due to him whatever may be the extent of his guilt. So far as can be foreseen, the interests of the public will long continue to necessitate severity of punishment and the infliction of the penalty of personal restraint above all others, as a means both of effectual correction and of inducing reformation and reclamation of the offender.

The attention which has latterly been devoted to the study of the general laws of the alliance of mind and body, has elicited much important evidence which, but tends to confirm the theories which have hitherto from time to time been somewhat hesitatingly advanced, but which are now rapidly gaining ground, in regard to the direct connection of crime with physical disturbances of the brain-matter and temporary derangement of the mental faculties and equipoise. And, although it may be that a tendency has, perhaps, been developed in its train to generalise too hastily from such facts, yet ascertained, as are based upon reliable data, the consideration of the doctrine of the irresponsibility of a temporarily disturbed intellect for criminal acts is forcing itself upon the public mind and attention, and will unquestionably, largely influence future legislation upon the subject of heinous crime. Trenching as it does so narrowly upon questions of public safety, the unhesitating general acceptance of the doctrine, "that a single insane delusion should be considered sufficient to destroy criminal responsibility, even for acts which the delusion did not prompt, and that it should confer upon its subject exemption from punishment, strictly so-called, although leaving him liable to confinement for his own good or the safety of others," cannot be at once looked for. That there is a growing opinion unfavorable to the extinction of life, as a mode of punishment, our penal statutes and the yearly decreasing number of

capital punishments sufficiently attest ; whilst on the other hand a life restraint, although it still finds place in the sentence of the judge, has practically ceased to be given effect to amongst all more civilized communities. The rapid and comparatively recent modifications of the English laws upon the subject of transportation have been most remarkable. In the year 1840, the complete abolition of sentences of transportation was strongly pressed upon the English Government of the day by Sir W. Molesworth in the Commons, and the Archbishop of Dublin in the Lords and, in fact so strong was the pressure brought to bear, that the point was conceded by the Government except as regarded Western Australia. In 1853 an act to substitute, in certain cases, other punishments in lieu of transportation, was brought in by Lord Chancellor Cranworth during the Aberdeen Ministry, and the important modifications of penal servitude, with remissions under Tickets of Leave, were first introduced. Again in 1857, still further amendments were effected, when Sir George Grey, then Home Secretary, basing his recommendations upon the report of a Committee of the House of Commons, carried a measure which, while effecting considerable important changes, maintained, and finally established beyond revocation, the practice of granting mitigation of sentences as a reward for good conduct, whilst restricting the range of their remission. The discharges, however, were rendered, generally speaking, unconditional.\* To the further enactments of 1864 (the Penal Servitude Act) the result of the labors of the Penal Servitude Commission, to the (Prisons) Act of 1865, the result of the House of Lords Committee on Prison Discipline, to the Habitual Criminals Act of 1869 (the result of the cessation of transportation) and to the Prevention of Crime Act of 1871, it is not necessary further to refer, than for the purpose of indicating the various progressive phases through which public opinion may be inferred to have passed implied in the consideration, adoption and sanction of these measures.

The leading principles so long persistently and ably advocated by Sir Walter Crofton for our great penal system, have at length been fully recognized, not only in England and the United States of America, but by most Continental nations, and it is found that successive stages of penal labour leading up to a final discharge on Ticket-of-Leave, or otherwise, guarded in some cases by subsequent police supervision for fixed periods is, of all others, the system which experience now commends to universal adoption. Political and other considerations may occasionally intervene to preclude the acceptance, in its integrity, of the scheme, but it is at length realized and admitted that the most injudicious

\* For terms of licences now granted 16 and 17 Vic. c. 99 s. 9, and 27 and to English convicts see Statutes, 28 Vic. c. 47 s. 4.

course which can be pursued is that which, whilst it deprives the criminal of all hope, leaves him a prey to the fever and ever present discontentment of despair. *Dolendi modus timendi non item.* As has been so forcibly argued by Thomas Carlyle "Despotism is essential in most enterprises, but make your despotism *Just.* Rigorous as destiny; but just too as destiny and its laws."

Of the various countries which have accepted the principles of conditional pardon or remission of sentences, the following details of the courses adopted for giving effect to these views may prove not uninteresting. They are gathered from the voluminous report of the International Penitentiary Congress, which met in London some three years since.

In Germany, it would seem, that two courses are open to a convict, and the duration of the term of his original punishment may be curtailed either by an order from the Ministry of Justice when  $\frac{3}{4}$  of the sentence has been accomplished with good conduct; or, by the clemency of the Emperor, a free pardon may be obtained upon official representation and petition on the part of the Governors of prisons. In the former case a minimum of one year's punishment is, however, prescribed. In Italy the formation of agricultural penal colonies on the islands of Pianosa and Gorgona has admitted of trial being accorded to a system which assimilates transportation. Prisoners who have attained to the highest class, through persistent good conduct, are recommended to mercy, and eventually released under certain conditions. In Sweden life prisoners are ordinarily released after ten years incarceration. There is no statutory abridgment of the term of confinement, but Royal pardons are ordinarily granted by the King after this term. In Norway the latter course is also followed. In the United States of America, the "Commutation Laws" allow of sentences being abridged for good behaviour during incarceration. In France prisoners placed on the list of preservation may, under an Ordinance of February 1818, be restored by pardon to free life, one-half the term of servitude only being ordinarily exacted. Certain exceptions in the case of political prisoners whose return to society might be attended with danger to the public safety are, however, enforced. In Belgium the administrative boards are permitted to recommend to the Minister of Justice cases deserving of remission, and the Royal clemency is then extended to them. There is, however, no fixed term of detention. In Austria a large number of prisoners who have undergone the greater portion of their term of incarceration are annually recommended to, and pardoned by the Emperor, whilst in the Netherlands, as in Germany, two courses are possible under a Royal decree of 1856: the one

an application direct to the King for pardon, the other preferred through the administrative commissions of central prisons, for pardons as well as for remissions of sentence. In Switzerland the legislative authority (Great Council) reserves to itself the right of pardoning, whilst in Russia, it would appear, that though the principle is admitted and is not without precedent in its enforcement, no rules have been yet prescribed or framed. In England one-fourth of the whole period may be commuted after a deduction of nine months passed in solitary confinement. In fact the remission of sentences earned by industry and good conduct and the methods of conditional liberation may be said to have now become an integral portion of the penal system in force throughout the civilized world.

"It is quite evident," urges Sir Walter Crofton, "that conditional liberty and registration are the only means of obtaining reliable statistics of criminals, and thereby testing the value of our prison training. It protects society, for the criminal who consorts with bad companions and shows he meditates criminal courses, is at once re-consigned to the prison from which he was liberated at too early a period. It surrounds the commission of crime with obstructions so formidable as to break up habitual offenders."

In India, in the Penal Settlement of Port Blair in the Andaman Islands, it has, however, been hitherto considered inexpedient to follow the course elsewhere adopted in the case of prisoners sentenced to transportation for life; and it was only in July of the year 1874, that a resolution was at length passed by the Indian Government to the effect, that the hope of eventual pardon should be held out to life convicts, who by a sustained course of good conduct in transportation might have earned a claim to the indulgence, either by conspicuous gallantry or devotion in the service of Government, or upon the completion of twenty years imprisonment (on the recommendation of the Superintendent). Practical effect has not yet, however, been given to the resolution, although it is believed that arrangements are in progress, in that view. Two stipulations only are attached to the latter of the two conditions, the first having reference to the convict having borne an uniformly good character in transportation, the second being a proviso that the return to his country of the criminal so released, shall not be dangerous to society or to public order. On the grounds of humanity, of political expediency, and in the interests and welfare of the settlement,\* no more politic decision could have been arrived at; and it would be matter of grave apprehension and regret were the fulfilment of the hopes thus raised, of

\* Upwards of 20,000 convicts have been received in the Andaman Islands since the second opening of Port Blair as a Penal Settlement in the year 1858.

the expectations thus excited, in any way marred or unduly delayed in their fulfilment from causes within control. With natives of India the love of home is simply ineradicable and undying; and no inducements or advantages that could be offered, would compensate for or equal, the boon of freedom with a return to their homes (even at the expiration of twenty years of toil and labor) thus held out to them.

Speaking of English criminals, Lord Carnarvon has given expression to an opinion which is deserving of thoughtful consideration in regard to this subject:—"The adequacy of punishment," he urges, "is primarily secured in the terms of the judge's sentence by hard labour; but it must not be forgotten that hard labour is largely supplemented by the separation of prisoners, by the restraint, the regularity of hours and occupations, the compulsory cleanliness, the enforced abstinence from drink and excess, and the usual animal tastes, and perhaps, most of all, by that separation and seclusion, which are utterly foreign to the life of the ordinary criminal." And much of this is applicable in no measured degree to our Indian convicts. If to this, be added the banishment across the seas involved in a sentence of transportation, the infrequency of communication with families and relatives, the loss of any property which may have been held (and which invariably passes to other hands), the enforced intermingling of castes\*—and in the case of death, cremation or burial at the hands of strangers, in a strange land, some conception may be gained of the tenacious retention of the hope of ultimate return to the land of his birth which with transported Indian prisoners never dies. Thrilling narratives might be adduced of the risks which have often been incurred in attempted escapes, where life itself seemed scarcely worth the perils and privations willingly and patiently endured by land or sea, in impenetrable jungles surrounded by hostile savages, or cast without food or water upon the trackless ocean; but no words could adequately convey the intense desire and passionate longing for home which animates the native mind. Thither, though almost certain of ensuring his re-apprehension, his footsteps will lead him again and again

---

* The number of convicts on the 1st January 1876 stood at 8,295, but this number will now rapidly increase owing to the recent orders of Government to re-commence the transportation of term convicts which had been abandoned for some years.	From Burnah ... ...	83
From all parts of British India 8,093	" Hyderabad assigned districts ... ...	167
Convicts are received from Bengal, Bombay, Madras, Oudh, the Central Provinces, Punjab, North-West, Assam, &c., and the confusion of caste and dialects can be better imagined than described.		
" Straits of Malacca ... 10		
" Ceylon ... ... 32		

with a power it seems futile to him to attempt to resist. Tradition, associations and affection, all combine to attach him irresistibly to the soil. If re-arrested it is but *kismet*, fate, or misfortune. He knows the penalty, nor does he shrink from it. Men, as has with truth often been urged, are powerfully actuated and influenced by the wants and circumstances of the moment, and things, which in a state of personal freedom are of small account, become in jails of the highest consequence and moment, and of this fact we should never lose sight in matters of penal discipline. Having then, thus ready to our hand an influence of this magnitude and power for controlling the better influences of those with whom we have to deal, it cannot but seem, that the justification which would warrant our abstaining from its judicious application should be strong indeed.

"If you would work any man," argues Bacon, "you must either know his nature and fashions and so lead him; or his ends and so persuade him, or his weakness and disadvantages and so awe him, or those that have interest in him and so govern him," and the advice certainly commends itself to the judgment. We have in this love of home the strongest motive power which can be brought to bear; and its extensive incitement would no doubt prove of the utmost value as a disciplinary aid. The state of craving for anything which is withheld is said, moreover, to be an internal conflict lowering the general vitality. In his excellent little work 'Mind and Body,'\* Bain in considering the theory of punishment offers some remarks upon the physical theory of pleasure and pain in its direct bearing on punishment and prison discipline, which are worthy of attentive consideration in this view. He contends that if the craving dies away after a time, the depression ceases, whilst the punishment it involves necessarily ceases with it, and argues that in whatever cases confinement (by its irksomeness, deprivations or otherwise,) operates as a serious punishment, the deterioration of the criminal is almost certain. On the extenton of the application of these principles space will not admit, however, that we should dwell. To their practical value and truth those who have acquired experience of prison discipline will bear the warmest testimony.

The theory advanced by Buckle in his uncompleted *History of English Civilization*, that in every population, under given circumstances, there will be an unvarying proportion and average of crime, certainly receives confirmation as regards India from the annual transpoataion returns of our Indian Tasmania† if allowance be made in the fluctuations shown for the cessation

\* *Mind and Body*. The theories of their relation by Alex. Bain, L.L.D., King & Son, London. 1874.

† The number of convicts received at Port Blair in each year has been as follows.—

of the deportation of term convicts and other causes which have influenced these statements in no inconsiderable degree ; and we may, therefore, unhesitatingly assume that in the absence of important modifications of the system which has hitherto been pursued, the evils to which we have referred will be more likely to be aggravated than to steadily diminish as the improvement of our police system, and its more extended application in India adds annually to the seething mass of human frailty and crime with which our courts are already called upon to deal.

In his predictions of the future of the human race the Archangel Michael is made by Milton<sup>†</sup> to take anything but a sanguine view of the cessation of the contest between Sin and Law—

Doubt not but that sin  
Will reign among them, as of thee begot ;  
And, therefore, was law given them, to evince  
Their natural depravity, by stirring up  
Sin against law to fight

and whatever may be the historic value which is in the present century attached to the traditions of the introduction of sin to the earth as the result and sequence " of man's first disobedience and the fruit of that forbidden tree, whose mortal taste brought death into the world, and all our woe with loss of Eden," there are few who will refuse to admit (warned by the teachings of cumulative experience in the past) that the distant horizon of the future, so far as our limited range of sight will permit its examination,

1858	...	1,949
1859	...	1,213
1860	...	733
1861	...	831
1862	...	1,053
1863	...	1,731
1864	...	965
1865	...	2,235
1866	...	2,190
1867	...	1,129
1868	...	659
1869	...	685
1870	...	442
1871	...	720
1872	...	651
1873	...	698
1874	...	863
1875	...	1,016
1876, Jan.	127	

During these years  
the transportation  
of term convicts has  
been in abeyance, it  
was resumed in the  
latter part of the  
year 1875, only.

The increase of heinous crime in the settlement during the years which have continued to deprive it of the admixture of term convicts (released from year to year) has been singularly marked, and has

necessarily left a large residue of criminals to be dealt with, who are men destitute of all hope of ultimate release save that afforded by the Government promise to which reference has been made. The practical effect of the releases of life prisoners after 20 years would be to transfer the restraining influences for good hitherto exercised by a leaven of term men to the whole body of the prisoners in their conversion from life to term prisoners, i. e., to men with reasonable hope and prospect of release after unexceptional good conduct for 20 years.

Further transportation of term men save in exceptional cases could probably thus be obviated and no inconsiderable saving of the costly burden of the Settlement to the State would ensue.

<sup>†</sup> *Paradise Lost*, Book xii. Line 285 et seq.

affords no indication of the ultimate triumph of law in the extirmination of crime.

"Law can discover sin, but not remove  
Save by shadowy expiations weak."

In his interesting and able work, *A Short History of the English People*, Green has traced, in an excellent sketch, the gradual growth of the present system of administration of the laws from the earliest days, when both order and law rested in each little group of English people upon the blood-bond which knit together its families, down to the present elaborate judicial provisions. He shows how from the recognition of the importance and value of this family bond, as a means of restraining the wrong-doer by forces which the tribe as a whole did not yet possess, sprang the first conceptions and ruder forms of English justice. The institution of the "blood-wite" (or money compensation) for personal wrong paid first by the offender, but later, in the case of life and limb, imposed upon and paid by the family or house of the wrong-doer to the family or house of the person wronged, mark important advances upon the primitive system under which justice had to spring from personal action, and every freeman was his own avenger, and show how the growing sense of public justice, even in the earliest phases of English society, endeavoured to modify and restrict the right of self-defence. In the safe guards with which the administration of justice is now surrounded, in the more enlightened recognition of the real aims and object of our punishments, in the decreased severity of our penal statutes, and in our treatment of our criminals during their incarceration, how vast have been the changes effected even during the past century.

It is the boast and glory of England that she has through a long series of years maintained and preserved unsullied the proud traditions of the purity and impartiality of her tribunals; that the distinguished office of her judges has ever been conferred but upon men eminent for learning, for impartiality for discernment, having "the intuitive decision of a bright and thorough-edged intellect, to part error from crime"—men before whom fallacies and sophistries are alike refuted or vanish "like streaks of morning cloud."

"I stand" pleaded Mr. (now Lord Chief Justice) Cockburn in a memorable trial:—"I stand, in a British Court, where Justice, with Mercy for her handmaid, sits enthroned on the noblest of

---

\* Defence of McNaughten in the assassination of Mr. Drummond, Private Secretary to Sir Robert Peel. The prisoner was found to be insane. The trial attracted special public and party interest, Sir Robert Peel having in debate charged Mr. Cobden with a design to hold him up personally as a mark for the pistol of an assassin.

her altars, dispelling by the brightness of her presence the clouds which occasionally gather over human intelligence, and aweing into silence by the holiness of her eternal majesty, the angry passions which sometimes intrude beyond the threshold of her sanctuary, and force their way even to the very steps of her throne."

The most elevated sentiments of which humanity is capable have, perhaps, most often found their expression from the judicial bench, whilst on the other hand there can be but little doubt that the entire trust and confidence reposed in them by the public has in no small degree contributed the means of the elevation of the judges to the height of their sacred duties. The intelligent observer has but to take some crucial case in which local public feeling has been intensely aroused and excited and to watch its progress through the courts to realize how fully this absolute confidence is merited by the result. Issues of fact of a difficulty apparently and complexity baffling all ordinary untrained judgment; irreconcilable discrepancies of testimony of so contradictory a character as to appear incapable of consistent adjustment, and which would result but in abortive proceedings if left to the bewildered disentanglement of an embarrassed and perplexed jury, alike find a calm and practical solution when reduced by the clear perceptive intellect of the judge to precise analysis and divested of all the foreign and extraneous influences, which, with consummate skill in their manipulation, he has succeeded in eliminating from the confused and heterogeneous mass as originally presented for elucidation. Nor is this all. In the avoidance of strained inferences and the repudiation of severe constructions it is left entirely with the judges to temper justice with mercy in their administration and enforcement of the laws, and whilst "casting a severe eye upon the example, to bend a merciful eye upon the person." How often, too, has not an erring prisoner found that if they have to read the law, an accent "very low in blandishment," they are yet gifted with

A most silver flow,  
Of subtle-paced counsel in distress,  
Right to the heart and brain, tho' undescried,  
Winning its way with extreme gentleuess  
Through all the bulwarks of suspiciois pride.

According to the institutes of Menu "the whole race of men is kept in order by punishment" \* \* Through fear of punishment, this universe is enabled to enjoy its blessings \* \* All classes would become corrupt, all barriers would be destroyed, there would be a total confusion among men, if punishment were not

inflicted or inflicted unduly. But, it is added "where punishment with a black hue and a red eye, advances to destroy sin, there if the judge discern well, the people are undisturbed."

As has been already observed the adequacy of punishment is primarily secured in the terms of the judge's sentence by hard labor, but the actual infliction of the award so pronounced and the ultimate fate of the criminal are matters beyond the province of the court, the prisoner being then virtually transferred from the judicial to the executive branch of the administration for the fulfilment of the sentence passed. Whilst, therefore, the award of punishment necessarily and properly rests with the bench, the consideration of any claims to mitigation later earned by good conduct and industry is placed absolutely and entirely in the hands of the executive. Special provision has been made in India (by Sec. 322 of Act X of 1872 and otherwise) by the Legislature to meet this contingency; and as considerations of humanity, of policy and of equity alike press the extensive adoption of a system everywhere found to be fraught with such substantial advantages, there is reason to hope that the action already taken but fore-shadows a liberal application of the principles of conditional pardons and remissions of sentences in India to which we have already referred.

The importance of the subject can, perhaps, scarcely be overestimated. In the words of Lord Carnarvon, from whose address we have already quoted "it concerns the Statesman whose legislation may modify, if it cannot arrest the course of crime, it concerns the whole body of the community, rich and poor, but especially the poor, who annually pay a far heavier tax to the criminal class than they do to the State for the administration of justice; and lastly, it concerns all who believe that man, however fallen and degraded, still retains some traces of the Divine Image; and that, though it is the duty of the State to punish sternly, there yet remains a certain portion of the criminal class with whom some moral improvement is not utterly hopeless, and upon whom Christian charity may exercise her most beneficent influences."

W. B. BIRCH.

## ART. VI.—THE LOGICAL DOCTRINE OF THE PROPOSITION.

**I**N offering an article upon a subject such as this to the readers of this *Review*, the writer feels a kind of necessity laid upon him to say a few words by way of explanation, perhaps even of apology. The logical doctrine of the Proposition is not one in which probably a large number of readers take a very deep interest ; it is not apparently connected with *India* in any peculiar manner or degree ; and, therefore, there may seem to be no particular reason why it should be discussed in the pages of the *Review* so long identified with the metropolis of the Indian empire. It is for the purpose of removing this *prima facie* prejudice against our subject that we offer this explanation.

We presume that all our readers will agree with us in holding that it is the exercise of *thought* which is the crowning glory of man ; and that the *proper* exercise of thought is the great distinction between the wise and the foolish man. Thought being thus such an exceedingly important function of humanity, it follows that the correct study and analysis of thought is a very important department of science. What is important for mankind at large is therefore important for the inhabitants of *India*, and hence follows the legitimacy of the discussion of this subject in this *Review*. But we think that we can claim also a *special* appropriateness for our subject. Western education in *India* is yet in its infancy ; the Calcutta University is only a creature of yesterday. While, therefore, it is of importance to introduce from Europe whatever is valuable in literature and science and art, it appears to be of equal importance to exclude or to modify systems or doctrines of questionable worth and accuracy. It would be a pity that the educational system of *India* should be loaded in its infancy with antiquated or inaccurate doctrines which the leading thinkers of the West have discarded. It is especially in the department of philosophy that there is the greatest danger of antiquated survivals being retained ; partly because the science itself is still scarcely rescued from the chaotic haze with which it has so long been surrounded, partly because the students of the science are in too many cases prevented by prejudice from seeing truth, and partly because it is an exceedingly difficult thing to dislodge any system of teaching from its position, even after its inaccuracy or inutility has been demonstrated. The present paper proposes to take only a very limited department of the great sphere embraced by philosophy, a limited department even of the sphere of thought. And if this humble

contribution has any effect in correcting any erroneous doctrines, or in leading to the introduction of a more accurate study of the nature of the most important function of our mind, the object of the writer will be accomplished.

Every act of thinking involves the perception or the conception of *some relation* between two or more objects of knowledge or belief. A vast variety and multiplicity of objects, presentations and representations combine to make up our conscious mental life ; and when we are engaged in contemplating the *relations* of those objects we are said to be thinking. The assertion or the denial of any relation is made in the *proposition*, the nature of which is the subject of the present paper. But, before advancing to the discussion of the nature and form of the preposition, we shall examine and classify the relations which are asserted or denied in propositions.

One of the most essential of the relations of phenomena is *difference*. The only way in which we can distinguish a smell, for example, from a taste, or a sound from a colour, or one colour from another, is by perceiving the difference between them. We could not know anything at all except by knowing it as different from something else, and thus difference is one of the most essential elements of our conscious life. But it would be impossible to perceive difference if we were not able to bring the two differing objects side by side and compare them ; and thus the condition of perceiving difference is simultaneous contiguity, or, as we shall call it, for simplicity's sake, *simultaneity*. We could not have a continuous and identical conscious life without being able to recall the past and connect it with the present. We believe that we are the same beings that we were some time ago, because we can remember things that we then knew ; we can now represent to our minds what was formerly presented. But we could not do this without perceiving a *resemblance* between the present representation and the past presentation. Thus the perception of resemblance is the condition of a *continuous* conscious life, as the perception of difference is the condition of a *momentary* conscious life. The perception of continuity, however, involves that of *succession* of one phenomenon succeeding another ; and the perception of succession again involves that of difference. We can only know ourselves as continuously existing cognitive beings by knowing succeeding phenomena differenced from one another, and by knowing past phenomena by means of resembling representations of them.

Here we have described the most universal and essential of the relations of our conscious life. We could not be permanent cognitive beings at all without being able to perceive and actually perceiving these relations. Thus difference and resemblance,

simultaneity and succession, are relations which enter into our very constitution as cognitive beings; without them thought would be impossible, and thus they may be called the *a priori* conditions, or the primitive essential elements of thought.

If now, we consider the *objects* of our knowledge we shall reach another division of relations subordinate to the above. All objects which are related to one another may be distinguished into *quantities* and *qualities*. The latter correspond to the *sensations* of which we are or may be conscious; the former consist of the *Form* of sensations or objects, namely, the space, time, motion and so on, by which sense objects are conditioned. Again the relations of all objects or classes which may be predicated are either *internal* or *external*; the former being the relations of objects or classes to internal constituent qualities or parts, the latter to other external objects or classes. Internal and external relations may be both quantitative and qualitative, and thus we have a four-fold division of relations into:—I, Internal Quantitative; II, Internal Qualitative; III, External Quantitative; IV, External Qualitative. This classification is founded upon and not exclusive of our former division of the four primary relations, as will be seen from the following table:—

I. Internal Quantitative Relations comprehend :—	II. Internal Qualitative Relations comprehend :—	III. External Quantitative Relations comprehend :—	IV. External Qualitative Relations comprehend :—
Relations of figure, size, shape, motion, number, and so on, of the constituent parts or elements of objects, classes or systems. These relations may be any of the four primary relations or any combinations of them.	Relations between the qualities of objects of our knowledge, or classes of objects. These qualities being made known to us by the sensations or ideas which they produce in our minds.	Relations of any of the four primary kinds or any combinations of them between the figure, size, shape, motion, duration, number, and so on, of objects, classes or systems which are external to one another.	Relations between external objects or systems with reference to qualities made known by sense, moral or aesthetic qualities, characters, habits, conditions and any other characteristics of objects of knowledge which may be appropriately called qualitative.

We shall give illustrations of these great classes of relations.

*I. Internal Quantitative Relations.*

When we construct a geometrical figure, as that of the fifth or the forty-seventh proposition of the first book of Euclid, we constitute a unity, and the subsequent demonstration is a comparison of the different internal parts in respect of their magnitude, and the inferences which result from that comparison. Similarly, many of the propositions of geometry consist of a

combination of predication regarding the internal quantitative relations of different kinds of figures.

The astronomer who studies the motions of the different bodies belonging to the solar system is engaged with internal quantitative relations. The solar system as a whole constitutes a unity, the elements of which are the sizes, masses, distances, orbits, velocities, and so on, of the various bodies which revolve around the sun or the primary planets, and of the central luminary.

The mechanical engineer is similarly occupied when he arranges the figure, strength, motion, position, and so on, of mechanical structures, as houses, bridges, or machines. Comparative anatomists are able to complete the skeletons of animals, having given them certain of the bones. This ability is the result of a careful study of the internal quantitative relations of the bodies of animals.

### *II. Internal Qualitative Relations.*

The qualities of single objects of sense often require to be studied and compared in the interests of science. The chemist in his analysis of the various organic and inorganic substances which come under his notice is engaged in the study of internal qualitative relations. The process of classification involves a careful examination and comparison of the internal qualities of bodies or things classified. The composition and criticism of the productions of the poet, musician, statuary, and painter, consist chiefly of the arrangement and examination of internal qualitative relations. The same relations are the objects of study when we examine the characteristics of a man, of a nation, of a government, of a religious system, of a systematic body of doctrine of any kind, of an oration, in short of any of the vast variety of things known to us which are characterised by internal differences of quality or powers of exciting ideas.

### *III. External Quantitative Relations.*

In classification, when the extension or quantity of one class is compared with that of another, we are dealing with external quantitative relations. Many geometrical propositions are concerned with these relations. Comparisons of the weights, masses, figures, proportions, velocities, numbers, and so on, of distinct bodies not forming parts of a connected system, have for their objects external quantitative relations.

### *IV. External Qualitative Relations.*

The botanist, zoologist, and chemist, in comparing the different specimens of objects which come within their respective spheres to study are concerned about external qualitative relations. So is the ethnologist in comparing the characteristics of different races of men; the philologist in comparing the principles of different languages, the mythologist in bringing together the myths, legends, and folk-lore of different countries, and the comparative economist

in studying together the different social and political institutions which have sprung up in different countries at different times. This study of the qualitative relations of things and systems has sprung into importance chiefly in modern times and is a very powerful method of scientific discovery. In the comparative study of physical characteristics, of moral and social habits, of myths, of religious beliefs, of languages, of institutions, of laws, and of historical events, consists the only available effectual method of discovering the beginnings and the principles of human progress.

Now all thought is concerned about some, or all or various combinations of the relations which we have just now classified ; and the result of every comparison as well as the expression of every relation, is a *predication* or a *proposition*. In the exposition of our own views, we shall use the former term ; in the criticism of current logical doctrine we shall use the latter. *Predication*, we may thus define as *the assertion that one object or element of our knowledge or conception stands, or does not stand, in some relation to one or more other objects or elements of knowledge or conception*. In order that we may clearly understand the nature and forms of predication we shall study a few examples of it. And we shall begin with the study of examples of the predication of internal relations.

When we say, *this rose is red*, we affirm an internal relation of simultaneity or co-existence. The redness is a quality found co-existing with all the other qualities which make up our knowledge of the flower. The uniform and inseparable co-existence of these qualities causes us to think of them all as making *one object* ; and when we say *this rose*, we mean by it the *one object* made up of all the qualities. The first term of the above predication calls up an image before consciousness ; the second term is one of the elements of the image singled out for the moment for particular attention ; the predication affirms that the element forms a part of the whole object, or co-exists with the other element of it uniformly and inseparably.

*The horse has four legs.* This predication also affirms a certain internal relation of the object *horse*. The first term of the relation denotes a particular object composed of many parts and qualities. The second term of the relation expresses particular elements or parts of the whole object. The predication affirms a relation of co-existence of that regular and inseparable kind which constitutes the co-existing qualities an *individual*.

All predications which we make regarding the internal constitution of objects are of the same nature as the above, and have about the same significance. The *form* of the predication is a matter of comparative indifference, as we are now engaged in the

study of *thoughts* not of *words*. The same relation is expressed by all the following forms :—The rose *is* red ; the horse *has* four legs ; the house *consists of* six rooms ; England *contains* Middlesex ; the lion *is possessed of* a shaggy mane ; the solar system *comprehends* the sun, planets and satellites. And in all these cases the first term of the predication denotes a whole object, and the second term expresses some quality, part, or element of the object.

Not only may we predicate internal relations of material objects and systems of objects, but also of mental and social phenomena. The following are examples of such predication :—A moral judgment consists of intellectual and sentimental elements ; the family is composed of a husband, wife, and children ; the Government of England includes the Sovereign, the House of Lords, and the House of Commons. The meaning of the predication in all these cases is the same as before.

There are other predication of relations which may, perhaps, be called internal, but which should be distinguished from the above. These are predication of *intransitive actions*. We may give as examples of these :—The dog barks ; fire burns ; the sun shines ; the river runs ; the wheel turns, and so on. In all these predication, and such as these, there is involved the idea of something *proceeding from* the first term of the relation. *The dog barks* means a certain sound proceeds from the dog. *Fire burns*, means that a certain sensation is experienced after contact with fire. *The river runs*, means that a body of water occupies different places at successive times. *The wheel turns*, means that the different parts of the wheel successively occupy different positions. The first term of each of these predication denotes some object ; the second term implies some sensation or action ; and the predication affirms a relation of *succession* between the co-existing qualities of the object and the sensation or action predicated.

We now proceed to the examination of external relations of objects as affirmed or denied in predication, and, for the sake of convenience, shall consider indiscriminately quantitative and qualitative relations. And first amongst these we have relations of difference. A relation of difference, we have seen, is absolutely necessary to enable us to distinguish one object from another. If two objects are *exactly alike* in quality they must, at least, have different *spatial positions* to be distinguishable. Relations of difference are usually expressed by the comparative degree of the adjective which expresses the quality with reference to which two objects are compared. The following are examples :—Red *is brighter than* green. Lead *is heavier than* wood. The sun *is larger than* any of its planets. The conceptions of “Paradise Lost” are *more sublime than* those of “The Deserter Village.”

A child *is not so strong as a man*. A greyhound *can run faster than* a bull-dog. The scenes of heaven *are more glorious than* can be expressed by language. The fruit of the pine apple *is not the same as* that of the orange tree. In all these cases, and in others which might be adduced, we see that the two terms of the predication are the two objects compared ; and the predication asserts that a relation of difference, in some particular respect, exists between them. The words which we have italicised in the above examples *express the relation predicated* between the two terms ; and it is manifest that it is of no consequence which term of the relation comes first in the predication. The substitution of the second term for the first would simply involve a slight change in the *expression*, but no change in the *thought*. *Red is brighter than green*, is in thought the same as *green is not so bright as red*. And so of all the others. Frequently we have to express a difference between two objects which consists in the fact that, along with a certain resemblance, the one possesses qualities which the other does not. For example, the bat differs from the mouse in that the former has membranous appendages answering the purpose of wings, while the latter has not. The zebra differs from the horse in having a regularly striped skin. The whale differs from the most of the mammals in being an aquatic animal. In such comparisons as these it is not easy to adopt such an expression as will show the difference predicated so clearly as in the former cases ; but the *thought* is equally simple. There are two objects compared ; they are found to differ in a certain respect ; and the predication affirms that they do thus differ. And, as before, it is of no consequence which term of the relation comes first in the predication ; the thought is the same whatever be the particular mode of expression.

Amongst the external relations of objects, both in respect of quantity and quality, that of resemblance is of great importance. It is in consequence of resemblance in certain respects that we classify objects together and constitute them a unity. It is in consequence of resemblance between objects that we draw inferences regarding them. We are not now concerned, however, with these uses of resemblance, but only with the nature and expression of the predication of resemblance. Let us study some examples :—

This line *is of the same length as* that. These triangles *are all equal-sided*. This piece of lead *weighs* two pounds. In the first and third of these examples there is a comparison of *two* objects, and a predication that they resemble one another ; in the second the predication of resemblance has reference to *several* objects. When the terms related to one another in a predication of resemblance are common names, there is always involved a comparison of several objects. For example, when we say, *horses have four*

feet, we mean that all objects known by the term horse resemble one another in having four feet ; here we predicate a relation of resemblance between all known or conceived individuals. And, as we said before, we imply that *each* horse has four feet—an internal relation of co-existence.

We often predicate resemblance between things which are not exactly alike, but yet sufficiently alike to be classified together. When we say *crimson is like scarlet*, we mean not that they are exactly alike, but that they are the *same kind* of colour, and thus distinguishable from blue or green. When we say that *the sheep resembles the deer*, we mean to predicate resemblance only in certain respects, and if we state our meaning fully we will particularise the points of resemblance. The most of the resemblances which are affirmed in predication are only partial ; when we affirm a complete resemblance we call it an identity, an equality or some such name.

Although mental phenomena and material phenomena are thought to be entirely different in kind, yet they are frequently employed to illustrate one another. We speak of a *lofty thought*, thus implying a resemblance between the excellence of the thought and the altitude of some material object. We use *light* as a symbol of *truth*, or we say that *light resembles truth*, although there is in reality no resemblance whatever between them in themselves ; but in their results there is a resemblance since the appearance of light and the imparting of truth are both productive of knowledge in the mind. The relation between a symbol and that which is symbolized, between a sign and that which is signified, is usually either a direct resemblance between the two things, or is accompanied by a resemblance amongst some of the circumstances or results connected with the two things. Sometimes, of course, this is not so, as in the case of the relation of a word to that which is denoted by it, where there is now often no resemblance, although there is reason to believe that originally the application of names was founded upon resemblance.

The relations of simultaneity and succession between mutually external objects are often the subjects of predication. As when we say :—*Milton was a contemporary of Cromwell* ; *John and James were class-fellows* ; *soldiers on parade keep step with one another*. Or when we say :—*Chaucer preceded Spenser* ; *after the flash of lightning a loud peal of thunder was heard* ; *a cause is always followed by its effect*. It will be observed that the same relation of simultaneity or succession may be expressed in many different ways ; and so far as *thought* is concerned, it is of no consequence by what words the relation is indicated, provided only it be indicated clearly. It will be observed, too, that the

order in which the objects said to be related occur in the predication is immaterial. The sentence, *Chaucer preceded Spenser* is the same as *Spenser followed Chaucer*. The predication consists in asserting that a relation of succession exists between the two individuals, specifying which comes first. And, with reference to all the other examples, it will be admitted that the form of predication is unimportant, provided only that it be clearly expressed what objects are related to one another and what is the relation between them.

We have hitherto confined ourselves as closely as possible to simple relations of difference, resemblance, simultaneity and succession; but in the great majority of predication the relations predicated are more or less complex; and often the relations implied in a predication are more numerous than those which are expressed. We may give examples of such complex relations.

*The judges in session, having tried the prisoner, agreed to find him guilty.* In this complex predication many relations are expressed and implied. The judges sit simultaneously upon the bench,—a double relation of simultaneity (1) amongst the judges (2) between the judges and the bench. *Having tried the prisoner*, expresses a continuous process and implies a multitude of relations; it also indicates that the action next asserted followed the trial. *Agreed to find him guilty*; here is expressed a relation of agreement amongst the legal opinions of the judges, and a relation of difference between the action of the prisoner and some law.

*John struck the table.* In this short sentence there are implied several relations. John and the table are in point of time simultaneous, in point of space contiguous; and contiguity is itself the result of the combination of several relations. The *stroke* of John is an *action*, and therefore involves *succession*, *viz.*, first the arm is raised; then it is gradually lowered, occupying successively different positions; and then it comes into contact with the table producing, probably, a sensation of sound and certainly one of touch. Thus this simple sentence predicates a complex series of relations between two objects, John and the table.

Many other examples might be given of complex relations being predicated between two or more objects; and it would be a useful exercise in the analysis of thought for the student to examine and separate the relations expressed or implied in the sentences which he reads. We think it will be found that *all relations* may ultimately be reduced to the four simple ones which we have described; and that all predication may be shown to consist of an assertion or denial, that one or more of these relations exists between two or more objects or elements of knowledge or conception.

We have now given and illustrated what we believe is a correct exposition of that most important act of thought which we call

predication. It now remains for us, from the stand-point which we have endeavoured to establish, to take a view of the current logical doctrines regarding the proposition. These doctrines are found in all the smaller text-books of logic ; and they find a place also in many of the more elaborate expositions of logical science. Not, however in all, for we observe decided tendencies towards a departure from the traditional doctrine of the proposition in some modern writers of distinction. The leading features of the traditional doctrine are the following :—

Every proposition consists of *two terms* and the *copula*. The terms represent either concepts classes or individual things ; and the copula serves as the connecting link between them. The words which constitute the copula are *is* and *is not*, according as the one term is to be affirmed or denied of the other. The first of the two terms, that about which the assertion is made, is called the *subject* ; the second, that which is asserted or denied of the first, is called the *predicate*. The subject of universal propositions is said to be distributed, or applied to all the things denoted by it ; that of particular propositions is not. The predicate of negative propositions, being altogether denied of all the individuals denoted by the subject, is distributed ; that of affirmative propositions is not. The copula is simply the sign of the relation of the two terms to one another ; it must not indicate the actual objective existence of the relation or the things related, nor the time when the relation existed, nor the degree of certainty with which the assertion is made. All these accidental things must be included in the predicate. It is always possible, after limitations and changes in the predicate or copula, to *convert* propositions, that is, to put the predicate in place of the subject, and the subject in place of the predicate ; and this conversion, being rendered necessary by the laws of the *syllogism*, is an essential part of the doctrine of the proposition. These are the principal points in the doctrine of the proposition regarding which writers upon logic are agreed ; but there are some points about which they are not agreed. They are not agreed as to the *character* of the *predicate*, some maintaining that it may be either denotative or connotative, others that it is connotative only. Those who believe that it may be denotative are not agreed as to its *quantification*, some holding that its extent should be explicitly stated in the proposition, others that its quantity should be determined by the ordinary rules. They are not agreed as to the *meaning of the predication*, some holding that the subject and predicate are simply asserted to be two different names of the same thing ; some that the predicate consists of attributes asserted of the subject ; and some that a relation of mutual co-existence or mutual inclusion or exclusion or congruence or confliction between the two terms is

asserted. These differing views may be referred to in the following criticism; but we shall give the most of our attention to the foregoing doctrines which are generally agreed upon. For the sake of clearness we divide the subject of our criticism into the following parts:—1. The terms of the proposition; 2. The relation between these terms as expressed by the copula; 3. The doctrine of distribution; 4. The doctrine of conversion.

(1). In examining the terms of the proposition our principal aim will be to ascertain whether they correspond with the terms of predication. All predication, we have already shown, consist of the assertion or denial that one or more objects or elements of knowledge or conception holds some specified relation to one or more other objects or elements of knowledge or conception. All predication have, therefore, two terms related to one another, and the assertion of some relation existing between them. And we have to enquire whether the terms of the proposition, as described by logicians, are the same as the terms of the predication which we consciously make. In every proposition, put into logical form, the predicate must comprehend all the elements of time, mode and action, which are usually expressed by verbs and adjectives or adverbs. A few examples of propositions may form a good basis for our criticism.

*Horses are vertebrated.* In this predication we affirm that each of a class of individual things possesses a certain quality or rather a certain part called a vertebra. Two objects of thought are before consciousness, the image of a horse or horses and that of a vertebra; and we affirm that the latter constitutes a part of the former. Thus we here assert an *internal* relation between the two terms; and this internal relation is correctly expressed by the word *are*. Neither can there be any doubt that the terms of the proposition correspond to the terms of the conscious predication. But, suppose we modify the proposition, and assert that *horses belong to the class of vertebrata*, it appears manifest that the predication which we make is quite different from the former one. Instead of predicating an *internal* relation we now predicate an *external* one; we assert that the class of horses are included in a much larger class of vertebrated animals. In the former proposition we do not think of any other animals except horses; in this proposition we must think of other animals constituting a large class which includes horses. Now the scholastic doctrine of the proposition teaches that the predicate *vertebrated* is either connotative or denotative, and thus fails to distinguish between the two important kinds of predication above illustrated. This ambiguity in the meaning of the predicate in such propositions should not be recognised either in psychology or logic; a predicate should mean either one thing or another,

and the mode of expressing it should indicate which meaning is intended to be conveyed.

Again, *the sun illuminates the earth*. In this predication we have in thought two objects which are the terms of the predication, and a certain relation existing between them, namely, that light proceeds from the first to the second and thus makes its surface visible to our eyes. This proposition when put into logical form becomes, *the sun is a-body-which-illuminates-the-earth*. There the subject is *the sun*, and the predicate is *a-body-which-illuminates-the-earth*, i.e., the sun again, along with its relation to the earth. Now we think that an appeal to consciousness will show clearly that the terms of this proposition, after being put into the logical mould, do not correspond to the terms of the predication which we consciously make. The two objects which we think of as related are, plainly, the sun and the earth, *not* the sun and *a-body-which-illuminates-the-earth*. And it should, therefore, appear that the so-called logical form of this proposition has no foundation in the facts of consciousness. *Gold is heavier than iron*. Here we have the image of two substances before consciousness, and we assert a certain relation between them, namely, that the one substance is heavier than the other. But according to scholastic doctrine, the predicate of the proposition is not *iron*, but *heavier-than-iron*. In this case also an appeal to consciousness will show that the second term of the predication, said to be in a certain relation to the first, does not correspond to the predicate of the logical proposition.

Many other propositions might be adduced which would show that in the majority of cases the terms of the logically-formed proposition do not correspond to the terms of predication which are thought of in consciousness as related to one another. We have seen and admitted that, when a proposition expresses an *internal* relation of an object or class to some of its constituent parts or elements, the scholastic proposition may be correct and adequate. But, when *external* relations are predicated between objects, the logical proposition is quite inadequate to their expression ; the terms of the proposition do not correspond to the terms of the predicated relation.

(2.) We now consider the relation itself predicated between the objects or elements compared. Is this relation accurately expressed by the logical copula ? According to logical doctrine the relations expressed by the copula are those of genus, species, difference, property, and accident ; the predicate of a proposition may stand to the subject in any one of these relations. The two first of these are external relations ; the remaining three are internal. Now it is manifest that these relations have all reference to the process of *classification* ; and it appears equally manifest

that there are a multitude of other relations which form the subjects of predication that have no reference to classification whatever. When we say, for example, *lightning precedes thunder*, we do not mean to classify either lightning or thunder with any other phenomena whatever, nor have we in our mind any fact or process involved in classification. We do not mean that the fact of preceding thunder is a differentia or a property or an accident of lightning, or that that fact distinguishes lightning from any other phenomenon. We mean simply to assert that a certain phenomenon, lightning, usually or always, is observed, before another phenomenon, thunder, is heard. And this relation of antecedence or succession is certainly not expressed by the copula. Again, when we say, *elephants are quadrupeds*, these words properly express an *internal* relation between the animals spoken of, and the quality indicated by the predicate, the possession of four feet. But if this proposition is made to mean, *elephants belong to the class of four-footed animals*, we have an *external* relation asserted, and the copula is not adequate to its unambiguous expression. In the same way it might be shown that all the other external relations of difference, resemblance, co-existence and succession, and their various combinations, cannot be expressed by the copula. In fact, logicians do not pretend that they can, because they always consign the expression of these relations to the predicate, thus playing false with the phenomena of consciousness and producing monstrous forms of language. It appears then, that psychology offers no foundation for the doctrine that the copula is the only proper expression of the relation between the terms of predication; and it might also be shown that there is no foundation in language. In many languages which are unquestionably expressive of thought there is found no such abstract verb as our *is*. And, even in our language, the substantive verb requires to be divested of all its meaning before it is fitted for logical use. Thus, it comes to be but an empty symbol, which differs from the symbols of mathematics, in that while each one of them has a definite meaning and represents a relation in thought, it is introduced for the purpose of putting aside the relations thought of which it cannot express.

(3.) The doctrine of distribution is manifestly founded upon facts connected with classification. In the classes which we construct of organized individuals there are some qualities which are found in all the individuals denoted by the class-name; there are other qualities, called accidental, found in some individuals but not in others. We are able, then, to predicate that *all* the individuals of the class possess the former kind of qualities, but only that *some* of them possess the latter kind of qualities. Again, when we predicate an external relation of certain objects, as when

we say "birds belong to the class of oviparous animals," it is evident that we speak of *all* birds, but only of *some* oviparous animals; and in this case the first term of the predication is distributed, the second not. But if we say "birds do not belong to the class of quadrupeds," we speak of all birds and all quadrupeds, and assert that the one class is altogether excluded from the other. In this case both the terms of predication are distributed. Thus, when the first term of the relation denotes a class, we indicate its distribution by prefixing the words *all* or *some*. When the second term denotes a class of greater extent than the first, we naturally indicate by the form of the predication whether we speak of *all* or *some* of the individuals belonging to it; and at least the accurate expression of thought demands that the distribution of both the terms of the relation should be unambiguously expressed.

These principles of distribution, properly applicable only to terms which denote classes, are applied by logicians to all kinds of terms and all kinds of propositions. All universal propositions distribute their subject, while particulars do not. All negative propositions distribute their predicate, while affirmatives do not. Now, if we had not a particular system to maintain, it might appear plain to us that the principles of distribution cannot be without absurdity applied to anything which does not admit of distribution or non-distribution. If we say, for example, "the Duke of Wellington is a man," neither the first nor the second term of the predication is a class name as here used; and were it not that we import from the process of classification, ideas foreign to the subject in hand, we should never think of the distribution either of "the Duke of Wellington" or "a man." Logicians, however, must reduce every proposition to the normal form, and so they make this a universal affirmation and write it "all of the Duke of Wellington is one of the class—man."

Again, if we take a proposition expressive of an internal relation, we shall see that the rules of distribution are not applicable. In the proposition "roses are sweet-smelling," the first term of the predication may denote either *all* or *some* roses according to our opinion of their odour. But the second term "sweet-smelling" expresses a *quality* possessed by roses, and when we speak of a *quality*, we surely mean the whole of the *quality*, and it seems absurd to say that the name of the *quality* is either distributed or not distributed; if we do so we apply a distinction to it which is plainly not applicable.

This objection, however, is got over by changing the predicate and thus forming *another proposition*, thus:—"Roses are sweet-smelling flowers," meaning "roses belong to the class of sweet-smelling flowers." But it is surely objectionable, in order to get

a proposition into such a form that the rules of distribution may be applied to it, *to change the relation* predicated in it. This proposition in its first form asserts an *internal* relation to the second term of which the principles of distribution do not apply ; and in order to bring it into such a form that the second term may be tested by the laws of distribution, it is changed so as to express an *external* relation. Surely a correct psychology offers no foundation for such a procedure.

It could be easily shown that the laws of distribution are inapplicable to many other kinds of propositions, of which we may give the following as examples :—The line A is equal to B ; the sun is brighter than the moon ; the dawn precedes the day ; silver is not so valuable as gold ; the Prince of Wales shot an elephant ; stars bespangle the sky. In all these propositions relations are predicated between two or more objects, the relation being expressed with perfect clearness, and in none of them can we say, with any degree of appropriateness, that either term of the relation is distributed or non-distributed ; the distinction is inapplicable and foreign to the subject.

Our conclusion, founded upon an examination of the meaning of propositions, may be thus stated. Only those terms which denote classes of things can be properly spoken of as being totally or partially distributed ; the names of single qualities or objects should not be quantified ; but wherever a class-name, admitting of quantification, should, for the sake of clearness have its quantity made known, we have a right to insist that its quantity should be explicitly stated. This conclusion is founded upon the great law of expression,—whatever is contained in thought should be accurately expressed in words ; whatever is not contained in thought should not be expressed in words. We do not *think* of the quality affirmed in the predicate of a proposition as being applicable to many or few objects ; we should not therefore quantify it. But where the subject or predicate is a class-name, wholly or partially distributed *in thought*, its distribution should be expressed *in language*.

(4.) We now come to the doctrine of conversion. For the sake of the transpositions of terms required by the syllogism, it is considered by logicians of importance, that all propositions should be convertible ; and there are certain well-known laws laid down for their conversion. The laws of distribution receive their full importance only in connection with conversion ; as the importance of the laws of conversion is seen only in relation to the syllogism. The great law of conversion is,—that no term should be distributed in the converted proposition, which was undistributed in the original one. And by the application of this law it is found that universal negative and particular negative

propositions may be converted without any change of quantity or quality, that the universal affirmative can be converted by limiting the quantity of the predicate, and that the particular negative may be simply converted after changing its quality, that is, changing it into a particular affirmative by transferring the sign of negation from the copula to the predicate.

Now, if we examine predications as they are naturally expressed, there does not seem to be any objection to the order of the term, being changed provided there is a sufficient reason for the change. If we say "whales are included in the class mammals," we mean the same as "the class mammals includes whales" If we say "thunder succeeds lightning," we are understood no better than if we say "lightning precedes thunder." The predication "gold is heavier than silver," expresses the same relations as "silver is lighter than gold." The sentence "John strikes the table," is, as far as thought is concerned, exactly the same as "the table is struck by John." In short, if we express any relation in a predication, the laws of thought and language require nothing more than clearness and accuracy in the expression; and it is a matter of indifference which term of the relation comes first.

But, if we examine the conversions of *logically formed propositions*, we cannot so easily admit their legitimacy. The proposition "roses are red," becomes, in the hands of logicians, when converted, "some red things are roses." The simple sentence "thunder succeeds lightning" is metamorphosed into "a class of things succeeding lightning is thunder." The monstrous forms of language which require to be introduced for the purpose of converting the majority of logically moulded propositions appear to afford a strong reason for doubting the legitimacy of the process. But, as we have seen, the principal objection does not lie against transposing the terms of a predication, but rather against the changes to which naturally expressed predications must be subjected, in order to bring them into the so-called logical form.

Having examined the principal features of the scholastic doctrine of the proposition, we may sum up our results. Propositions concerned about classification, are wrongly taken to be the type of all propositions; and all other kinds of propositions are forced into the form naturally assumed by them. The terms of the logical proposition do not, in the majority of cases, correspond with the objects whose relation is predicated in thought. The copula is incapable of expressing the most of relations, and consequently the words expressive of relations are usually relegated to the predicate, this being inconsistent with the facts of thought. The laws of distribution, founded upon facts of classification, are

applied where there is no reference to classification, and where they are consequently inapplicable. And finally the simple process of changing the order of the terms of a relation, when applied to the terms of a proposition forced into the logical form, produces results quite opposed to the facts of thought and the forms of language.

In the preceding exposition and criticism, we have taken our stand upon the position that the psychologist and the logician ought to occupy themselves with the analysis and study of *thought* rather than of *expression*. The scholastic logicians concerned themselves too much with words, mere words; hence the word quibbling, the logomachies of mediæval times. We have inherited their logical system and still teach it in our colleges; and a useless system it is, interesting chiefly as a specimen of the ingenuity of men, who had nothing better to do than to invent puzzles. We hope that the time may soon come when a logic will be generally taught which will attempt to be a real and accurate analysis of thought worthy of the study of men, who wish to understand the working of their own minds in its higher operations, and who desire a method by which their practical researches after truth may be systematically guided.

---

## ART. VII.—ORIENTAL SCHOLARS.

**I**N a late number of this *Review* we attempted to give our readers an account of an International Congress of Orientalists held at London in September 1874: the first of the series was held at Paris in 1873: the third was proposed to be held this autumn at St. Petersburg, but for the present it has fallen through. We propose now to give some fuller particulars of the constituent members of such Congress, who are known generally under the name of Oriental *Savans*, or scholars, and also occupy now a very prominent position in the learned bodies of Europe.

It is necessary to contract the boundaries of a very large subject by excluding from our present notice the distinguished men, who have exclusively devoted themselves to the subjects of Oriental Geography, Ethnology, Archaeology, Numismatics, Comparative Mythology, History and Religion. Each of these would require a chapter for themselves. The word "Orient" must be expanded, so as to include Egypt and North Africa, and to exclude any portion of Europe, Australia, and South Africa. Language, in all its developments of Philology proper, Phonology, Grammatography, Palaeography, Comparative Philology (called also Glottology), comes into the scope of our notice—whether such language may be dead, extinct, or living; whether cultivated or left in savage freedom; whether committed to the safe custody of paper, linen, reeds, wood, metal, stone, or clay, or handed down orally from generation to generation without the shackles and the safe-guard of alphabetic, syllabic, or ideographic characters.

It is necessary to cast over the world of Oriental letters such a net of classification, as will embrace all the component parts in such harmonious order, as will commend itself to the judgment of the reader. The noble army of scholars has been recruited from many nationalities, the majority using the languages of England, France and Germany. We use our phrases with caution, as many scholars write in French, who are not so by nationality. Some have also ventured upon English, who do not belong to that nation. Latin was in former years, and is sometimes now, a vehicle of communication. In addition to the above named three great nationalities, foremost in every labour of science and art, we may note that students and scholars, some of very marked distinction, have been contributed by the United States of North America, the kingdoms of Holland, Belgium, Sweden, Denmark, Italy, Spain, and Greece, the Empire of Russia, and the Vice-Royalties of India and Egypt.

Another grouping must be by subjects. We write for those who are familiar with the technical terminology of the new Science of Language. The regiment of Oriental scholars, made up of recruits from different nations, in the manner above described, is divided into certain companies, according to the family of languages to which their labours have been directed. Some scholars belong to two or more of these companies. Knowledge would advance with more certain steps if there were less special devotion to one subject, and a larger and more Catholic spirit in study: but we must take scholars like poets, as we find them, and be thankful. They are well described as the "rolling-stock" capital of the Knowledge Concern, just as libraries are the dead stock. The importance of these last is enormous.

Now these companies are as follows:—

I.—Aryanists—the term "Sanskritists" is too narrow. This company is the most numerous, the most learned, the most influential: but their tyranny in a linguistic sense has become insupportable. They were first in the field, and came into possession of a highly cultivated literary treasure, to which they have done the fullest justice; but they forgot how small a portion of the world's surface was occupied by the speakers of Aryan languages, and that linguistic axioms and deductions are not of universal application.

II.—Semites, occupying a small but important field, with a method as rigorous, and an egoism as exclusive as their Aryan brethren, and without the same justification, as the poverty of their materials has disabled them as yet from arriving at any conclusion as to the archaic form of their own languages.

III.—Sinologists, occupying the great and insufficiently explored fields of China, Japan, and the Monosyllabic languages generally. The progress in this direction is watched with intense interest, as the great secret of the origin of language can here be traced back to the earliest dawn of linguistic expression, while in the Semite and Aryan families we drop the longest line and find no bottom. When we have interpreted the earliest sentence of Sanskrit or Hebrew, we still stand face to face with this great problem—how many centuries were required for the slow process of evolving this syntactical arrangement of words, and of rubbing, snipping, compounding and distorting these words, so as to become coins or symbols to represent the idea conveyed?

IV.—Egyptologists, occupying a narrow geographical kingdom, but one of the grandest triumphs of intellect that the world has ever seen. We scarcely know whether to be more proud of those ancient races, who in the first dawn of the human intellect invented and left on record those wonderful hieroglyphics, or of those gifted men, who, after two thousand years of extinction, have

restored them to life. To this class must be added, for convenience, those few scholars, who have turned their attention to the Berber Inscriptions of North Africa.

V.—Assyriologists, occupying the whole territory, not a very extensive one, in which Cuneiform Inscriptions have been found. There are upwards of seven varieties, and they belong to different families of language ; but are for convenience classed together under a name, which is not sufficiently broad so as logically to include them all.

VI.—Turanians—this word is used under a protest, and only because its omission might, in the present state of recognised nomenclature, produce a confusion. The scholars, occupying so-called Turanian ground, are those, whose attention has been directed to Asiatic languages other than those which fall under the five preceding classes ; these languages are, for the most part, agglutinative.

Before entering into details we must note, how difficult it is to obtain information, as to the state of progress of any particular branch ; how imperfect are the arrangements to record the names of the workmen, the out-put of each year ; how impossible it has been to bring labourers in the same field into communication with each other. There have been established for many years three learned societies, the Royal Asiatic Society of London, the Société Asiatique of Paris, the Morgenlandische Gesellschaft of Leipzig ; and latterly a fourth has been added, the Società Orientale of Florence. Annual Reports have been issued ; but insufficient, unmethodical, and disappointing. Those of the French Society, written by M. J. Mohl and M. E. Renan, have been models of style, but very limited in scope, and nearly entirely restricted to notice of the work of Frenchmen. The ponderous reports by Professor Goske of Leipzig have fallen seven years in arrears, and attempt too much, and therefore produce no result. Enterprising publishers have from time to time put forth records, or reviews ; but too prominent a place is assigned to their own publications, and no attempt made to include everything. Latterly a scheme has been started by the united agency of the four Societies so to divide the work geographically, as to secure the notice of every work, good or bad, that has come forth within the year. This may possibly lead hereafter to an international report of work done, prepared every year, marking the progress of each branch up to date.

The two great nationalities of England and France, were first in the field, rival in arts, as well as arms. The possession of India threw a great advantage into the hands of England, and the proclivity of scholars of that country has been decidedly in an Aryan direction, led by the great Hindu Triad, Jones, Colebrooke and Wilson,

On the other hand the closer connection of the French with the Levant, and latterly their connection with Algeria, have given them a bias towards Semitic studies ; and they have also almost monopolised the Chinese field. There are names, which can only be pronounced with veneration, among the French pioneers ; such as Champollion, De Sacy, Auquett<sup>il</sup> de Perron, and Eug<sup>ene</sup> Burnouf ; of whose early death it may be truly said, that we should indeed have known something had Burnouf lived to old age. In those days the ore lay near the surface, one fortunate scholar could skin all milk-pots, and spread a net to catch all fish ; but with increase of knowledge has come a demand for more accuracy, and minuter subdivision of labour. The scholars of Germany came in next, and introduced system and method, and propounded laws to regulate all future progress. Thus a science was created, where formerly had existed only empirical discovery. Societies, professorial chairs, State institutions, sprang into existence. Political necessities helped the progress of knowledge, and on the confines of Europeau Russia, in the town of Kazan, a University has sprung up with seventy professors, the object being to supply instruction in Arabic, Persian, Turkish, Tartar, Mongol and Chinese, aided by the out-put of most prolific printing presses. Still further east, in India and China, a free press, numberless places of education, and no few literary societies or Aujumans, have had a marked effect. How different is the lot of students of the nineteenth century, who read printed works with settled texts, set out with all the luxury of punctuation and pagination, garnished with notes, supplemented by translations and vocabularies, and in the comfort of their own arm-chairs, compared with the hard lot of the labourers of the eighteenth century, who in dirty and ill-lighted libraries pored over ill-written, imperfect and unintelligible manuscripts, to which earthen vessels, however, were committed with impunity for many centuries, the priceless treasures of the East !

The blessed peace and liberty of England which has lasted for so many years, can only be estimated at their full value, when we consider for one moment the lot of other nations even in these latter days. During the war of 1870, professors and students were hurried to the field of battle from the calm of the lecture room, and we read of the progress of the compaigu being reported home in Sanskrit Slokes by some unwilling combatant. On the other hand we read, that the occupation of the country by the enemy, and the siege and Commune of Paris, interrupted the serene course of Oriental study. The Council of the Societ<sup>e</sup> Asiatique met in fear and trembling—not for their own lives—but for their books and collections. The monthly number of their journal was stopped for a time, but the Savans were equal to the occasion, and each number has been made up to the full tale by the publica-

tion of accumulated material. During the siege the printing of Masaudi's "Prairies d'Or" was pushed on ; Garcin de Tassy issued his annual Report on the languages of India from a village in Normandy, to which he had retired for a season. Some of the members of the Society were so discomposed, that they succumbed under the annoyance of the interruption of study : the usual official compliments were, however, paid to their memories. While the cannons were still firing, they remembered that some of De Sacy's best works were published in the midst of the horrors of 1793 : they had not forgotten that Archimedes perished at the capture of Syracuse, while working out a problem. It is characteristic of the brave and sensational nation to have done as they did, and to have cared to record it.

The opening address of the first number of the "Annuario della Società Italiana per gli studii Orientali" gives us another peep behind the scenes in the history of a noble nation. Signor Amari, a man of European reputation, who suffered as a patriot under the Bourbons, alluded to Italy as being in old time the first in the Oriental field, and first in the Renaissance of the fifteenth century in every intellectual field. But, smitten to death by the arrangements made at the peace of 1815, Italy lost its mental activity, and had no spirit to attend to the affairs of Asia and Africa, while the happier people of the other kingdoms of Europe had been daily adding to the domain of knowledge. Then came the struggle for independence, and at last freedom and unity in 1870, and leisure and national confidence, and a right to name their union Società Italiana. So in 1871 was started the idea, and in 1872 was ushered into the world the first annual Report.

Before we go further, let us gather some idea of the manner of men who make up our regiments, their inner life, and the characteristics of the genus *Savans*. One thing is clear, that it is a mere chance, that brings recruits to the ranks ; no one has deliberately from his childhood selected the profession. There is scarcely an instance of the mantle of scholarship having fallen from the shoulders of the father to those of the son : on the contrary we have heard a scholar say, that he would never allow his children to adopt such a thankless walk of life, and as a rule the children grow up totally ignorant of, and unsympathetic in, the pursuits of their father. We have an instance of a great Sanskrit scholar with six sons, not one of whom had the grace or the curiosity to learn the character of the language which had made his father's name and fortune. It is very well for spoilt children of fortune such as Max Müller to eulogize the still life of the professor in a German University. When he had the opportunity, he cared not to exchange the fair home in

the Parks at Oxford, the abundant income, and the repeated dota-  
tions from the India Office, for the *Geist* and narrow resources  
of a chair in his Vaterland, though he talks of doing so now.  
It is all very well for Niebuhr and Bunsen in their splendid  
positions as diplomatic representatives of Prussia to write romantically  
of their regret for their abandoned professorial lecture  
rooms: it is patent, that the pursuit of Oriental learning is  
ill-requited, either by honour or by material reward. Talents, which  
might have achieved fame; industry, which might have rolled up  
wealth; sometimes an eloquence, which would hold the first place  
at the bar; a grasp of intellect, and power of calculation, which  
would have made the fortune of a merchant or a banker: a  
shrewdness, and a detective skill, which would have picked the  
locks of diplomacy:—such are some of the varied capacities  
of the intellect, which have been brought into the service of Ori-  
ental literature, where every step had to be won by strong power  
of reasoning united to undaunted perseverance.

Nor have instances of devotion of a life, abnegation of self,  
and singleness of purpose, the noble qualities which make up  
the perfect man, been wanting. We read how Alexander Castren,  
in delicate health, left his study, and travelled for years alone in his  
sledge through the snowy deserts of Siberia, coasted along the  
borders of the Polar Sea, lived for whole winters in caves of ice,  
or in the smoky huts of greasy Samoïeds, then braved the sand-  
clouds of Mongolia, past the Baikal, and returned from the fron-  
tiers of China to his duties as Professor at Helsingfors—only to  
die after placing our knowledge of the so-called Turanian family  
on a sound basis. A few years ago died De Gabelentz: his name  
known only to a few, patient, methodical and undaunted by  
difficulties, he brought to bear on his studies the highest philo-  
logical acumen. He never formed a final opinion of the nature  
of a language till he had analyzed a number of original texts.  
In many cases, when no grammars or lexicons existed, he made  
his own: he acquired the knowledge of subsidiary languages,  
merely to help him to the study of some outlandish tongue other-  
wise inaccessible. Thus he learnt Russian so as to get at Mongol  
and Altaic dialects; he attacked the Wogulian dialects through  
Magyar, and the Finnic through Swedish. He was the greatest  
linguist that the world ever knew—not only did he know eighty  
languages, thus far surpassing Mezzofanti—but he made that  
knowledge available for the highest philological purposes, while  
the latter did not enrich science with a single discovery or a single  
new idea, he could talk his languages, and that was all.

Other names occur to our recollection: some, like Schultz, have  
been veritable martyrs: others, like Norris, have been gifted  
with such modesty of character, that they have allowed others

to carry off the credit for work, to which they have contributed so much, that to impartial critics it seems to belong to them alone. When we think of such instances, we can bear with more patience the self-assertion, the flashy-trumpery book, reviewed by friendly hands—the proof sheets of the review being corrected by the author of the book; the flimsy lecture, the greasy compliments, the false reputation, gained by some sciolist, who has the art of stringing neatly together a few facts culled from the works of others, prates wisely, prints carefully, and binds handsomely.

The life of the French, or German *Savans*—and they alone are the true stock—is not much to be envied; they have generally limited incomes, and are to be found in the second or third floors of houses in large towns, where a small suite of rooms contains their family and their library. To one not accustomed to the life, there appears to be too close an atmosphere, and too much tobacco smoke; to visitors the *Savant* appears as a genial, enthusiastic man, a delightful companion, full of intelligence: perhaps a little too much oil and vinegar in his conversation according as the name of a friend, or a rival, comes on the tapis. His is a hard life, much rising up early, and going late to rest, daily disappointments or mortifications, and midnight toil. The work of the compiler of a dictionary is enough to drive a man mad, and it has come to our notice, that after the completion of a fourteen years' work, and the correction of the last proof-sheet, the intellect of an unhappy compiler lost its balance from sheer want of the food to which it had become habituated. Then, as might be expected, eyes grow prematurely weak, the health fails, the memory fails; the right hand loses its cunning, early death interrupts the work, as in the case of Burnouf and Deutsch. Champollion is said to have contracted some peculiar disease in the tombs of Egypt: the stooping back, the scholarly bend, the pallid abstracted countenance, mark the book-worm who can take no interest in any branch of the subject but his own—a form of selfishness has swallowed up everything, and he sees, as it were, with a single eye.

The characters of the men vary: some plod on, and are diffident, and doubt to the last—but *their doubting convinces others*. Some are unduly modest; some so conceited, that they describe the outer world by a negation, calling them “Nicht Arabisch” or “Nicht Sanskrit,” dividing the human race into *Savans*, or non-*Savans*. Some are too daring, using the divining rod too freely, dashing off a hundred suggestions, and conflicting interpretations of the same inscriptions, so as to generate a feeling of distrust in spite of their profound knowledge. Some are so presumptuous, that unsupported by long study or tested knowledge, they are sure of themselves, resent contradiction or suspended judgment on their theories, lavish abuse on those who venture to differ,

consider a critique to be good only on condition that it agrees with their views, and denounce the writer as ignorant who has an opinion of his own: such a writer expresses undue confidence in his own ideas, all the stronger, because he possesses the whole article himself, not one single person taking a share, except his much injured, and much suffering, wife, who like the consort of the Prophet Mahomet, allows herself to be convinced for the sake of the peace of the house:—of all phases this is the most contemptible.

The wife of the scholar often sits by his side, sharing his narrow quarters for a quarter of a century, and, while he is picking the most intricate locks, and solving the most difficult puzzles, that an extinct language can supply, she knows nothing about it from the first to the last, or at least understands nothing. She listens to his abuse of his fellow-labourers; she is present while he talks with his friends; she hears his mutterings in his sleep, she knows his last work by the look of it on the shelves, but often that is all, and it is as well: if she had unusual intelligence she might possibly differ: if she had none, as is most probably the case, nothing could make her understand the subtle points at issue, which it requires a special education to approach. And there is another feature of the life of the scholar: the practiser of the Law goes out in the morning to his work, and for all that his wife knows, may spend his day in the grossest immoralities, but he returns home at the usual hour fresh, and with an aroma of the outer world, to cheer his home: the Doctor is in and out at all hours; and so on with other professions; but the student and scholar has his workshop in his home, and has no occasion to go forth and mix among his fellows, except on the occasions of giving a Lecture as professor, or the meeting of a learned society, or a visit to his Publisher—if he has faith in his stars, he may say to himself, with Telemachus—(Odyss. I. 302).

*αλκιμος εσσ'ινα τιν ας και οψιγονων εν ειπη*

And in very deed his name may hereafter be pronounced with reverence like these of Champollion, Burnouf, Colebrooke and Horace Wilson, or with a laugh like that of——, or with a sigh like that of Goldstücker and Deutch, and many another, the lengthening of whose days would have made the world wiser.

Some die “opere in medio,” with their papers and notes in confusion, and the table and desk of the scholar is generally in that state; the materials collected, but the arranging mind gone: on the last page of the incomplete work may be inscribed—“He fell asleep here” and “sulle pagine Cadde la stanca man.” Stores of painfully accumulated knowledge are all wasted; pigeon-holes of memory stuffed with quotations and references are all

rendered useless:—a great reputation lost for ever, as the tired scholar lays some evening his head down on his great work, never to lift it up again from the leaf, on which his amanuensis finds it stiffened next morning, when he comes in to ask for more copy. To that scholar there are no more secrets as to the Origin of Language: he has got to the bottom of the Myth or the Reality of the Tower of Babel at last. On the tomb of Beer an inscription was carved in the Sinaitic characters, the secret of which he had unravelled,—a well deserved trophy to one who died a martyr. Some may have the good fortune of possessing good and capable sons, like deRongé, to whom it is a privilege to arrange and edit the manuscripts of their deceased parent. Some may, like Champollion, be great enough, and blessed enough to leave a school of devoted followers whose delight it has been, like the companions of Mahomet, to catch up every word of their great master: this is not generally the case: the premature death of an Oriental scholar means literary bankruptcy. In the obituary notice of a dead worker we too often read the sad announcement of "unfinished work found among his papers," the "last portion of the treatise unwritten," or we hear of voluminous collections of materials for a Dictionary quite useless except to the Master mind which, like the Prince in the Fairy tale, alone had the power of sorting the confused heap of commingled feathers. It would add to the bitterness of death, or cause the body of the dead man to turn in his coffin, to know, that the task of finishing his work was entrusted to some incapable blunderer, or some hated rival.

There is yet another class, to whom some may refuse the name of scholars, but whose scholarly tastes, and wide range of acquirement, place them as far above the mere scholar as a Jurist is above a Case-Lawyer. Such was the Duc de Luynes in France, and such are many retired Anglo-Indians, who after years of active employment have a sufficient range of culture to take an interest nearly, or entirely, all down the line of Oriental research. Such men are found listening with interest to Dr. Morris on the *Cursor Mundi*, to Dr. Martin Haug on the *Viragnamul* of the Parsces, to Dr. Edkins on his theories of old Chinese pronunciation, to Brugsch Bey on his *Papyri*; and last, not least, to Rawlinson, Oppert, and Schrader on the latest revelation in the *Cueei-form*. Such men are too wise to write books, and lose their peace of mind: they prefer reading, and forming an opinion on the books of others: perhaps their knowledge is too diluted, or spread like gold over too large a surface: but they form that intelligent public, which is a necessity to an author, and they are free from those enmities, those prejudices, that dead weight of envy, hatred and malice, which make grave Oriental scholars as sensi-

tive and irritable as concert singers and ballet dancers, and exhibit such deplorable absence of nobility of character.

"Oh ! that mine enemy had written a book ! " "How these *Savans* hate each other ! " Such sentiments must rise up in the mind of the most casual observer : the "Odium Literarium" is something worse than the "Odium Theologicum." Fierce invectives in a Preface denounce a rival work : jealousy as to priority of discovery in an age, when needs be there must be often simultaneous arrival at the same result from the same data : general depreciation of every one : the title of charlatan liberally circulated : an extreme littleness of disposition : most illiberal, most unjust, and unworthy insinuations :—the spectacle would be saddening, were it not ridiculous.

"Ce n'est pas la paix, c'est la guerre que M. Halevy est venu apporter dans ce monde" was the remark of M. Renan in the last annual Report of the Société Asiatique with regard to this Free-lance ; who, armed at all points by profound knowledge, but deficient in common sense, wages war single-handed against the company of Assyriologues, Egyptologues, and interpreters of Monumental Inscriptions generally.

The din of battle sounds on all sides : a remark made thirty years before is neither forgiven nor forgotten. Fierce quarrels have lasted a whole life, have destroyed the serenity of scientific meetings, have only been allayed by death, even if then, for to either of the combatants it would impair the bliss of Paradise to have the other man *there*. Pauthier and St Julien, the only two Frenchmen of their time, who were masters in Chinese, have managed to carry on their life-long war "*outre le tombe*" by leaving for posthumous publication, discordant translations of the same work. In one celebrated seat of English learning the only two men, who have knowledge of the great Aryan master-language, refuse to hold any intercourse with each other. Still the volumes of the greatest enemies, the most unkindly rivals, rest peacefully side by side on the shelves of the student, who is able to utilise the great good that can be extracted from both, and laugh at his ease at the follies of the wise, the weaknesses of the strong.

As a rule the centre fight is betwixt the armies of France and Germany, with the English army looking on. Sedan and the occupation of Paris leave their traces even in Oriental literature. Like the head of Charles I. in Uncle Dick's work, contemporary politics will crop up at most unexpected opportunités. While discussing the wars of Assyria and Babylon, 800 B. C., M. Lenormant descends to the humiliating littleness of dragging in the ingratitude of the French Chamber to M. Thiers, with reference to one of the campaigns of Sargon. As in the Homeric wars, so throughout the whole field of Oriental research, there are desperate hand-to-hand

fights going on ; and by a strange attraction, or repulsion, we find generally a Frenchman on one side, and a German on the other. The duel is sometimes triangular, or even quadrangular. Fire is no doubt struck out of the weapons of the combatants, and the gold of truth is wrought out, and refined in the furnace of controversy ;—and so far the world is a gainer. Gradually, gradually, certain great truths work themselves beyond the arena of dispute—they are removed beyond the debateable ground : no one would now-a-days question the classification of Bopp, the law of Grimm, the hieroglyphic interpretation of Champollion, the translations from the Cuneiform of the great company of Assyriologues ; but impudent frauds, and foolish theories, and down-right forgeries, do sometimes crop up, and have to be coughed down, or laughed down, or trampled down till they are put aside and forgotten. Other great questions, such as the nature of the Proto-Babylonian language by whatever name known, the proper principles of Vedic interpretation, the proper translation of certain inscriptions, Hymaritic, Berber, Punic, Cypriote, Etruscan, Lycian, are still the subject of vehement, shifting, and bitter, controversy.

It must not be supposed, that the feeling of the general body of scholars and authors does not revolt and protest against the puerile license of recrimination and abuse in which great men have indulged against their literary adversaries. More than once in the report of the Société Asiatique of Paris, the subject has been noticed with regret and reproof: authors seem hardened to it, but the outside world regards with feelings of disgust the exhibitions of petulance. The saddest feature is, that greatest scholars have been the greatest offenders against the laws of good feeling and good taste ; and the Editor of the *Revista Italiana* in commenting on the discreditable controversies betwixt Weber, Whitney, and Max Müller, remarks that these scholars, after having accomplished work worthy of giants, commence to prick each other with pins, as if they were dwarfs and buffoons—they forget Niebuhr's noble advice to scholars : “ If in laying down our pen we cannot “ say that we have knowingly written nothing that is not true ; “ if without deceiving ourselves or others, we have not presented “ our most odious opponents only in such a light that we could “ justify it on our death-beds, study and literature serve only to “ make us unrighteous and sinful.” And we fear very much that such is the case.

It is difficult to say to which of the three great nations the palm must be awarded of the greatest violation of good manners. We have already alluded to the really disgraceful controversies of the great French Sinologues, but what shall be said of the abuse of the English language made by Max Müller and his great American rival, which so much diminishes the value, and certainly

the beauty, of their latest works? The late Sanskritist, Goldstücker, in one of his greatest works, has allowed himself a license of abuse, quite unwarranted by the abstract nature of the subject, regarding which there is ample room for a variety of opinion.

We return now to a detail of the constituent parts of each company. A large and important portion of the Aryan, or Indo-European family, does not come within the scope of this notice: two branches only of the family belong to Asia, the Indian and the Iranian. They were closely united, and held together long after the other branches had left their original home, and migrated to the West, where they occupied the whole of Europe in successive waves of colonization. The Indian branch is represented by the magnificent Sanskrit; the descendants from Sanskrit in the first generation, known by the names of Prakrit and Pali; and the descendants in the second generation, known by the name of the Aryan Vernaculars of India and Ceylon, *viz.*, Hindi, with its congener Hindustani, Punjabi, Bengali, Uriya, Marathi, Sindhi, Gujarati and Singalese. The study of Sanskrit is so wide-spread, and so renowned, and Sanskritists are so numerous and well-known, that it will be sufficient to mention the most distinguished living scholars, leaving any minuter detail to another opportunity. A mere enumeration of names is unreadable. England is represented by Muir, Monier Williams, Cowell, Griffith, Johnson, Burnell, Boyd, and Gough. France is represented by Moli, Pavie, Foncaux, Breal, Oppert, Garrey. Italy is represented by Gaspar Gorresio. Germany has produced a very host, Lassen, Benfey, Weber, Roth, Aufrecht, Boltingeck, Brockhaus, Stenzler, Max Müller, Haug, Spiegel, Pischel, Rost, Kielhorn, Buhler, Eggeling, Thibaud, Gildermeister, and Hoefer. The United States of America are represented by two excellent scholars, Whitney and Hall. The Minor States of Europe are represented by Westergaard from Denmark, and Kem from Holland. India has worthy representatives in Iswara Chandra Vidyasagara, Bhandakar, Krishna Mohun Banerjea, Taranaka Tarka Vachaspati, Shankur Pandorung, Jitananda Vidyasagara, and others for whom we have no space.

Passing on to the descendants of Sanskrit, we find a fresh cluster of scholars. Pali has been illustrated by Childers, Kuhn, Sen-nast, Fausboll, Feer, Minayeff D'Alwys, Rhys David, Sir Muṭu Comara Swami, Weber, Westergaard; and Prakrit by Cowell, Hoeffer, Lassen, and Pischel.

The Aryan Vernaculars of India and Ceylon have been worked by a very host, of whom the most conspicuous living members are Garçin de Tassy, Beames, Trumpp, Platts, Dowson, Hall, Eastwick, Monier Williams, Etherington, Max Müller. In this branch we are perplexed by the number of names, and the difficulty of making a selection, which is necessary: it must be recol-

lected that many names ought to appear over and over again, as belonging to several families, and several branches. Our remarks must necessarily be incomplete.

The second branch of the Asiatic portion of the Aryan Family is the Iranic, of far less importance and notoriety than its Indian sister. The monuments of this family have come down to us in the form of inscriptions on stone, which are the actual originals, and of manuscripts which may be copies of copies in a long succession, and of uncertain date, and open to great suspicion of alteration. The earliest form of the language may be called "Avestan," or "old Bactrian," or by the generally received, though incorrect term of "Zend." Descended from these in the first generation we have another language of uncertain nomenclature called Pehlavi, or Pazend or Huyvaresh, and the celebrated language of Persian. The language of the Afghans called the Pushtu, and that of the Balochis is asserted by some, and denied by others of less authority, to be of the same branch of the Aryan family.

The elder form of this branch has been worked by Anquetel de Perron, Burnouf, Raske, Martin Haug, Spiegel, Jamasji, Lenormant, West, Andreas, Westergaard, Olshausen, Longperier, Mordtman, Dorn, Weber and Lassen.

Persian is represented by many distinguished scholars:—Vullers, Zotenbrug, Baubier de Meynard, Chodyko, Ouseley, Blochmann, Mohl, and a large number beside.

Pushtu has been illustrated by Trunpp, Raverty, Bellew, and Dorn.

With the exception of Persian, a living vernacular, and the early Persian of the Shahnamah, free from Arabic admixture, all the rest that is known of this branch is the absolute creation of the present generation, being the result of the brilliant resuscitation of the language of the Avestan by Burnouf, and the discovery of the key of the Persian cuneiform inscriptions by Grotfend.

Next in order to the Aryanists stand the Semites, with their three languages of the first rank, closely allied to each other, and maintaining a kind of chronological sequence, Hebrew, Syriac, and Arabic, the vehicles of the dogmatic writings of the Jew, Christian, and Muhammadan. It is an astonishing fact, that no Vernacular languages should have been generated in this family, though its vocabulary has been so largely used to enrich the languages of other families, such as the Persian, the vernaculars of India, and the Turkish. To this family must be credited the scanty relics of the Phoenician, the Samaritan, the Moabite, the Punic, the Himyaritic dialects, and the languages of Abyssinia ancient and modern. A numerous and influential body of scholars have devoted themselves to the boundless treasures of this

family. The study of Hebrew has for centuries been an important portion of European study, and in late years the study of Syriac and Arabic has received a large development. It is hopeless to approach even any certainty in forming such a catalogue. We name at random, Noldeke, Neubauer, Ewald, Pusey, Renan, Cull, Delitz, Fleischer, Movers, Palmer, Wright, De Goeje, Dozy, Sprenger, De Slane, Gayangos, and Nutt. Possibly we may be unconsciously omitting some of the greatest scholars, and we must beg that the above be taken only as a sample.

Extraordinary progress has been made on every side of the subject: texts, translations, commentaries, grammars, and dictionaries have been published in profuse abundance. The discovery of the Semitic "Assyriau" has let in a new light on the subject, by introducing a language perhaps earlier than, certainly contemporary with, Hebrew, and closely allied to it. At the same time the collection of sporadic inscriptions in every part of the Semitic country has exercised the ingenuity, and sharpened the polemical appetite of rival schools, while they supplied solid additions to linguistic knowledge. The disinterred palaces of Nineveh, the Moabite Stone, the Himyaritic inscriptions of Arabia, the scratchings on the Rocks of the Sinaitic Peninsula, remnants of old Tyre and Carthage, have placed original documents in the hands of the scholar, by which the manuscripts, which are all comparatively modern, can be checked.

Fatigued with the glories, embarrassed with the wealth, stunned by the noise, and rather put out of thoughts by the pride of the Aryan and Semitic scholars, we fly with quiet satisfaction to the domain of the Sinologues; not that we shall necessarily find peace there, but we find a study in the comparative freshness of youth, great hope for the future, satisfaction with the results of the present generation. The subject of the progress of Chinese research is one worthy of special and separate illustration, and the sketch should include the whole of the monosyllabic Family. Among the scholars, who have widened our knowledge, and from many of whom we expect much still, we may mention Legge, Edkins, Medhurst, Alcock, Harvey de St Denys, Leon de Rosny, Summers, Wade, Williams, Aston and others.

The Egyptologists occupy a ground of transcendent interest; and, though much has been done, they have work sufficient to employ the scholars of this and the next generation, in interpreting the material with which all the Museums of Europe are crowded. A strong light now blazes on Egypt: excavations are being made under orders of the Khedive, who has two accomplished scholars, Brugsch Bey, a German, and Mariette Bey, a Frenchman, in his employ. The astounding historical results of this study attract an attention, which will not be relaxed; and no

difficulties of access can keep back the curious, and no religious prejudices stand in way of research. Among the great names in the world of hieroglyphics are Lepsius, Chabas, Maspero, Ebers, Birch, Le Page Renouf, Eisenlohr, Goodwin, Cook, Pierret, Lieblein, Brugsch, and Mariette.

The subject is too large, too fascinating, to be disposed of in a few lines in the midst of a survey of the whole linguistic world ; we hope to return to it at some future time. Attached to this company, more by geographical than by linguistic considerations, is the Berber language of North Africa. From the starting point of their province, of Algeria the French scholars have made good use of their opportunities of research into the Chamitic dialects of North Africa, by whatever name known. All that has been found is of the nature of inscriptions, which very much exercise the ingenuity of the palaeographical *Savant*.

Under the head of Assyriologues are, as was stated above, illogically grouped all those who have consecrated their time and talents to the interpretation of the cuneiform inscriptions of Western Asia. The Assyrian monuments are the most numerous, and occupy a middle place as regards time, betwixt the Proto-Babylonian (called also Accadian and Sumerian) who invented the system of ideographs stamped by a wedge-shaped stylus on soft clay, and the lordly Achaemenides, who wrote their decrees, which alter not, on the rock of Bisutur, or the palace of Per-epolis, or the tomb of Cyrus at Murghab in the latest fashion of these characters, worn down into the form of an alphabet. We trust to return to this subject also at a future date. Year after year we depute skilled searchers to bring home further treasures, and we know not what new discoveries and surprises may be in store for us. Up to the present moment it is considered that there are the following separate cuneiform systems : Proto-Babylonian ideographs in a Turanian language : Assyrian syllabaries in a Semitic dialect, in which also are the inscriptions at Van in Armenia : of this there is an older, and a more modern variety. On the rock of Bisutur is the first tablet ; and on the ruins in Persia Proper, are the Persian alphabetic cuneiforms in an Aryan language. In the second tablet of the rock of Bisutur, in Susiana, are inscriptions in a syllabic character and a Turanian language. It is necessary to state this to show that there is, as it were, a little world represented in three distinct families of languages, three distinct systems of writing, the Ideographic, Syllabic, and Alphabetic, and at least seven distinct systems of characters, though to the outer world known under the general term of cuneiform. The science is, therefore, in its vigorous youth : materials already collected are unexhausted : uncollected materials exist beyond calculation, but entirely of the

character of inscriptions on stone, metal, and baked earth. Among the scholars devoted to this branch, we may mention at random, Rawlinson, G. Smith, Sayce, Fox Talbot, Geldart, Oppert, Menaut, Lenormant, Schrader, Lassen, Westergaard, Olshausen and Delitzeh.

The last separate field is the so-called Turanian : and of this great receptacle for unclassed languages we can lop off, as far as our subject is concerned, all that lies beyond the limits of Asia. A further classification can be made by dividing the remnant into North and South : of the South the great Dravidian family exists entirely in British India : of the family, as a whole, Caldwell is the greatest and, perhaps, sole representative : the names of Gundert and Burnell are deserving of mention. In the South subdivision are also the Kolarian family of Central India, and that great cluster of languages on the eastern confines of British India, including the Himalayan mountains, the valley of the Brahmaputra, British Burnah, Siam, and the Malay Peninsula and Archipelago. A great harvest awaits the labourers in this quarter ; and it is not creditable that so little should have been done, and such little system in what has been done. In the last ten years great activity has been displayed, and numerous works published by authors not yet recognised as scholars, though valued as pioneers. It would be a mere registering of unknown names, to give a list ; but some names have already achieved a European reputation in this field—and we note among them Dr. Hunter, Brian Hodgson, Max Müller, Judson and Mason, for the languages within British India—and for the Malay-speaking regions Vander Tuck, de Groot, Roorda, Van Hoevell, as the Dutch have very much the monopoly of this language.

But the names we have given are those of the living scholars only : time and space would fail us if we would attempt to speak of the dead—the mighty dead—resting from their labours, of each of whom it may with truth be said, that “though dead he still speaketh.” They have gone beyond the tribunal of human praise or blame, but left their works behind. How grand and kightly do the figures of Champollion and Burnouf stand out amidst the haze of the past, like Raphael among painters, superior even to the envy of their contemporaries. When Burnouf fell, not only were lost to science the further revelations which that splendid and trained genius would have made, but the principal fire was extinguished, from which the youth of that generation, the scholars of the next, used to gather their inspiration. We think with reverence of the schools of Sylvestre de Sacy and Horace Hayman Wilson. Knowledge has gone far beyond the high water level of their time ; but the novelty of the study, the great variety of their attainments, surrounded them at that

time with a dignity, and after the lapse of years, with a halo, which is now unattainable. Every scholar, every successive generation, owes a debt of gratitude to the great discoverers, or the mighty pioneers, such as Grotfend, Champollion, Burnouf, and Colebrooke. It may be that they were fortunate in being the first in the field, that the general knowledge was so fast advancing that the ripe fruit must soon have fallen. Such may be said of all inventors and discoverers. Many had failed before them. After ages at least do justice to patient and *truthful* scholars.

There are certain authors, who from time to time thrust themselves forward on a much enduring public, of a very different character. We mention one case, as the author has passed beyond the arena of criticism, and it is typical of others. A country clergyman, of a most narrow religious type, with no knowledge of language or palæography in the proper sense of these terms, nor well read in the works of others, presumes to rush into the field on three of the greatest subjects of Oriental investigation of the time, the Sinaitic Inscriptions, the Egyptian Hieroglyphics, and the Cuneiform Systems of Western Asia. This gentleman swept away, as with a feather broom, the labours of Champollion, Lipsius, Grotfend, Burnouf, Rawlinson, Beer, and Credner, and substituted a baseless theory of a primeval language and character, which he found in the Arabic dictionary; and to this one type he triumphantly reduced to his own satisfaction the above mentioned inscriptions, which have no one connecting link of date, or principle, or language. Such books can only be passed over by scholars in silence, but they do infinite mischief by misleading the general public and thus causing them to mistrust the researches of real scholars. The manner of treatment was so plausible, that it would be quoted and read by many, who would never be aware what downright nonsense it contained. And here we may add that treatises on such subjects must necessarily be two-fold: either for the benefit of other scholars, and therefore technical and in detail, or in a popular form: and it is on this point that so large a portion of praise is due to Professors Max Müller and Whitney, who have done more than any other scholars to popularize the subject, and give correct information in a readable and entertaining garb.

Modesty and self-distrust are two of the chief tokens of a great scholar. Those who know something, get into the light, and then know how very little that light is: those who know next to nothing are still in outer darkness and have not light enough to measure the extent of their own ignorance. And to do good work, there must have been good training in a good school of comparative philology: the greatest industry, the most fortunate opportunities, will not enable a scholar to dispense with this condition.

The works of some otherwise valuable scholars are marred by this deficiency : the absence of proper training, and a sufficient breadth of reading lets itself be unconsciously seen, like the pronunciation of a boy not educated at a great public school.

Luck and a good constitution, in war, and politics, at the bar, and every other profession must have some influence. Poor Rosen, poor Leyden, poor Deutch !—*tulit alter honores* : they succumbed early, having made the way easy for others. On the other hand Colebrooke and Horace Hayman Wilson, Benfey, Lipsius, Westergaard, Lassen and others have worked every day of a very long life, and the result has been prodigious. The aid of a friend in power, by putting forward a young man of ability, enables him to secure a position at a time of life, when he can cultivate his talents and secure a hearing. Without detracting from the great merits of Max Müller we may say, that he would probably not have risen so early to distinction but for the judicious assistance of Bunsen, who helped him down to the well, leaving no doubt some better men on the steps, waiting for some helping hand.

The true scholar must feel that it is of the essence of his profession to be led occasionally into error. In the course of investigations, where there is so much guessing, so much hypothesis, so much strained analogy, there must be time lost in constructing and pulling down, in advancing, and retracing one's steps, in casting about with the diviner's rod, until at last the right vein is struck, the right nail is hit on the head, the right interpretation or deduction made. Each man should be to his own works the severest critic and censor : his own consciousness should gradually lead him to see his error, and, as perfectness and truth must be the object of all true research, to correct it. It must be trying to scholars, who have passed their maturity to come suddenly on such a new revelation as Bopp's Comparative Grammar, and to see so many of their castles of card swept to the ground ; but it is one of the conditions of advancing knowledge to be liable to such great changes of fruit, and all epochs and all fields of inquiry have known them. It is wiser to accept the new truth, than to be left stranded, or impotently to contend against what is accepted by others upon grounds which cannot be gainsaid. Ask any of the great scholars mentioned a few lines back, who are now approaching, or have past, their seventieth year, how much they have had to unlearn, steps to take back, rolls of manuscript to put behind the fire, before they arrived at conclusions which satisfied themselves and others. No one can read Bunsen's works without wishing that he had lived a little longer, and enjoyed the advantage of the discoveries, of the advance down the line, made since his death.

Attention was drawn in the *Journal of the Société Asiatique* some thirty years ago, to the degree of attention and patronage extended by the Governments of France, England, Germany and Russia respectively, to the extension of Oriental studies and research. Though somewhat coloured with that amusing self-love, which compels a Frenchman to view everything through patriotic spectacles, still in the main the judgment expressed was discriminating and correct. Of course France had done more for Oriental science than any other country. Professorial chairs had been founded, books and manuscripts collected, expeditions undertaken to foreign countries; special types had been founded for the publication of Oriental works: the scholars themselves had been encouraged by honours, by pensions, by flattering distinctions; but whatever had been done, was confined to Paris, and a very limited circle in Paris: no portion of the general education of the people had been touched, no works were published in a popular form, no interest whatsoever was felt by the general public.

In England nothing is done by the State for Oriental literature, as in fact nothing is done for any branch of science: such matters are left to the disposal of associations and corporate bodies. The Universities are very rich, but they also do nothing at all; there are no proper Oriental chairs. The Sanskrit chair was the endowment of a private person. There are magnificent libraries, abundance of learned ease, but absolutely nothing is done. The public, however, do not neglect the subject. Large sums have been devoted to the Oriental Translation Fund and the Oriental Text Fund. Associations are formed, voyages are undertaken, missionary bodies are established, there is a countless out-turn of translations of the Holy Scriptures, dictionaries, grammars, and texts, all by the means of private subscriptions. Conspicuous above all had, in former days, been the great East India Company, which had been lavish in its patronage of Oriental literature. From the servants of that great Company has sprung up a constant crop of ripe scholars, who obtained their first taste for the subject at Hileybury or Addiscombe Colleges. All is changed now; there is no native army to supply new scholars; the Civil Service, as now recruited, may contain able men, but few Oriental scholars. The blank is already felt; a scant gleaning of perhaps four Oriental scholars is left in the united Civil Service of British India. The Secretary of State for India has not inherited the liberality with the power of his predecessors; and even in the last few months, an application made by the Royal Asiatic Society for assistance in preparing the all important "Corpus Inscriptionum" of India, has been met by a recommendation to undertake this truly Imperial work by the means of private associations.

What has Germany done? It has supplied the workmen: a

nation without colonies or commerce to absorb the flower of their youth, has supplied the raw material for forming Missionaries, *Savans*, Librarians, Editors, Lexicologers, Translators and Critics. A great number of small Universities and professorial chairs, a simple manner of life and a cheap system of education, have resulted in spreading Oriental knowledge over a much wider surface, and supplying a crop of well-grounded men to do the literary work of Europe. But, with some remarkable exceptions, such as Max Müller, Bopp, Lassen and others, whose names will occur to our readers, the tendency of German scholarship is to literary brick-making, rather than to literary architecture. The German Government have not been wanting in liberal assistance; expeditions have been despatched, such as that headed by Lipsius to Egypt: and magnificent additions made to Royal museums and libraries, sometimes, as in the case of the late Shapira Potteries, with more haste than judgment.

The smaller kingdoms of Denmark, Sweden, Belgium and Holland have not been wanting, and especially the latter: but the Dutch colonies are managed on principles abandoned even in Japan. However, though conducted on low principles, the Government of Java is liberal to science. Italy, which was once the foremost, and whose existence was effaced from the catalogue of nations, has now assumed its place. Spain and Portugal are as stolid and ignorant as Turkey itself; and it is a sure mark of an ignorant people, that they take no thought to instruct others.

We come to the last and, perhaps the greatest, the Russian Empire. It has done its duty to science, whatever may have been its motive; but each adjacent country, that heard that the peculiarities of its language were being studied at St. Petersburg, must have felt a cold shudder, such as men are said to feel when the spots destined to be their graves are trodden upon; it must have occurred to them, that a rod was in pickle for them, and a deadly fascination must have come over them, as when a serpent is first spied by its prey. Thirty years ago, German scholars of repute were salaried to learn the languages of Armenia and Georgia; both countries have since been absorbed. A flank movement round the Caspian brings Russia in face of a great Muhammadan people, and simultaneously Professor Dorn publishes at St. Petersburg a grammar of the Pushtu language, though the legitimate interest of Russia in the Afghan people is not obvious. Further inquiry brings to notice the preparation of grammars of the Mandchu and Mongol languages: in fact, grammatical study is the advance-guard of conquest. Kazan has become a city of printing presses, but with a view to the administration of conquered provinces, a kind of military propaganda. As Rome sought to enclose the world in a spiritual net, so Russia seeks physical aggrandizement.

There is no public in Russia of any kind to appreciate such Oriental studies : they are but a portion of the rolling stock of the great railway of absorption.

We have alluded, in an earlier portion of this article, to the existence of learned societies. Let us consider more closely the "*raison d'être*" of such associations ; they are in fact the offspring of a kind of protestantism against the effeteness of existing institutions ; they play the part of prophets against the antiquated and sluggish priesthood ; they consist of selected members from a larger and more inert mass, endowed with a greater elasticity of combination, and a greater vigour of proceeding.

Twice in late years such associations have sprung into existence. First, at the time of the Renaissance, when the established schools were quite out of harmony with the aspirations and necessities of the time : then it was that the few enlightened associated themselves, and at length reformed education, and the Universities, and the conventional limits of knowledge ; and, having done their work, they ceased to exist. At this time the study of Greek and Latin authors was introduced ; and a long period followed, during which the work of classicizing Europe was slowly carried out.

In our days has come the second occasion—a new world has come into existence. *Ex Oriente Lux* ; we have found the existing institutions unequal to the burden, and unwilling to move onwards. From this cause have sprung into existence associations, which have gradually reached the whole mass. Slowly education, schools, and Universities are reforming themselves. Scholars, linked together, have made themselves heard. The existing learned Societies were all founded soon after the peace of 1815. There was then a general development of intellectual activity, and great interest in all things ancient exhibited by all classes. The East came in for its share ; and many men of great distinction and wealth joined Oriental Societies from general love of learning : not only London, but also Paris and other Continental cities felt the same movement. But as time went on, this influential class has died out, and no recruits have succeeded to the vacancies caused by death ; and, as the members of the societies have become more strictly Oriental scholars, the income and influence of the Associations have diminished : the real reason has been that the reform to effect which these institutions were formed, has been more or less effected. Notably a great portion of the original object, which the Royal Asiatic Society laid before themselves, has been undertaken by the Government of India, which has been roused to a sense of its responsibilities. But a work still remains, and it is this. Missing pages of history have to be written, and existing pages to be re-written under the light of subsequent discoveries. The depth of previous ignorance would be more descanted upon

did not real scholars feel how little even now was known. The real object of the movement, which now sways the intelligent of Europe, and which is the *raison d'être* of Oriental Societies, is to approach nearer to the mechanism of the human mind, to scatter the mists of fable, and worse than fable, the oft-repeated historic lie ; to get at the real annals of the early world ; to enrich moral and social Science with the experience of the grand nations who peopled Asia four thousand years ago : to feel to the bottom of the religious sentiments and philosophical groundwork which influenced men of like passions as ourselves at that remote period : to trace the origin, migration, and fall of races and to give a larger and firmer basis to the history of the world. When this work is done, the Societies may dissolve, and the longer series of their Journals—the contemporary chronicles of the un-rolling of the great Palimpsest of the Past—may be discontinued.

The curtain has been gradually lifted up, that for the last twenty centuries has obscured the Oriental world. We now know secrets which the priests would not reveal to Herodotus, or Manetho, or Berossus ; perhaps the recollection, and right understanding of them had fairly died out before their time. We can handle and read Papyri, which Moses could never have seen, as before his birth they had been deposited in the tomb of some Egyptian sage, which has only now been compelled to give up its treasure, held so many centuries in the mummified hand, or hidden away in the cermements.

Still knowledge comes slowly—slowly creeping on, always gaining a point, sometimes making an advance down the whole line, amidst a multitude of hypotheses, the din of controversies, and alas ! no lack of shameless forgeries. And the result is the shaking to the foundation of every received date, the turning inside out of every accepted fact, the white-washing of some great historical characters, the lamp-blacking of others ; the propounding of the Eponyme theory, the abuse of the Myth theory, the wide extension of the Legend theory, till absolutely nothing solid remains. In his transcendental scepticism we find M. Renan in his report of the Société Asiatique of 1873 treating with scorn any one, who ventured to talk of Abraham, Isaac and Jacob, as real characters, or who did not allude to Moses *with reserve*. A soberer author, though of the same school, talked of the possibility of there having been one hundred Adams, and therefore one hundred separate seed plots of language. The pavement of History quakes beneath us—we walk

per ignes

Suppositos cineri doloso.

We give up with a sigh, and a wrench of conscience, the Garden of Eden and the Biblical heroes of our infancy, and at the same

time we are requested to give implicit credence to new truths disinterred from a tomb, which has been sealed up for four thousand years. Archbishop Ussher and his theory of Chronology are placed out of court. Fifteen thousand years are required as the least possible interval betwixt Abraham and the Creation, which event is not easily dispensed with, though the Deluge shrinks up into a local flood. No wonder that an astonished Clergyman on one occasion rose to remind his hearers that the Society to which they belonged, and at which they listened to such astounding novelties, was one of *Biblical Archaeology*.

What will be the feelings of the next generation, if they find themselves with no new worlds to conquer? Is it possible that they will think this generation slow, or diffident, or unduly conscientious, or without the power of gestation of theories and paradoxes? At any rate we of this generation have the better of our successors on some points. There can be no new Egyptian hieroglyphics to decipher, no new Assyrian palaces to disinter, no new China and Japan to discover. There can be no new Sanskrit grammars to study, no new sacred literatures, such as those which are enshrined in Pahlavi and Pali, to unfold: no new libraries to catalogue in Europe, no old ones in Asia or Africa to rifle: we have them on the hip there.

But let the over-confident pause for a moment in the midst of his egotistical presumption, and think what place his book will occupy in 1900. Will it exist at all, be read at all, or will it have found its way to the trunk-maker, or be reduced to mere useful pulp, or kept in a dishonored existence? It is humbling, but salutary, to reflect that the merest schoolboy of Macaulay, the very baby in arms, will laugh some favourite theories to scorn, as being so stupidly wrong, when seen in the light of subsequent discoveries. But let a scholar do his work thoroughly, issue it modestly, and admit and correct his errors as they are pointed out, and he will hand down to posterity a brick—a good brick, which will occupy a position in the wall for ever. Controversy within bounds is good, is indispensable.

“Il faut a de pareilles problèmes des esprits variés, opposés même, provoquant d'écoles contraires, abordant la question avec des outils divers, et avec la résolution de ne céder à aucun préjugé.”

So wrote a deep thinker.

All scholars and authors would do well to reflect on the fierce light which in the next generation will fall upon them, and if their lives are prolonged, they may find that they have outlived their epoch, that knowledge has progressed to a stratum beyond their scene: that all their labours are incorporated and assimilated by some young author, who forgets to thank the writer, to whom

he is indebted for his teaching, though he does not forget to point out his inaccuracies. All that was true in his discoveries has become part of the general inheritance of acquired knowledge.

It has been justly remarked, that for many years less attention is paid by the English public at large to Oriental literature than has been paid on the Continent. The reason is obvious: we have to deal with the East practically, and this rubs off much of the romance that surrounds the subject in the vision of the untravelled scholar. Anglo-Indians know the Hindu Pandit as a dirty, half-naked fellow—with a deficiency of hair upon his head and a most offensive breath from over-indulgence in the betelnut: we remember the Muhammadan Maulavi as a conceited illiberal personage with a turban of unusual proportion: to the untravelled foreigner a certain amount of sanctity and reverence has attached itself to the idea of the Indian sage. The flower of the youth of England throw themselves into the more exciting professions; and those who have obtained distinction as Oriental scholars, are generally not professors or schoolmasters, but the soldier, the civilian, the medical man, who in the midst of his proper avocations has indulged the bent of his genius. This gives a greater manliness and larger-heartedness to his views, though it diminishes his accuracy, and profoundness of knowledge. Moreover it saves him from the Scylla of the Société d'Admiration Mutuelle, which is the snare of some professorial cliques, and the Charybdis of Immortal Hatred, which is the bane of others. The practical bent of his mind saves him from devoting a life to a really useless work—a mere intellectual *tour de force*, such as M. Renan describes in the following biting sarcasm:—

Quel gout du travail il a fallu pour mener a terme une pareille œuvre de patience, qui ne peut avoir d'autre récompense, que le plaisir qu'on a trouvé de l'exécuter.

This is in the Report of the *Société Asiatique* for 1875: and again:—

Quelques personnes regrettent, que cet eminent philologue dépense en apres critiques contre les travaux de ses confrères une part d'activité que pourrait être mieux employée

The fact is that when science has become a profession, the means are sometimes mistaken for the object, and the real point is lost sight of. Comparative philology is after all, in the opinion of all properly constituted minds, only a means towards the solution of most important philosophical and historical questions. As we rejected the scholar with the one eye only, and protested against the tyranny of Sanskrit in the republic of letters, so we would wish to distinguish the grand philological architect from the mere maker of bricks. Technical philology and critical

power of details of grammar, are excellent things ; but on one condition that they subserve to an inquiry into the history of the past, and a fuller knowledge of the progress of human intellect. To degrade linguistic science into a mere game of puzzles, a mere trial of strength in the way of resolving most points, is an act of sacrilege, something like playing at dice with the knuckle-bones of a saint. There have been botanists who have been deeply interested in counting the petals of a flower, and cared nothing for the perfume. Let us not hold them up as objects of imitation ; nor fall into the opposite error of believing what every literary charlatan may please to propound, who asserts that he has made a great discovery, and that nothing was known before his coming.

The close of the nineteenth century will find us only at the door of the temple. It is idle, with our present knowledge, to discuss the origin of language, or even the affinity of languages to each other, until we have more full and sufficient data. We cannot as yet approximate the well-worked Semitic and Aryan families—and outside them are vast families of languages, systems of stars and asteroïds, beyond the ken of our best linguistic telescopes. The men of the twentieth century will have this work before them, to utilize the material which we are diligently collecting. We look back with pity on the limited knowledge of the eighteenth century, because they knew little and did nothing. But the nineteenth century has gathered in an ample harvest from all quarters of the world ; and from this point of view the Oriental scholars are deserving of reverence, as ants of great labour, who have been storing honey during many a long year for the benefit of an unknown race of philologers, who will be born to profit therefrom.

## ART. VIII.—PATTANI (*PUTNEE*) TENURES.

THE inquiry into the origin of Indian institutions, must necessarily be attended with difficulty ; and though results are sometimes obtained, they are always open to doubt. The researches even of distinguished Orientalists are now-a-days being weighed in the scales of criticism and are sometimes found wanting. But a first inquiry, however erroneous, has always its advantages, inasmuch as it calls forth criticism, and generates further and active research on the subject. The object of the present paper is to throw out some suggestions regarding the *possible, probable* we dare not say, origin and signification of the word *pattani* (*putnee*) ; as well as to give some particulars about the tenure which goes by that name. This, we believe, is the first time that this subject has been discussed ; and, as a beginning, the inquiry must needs be very imperfect.

We begin by giving an extract from the definition of *pattani*, given by Professor Horace Hayman Wilson in his "Glossary of Indian Terms." "*Pattani*, more usually written *Patni* (Bengali পত্তনী, "পটনী"),—a tenure by which the occupant holds of a zemindar "a portion of the zemindary in perpetuity, with the right of "hereditary succession, and of letting or selling the whole or part "as long as a stipulated rent is paid to the zemindar, who retains "the power of sale for arrears, and is entitled to a regulated fee, "or fine upon any transfer ; the tenure created by an underletting "in the second degree is termed *Darpalni* (lease within lease), "and a third underletting is called *Sepatni* (from the Persian "se three). This description of sub-tenures originated in Burdwan, "being created by the Raja or zemindar ; it has been sanctioned "and extended by regulation. The word *pattani* or *patni*, is not "found in any dictionary, and is differently explained by those "who use it. Mr. Harrington (Analysis, vol. iii p. 519), says, "it may be rendered 'settled or established,' which is very ques- "tional. In the Sudder Dewanny Adawlut Reports, vol ii., "p. 99, *pattan* is said to be incorrectly interpreted 'dependant,' "whilst it really signifies "constituting"; but this is equally doubt- "ful. As the term originated in Burdwan, it must be Bengali, "but its omission from the dictionaries leaves it uncertain whether "it should be written with the cerebral or dental *t* : if with the "former, it probably bears a relation to *patta* or *potta* (পট্টা) a "lease ; if with the latter, to *pattana*, colonising : the former "seems the more likely." "*Pattana*," he says, "is a Sanskrit word, "and when used in Bengali, it means the first settling of a colony, "village or town." In Bengali, however, it also means, "the act of beginning : the laying of a foundation."

It would appear from the above, that Professor Wilson was not quite positive about the definition of this word ; but he goes too far when he states that " its omission from the dictionaries leaves it uncertain whether it should be written with the cerebral or dental t (ତ or ତ୍) ;" for while admitting, and rightly, that the word must be Bengali, he seems to have forgotten that the best test for determining the correct spelling was to observe how the people among whom the word originated, namely, the Bengalis, spelt it, or how they pronounced it. To this it might be objected that the philological law of *phonetic decay* may operate in tending to soften down the cerebral *t* into the dental *t*, but there was scarcely any fear of that in this case, considering that the *t* in the word *patta* ପାଟା is still spelt and pronounced by the natives as a cerebral, while that in *pattani* invariably by the dental, even in the distorted spelling of the courts of justice. Under these circumstances we are inclined to think that the word is Bengali (being derived from the Sanskrit word ପତ୍ତନ), that it has hardly any connection with the word *patta*, and that Professor Wilson's view that it is otherwise, is unsound. On the other hand its absence from dictionaries may be easily accounted for. Professor Wilson's " Glossary " appeared in 1854, when the light of European knowledge had only been beginning to illuminate Bengal, when the cultivation of literature and other collateral arts on a reformed principle can be said to have only commenced under the fostering care of the British Government, and when even Sanskrit dictionaries on the model of modern European lexicons, giving the philology of each word were rare (there were only two or three at the most), far less Bengali dictionaries. So that it is scarcely surprising that Professor Wilson could not find the origin of this word given in any Bengali book.

Taking *pattan* (ପତ୍ତନ) therefore as the original word, its derivation is obvious. Professor Wilson, Mr. Monier Williams, in their Sanskrit dictionaries, derive this word from the Sanskrit root *pat* (ପତ୍ତ) to fall, and add the *kridanta* or verbal affix (ତନ୍ତନ) *tanan* (dropping the latter *n*.) This view is also taken by Professor Taranath Tarkavachaspati in his Sanskrit Dictionary, the " *Sabdustomamahânidhi* " (ଶବ୍ଦତ୍ତୋମମାହାନ୍ତିଦି). \* The derivation is simple enough, but the meaning assigned to the word, *viz.*, " the first settling of a town or colony," is somewhat doubtful. The derivative meaning of the word *pattani* apparently *is something which falls or is derived from another.*

\*Some people try to derive the word from the Sanskrit root *pad* (ପଦ) with its affix *tanan* ତନ୍ତନ and assign as its meaning, "something to lay a foundation upon ;" *ex. gr.* ଡିକ୍ଟି

ପତ୍ତନ, *laying the foundation of a house.* The explanation is doubtless plausible, but nevertheless open to question.

and a *pattani taluq*, a *taluq* which comes out of another, namely, out of a parent zemindary. Mr. Harrington's definition, "settled" or "established," is taken exception to by Professor Wilson himself; while, on the other hand, the doubtful meaning given in the decision of the Sudder Dewanny Adawlut no way coincides with the one we have ventured to suggest.

This being so, we have only to inquire how the final *i* (ঈ) came to be affixed to the word; and for this purpose it will be necessary to dwell briefly on the state of Bengali society at the time of the Permanent Settlement. Centuries of Moslem rule had, like the English rule of the present day, tended to produce a considerable change in the habits, customs and mode of living of the people of Bengal; the effects of which on their language are even now felt most heavily. Even until very lately the education of a gentleman's son was not deemed complete unless he had read some Persian books at least; so that, not to speak of the *Rubakáris* of the courts of justice, and the *pottahs* and *kubulyets* of zemindari sheristahs, &c., the very conversation of a respectable native in his own family circle was much interlarded with Persian words and phrases. Sanskrit was studied only by the learned few, especially those who wanted to make a living by it; and few as they were, their influence was little felt in a society, a considerable portion of the members of which were votaries of the Persian. The Sanskrit grammar, therefore, had little to do with regulating the current of the vernacular; and substantives and verbs were formed in the way which best suited the whims of the people. Those who knew how to read and write, being, as we have mentioned before, mostly Persian scholars, made use of Persian words even where there were Bengali equivalents; and sometimes adopted the Persian terminology too; and this practice was carried to such an unwarrantable extent, that the laws which generally regulate the formation of a word in a language in the inflectional stage, entirely succumbed to the superior influence of Persianism, then almost all-powerful. This is sufficiently evidenced by the chequered language used at the present day in our courts of justice as well as in zemindari sheristahs. The baleful consequences of this practice can hardly be over-estimated from a linguistic point of view. In our own days, the extensive study of the English, to the sacrifice sometimes of the mother tongue, has produced among *Young Bengal*, a jargon, half English, half vernacular, which makes their ordinary conversation wholly unintelligible except amongst themselves; and the habit of speaking in this way, once acquired, stands not only in the way of expressing their thoughts with clearness solely in their own vernacular; but is also a hindrance to their becoming masters of a correct and idiomatic English style.

The termination *i* (ঈ) in the word *pattani* therefore, is evidently an out-come of the Persian influence ; having originated in a desire on the part of the Amlahs of the Burdwan Mahárájá's cutchery to form a substantive of the original word. We have examples of it in the words প্রতিনি,—a *hearing* ; দৃশ্যনি,— a *present*, &c. ; and though the termination as it stands, seems in some instances perfectly superfluous, it is easily accounted for by the fact that the generality of the respectable natives were perfectly innocent of Sanskrit grammar and its various inflections, and as such, did not care much about the grammatical accuracy or otherwise of their syntactical formations. If on the grounds above stated, the derivative definition we have given be accepted, we have only to submit that *Darpattani* and *Sepattani* are formed by the mere addition of the Persian words *dar* (sub) and *se* (three), as prefixes.

Then, as regards the origin of the tenure which, as is well known, originated with the Mahárájá of Burdwan. Now, the assessment of Chakla Burdwan (the estates comprised in the Burdwan Ráj) at the decennial settlement of the Lower Provinces, was very heavy compared with that in the other parts of the country, and left only a small margin to the Mahárájá as profits. The estate, too, comprehended several thousand lots, and extended over an area of several thousand square miles, where *khas* collection was almost an impossibility. Then again, the letting of these estates in perpetuity being expressly forbidden by the Revenue Code of 1793 (*Vide* Reg. XLIV of 1793), the Mahárájá had no other resource left but to let them in *ijárá* for a term of years. Considered with regard to the laws of political economy, these measures were injurious alike to the lands as well as to the cultivators. The *ijárádárs* (who passed under the various appellations *gántidárs*, *hudálárs*, *katkínálárs*, &c.) having no permanent interest in the land, cared little about improving the estates in their charge, while they tried every means in their power to extort as much money as they could from the helpless ryots. On the other hand they were as irregular as possible in the payment of the Mahárájá's dues ; who, however, had to pay off his heavy quarterlies to the Collectorate with the utmost punctuality on pain of having his broad acres publicly sold to the highest bidder. The Mahárájá left no remedy untried to enforce regularity from the defaulting middlemen. He had recourse to law, obtained decrees for arrear of rent, and not unoften, though illegally, seized upon their persons and confined them in a dungeon in his own palace. But all to no purpose. The *ijárádárs* had consumed the money they had collected, and consequently patiently underwent all the tortures inflicted upon them. The *diwáns* again misappropriated a large part of the money paid by the *ijárádárs*, when they did pay ; and thus many

of them not only became immensely rich, but turned independent landholders themselves. Many of the ijárádárs, who at the same time held responsible posts in the Mahárájá's *sherista*, got their holdings made *istamrari*, instead of only the temporary interest which they previously had, in utter defiance, as it would seem, of the spirit of the Regulations. This state of things could not continue long without telling very heavily on the Mahárájá's exchequer. He became involved in debt, and his affairs were very much embarrassed. Corruption reigned supreme throughout his vast establishment.

At length, so runs the story, Gourang Munshi, a kinsman of the famous Vishwanath Munshi, who played so prominent a part in the decennial settlement of the Ráj, entered the Mahárájá's service, and having prepared a draft of a regulation, took Kumár Pratáp Chánd\* with him to Calcutta, spent immense money in giving balls, &c to the members of the Government, and through Pratáp Chánd's influence and countenance, had his draft made law in the Council. This was the famous Regulation viii of 1819, the *Kanun Ashtam* of the inhabitants of Burdwan, and one of the most selfish enactments that ever emanated from a Legislature. It was a turning point in the history of the Burdwan Ráj. The old ijárádárs, many of whom had already secured permanent leases, were at one stroke made patnidars on payment of a certain sum of money as bonus; and the periodical sales of the defaulting tenures, under the regulation, served to ensure regularity in the realization of the rents. The peculiar feature of this regulation is the fact of the lease being saleable at the simple request of the zemindar, at his bare statement that an arrear is due, and on his responsibility. There is another feature in the working of this regulation which merits notice here. By a sale held under this Regulation, the purchaser acquires the tenure free from all incumbrances just as in the case of an entire estate sold for current arrears under Act. XI of 1859. And Burdwan being a district where the unculturable lands bear an immeasurably small proportion to the arable ones, the periodical patni sales there are more numerously attended, and larger prices are realised for the estates advertised than even at revenue sales held under the sunset law in any other district.

The patnidars again were allowed to sub-let their tenures to the second and the third degree; but the difference between taluks of the first and second degree, namely, the patni and the darpatni thus created by the Regulation is that the patni *kabulyet* gives the zemindar the power to sell the tenure twice every year on default of payment of rent, while the patnidar has his remedy only

---

\* Pratáp Chánd is styled Kumár because his father, the Mahárájá Tej Chandra, was then living.

by a regular suit for arrears of rent in the civil courts against his darpatnidár under the ordinary Rent Law, even if there were a similar clause in his *kabulyet*. This is also the relation between the darpatnidár and his under-tenant.

However injurious this system of continuous sub-infeudation may be to the cultivating ryot, it is allowed by law, and it has become an incurable malady among the landholders of the Lower Provinces, who consider the act of *khas* collection from the ryots a nuisance, and endeavour by all possible means to sub-let their lands and secure thereby a *pákká munásá* (an unfailing income) as if that were the *summum bonum*. This practice is nowhere more inveterate than in Burdwan, where almost all the lands are let in patni ; and one evil amongst others is that by this wholesale sub-letting the principal landlord of the district, the Mahárájá, never comes into contact with the ryots (many of whom, by-the-way, have a vague notion that he is somehow or other a pensioner under Government like some other titled noblemen of the country besides their *hukim*) ; and is therefore, except in so far as the power of alienation is concerned, no more a proprietor of his vast estates, in the sense in which political economists would consider the word than a collector of the district which he has charge of.

S. B. CHAUDHURI

## ART. IX.—CENTRAL INDIA IN 1857.

**I**N the beginning of the hot weather of 1857, Sir Robert Hamilton, the Governor General's Agent in Central India, was driven by ill health to Europe. Colonel Durand, who had been appointed to act for him, arrived at Indore on the 5th of April.

At this time there seemed to be no immediate danger that the new Agent's tenure of office would prove an unquiet one. The uneasy feeling which, during the last few months, had permeated the ranks of the Bengal Native Army, was apparently on the decrease. A perilous crisis had just been safely passed. The 19th Native Infantry, goaded into sudden mutiny a few weeks before by the story of the greased cartridges, had suffered itself to be quietly disarmed at Barrackpore, and its fate had provoked no overt expression of sympathy. April brought with it a general hope that the effect of this example, and the soothing assurances conveyed to the troops, might suffice to allay the prevailing spirit of insubordination or mistrust, that the wave of disaffection would die away as the circle widened. In Central India itself all seemed perfectly quiet. Writing to the Private Secretary on the 10th of April to announce his arrival, Colonel Durand found no topic of local interest more important than an outbreak of cholera in the city of Indore. But in truth India was on the eve of a terrible awakening. The storm was gathering to the northward, and it was not long before its first mutterings began to make themselves heard in the territories under the Agent's charge.

The earliest warning of trouble came from the most distant point of the Agency. On the 25th of April, Colonel Durand received information that a sepoy of the Bengal Native Infantry had been apprehended at Rewah, charged with the delivery of a treasonable missive to the Durbar. It was at first supposed that this man belonged to the disbanded 19th, but it turned out on enquiry that he was a private of the 37th Native Infantry, then stationed at Benares, immediately north of the Rewah State, and there was reason to believe that he was one of several emissaries sent out by that regiment to try the temper of the Native Courts. From this time evil tidings poured in fast. A private letter brought the news of the mutinous behaviour of the 3rd Cavalry at Meerut. Then came a report that a regiment of Oudh Infantry had misconducted itself at Lucknow, and this was a warning of peculiar significance for Central India, for it showed that the prevailing disaffection was not confined to the Regular Army. Even Contingents were becoming tainted, and on the fidelity of

Contingent troops depended the safety of the Agent's charge. But the Oudh soldiery were after all little different from their brethren of the Regular Army. In Central India all still seemed secure, and Colonel Durand wrote to Lord Canning : "I have 'no reason to suppose that any of the Contingents of Central India 'have as yet shown any disposition to sympathise with the disaffected movement. Rumours of an uncomfortable feeling existing 'among the Mhow native troops I have had, but nothing definite, 'and nothing to which I attach any importance." This was on Monday the 11th of May. On the following Thursday the calm was over. A series of startling telegrams had come in from the Lieutenant-Governor at Agra. The native troops at Meerut had broken into open revolt, many Europeans had been massacred, and Dehli was in the hands of the insurgents. The storm which had been so long gathering had burst at last. Every Englishman knows what followed. How through the long summer months, came from station after station the same story of treachery and massacre. How province after province was wrenched from our grasp by our own revolted soldiery. How a Mughul again enjoyed for a time the substance of power at Dehli, and a Peshwah was proclaimed at Bithoor. How here and there little clusters of our countrymen stood doggedly at bay, hardening their hearts against tremendous odds. And how at last doubt and disaster gave place to confidence and triumph; and the last of the Peshwahs fled before Havelock; and Hodson brought in as a prisoner the last of the Dehli Kings; and the British Government stood out in name as well as in fact the Paramount Power in India. We won in the end, as we have a way of doing. But it was a life and death struggle, and from end to end of India, Englishmen had to strain every nerve before our supremacy was restored.

To understand the part which Central India was called upon to play in the great conflict, it will be necessary to examine in detail the geographical position of the territories under the Agent's charge, and the circumstances which surrounded him. Central India may be roughly described as a great triangle. The base, some five hundred miles in length, lay nearly east and west. It was formed by a line drawn across the continent, from a point about fifty miles east of Baroda. This line followed the course of the Nerbudda as far as Jubbulpore, and was thence produced to the eastern extremity of the Rewah State, about a hundred miles south of Benares. From the terminal points of the line, the sides of the triangle, each over three hundred and fifty miles\* in length, sloped upwards to the northern extremity of

\* These distances and many others mentioned in this article have been roughly computed with the aid of a map. Probably they are under the mark as a rule.

Sindia's dominion, a point on the Chumbul about thirty miles south of Agra. Of course this figure was a very irregular one. The Rajpootana States encroached on the north-west side of the triangle, and the British provinces, below the Jumna, encroached on the north-east side, while Holkar's territory fell in a loop over the Nerbudda at the south-west corner. But the description will serve to convey a general idea of the position of the territories over which the Agent had to exercise a more or less direct control.

The importance of this great tract of country did not lie mainly in its size. From the southern frontier of Holkar's possessions below the Nerbudda to the apex of the triangle near Dholepore, the direct road between Bombay and Agra lay through the territory of the States under the Agent's charge. Both as a postal and telegraphic line this road was invaluable, for at that time there was no direct telegraphic line between Madras and Calcutta, and the only circle by which telegraphic communication with the Madras and Bombay presidencies could be effected, was that by Agra and Indore. It was not less important as a purely military road, for along it the Bombay army could be brought directly into operation against the north of India. The maintenance of this line of communication, the very backbone of his charge, was at the beginning of the outbreak, the main object which the Agent had in view.

Unfortunately he had to contend against no common difficulties. The road was flanked to the westward though at a considerable distance, by the two large military stations of Neemuch and Nusseerabad, both of which were occupied by Regular troops not under his orders. To the eastward, the position was still more insecure. The great triangular tract of which I have spoken, was not all under the direct control of the Agency. It was fairly cloven asunder by the "Saugor and Nerbudda territories"—a wedge of country which pushed up through the base of the triangle, throwing off Bundlecund and Rewah to the eastward, and narrowing to a point at Jhansee, in the very heart of the Agent's charge, where it was met by a southerly projection from the British sub-Jumna districts. This tract of country was studded with military stations occupied by Regular troops. Jubbulpore, Saugor, Lullupore, Nowgong, and Jhansee flanked the Bombay road at various distances, closing gradually upon it to the northward. The last-named and most northerly station was, perhaps, fifty miles east of the road. As this chain of posts completely separated the Agent from the eastern portion of his charge, the only force he could depend upon for the protection of the great line of communications, was that at his disposal between the western frontier of the Saugor Commissionership and the eastern frontier of Rajpootana, close to which was Neemuch.

The value of this force did not consist in its European element. With the exception of one battery of foot Artillery, which contained a source of weakness in the shape of native drivers, there was not a single European soldier under the Agent's orders. The only strong point about his position was the fact that the bulk of the force was not composed of Regulars. It was made up of troops from the several Contingents of the States under the Agency. These Contingent troops formed a service apart from the Regular Army. They were as soldiers under somewhat different conditions, and had little in common with the men of the British Line. Hitherto they had shown no signs of disaffection. It seemed possible, therefore, that masses of Contingent troops, carefully isolated, might keep the Regulars in check, the latter being uncertain whether sympathy with themselves or the ties of discipline would prevail in the ranks of the local forces. It was at best a precarious chance, but it was the only one, and so long as the isolation was maintained, the Contingents of Central India did, in fact, remain outwardly loyal.

The disposition of the various troops was as follows:— At Mhow, some five and twenty miles north of the Nerbudda, and the first military post on the line, were stationed the only Regular troops within the Agency. These were the 23rd Bengal Native Infantry, and a wing of the 1st Cavalry, the other wing of which was at Neemuch. Here also was stationed the European battery under Captain Hungerford. It was from Mhow that trouble was all along expected, and it was from Mhow that the worst of the trouble came. Thirteen miles higher up the road lay Indore, the head-quarters of the Agency. In Indore itself was a detachment of the Malwa Contingent, 200 strong, which acted as a guard for the treasury and other public buildings. There was also a large force of all arms belonging to the Maharaja Holkar. Above Indore there was no military station on the main road for something like 200 miles. But flanking it on the west were the two stations of Mehidpoor and Augur, thirty miles apart, and rather more than that distance from the road. Mehidpoor was the head-quarters of the Malwa Contingent. Facing these stations, some forty miles east of the main road, and about 100 from Indore, was Sehore in Bhopal, the head-quarters of the Bhopal Contingent. Higher up again, in Sindia's territory, and on the road itself, lay Goonah, perhaps 200 miles from Indore. Some sixty miles further north was Seepree, and about the same distance above it Gwalior. These three stations were all occupied by troops of the Gwalior Contingent, the head-quarters of which were at Gwalior itself, only 65 miles south of Agra.

Mhow, therefore, was entirely isolated. Below it lay the Ner-

budda, and the troops of the Bombay and Madras Presidencies, while above it overwhelming numbers of Contingent and Durbar troops were spread out over the country and barred all passage to the northward. It would be useless to overload these pages with a statement of the strength of each Contingent. The Gwalior force alone numbered over 8,000 men, commanded by European officers. So long, therefore, as the Contingents remained faithful, the Agent could make sure of eventually crushing any attempt at revolt on the part of the small body of Regulars at Mhow. But on the fidelity of the Contingents everything depended.

Such was the state of affairs in Central India, when on the 14th of May news arrived of the great catastrophes at Meerut and Delhi. It was a critical moment, for the treasury at Indore was a tempting prize, and the guard available for its defence was a very small one. Colonel Durand immediately sent out right and left for reinforcements. But these could not arrive before the 20th. The Mhow troops could hardly be kept so long in ignorance of what was passing, and it was impossible to say how they might be stirred by the tidings. The City of Indore itself was full of dangerous classes who would be only too ready to join in any undertaking which offered a chance of plunder. The European battery without supports of any kind could not, of course, be expected to do much against the mutineers. Indeed, it seemed only too probable, that if either Infantry or Cavalry plucked up courage for a rush, the guns must fall an easy prey. However, what could be done to secure Indore was done. A body of the Maharaja's Cavalry, with some guns, was kept ready night and day, and pickets were pushed forward along the Mhow road. But it was very doubtful whether these troops could be relied upon to fight the Regulars, and if they gave way there seemed to be little chance of saving Indore. The danger was narrowly escaped. It afterwards transpired that the Mhow troops had debated among themselves whether they would make a dash for the north, *vid* Indore, before reinforcements could arrive. But they were not at this time sure of the Contingent or of Holkar's men, and they allowed the chance to go by. On the morning of the 20th May, the attempt would have been too late. The Bheel corps from Sirdarpore, 270 strong, about the same number of Bhopal Contingent Infantry with two guns, and two troops of Bhopal Contingent Cavalry, mostly Sikhs, had been brought in by forced marches.

Meanwhile, however, the Mhow officers had lost all confidence in their men, and the excitement throughout the Cantonment was distressing. Colonel Platt, who commanded the 23rd and the station, was known to be ever ready and resolute. But he had gone out tiger-shooting, and his absence was unfortunate.

Those who should have been lessening the danger by keeping up a show of confidence were in fact doing their best to precipitate the collision by a series of injudicious proceedings. When the bad news arrived from Dehli, a large and heterogeneous council of officers was convened to discuss the position. As might have been expected this resulted in the enunciation of some very unwise views, and the increase of alarm. On the 17th, Major Harris, commanding the Cavalry, who had himself objected to the council when it met, came into Indore and described the state of affairs at Mhow. Colonel Durand immediately informed him that the summoning of such an assembly was an indiscreet measure, and that it should not be repeated. With regard to the proposals of the officers, which involved a show of mistrust, the Agent replied that in his opinion there were only two courses open on these occasions—undiminished trust or overt mistrust with its accompanying precautions—that the former was in their power, the latter from want of force not so, and that they should be very careful to do nothing which might precipitate an outburst of feeling on the part of the troops. But the alarm did not subside. The artilleryman, Hungerford shotted his guns ; measures were taken for provisioning the magazine, and the hesitating natives were encouraged to rise by every sign of perturbation among the Europeans. So it ever was. With Colonel Durand, as with all others in high places at the time, one of the great difficulties was to induce men, some of whom afterwards proved themselves brave enough in actual danger, to meet the approach of the danger with a serene face and a show of confidence. "Don't be alarmed yourselves and don't alarm others" was Colonel Durand's incessant advice. And from end to end of the Agency it was sorely needed.

For a few days after the arrival of reinforcements at Indore, things seemed to be going on better. The Regulars in Nowgong and Jhansee were loud in their professions of loyalty. The city of Indore, which from the 15th to the 20th had been in a state of the wildest alarm, began to regain its wonted composure. News came from Agra that "the plague was being stayed." The Dehli mutineers, some 3,000 strong, were clinging to the walls and living by plunder. The "final advance" of our army was about to be made, and it seemed likely that the news of the city having fallen would soon come to act as a general sedative. But as the month of May wore to a close this gleam of sunshine was overcast. Disquieting rumours came in from Neemuch and Nusseerabad. A body of the Gwalior Contingent Cavalry pushed up, contrary to Colonel Durand's wishes, into contact with the mutinous masses at Hattrass, deserted its European officer and went into open revolt. General Ramsay, who commanded at Gwalior, expressed himself doubtful of the whole Contingent and refused

to call in any detachments to head-quarters. Nearer at hand, Colonel Travers, commanding the Bhopal Contingent, reported that emissaries from the 23rd were tampering with his men. Writing to Lord Elphinstone on the 31st of May, Colonel Durand summed up the position as follows: "No great reliance can now be placed on Contingents any more than on their comrades of the Regular Army. In Central India, however, there is nothing for it but to hold the one in check by the other until some blow struck by the Commander-in-Chief tell as a sedative. Every day's delay is, however, rendering our position here as elsewhere more precarious."

The early days of June brought news of a still more serious nature. On the 1st, Colonel Durand learnt that the Nusseerabad troops had risen, and marched off in a body towards Dehli. Five days later it was known that the force at Neemuch had followed their example, and foremost among the mutineers had been the wing of the 1st Cavalry. It was very doubtful how the Mhow troops would take the news. Colonel Platt was confident, but the Durbar Vakeel at Indore insisted upon it that they were on the point of rising; while from other sources came information that they had been incited to mutiny by the Durbar itself. It was said that they meant to rise on the 9th, to surround and overwhelm the European battery, and then, "with Holkar in their favour," attack the Treasury at Indore. But if any rising had been contemplated it was not carried into execution. The news of the Neemuch outbreak filtered through the ranks and seemed to produce no fresh excitement. The Cavalry remained outwardly respectful, and the 23rd volunteered to march against the mutineers. It seemed just possible that all might yet go well. Distrust of the Maharaja's troops, and of the heterogeneous detachments collected at Indore, might be sufficient to curb the Mhow force. Colonel Durand was well aware that Holkar's name was being made use of among the sepoys as an incentive to revolt. But he attached little credit to tales of Holkar's disloyalty: "Holkar's fears and interests," he wrote, "are on our side, and so far as any Durbar, especially a Mahratta Durbar, is trustworthy Holkar's seems so: I have seen nothing suspicious." This was written on the 8th June. On the following day came a piece of bad news. The Malwa Contingent Cavalry, pushed up contrary to Colonel Durand's orders into practical contact with the Neemuch mutineers, had murdered their officers, and gone off in a body. The defection of this force was peculiarly unfortunate. The men had many relatives among Holkar's cavalry and their misconduct naturally threw suspicion on the latter. Holkar himself frankly confessed that he was no longer sure of his troops. But there was little further aid

available. Beyond calling in Colonel Travers from Sehore with the rest of the Bhopal Contingent Cavalry, some 50 men, nothing more could be done to make the position secure. Meanwhile, more bad news had come in. A terrible massacre of Europeans was reported from Jhansee. The troops at Nowgong were said to have followed suit. And, worse than all, on the evening of the 14th June, the interruption of the telegraph between Gwalior and Seepree gave the first intimation that the great main road itself was in danger. Two days later the cause of the interruption was known. The Gwalior Contingent had risen, and Sindia's capital was in the hands of the mutineers. The communications with Agra along the direct road were now cut off. For a hundred miles below the Chumbul the line was gone, and, as detachments of the Gwalior Contingent held Seepree and Goonah, it seemed likely that the flame of insurrection would run down the line, and that the telegraph would soon be working only upon the last 150 miles above Indore. This apprehension was soon verified. On the evening of the 20th, an express from Captain Harrison, who commanded a troop of the Contingent at Goonah, announced that the Seepree officers had joined him. Captain Harrison added that he was falling back on Indore. He was ordered to halt his troop at Biowra, 120 miles north of Indore, and to keep up telegraphic communication from there. Letters from Agra had now to travel round by Jeypoor in Rajpootana, and even so their safety was very doubtful.

Meanwhile, a small relieving column, under the command of Major-General Woodburn, had been moving up to Mhow from Bombay. It consisted of five troops of H. M.'s 14th Dragoons, a battery of European Artillery, one company of Sappers, and a regiment of Native Infantry. The 3rd Nizam's Cavalry, and another regiment of Native Infantry, were waiting at Mulligaum to join in the advance. The advent of this force at Mhow had been anxiously awaited. It would have kept the Mhow troops in order, and established the fidelity of the Contingents which still stood. In all probability, it would also have enabled the Governor-General's Agent to recover the greater part of the lost line of communication with Agra. But Colonel Durand's hopes were doomed to disappointment. Just as it seemed probable that he would soon have a trustworthy force above the Nerbudda, the 1st Nizam's Cavalry, which had been pushed up to take the place of the 3rd, mutinied at Aurungabad; Woodburn's advance on Mhow was checked, and the column was diverted to the eastward. The result of this move was likely to be serious. The Mhow troops were relieved from immediate fear, and it seemed probable that they might take advantage of the delay to make a dash for Sindia's country, while immediately to the south of the Nerbudda symptoms of

disaffection had begun to manifest themselves. At the moment that this unlucky diversion took place worse news came pouring in from the north and east. Jubbulpore was on the verge of mutiny ; Lullutpore the same ; Saugor was hesitating ; and in Bundelcund a rising of the turbulent natives began to assume formidable dimensions. Nothing now stood above Indore but a small semi-circle of doubtful Contingent troops. At Mehidpoor the Artillery and Infantry had remained faithful under peculiarly trying circumstances ; Augur was held by a detachment of the same force ; Captain Harrison, with his troop of Gwalior Cavalry, lay at Biowra ; and from Sehore all was reported safe. But in Mhow itself the temper of the troops was so uncertain that Colonel Platt dared not risk the punishment of an emissary who had been caught tampering with the 23rd. The man was sent over to Indore to be dealt with, and Colonel Durand wrote : "Any thing more ' ticklish than the state of the native corps at Mhow, Saugor " and Jubbulpore, can scarcely be conceived. Of course there has "been volunteering, etc., and 'entire confidence' on the part of "commanding officers. But that is all moonshine, and every one "knows the real state of affairs."

The fate of Central India was trembling in the balance. For a moment it seemed as if the crisis would be safely passed. News came that Woodburn had roughly trampled out the rising at Aurungabad and was free to march on Mhow, and at the same time Colonel Durand received information that Dehli had fallen on the 12th. But these good tidings were soon found to be delusive, and the reaction turned the scale. On the 28th Lord Elphinstone telegraphed that Woodburn could not advance, and enquired the probable effect on Colonel Durand's charge. The Agent immediately replied that he could not answer one hour for the safety of Central India if it should become known that the column was not marching on Mhow. He urgently pressed Lord Elphinstone to push on the little force without delay, and pointed out that there was no difficulty in its path. Lord Elphinstone replied that the advance had not been countermanded. But it was too late. The contents of the first message had leaked out of the telegraph office, and were soon known in the bazaars. About the same time one of the Indore bankers received bad news from Dehli which he would not communicate to the Agent. What that news was became only too soon apparent. On the morning of the 1st July, a letter came in from Agra. It was dated the 20th June, and showed that the former report of the fall of Dehli had been premature. Up to the 17th, the British position had been repeatedly attacked, it was all we could do to hold our own, and the General had determined to await reinforcements before venturing on an assault.

Colonel Durand was in the act of condensing this information into a telegram for Lord Elphinstone, so that the latest news from Dehli might reach England by the Bombay steamer of the 1st July, when a *chupprassee* rushed into the room and reported that there was a great commotion in the bazaar. The noise rose rapidly, and Colonel Durand laid down his pen to see what was the matter. He had not long to wait. A fortnight before, three of Holkar's nine-pouunders and two companies of Infantry had been brought over to strengthen the garrison of the Residency. As Colonel Durand came out upon the Residency steps these guns opened fire, and sent a shower of grape into the Bhopal Contingent lines. The surprise was complete. The Cavalry at their pickets had received the greater portion of the discharge, and as fast as the men could saddle and mount they came rushing out, wild with alarm. All attempts to form them were useless. They were galloping hither and thither in utter confusion, and seemed to think only of getting under cover. Colonel Travers, always ready for a deed of daring, did the best thing that could be done under the circumstances. Calling upon his men to follow he dashed into the open and rode straight at the guns. But his example was not sufficient to stir the blood of the panic stricken troopers. Five men, all Sikhs, followed him and got in among Holkar's gunners, but the rest of the regiment hung back, and the chance of taking the guns was lost. Of course the charge, gallant as it was, could make no real impression, though it served to gain a little time. Holkar's Artillery moved round unmolested by the left of the Infantry lines and took up a new position in front of the Residency, where they were less exposed to a second attempt of the kind; a position they could never have held and would never have taken up had they not been sure of the Contingent Infantry. They were supported by Holkar's Cavalry, swarming under every sort of cover, and by the two companies of Infantry which had been posted for the defence of the Residency. The two guns of the Bhopal Contingent were now moved forward to meet the attack. Those of the native gunners who had not made off at the first discharge of grape, fourteen in number, did their duty well under the direction of two European Sergeants, Orr and Murphy. One of the enemy's pieces was disabled, and the Infantry supports driven off. But the success of our people was only temporary, for it was not supported. Nothing would induce the Contingent Cavalry to seize their opportunity. They were mostly Sikhs, and Colonel Durand, who knew of old how Sikhs could fight, had fully relied upon their courage. But he was miserably disappointed. No exertion on the part of the officers could bring them into any sort of formation. A portion of the regiment was already scampering along the road to Sehore,

where they arrived incoherent with terror, spreading the report that every European in Indore had been massacred, and that they alone had escaped to tell the tale. The rest gathered in a shapeless heap far to the rear of the Residency, and there remained, loyal but useless. The behaviour of the Infantry was still worse. The men of the Bhopal Contingent, some 270 strong, levelled their muskets at their European officers and drove them off. The Mehidpore Contingent Infantry, of whom about 200 were in the lines, refused to obey orders, and remained sullenly aloof. The Bheels under Colonel Stockley, were so far manageable that they allowed themselves to be formed ; but fight they would not. By incessant exertion their officers succeeded in making them keep their ranks, but Colonel Stockley reported them too unsteady to be thrust into action, and all thought of an advance had to be given up.

One last chance remained. At the beginning of the cannonade Colonel Durand had sent off a note to Colonel Platt asking for the immediate despatch of the European battery. A stand might possibly be made until news should arrive from Mhow. The Bheels were thrown into the Residency in the hope that they might pluck up courage under cover and do something to punish the attacking force. But the hope was a vain one. Holkar's guns had now moved round to their original position, where they had good cover, and were pouring a well-directed fire of round shot and grape into the Residency building itself. The Bheels were completely cowed by the storm, and could not be induced to discharge their pieces even from the comparative security of the Residency windows. The whole work of defence was left to the fourteen faithful gunners, and it soon became clear that even if Hungerford's battery were able to leave Mhow it would arrive too late to do more than cover a retreat. The attack was no longer a tentative one. Encouraged by the impunity with which the guns had for nearly two hours cannonaded the Residency, Holkar's troops came pouring up to their support. A Durbar officer of high rank called them out to the attack, and the lines were rapidly emptied. Holkar was known to have a powerful force. Besides the three guns which had proved too much for the feelings of the Cavalry and Bheels, he had nine good English six and nine-pounders, with some fifteen or twenty others of various calibres. His Cavalry numbered about 1,400 sabres. His Regular Infantry, putting it at the lowest computation, was 2,000 strong, and was backed by all the rabble of the city, burning to join in the slaughter of the *Sahib logue*. To make matter worse nearly 500 mutinous Contingent Infantry were biding their time within the Residency lines.

At this juncture, Captain Magniac, the officer commanding the Bhopal Contingent Cavalry, came up for the third time with a

message from his men. They intimated that they were about to consult their own safety, further resistance being hopeless, and begged that this last chance might be taken of saving the ladies and children. Some of Holkar's guns and Cavalry were moving round to cut off the retreat, and they intended to make their escape before it was too late.

To fight longer with any chance of success was impossible. The flight of the Bhopal Horse would have cut away even the faint show of strength which remained. All the Europeans who had not been murdered were now in the Residency, and the last hope of saving them was to retreat while retreat was possible. To cling to the Residency was to pronounce the doom of the little company. There was just a chance that the European battery might be coming up, but this was very unlikely. The Mhow troops had from the first formed the nucleus of disaffection and intrigue. In all probability the rising was a concerted one, and Hungerford had enough to do to hold his own. Even if this were not the case the arrival of the battery would now be too late to turn the scale. It could hardly be up under two hours, and by that time the whole of Holkar's troops would be ready to receive it. Unsupported by either Cavalry or Infantry it could hardly be expected to break through the overwhelming masses of the enemy and bring off the survivors, if there should be any survivors, of the little garrison. More than this it certainly could not hope to do. There was nothing therefore, to be gained by clinging to the walls of the Residency, and there was everything to be lost. To retire now while the remnant of a force hung together was the course dictated by every military consideration. At half-past ten the order was given. The mutineers had cut off all the horses and carriages, but the ladies were mounted on the gun waggons, and thus with the Bheels and Cavalry covering the rear, the little force moved slowly off under the fire of Holkar's guns. For the time at least it was not pursued. Small as it was, it was yet sufficient to command a certain amount of respect; and Holkar's troops, shrinking from a hand to hand fight, or satiated by the slaughter of some forty Europeans, who had been cut off outside the Residency, turned to the more congenial occupation of plundering the Treasury. In this they were joined by the Contingent troops.

The line of retreat chosen was of course that on Mhow. It was possible that the battery might be on its way and that a junction might be effected. But the hope, if hope there ever was, was very soon over. The Bhopal Cavalry could not be persuaded to follow; their fears of the Mhow troops were too vivid, and the attempt had to be given up. The next best course was to circle round Mhow and make Mundlaisur, which Captain

Keatinge, the Political Officer in Nimar, had prepared as a point of refuge for our people in case the Mhow troops rose. Mundlaisur was situated on the northern bank of the Nerbudda, some five and twenty miles south of Mhow. The force was accordingly diverted from the Mhow road with the view of crossing the hills by the Simrole pass. But this plan also failed. When Colonel Durand arrived at Tilloor, about ten miles from Indore, some villagers came up with the information that four guns and some Cavalry of Holkar's had gone on in advance the day before, and had occupied the pass. This information was corroborated by a Sikh trooper, who stated that he had seen the guns go by when on picket upon the Mhow road. Colonel Durand decided upon this to force the pass, and descend on Mundlaisur. But again the fears of the Cavalry stepped in. They resolutely declined to obey the order, and intimated in the plainest terms, that if the attempt were persisted in, they would detach themselves from the force and leave the Bheels to follow alone. Their officers were in no position to enforce obedience. The value of the Bheels had been sufficiently demonstrated, and the Mundlaisur route was reluctantly given up. The only chance of keeping together the semblance of a force, and effecting an orderly retreat, was to humour the Cavalry and march eastward on Sehore. As I have already stated, this place was the head-quarters of the Contingent, and the Cavalry were disturbed by fears for the safety of their families, the Mussulmans distrusting the Sikhs, and the Sikhs distrusting the Mussulmans. The change of route was a serious one, for it took the little force away from the only strong place within reach, from the chance of rejoining the European battery, and from the line of Woodburn's advance. It trebled the distance to be covered and of course it invited pursuit. But there was nothing else to be done. The retreat was safely effected. Pressed on in rapid marches by the Cavalry, whose ungovernable fears made them utterly careless of the exhaustion of the unmounted men, the remnant of the little force marched into Sehore on the 4th of July, bringing in its guns, and every European, who had reached the Residency on the morning of the outbreak. For the time the Contingent remained faithful, and the troops of the Bhopal State behaved well. The Sekunder Begum, a lady of remarkable talent and tact, was at the head of affairs, and she succeeded in keeping down the gathering spirit of revolt. After a day's stay in Sehore, Colonel Durand struck down to Hosbungabad, on the southern bank of the Nerbudda, whence he hoped to get into communication with Major-General Woodburn, and to bring round his people to Mundlaisur, or if such a course seemed advisable, to Mhow; of course any attempt to reach either place by the northern bank of the river was to retrace his steps through

Holkar's territory, unattended even by the Contingent. When he arrived at Hoshungabad, however, he learnt that the Mhow troops had risen on the night of the 1st July, and after murdering three of their officers had gone off to Indore. The European battery was safe in the Fort, neither pressed nor threatened, though without supports, and crippled, moreover by the defection of its native drivers and syces, it could do nothing to check or punish the mutineers.

The whole line of communication from the Nerbudda to the Chumbul, had now passed out of our hands. But below the Nerbudda all stood firm so far, and it needed only the rapid advance of Woodburn's column to stay the spread of disaffection, and maintain our position at all events up to the river line. To delay any longer was to risk the loss of the river itself, and the fall of the only barrier which yet stood between the blazing north and the smouldering south. But neither Major-General Woodburn nor the Civil authorities at Nagpore had grasped this fact. While Colonel Durand was at Hoshungabad he received information which struck him with indignant surprise. Blind to the disastrous nature of such a surrender the Nagpore Commissioner, Mr. Plowden, was doing his utmost to throw up the Nerbudda, and to divert Woodburn's column from its advance. The officers commanding the military posts upon the northern line of the Commissionership had been directed to fall back on Kamptee, if the Indore mutineers threatened to march southwards, and Mr. Plowden had written to Major-General Woodburn, begging him to march eastward on Nagpore. It is hardly necessary to point out the consequences of such a move. It would have lost us a remarkably strong military position, thrown back our frontier, perhaps 150 miles, exposed Candeish, imperilled the northern portion of the Nizam's dominions, and afforded a strong incentive to the southern troops to revolt. A more dangerous confession of weakness could hardly have been conceived. Moreover it was totally unnecessary, for Nagpore was strong in European and Madras troops, and the mutineers could not cross the river if the posts were held. But it is only fair to add that Mr. Plowden was at the time under a misconception as to the results of the rising at Mhow. He believed that every European had been put to death.

Directly the news of the great mistake contemplated by the Nagpore authorities reached Colonel Durand, he did his utmost to prevent its commission. He addressed Mr. Plowden and the Supreme Government, pointing out the serious military error of the move. He sent an express to Major-General Woodburn announcing that he entirely disapproved of Mr. Plowden's advice, and of the instructions issued to the military posts. And he authorised

the officers commanding those posts to disregard the orders they had received. But this was not enough to secure the line of the Nerbudda. Woodburn had left it uncertain whether he meant to advance or not, and Colonel Durand knew that the effect of his representations must at best be very uncertain. There was no time for a protracted correspondence on the subject. Woodburn's delay had already done irreparable mischief. He had wasted a fortnight at Aurungabad trying mutineers when he should have been making long marches. It was now near the middle of July, and a dry July in Central India was no common phenomenon. If the column were not on the Nerbudda before the rains set in, and the roads over the black soil became impassable, it could not be there for several months, and as the line of the river was held by native troops, it was impossible to say what might happen. The Agent could of course do no good by joining the little garrison shut up in Mhow Fort. So he determined to go down himself to Aurungabad, or if necessary to Lord Elphinstone at Bombay, and force up the column by the weight of personal argument. Accordingly on the 14th of July, after satisfying himself that Mhow was safe for the present, and making arrangements for the transaction of any political business which might require attention during his absence, he started for Asseerghur. Happily his fears were soon at an end. On the 17th after reaching Hurdah, he learnt that his urgent appeals for the advance of the column, and his indignant notice of Mr. Plowden's instructions, had been effectual. Woodburn had retired to Poonah sick. But his successor, Brigadier Stuart, had been ordered to push on at once, and had marched for Mhow *via* Asseerghur on the 12th. To Asseerghur Colonel Durand proceeded to meet him and hurry on the advance. On the 1st of August he stood again at Simrole in the guise a British Agent should stand, independent of the good will of any native chief, and ready to enforce his orders. While the column lay at Simrole, it was reported that Holkar's mutinous regiments were coming out to attack it. It is a pity they did not carry out the idea, for despite their great numerical superiority they would have been scattered to the winds by Stuart's handy little force, and a good deal of after trouble would have been saved. But they thought better of it, and on the following day the column marched into Mhow. Colonel Durand had brought it up but just in time. The first shower of rain fell on the night of the 1st, and the black soil was in such a state next morning, that the European battery took fourteen hours to cover the nine-mile march. However, the column was there, and the line of the Nerbudda was saved. A few days later the force was strengthened by the arrival of 250 men of H. M.'s 86th.

Shortly after his return to Mhow, Colonel Durand summed up in the following words the state of affairs in Central India and the measures which seemed to him to be necessary for the re-establishment of the British power:—

“ The means of coercion at our disposal are extremely inadequate to the restoration of order, and to the stay of anarchy wherever that exists. The Gwalior Contingent has wholly gone from our colours, and is now, with its well equipped Artillery, in Sindia’s hands, and of course at his disposal. It may act against us. It never can act for us. The Malwa Contingent has lost all its Cavalry, a body of 800 good horse, and its Infantry so misbehaved at Indore, that it is impossible not to hold the whole body in suspicion, though the Artillery and Infantry are still together at Mehidpoor under its European officers. The Bhopal Contingent, after its disgraceful and treacherous behaviour at Indore, is now in open mutiny at Sehore and not likely to hold together long. The Bheel Corps is in course of re-assembly, but with its character and influence deteriorated, and having to be thinned of many native officers and men whom the utmost latitude of commiseration cannot permit to remain in the ranks. At Nagode, up to the latest advices from Major Ellis, the 50th Bengal Native Infantry still stood and was dutiful, but with that single exception from north to south of this charge, there is not a gun, there is not a sabre, there is not a musket, which can be called in aid of the maintenance of order and British supremacy, except Brigadier Stuart’s weak column at Mhow, consisting of one battery of European Artillery, thoroughly effective, one battery of European Artillery paralysed by loss of drivers, 230 Dragoons of H. M.’s 14th, 250 of H. M.’s 86th, the 25th Bombay Native Infantry, details of Bombay and Madras Sappers and Miners, and the 3rd Nizam’s Cavalry. The total of this effective force may amount to 700 Europeans of all arms, and 1,200 native troops of all arms, giving a grand total of 1,900 men. This force may for the present be considered in observation of Holkar’s force at Indore, composed of 30 guns of various calibres, about 1,400 horse, and five battallions of Infantry, besides a city which has shown itself hostile and seditious.”

Such was the condition of affairs in the middle of August. It could hardly seem much worse. But worse was to come. As the rainy season wore on a person calling himself the Shahzada Humayoon raised the Mussulman standard at Mundesore near the Rajpootana frontier. He was joined by a portion of Sindia’s troops, and by all the turbulent Velayutees and Mewatees of the neighbourhood. The force under his orders rose rapidly, until at last it was estimated at no less than 20,000 men and threatened

to over-run all western Malwa. To the north-east the look-out was even more threatening. It seemed only too probable that the Nana's forces, broken by Havelock about Cawnpore, might strike southward into Bundelcund, and gathering to themselves the Banda and Gwalior mutineers, pour down in one overwhelming mass upon Central India, where there was nothing to stay their advance but the small column at Mhow. The Nana's Agent Tantia Topee was known to be intriguing at Jhansee, and the Mahrattas eagerly awaited the advance of the "Peshwah" himself. Meanwhile, immediately to the east of Mhow a body of Velayutes menaced Nimar, while immediately to the westward a strong force of Afghans and other mercenaries rose and occupied Dhar and Anjhera. From this position they communicated by their left with the Mundesore army, and threatened with their right the Bombay road below Mhow.

All this time the little force at Mhow was chafing in helpless idleness. It could not attempt to enter on a campaign during the rains. Its strength lay in Cavalry and Artillery, and until the black soil was dry, there was no possibility of using these arms with effect. The roads themselves were in most parts around Indore execrably bad at this season, and off the roads there was no firm ground to deploy and act. The Infantry by itself was too weak to do much, and moreover the exposure of the men in the open, where carts baggage and Commissariat stores could not follow, was to ensure the ruin of the force from wet bivouacs and want of supplies. Swayed partly by these considerations and partly by others of a political nature, Colonel Durand decided to keep the column stationary at Mhow until the rains should cease, and the surface of the country should become sufficiently hard to admit of rapid and effective movement. In this course he was supported by the Bombay Government, who feared for the security of their frontier and objected to the employment of the little force at any distance from Mhow.

Directly, however, that the weather showed signs of breaking the column prepared to open the ball. There were some difficulties to be overcome before it could take the field. The Bombay Government still desired to retain it at Mhow, and the Sangor authorities wished to cripple it by borrowing half its Artillery. To both those suggestions, Colonel Durand resolutely declined to listen, and strengthening himself by calling up a force of Nizam's troops, which the apprehensions of the Bombay Government would have kept inactive below the Nerbudda, he set his force to the northward. But it was no easy matter to decide in what direction the force should deliver its first blow. It was, of course, very desirable to disarm the Indore insurgents, and dangerous to leave them in the rear. On the other

hand their position was strong ; an attempt to disarm them would probably involve a good deal of street fighting, which was the thing of all others to be avoided ; and if they should prefer to retreat before the column could close on Indore, the only result of an advance in that direction would be to swell the Mundesore insurrection, already sufficiently formidable. It was decided finally that the best course would be to move on Mundesore first *via* Dhar. The crushing of the Shahzada's army would, it was thought, have a most salutary effect. His rude Velayutees were dreaded by the natives almost as much as Europeans, and with justice. The defeat of these hardy fighting men would probably take the heart out of Holkar's troops, and their disarming would be easy. If the latter should take advantage of the northward march of the column to attack Mhow they would, of course, cause temporary embarrassment. But they seemed unlikely to undertake any offensive operations, and it was necessary that something should be risked. In the middle of October, therefore, the column moved out of cantonments. The plan of operations was as follows :—The insurrection which had broken out in Dhar and Amjhera, was first to be put down. The force was then to march north against the Shahzada, and disperse the Mundesore army, after which it could either swing round on Indore, or if necessary, strike across the road above Indore, and hound back the Nana to the north-east.

It will not be necessary for the purposes of this article to give any detailed account of the movements of the column during the next two months. Dhar Fort was occupied on the 1st of November after ten days' siege, and a detachment was sent to Amjhera, a few miles further west, to free the rear and left flank of the column as it marched northwards. Amjhera was occupied without opposition. Before our troops arrived the mutineers had fled to Mundesore, and the Bombay road was free from insult. It was now hoped that the Shahzada's force might come down to meet the column in the open field, and at first it seemed as if the hope might be fulfilled. On the 8th a body of Velayutees attacked Mehidpoor, where the Infantry and Artillery of the Malwa Contingent still made a show of standing faithful. Little resistance was offered, and the enemy carried off a large supply of ammunition and some guns. Their success, however, did not last long. Major Orr, who had been pushed on in advance with a small body of Nizam's Cavalry, came up with them about sunset on the 12th. His men justified the confidence Colonel Durand had placed in them. The Velayutees made a hard stand for their supplies and guns, but they were broken and dispersed, and the whole of the spoils of the Mehidpoor station were retaken. During the next fortnight the Shahzada's army was completely shattered, after some

very severe fighting, and then, leaving the Hyderabad Contingent Cavalry at Mundesore, the little column turned round upon Holkar's troops. The effect of the move had been accurately calculated. While on the march Colonel Durand wrote to inform Holkar that he should be at Indore about the 15th of December. It was added that ample time had been allowed for the punishment of the troops and people concerned in the attack on the Residency ; that only one man had in fact been punished ; that now if the Maharaja could deal with the guilty their punishment would be left to him, but that if he could not, force would be used rapidly and summarily. Holkar intimated in reply that if the column would halt outside the city a mile from the Cavalry lines, he would disarm the troops himself. This was done, and on the 15th the mutinous regiments quietly laid down their arms. The mere presence of the victorious little force was sufficient. On the following morning Colonel Durand made over charge of the Agency to Sir Robert Hamilton, who now arrived on the scene, and at the same time Sir Hugh Rose took command of the troops.

Such, from a military point of view, were the facts, very briefly stated, of Colonel Durand's administration in Central India. Without the aid of any European force he had succeeded in maintaining himself at Indore for six weeks after the outbreak at Delhi, by isolating the Contingent troops and playing them off against the Regulars. When contrary to his wishes the two were allowed to come into contact, the fidelity of the Contingents gave way, and gradually the circle of insurrection closed upon Indore. At last, driven out of the Residency by a combination of treachery and cowardice, he made good a soldierly retreat in the face of overwhelming masses, veiling his weakness by a show of force, and marched into Sehore without the loss of gun, standard, or other trophy. Thence he proceeded to Hoshungabad, and resolutely holding, in the teeth of orders, the great natural barrier of the Nerbudda, dragged up Woodburn's hesitating column to Mhow before the rains came down. Using that column compactly to deal heavy blows, he took a strong fort, crushed a formidable insurrection, dispersed or disarmed forces far exceeding his own in numbers, and finally handed over his charge free of serious embarrassment to his successor.

It remains to consider the political aspect of his administration. For the purposes of the present article this resolves itself into a consideration of his relations with the Holkar State, for, as far as I am aware, his relations with the other States of the Agency never gave rise to discussion, except in the case of Dhar, and this point will be more conveniently treated later on. Up to the time of the attack on the Residency, Holkar had been treated with perfect confidence by the Acting Agent. His interests seemed to be on

our side, and his fears were openly expressed. He was at his own desire supplied with ammunition for his guns. His troops were invited to aid in the defence of the Residency. He was made acquainted with the progress of our arms in the north. In every way trust was openly shown to him until the end of June. But on the 1st of July that trust vanished and gave way for a time to suspicion. There were many circumstances which seemed at the moment to throw serious doubt upon Holkar's loyalty. He was said to be in constant communication with those whose ill-will towards the British power was beyond a doubt. It was reported that he had just received, and entertained, a messenger from the Emperor at Dehli. During the two hours that the cannonade lasted, he made no attempt to communicate with the British Representative, and some of his officers were prominent among the insurgents. Finally, when the Residency was abandoned, the retreating Europeans found that Holkar's guns had been sent round to the passes in their rear. All these facts were suspicious, and failing any denial on the Maharaja's part, Colonel Durand was led to believe that he had declared against us. To this view he gave open expression. But, meanwhile, Holkar had been doing his best to prove that he was in fact innocent of all participation in the attack. He behaved kindly to some Europeans, who had sought refuge in his palace. He saved what treasure the mutineers had left and sent it in to Mhow. He forwarded some supplies he had promised, to aid the advance of Woodburn's column. He met the requisitions of the officers in the Mhow Fort. He brought in Lieutenant Hutchinson from Jhubbooa. And he wrote protesting his innocence to Lord Elphinstone and to Colonel Durand. These protestations Colonel Durand received with the necessary caution. He informed the Maharaja that the Governor-General would doubtless be gratified with His Highness' proceedings after the outbreak; but he pointed out that Native Chiefs must *prima facie* be held responsible for the conduct of their troops, and courteously requested the Maharaja to submit any observations he might wish to make with regard to certain points connected with the insurrection; particularly with regard to his silence during the cannonade of the Residency, his retention of mutineers in his service, his supply of carriage and provisions to those of the insurgents who had marched northwards, and his despatch of guns to the rear of the Residency before the attack. Holkar replied that the confusion during the attack had been too great to allow of any communication being made; and that the moment he learnt what had happened he prepared to start for the Residency, but was stopped by the news that all was over. With regard to his troops he was powerless to punish or control, having no one on whom he

could rely. It was true that he had supplied carriage and provisions to the mutineers who marched north, but they were plundering the city, and this was his only chance of getting rid of them. As to the guns they had been sent to Mahesur, south of Mhow, in anticipation of disturbances below the Nerbudda, and the smallness of their escort showed that they were not meant for offensive action.

This explanation was forwarded to the Supreme Government by Colonel Durand with a covering letter which reviewed the circumstances in the fairest possible manner. The Agent observed that before the rising Holkar had candidly expressed mistrust of his troops, that a marked distinction was to be drawn between the Maharaja and his Durbar, that whatever might be thought of the conduct of those about him, there could be no doubt of His Highness' anxiety to separate his own name and fame from the guilt of participation in the rising, and that in his case the plea of helplessness was certainly not a mere excuse, his only means of saving Indore from the prolonged stay of the revolted soldiery being to find them carriage and supplies. As to the guns, Colonel Durand observed that there had been no concealment about their despatch, and that some time before the rising the Durbar Vakeel had talked of sending guns to Mahesur. It was added that the Maharaja proposed to appoint a commission for the trial of the guilty at Indore, but that in Colonel Durand's opinion this measure was useless, for Holkar could not enforce its sentences, even should they be honest, against armed bands who had set at defiance alike the authority of their own sovereign and that of the Supreme Government. Pending the receipt of orders on this letter, Colonel Durand continued to treat the Maharaja with friendliness, but he declined to commit himself to any act which might seem to anticipate the decision of Government as to His Highness' *prima facie* responsibility. To do so would not only have been indiscreet, but it would have been contrary to orders, as the Governor-General in Council had expressly reserved to himself the power of pardoning any individual guilty of certain crimes, and among these was the supply of assistance to mutineers.

But in the meantime others had not been so judicious. After the outbreak at Mhow, Captain Hungerford of the Artillery had assumed command of the Fort, apparently in the presence of his senior officer, Major Cooper of the 23rd. The mutineers had retired to Indore unmolested in the darkness. In spite of the fact that incendiary fires had been blazing in the Cantonment from sunset until ten o'clock on the night of the 1st July, and that a rise was momentarily expected, Hungerford had made no preparations for rapid action. When the rise came he was not ready to meet

it. The battery turned out eventually, but too late to do any good. Colonel Platt and his Adjutant, Fagan, who went on in advance, were shot down, and when the guns arrived there was no enemy to be seen. A few round shot were fired at the native lines on the chance of somebody being in them, and the battery returned to the Fort. Next morning there was not a sepoy in sight, dead or alive. But it was perfectly clear that if Holkar's troops did march down to Mhow, Hungerford could do nothing but cling to the walls of the Fort. He had no supports of any kind, and his battery was, moreover, immediately crippled by the defection of the native drivers and syces. If Holkar had any power, he was in a measure dependent on Holkar, who could at any moment surround the Fort and cut off all supplies. He was, of course, absolutely ignorant of all that had passed at Indore, of the many suspicious circumstances connected with the attack on the Residency, and of Holkar's character and conduct. In fact he was about in as bad a position as he possibly could be in to pronounce upon Holkar's loyalty. But, believing himself to be "threatened by an attack from the Rajah of Indore," Capt. Hungerford addressed His Highness, pointing out that Holkar's interests lay on our side, and expressing his confidence that Holkar was not blind to the fact. It need hardly be said that this was not a judicious proceeding. Even if the Maharaja was disloyal it was clearly to his advantage to anticipate a deliberate review of the circumstances attending the insurrection, and to gain an advocate with the British Government. He was certain therefore to respond to the overtures, and the fact that he did so was no proof of his loyalty. But Hungerford did not see the indiscreteness of committing himself to an opinion which he was not qualified to form. Hastily assuming Holkar's innocence from Holkar's behaviour after the outbreak, and relieved from apprehension by the success of his diplomatic effort, he "took political charge," and from his little corner in Mhow Fort sounded forth the Maharaja's loyalty to Lord Elphinstone at Bombay. He was joined in this by Lieutenant Hutchinson, a son-in-law of Sir Robert Hamilton's, and himself a political officer, who was at the time a fugitive in Holkar's hands. I have already shown what Colonel Durand was doing in the meanwhile. He was upholding the line of the Nerbudda and forcing up Woodburn's column. But he had not devoted himself to any lengthy exposition of his views on the comparatively unimportant question of Holkar's loyalty, and the protestations of the Maharaja backed by the advocacy of the Mhow officers, were at first somewhat hastily accepted by Lord Elphinstone at Bombay and Lord Canning at Calcutta, as proof positive of his innocence. I have no wish whatever to assert, or to imply, that the Maharaja was guilty, or that Colonel Durand continued to think

him so. I have already shown how favourably the Acting Agent received Holkar's explanation of his conduct when it was submitted. But Holkar's innocence should not have been taken for granted without careful enquiry. There was a very important principle involved, that of the *prima facie* responsibility of Native Chiefs for the acts of their troops, and the dangerous nature of the precedent created in Holkar's case was afterwards fully recognised.

From the time that Colonel Durand arrived at Mhow with Stuart's column, the main political difficulty of the position was the disarming of Holkar's troops. The Durbar could never make up their minds whether they did or did not want the aid of the British force. From the very first this vacillation showed itself. While the column lay at Simrole, waiting for the Artillery to close up, Holkar's ministers asked whether help could be afforded. They were informed that if they wished it the column would march on Indore direct instead of Mhow. But their fears had abated as suddenly as they had risen, and the answer was that as the troops were at present quiet, they did not require assistance. And so it ever was. When their fears were on them, urgent cries for help were sent to the Agent at Mhow. But when they had to face the consequences of his advance, they drew back and declined his help. They feared that the march of the Mhow troops might precipitate the crisis, and they shrank from the unpopularity attendant upon measures of punishment, and from the loss of dignity involved in the disarming of the State troops in the State capital by a British force. In this way the disarming of the mutinous regiments was deferred from week to week, and from month to month, and Colonel Durand, who wished as far as possible to respect the Maharaja's feelings, and had strong military reasons for not pressing the matter during the rains, so long as the troops remained quiet, exerted no authoritative interference. How the difficulty was eventually solved I have already described.

Such were the main facts; very briefly stated, of Colonel Durand's political administration in Central India, considered with reference to the Holkar State.

In July 1859, eighteen months after he had left Indore, when all the facts had been fully and calmly reviewed, Lord Canning wrote a Minute recording the services of certain officers during the mutiny. It contained the following words:—

“ I desire to bring prominently before Her Majesty's Government the very important services of the two distinguished men who have had charge of the affairs of Central India during that time.

“ The first thanks of the Government are due to Lieutenant-Colonel Durand, C.B., who at the time of the out-break was officiating as the Agent of the Governor-General. Colonel Durand's conduct was marked by great foresight and the soundest judgment as

"well in military as in civil matters. He had many points to guard, and the trustworthy force at his disposal was almost hopelessly small, but by a judicious use of it, and by the closest personal supervision of its movements, Colonel Durand saved our interests in Central India until support could arrive."

Such, after long and mature consideration, was Lord Canning's opinion. But Sir John Kaye, whose latest work now lies before me, takes an altogether different view of Colonel Durand's conduct; and as Sir John Kaye's works are at present extensively read, I propose to point out briefly what I venture to think are imperfections in his account of the mutiny in Central India.

To begin with, it may be as well to consider the source from which he draws his information. In the preface to his first volume Sir John Kaye mentions that he has obtained "much valuable matter in elucidation of the history of the Central Indian campaign" from Sir Robert Hamilton. It is not altogether unreasonable to suppose, that he is indebted to the same authority for more valuable matter in elucidation of the conduct and character of the Acting Agent, Colonel Durand. The supposition is borne out by the tone in which the historian speaks of Sir Robert Hamilton himself, and the coincidence of his views with those which Sir Robert Hamilton is known to have held. Now, Sir Robert Hamilton and Colonel Durand were, as Sir John Kaye justly remarks, "extremely dissimilar." "They had different characters and different opinions." Therefore, it is at least possible that Sir John Kaye has followed a somewhat unsafe guide in forming his judgment of Colonel Durand's action in Central India. It will be advisable to bear that possibility in view in estimating the value of Sir John Kaye's criticisms. But to turn to the story itself. In the first place it is singularly incomplete. Sir John Kaye ignores altogether the position of Central India, the objects which the Agent had in view, and the difficulties which beset him. He discusses Colonel Durand's conduct almost entirely with reference to Holkar and Holkar's behaviour on the particular occasion of the Indore outbreak. He describes with his customary eloquence the attack on the Residency, drives the British Representative into outer darkness, and then, making no mention whatever of subsequent operations, dismisses Sir Henry Durand to his doom in the Punjab, with a few final words of somewhat inconsistent eulogy. The whole chapter reads far more like an elaborate justification of Holkar, than an attempt to narrate the facts of the mutiny in Central India. But doubtless the behaviour of the principal Native Chiefs had some bearing on the progress of the revolt, and Sir John Kaye may possibly be right in attaching such exclusive importance to the discussion of Holkar's loyalty. His view of the insurrection at Indore may be stated in a few

words. Holkar was "thoroughly true to the British Government," and from first to last did his duty boldly and well. Colonel Durand unfortunately was not capable of grasping this fact. He had an "antipathy" for Holkar from the first. He was "not tolerant." He expected a Mahratta Chief to be "as leal as a Percy or a Campbell." He "wanted imagination" and "could not orientalise himself." He was inclined to "leap hastily to conclusions." On the 1st of July, when Holkar's troops attacked the Residency, he leaped hastily to the conclusion that Holkar was faithless, simply because Holkar was as much "bewildered" as himself, and had not sent any message during the cannonade. Thus easily convinced of Holkar's disloyalty, Colonel Durand "fled without good cause from Indore," and disappeared into space; leaving his political functions to be assumed, and the British Government to be "saved," by a stout-hearted artilleryman at Mhow, who, if Colonel Durand had only held on "a few hours" longer, would have rattled up with his battery, dissipated the enemy, and crushed the revolt. Afterwards as this "precipitate retreat" could only be justified "by proving the consummate treachery of Holkar," Colonel Durand laid himself out to prove it. He did not succeed. But his influence was sufficient to keep Holkar ever "more or less a suspect," and to prevent his obtaining, what he most coveted, the grant of a territorial reward. "There can be no question that Holkar was sacrificed to the justification of Durand."

Such are Sir John Kaye's views. Now this line of reasoning is based throughout on what seems to me a patent fallacy: that the retreat from Indore was made in consequence of political considerations. Sir John Kaye states the case as follows:—"Durand, \* \* hastily condemned Holkar, and by his flight from Indore brought matters to this issue, that either the Maharaja was a traitor or that the British Agent had fled without good cause from Indore." If I were disposed or obliged to accept this issue I should be able to do so with a certain amount of encouragement from Sir John Kaye himself. I might remind him of his own words used with regard to Sindia. "It was not to be "expected that being a man and a Mahratta he should not when "assailed by the fierce temptation sometimes have wavered in "his allegiance, and for a little while yielded inwardly to the "allurements that beset him. Perhaps, indeed, there was not a "Native Chief in India, who was not sometimes minded to wait "and watch at the outset of the great convulsion." Holkar also was a man and a Mahratta, and if he waited and watched while his guns were cannonading the Residency, he was not "thoroughly true to the British Government." But in point of fact Sir John Kaye's issue is altogether beside the mark. He has failed

to see that Colonel Durand's retreat from the Residency, and Colonel Durand's treatment of Holkar, were two entirely separate and distinct matters. If Colonel Durand fled from Indore without good cause, he tarnished his honour as a soldier. If he misjudged or maligned Holkar, he was a bad political officer or a dishonest man. But to mix up the two considerations is wholly illogical. The retreat from the Residency was a purely military operation to be justified or condemned solely on military grounds. No one seems to have realised more clearly than Sir John Kaye, the fact that Holkar was entirely powerless, that he neither had nor pretended to have the smallest remnant of control when his troops rose. One of the leaders of the insurgents was a Durbar officer named Saadut Khan, who was hanged two years ago for his share in that day's work. The evidence given at this man's trial shows clearly enough what the Maharaja's power was. His troops turned out as one man. Cavalry, Infantry, and Artillery came pouring up in a mass all equally eager to join in the slaughter of the English. As the Durbar Vakeel afterwards told Colonel Durand, with the view of justifying his master, "the lines were empty." For three days after the attack Holkar could not even bury the dead. Until the 4th of July, when the Maharaja first visited the Residency, the bodies of the men and women murdered by his Cavalry lay about his city of Indore. According to Sir John Kaye the Maharaja was himself subjected to insolence and threats. This being the case what conceivable difference could it have made, if, when Colonel Durand saw the whole of Holkar's troops surging up to the Residency, he had been absolutely confident of the personal loyalty of Holkar himself? He "fled" not from Holkar but from Holkar's guns and sabres and muskets. An inkling of the distinction seems to dawn upon Sir John Kaye's mind when he writes: "But admitting that the sudden retreat was justifiable or even commendable, I can see nothing to justify the after-treatment of Holkar by the Acting Resident at Indore." It need hardly be pointed out that the possibility of such an admission, coupled with the assertion of the Maharaja's innocence, is wholly incompatible with the issue stated above—"Either the Maharaja was a traitor or the British Agent fled without good cause from Indore." I propose, therefore, to treat the two matters as they ought to be treated, separately; to show first that the "sudden retreat" was in fact not only justifiable, but commendable and necessary, and secondly that "the after-treatment of Holkar by the Acting Resident at Indore," was equally capable of being justified.

First, as regards the retreat. Sir John Kaye contends that it was "precipitate" and groundless, that Colonel Durand ought to have held on "a few hours" longer, that if he had done so the Maharaja

would have had time to "declare himself on our side," the European battery would have come up, the revolt at Indore would "most probably have been suppressed" and "there would have been no combination of Holkar's troops with the Mhow mutineers." It will not, I think, be necessary to delay long over this matter. As I have already shown Colonel Durand's fighting men consisted of fourteen gunners, and five Sikh troopers of the Bhopal Contingent Cavalry. Besides these he had 270 Bheels, who could not be induced to discharge their pieces even from the Residency windows, 150 troopers who could not be formed, and nearly 500 Contingent Infantry, who were threatening to shoot their officers. With this force he held his ground for nearly two hours, and retreated only when the last show of strength was about to be taken from him by the flight of the Cavalry; when the attack, at first hesitating and tentative, had become organised and overwhelming, and, he found surging up to surround the Residency, masses of Holkar's troops consisting of 1,400 Cavalry, 2,000 Infantry,\* and from 25 to 30 guns, besides any amount of armed rabble from the city.

But Sir John Kaye's contention is that Colonel Durand ought to have held on notwithstanding until the arrival of the European battery from Mhow. Now there are several circumstances which militate against this view. In the first place, even supposing that the call for help had safely reached Mhow, which was doubtful, the probability was that Hungerford would be unable to obey it. From first to last Mhow had been the point from which danger was apprehended. As Sir John Kaye himself remarks: "It is scarcely to be doubted that the sepoys of our own regiments at Mhow contaminated Holkar's troops at Indore." This was precisely Colonel Durand's view, and the natural conclusion was that the rising was a concerted one; that Hungerford was hard at work on his own account, if not already overwhelmed by the rush of an Infantry regiment and a wing of Cavalry upon his unsupported battery. That this apprehension was not altogether unfounded was afterwards shown. In a letter written in January 1858, certainly with no view of justifying Colonel Durand, Sir Robert Hamilton gives a lucid account of the progress of disaffection at Indore. After describing "how the Durbar troops became associated with the Contingents and the mutineers at Mhow," Sir Robert goes on as follows: "This was the position of the Indore plotters when news came of the Neemuch rising. "About that time a detachment had come from Mhow for treasure,

---

\* They were afterwards computed higher figure. But I choose the lowest by the Indore Durbar itself and by est estimate. others, themselves soldiers, at a far

"and it seems to have been arranged that the morning of the 1st of July should be the day on which the Mhow and Indore troops should simultaneously rise. To test the sincerity of Holkar's troops, it was decided that they should commence early at eight o'clock on the morning of the 1st. At the time appointed, Buns Gopal, with the men of the Maharaja, and Bujrung Pultans with their guns, commenced the attack." So Colonel Durand can hardly be blamed for supposing that help from Mhow was very doubtful. As a fact the treacherous Regulars waited to see the result of their machinations before committing themselves; and Hungerford was able to obey orders. But it was impossible to count on this, and after Holkar's troops had begun to cut off the retreat there was no time left to wait and see.

Supposing, however, that Colonel Durand had resolved to await the battery, and stake all on the chance of its arrival, what would have been his position? Hungerford could hardly come up before one o'clock. How was the defence to be maintained for two hours and a half against the increasing masses of the enemy? If Holkar's troops had consisted of Cavalry and Infantry only, the thing might perhaps have been done. Could it possibly have been done against an overwhelming force of Artillery? It afterwards transpired that Hungerford left Mhow at a slow trot, and never mended his pace. He would not have been at Indore at this rate until four o'clock in the afternoon. Meanwhile for more than five hours Holkar's numerous guns, choosing their own position and getting their range with perfect impunity, would have been pouring a concentrated fire on the Residency building, and a rush on the part of the mutinous Contingent, or Holkar's swarming Infantry, would at any moment have overwhelmed the fourteen faithful gunners, and put an end to the defence. But even supposing that the Residency had still been standing and occupied when Hungerford's leisurely advance was completed; supposing that his unsupported guns had been able to burst through the attacking force and reach the little garrison, what could they have done beyond helping to cover a perilous retreat? With all Sir John Kaye's *esprit de corps* he surely cannot maintain that one European battery, with the aid of 270 Bheels, who declined to discharge their muskets, and perhaps 30 European officers and native gunners, could have attacked and defeated a force numbering, at the lowest computation, some 3,500 Cavalry and Infantry with a large superiority in guns, not to speak of the Contingent troops and the swarming city rabble.

At pages 344 and 345 of his book, after stating his views on the subject, Sir John Kaye quotes, what purports to be Colonel Durand's "answer." This is a letter to Lord Canning's Private Secretary in which Colonel Durand animadverts on certain incorrect statements published by the *Friend of India*. After stating

that the call for help reached Mhow at a quarter to ten, and describing the slowness of Hungerford's advance, Colonel Durand says: "It would have been four P. M. at least before he reached the Residency, for they did not canter out. I retired from the Residency after a two hours' cannonade about half-past ten." Upon this Sir John Kaye, abruptly breaking short Colonel Durand's "answer," proceeds to make the following point. "That is three-quarters of an hour after the call for the battery reached Mhow. Now the battery could not have been equipped, mounted, and brought down to Indore at full gallop in three-quarters of an hour. So it is clear that Colonel Durand did not await even the possibility of an arrival under the most favourable circumstances of Hungerford and his battery." Sir John Kaye's argument would have been fairer if he had allowed Colonel Durand to finish his sentence. It runs as follows: "As none of our men would fight, except the two Bhopal guns, the support of our guns and the defence of the Residency for five and a half hours would, had I tried to hold it longer, have depended upon the officers and European non-commissioned officers present, in all, telegraphic signallers included, from sixteen to twenty in number." Colonel Durand's "answer" was, not that he awaited the battery and that it did not come, but that he knew it could not arrive before one o'clock if it arrived at all; that, as a fact, it would not have arrived before four; that he had little chance of holding the Residency even up to the earlier hour; and that he must certainly, as it turned out, have been overwhelmed if he had attempted to do so. It is to be observed that Colonel Travers, commanding the troops, who earned his Victoria Cross among Holkar's gunners, never hinted at the possibility of prolonging the defence. Yet it was undoubtedly his duty to do so if he thought the retreat premature. The question was a purely military one.

Further comment with regard to the retreat itself would be superfluous. Before passing on, however, to the political question, there is one more point in Sir John Kaye's narrative which requires notice. On page 334 of his book, Sir John Kaye describes how Hungerford's advance was stopped midway by the arrival of a trooper of the Bhopal Cavalry who brought the news that Colonel Durand had evacuated the Residency. "The trooper added that Colonel Durand had not gone to Mhow because the cantonment was in Holkar's dominion, and an attack on our cantonments was meditated in the course of the night." This sentence is calculated to leave a wrong impression on the mind of the reader. Colonel Durand's manuscript memorandum, to which Sir John Kaye refers, shows clearly that the retreating force was not diverted from Mhow by the reasons here given. As I have already noticed

Colonel Durand did in fact order a retreat in that direction, but was unable to carry it out, because his troops refused to obey orders.

To turn now to the political aspect of the question, Sir John Kaye "can see nothing to justify the after-treatment of Holkar by the Acting Resident at Indore." Now I have no intention whatever of entering upon a discussion of Holkar's loyalty. There is happily no necessity for doing so. The justification of Colonel Durand's after-treatment of Holkar depends, not upon the proof of Holkar's bad faith, but upon the fact that that treatment itself was never harsh or hostile. To begin with, Colonel Durand certainly imagined that Holkar had thrown in his lot against us. But I have already enumerated some of the many circumstances which led him to entertain this belief, and I have shown that directly Holkar endeavoured to explain those circumstances, Colonel Durand wrote most fairly, and, indeed, favourably reviewing the Maharaja's excuses for his conduct. Nothing surely can be less inimical or indicative of the "antipathy" which Sir John Kaye most unjustly attributes to Colonel Durand, than the tone of the letter already quoted. If after writing that letter Colonel Durand still entertained a doubt as to the Maharaja's fidelity, and I am far from asserting that he did so, that doubt certainly amounted to nothing more than this, that at the beginning of the outbreak Holkar was playing a waiting game. Considering that Sir John Kaye himself expresses the same doubt with regard to all the Native Chiefs in India, he is hardly justified in blaming Colonel Durand for expressing it, if he did so, with regard to one. Nor is it reasonable to attribute to Colonel Durand's influence the refusal of a territorial reward. Holkar had a steady advocate in Sir Robert Hamilton, and he had perfectly impartial judges. Men like Lord Canning and Lord Lawrence and Lord May, were surely capable of forming their own opinions. No misrepresentations on Colonel Durand's part would have kept Holkar out of his due. And it must be remembered that the refusal of a territorial reward is not necessarily equivalent to an imputation of disloyalty. It was confessedly in 1857 the Maharaja's misfortune to be powerless. He was not therefore in a position to render any conspicuous active service to the British Government. This fact is surely sufficient in itself to account for the withholding of a grant of territory. Indeed, the honours subsequently bestowed upon the Maharaja and the consideration invariably shown to him by the Government of India, do not seem consistent with the possibility of his being a "suspect." They are certainly inconsistent with the statement that the Maharaja was "sacrificed" to the justification of another.

I have already referred in passing to Sir John Kaye's account of what happened at Indore and Mhow immediately after

Colonel Durand had been driven out of the Residency. But that account is so calculated to mislead that it will be necessary to notice it a little more in detail. On page 336, *et seq.* of Sir John Kaye's book, will be found a vivid description of the behaviour of Captain Hungerford after the outbreak. The writer tells how that officer wrote to Holkar expressing his disbelief in the story of the Maharaja's disloyalty; how he was satisfied and assured by the Maharaja's answer; how he proceeded to take upon himself the diplomatic as well as the military control of affairs; to prepare himself for a month's siege at Mhow; to "establish himself as representative of the Governor-General in Holkar's dominion," and to open a correspondence with Lord Elphinstone in Bombay. The description winds up with the following sentences. "He 'did "what he had no right to do' and he was afterwards severely "rebuked by Durand. But History, rising above all official formalities, must pronounce that the men who did what they had no "right to do were those who saved the British Government in "India." Now I have no wish to say anything against Captain Hungerford's reputation as a military officer. He afterwards did good service with the Mhow column in western Malwa, and Colonel Durand spoke in his favor for brevet rank. But before this he certainly did nothing to merit the extravagant laudation bestowed upon him by "History." He was not strong before the outbreak when a rise of the Mhow troops was expected. He was not ready during the outbreak either in the morning or the evening of the 1st July. And he was injudicious after the outbreak. If the actual facts of the case be extracted from Sir John Kaye's glowing pages, they seem to amount to this,—that Captain Hungerford's contribution towards the salvation of India consisted in firing a few rounds of grape through the darkness at nothing in particular, in holding for a month a fort which was never threatened, and in writing a series of letters to, and about a suspected Native Chief, of whose loyalty he was in no position to judge.

A little further on Sir John Kaye proceeds to describe how Lieutenant Hutchinson was driven out of Bhopawur by the Amjhera mutineers and was reported a prisoner; how Captain Hungerford "promptly took upon himself the political responsibility" of allowing Holkar to rescue the party, and how Lieutenant Hutchinson "had such implicit confidence in Holkar's friendship" that he did not hesitate to place himself "under the protection of his troops." "And thus" as Sir John Kaye remarks "was Hungerford relieved from the political responsibility which he had "undertaken with so much promptitude and acquitted himself of "with so much address." Thus the Artilleryman, who unable to stir out of Mhow, and ignorant of Holkar's conduct before the rising,

had "established himself as representative of the Governor-General in Holkar's dominion," handed over the charge to an equally ignorant political assistant who was a fugitive "under the protection of Holkar's troops." It would be rather interesting to know what these gentlemen would have done if, while they were acquitting themselves so entirely to their own and Holkar's satisfaction, the man whom they were endeavouring to supplant had let the barrier of the Nerbudda drop behind them and allowed Woodburn to march off to Nagpore.

There is one more question taken up by Sir John Kaye which requires a passing notice. He refers to Colonel Durand's "argument, persistently repeated, that a native prince is responsible for the conduct of his troops;" and he cites the case of Dhar to show how "impolitic and unjust" such an argument was. Now, in point of fact, what Colonel Durand persistently argued was the necessity of holding native chiefs *prima facie* responsible, which is something widely different. A loyal chief could easily produce evidence to rebut the presumption in his own case. Holkar himself, for example, produced such evidence, and it was immediately received with favour by Colonel Durand. But the presumption in itself is surely a reasonable one. The nominal Government of a state must be *prima facie* responsible for the acts of its troops. The distinction between the view attributed to Colonel Durand by Sir John Kaye, and the view Colonel Durand actually held, is brought out by the very case cited, that of Dhar. Colonel Durand urged the sequestration of the State, not simply on the ground that the Dhar Durbar was responsible for the excesses of its mercenary troops, but because the Durbar had, as a fact, thrown in its lot with the mutinous soldiery and encouraged rebellion against the British power. The case has already been the subject of much discussion. As Sir John Kaye has thought fit to bring it up again, it may be as well to supplement his account by a short statement of the facts. Just after the news of the Meerut and Delhi tragedies reached Central India the Dhar Rajah died. He had adopted his younger brother, Anund Rao Puar, then about thirteen years of age. The boy was acknowledged as Rajah, and chose for his Dewan or minister one Ranchunder Bapejee, who had a thorough knowledge of English, had associated much with English officers, and was supposed to be in favor of our interests. Contrary to the well-known and repeated instructions of the British Government, this man commenced his career by enlisting large numbers of foreign mercenaries. As soon as the news of the Indore rising reached Dhar, a party of these mercenaries, joining with those of the Rajah of Anjhera, plundered the stations of Bhopawur and Sirdarpore, and burned the hospitals over the heads of the sick and

wounded. Returning to Dhar with their plunder they were met and honourably entertained by the young Rajah's uncle ; and on the 31st of August they were in possession of the Fort. Six weeks later Captain Hutchinson, the Political Agent, reported that there was strong reason to believe that the Rajah's mother and uncle and other members of the Durbar were the instigators of the rebellion. The Durbar Agent gave him no trustworthy information, and had purposely deceived him on the nature of the Durbar's negotiations with the mutinous mercenaries, and the number of such men who had been enlisted. And the Durbar had received with attention and civility emissaries from Mundesore, which was the centre of the Mussulman rising. On receipt of this intelligence Colonel Durand dismissed the Dhar Agent who was in attendance upon him, with a message to the Durbar that they would be held responsible for what occurred. Then followed the march upon Dhar, and the occupation of the Fort. After the capture Colonel Durand ordered the Fort to be demolished, the State to be attacked, pending the orders of Government, and charges to be prepared against the leaders and instigators of the rebellion. Consideration was to be shown to the Rajah on account of his youth, and to the Ranees on account of her sex. But the Dewan Ramchunder Bapojee, the Rajah's uncle, Bheem Rao Bhonsla and others, were carried prisoners to Mhow, and were to be tried for their lives. Shortly afterwards Sir Robert Hamilton returned from England and resumed charge of his office as Agent of the Governor-General. To his negligence is attributable the escape of these men from the punishment they had merited. They were never brought to trial ; beyond a summary and unofficial enquiry nothing was done ; and on the 29th November 1858, without the knowledge of the Supreme Government, and in spite of the orders issued for their trial, of which Government had approved, they were permitted quietly to return to Dhar.

Three years later, when Sir Robert Hamilton had been relieved by the late Sir Richmond Shakespear, this neglect of orders was brought to light. Government could not then, of course, press any charges against the Durbar, and if it had desired to do so, there was little chance of evidence being procured. The record of the summary enquiry made in 1858 had been lost.

But the complicity of the Durbar in the rebellion was never questioned by any one in India, not even by Sir R. Hamilton, the champion of Dhar, till the 5th July 1858. It fell to Sir R. Hamilton to carry out the first orders for confiscation, and in doing so he did not hesitate to describe the Durbar as 'ungrateful and unfaithful,' and to declare that 'the treaty with the Dhar State has been completely abrogated by the act of that Durbar.' It may be noticed that the offence of Dhar was precisely the same

as that of Amjhera. The troops of both States conjointly plundered Bhopawur and Sirdarpore. The Rajah of Amjhera was hanged, and his territory incorporated with Sindia's dominions. No one has ever questioned the justice of his fate.

Such, as I have seen them publicly stated, were the facts of the Dhar case, which Sir John Kaye quotes as an exponent of Colonel Durand's mischievous views upon the responsibility of native princes. The action of the Home Government is well known. The despatch of the Court of Directors, cited by Sir John Kaye, which prevented the "unjust and impolitic" sequestration of the principality, was based on imperfect information. When the facts of the case were more fully reported in Lord Canning's letter of the 6th December 1859, after personal enquiry during his great progress through the Upper Provinces, which clearly established the complicity of the Dhar Durbar in the rebellion, the Home Government entirely concurred in the justice of the confiscation, but from 'merciful consideration' to the youth and apparent innocence of the young Rajah himself, decided to forego the extreme penalty. An outlying portion of the State was, however, sequestered and handed over to the Begum of Bhopal, as a reward for her faithful services, Her Majesty's Government being of opinion that it was "not right nor expedient that the principality of Dhar "should wholly escape all penalties for the misconduct of those "who directed its counsels and forces during the late events."

It would be impossible for me to notice here the many other defective or erroneous statements advanced by Sir John Kaye in this short chapter of his history: that Lord Elphinstone, "with all the facts before him," condemned Colonel Durand's retreat from Indore, that Colonel Durand had an "antipathy" for Holkar, and so on. As a fact, all Lord Elphinstone appears to have done, was to write a few days after the insurrection and assert Holkar's innocence on the strength of the reports received from the officers at Mhow. This was no slur on Colonel Durand, as Lord Elphinstone afterwards proved by personal assurances. I have already pointed out that Holkar's justification was not in the smallest degree inconsistent with that of the Acting Agent. As to the alleged "antipathy" Colonel Durand had been under three months at Indore when the troops rose, and had seen Holkar only twice. But it would be useless to notice every point of this kind. Nor would it serve any practical purpose to criticise Sir John Kaye's general imputations on Colonel Durand's character as a political officer, his intolerance and his want of consideration for the "down-trodden native princes and chiefs of India." Certain it is that I have received no warmer tributes to my father's memory than from some of these very princes and chiefs. However, this is a question which I have no wish to discuss. As I have

before observed Sir John Kaye draws a marked contrast between Colonel Durand and Sir Robert Hamilton. He says the two men were "extremely dissimilar," that they had "different characters and different opinions." No one who knew them both will be likely to dispute the assertion. For the rest every man has a right to his own opinion. Sir John Kaye believes that Sir Robert Hamilton's views were altogether right, and Colonel Durand's altogether wrong. In his case the belief is not incomprehensible. It arises partly from personal friendship for Sir Robert Hamilton, and partly from the fervour with which he has espoused the "predominant theory" that all our troubles came upon us "because we were too English." Colonel Durand "could not orientalise himself." Therefore he was a bad political officer.

The peculiar tone of Sir John Kaye's narrative is doubtless due to the same causes. Where he is not writing about anything connected with Sir Robert Hamilton or the defects of our national character, he can be just and even generous to the memory of Colonel Durand. But where Sir Robert Hamilton and the predominant theory are concerned, he can be neither the one nor the other. Fired by an enthusiastic desire to right what he conceives to be Holkar's wrongs, and imagining, without reason, that the justification of Holkar implies the condemnation of Colonel Durand, he allows himself to be carried away into a good deal of inconsistency and bad taste. He accuses "a man brave in battle" of making a groundless and precipitate retreat, and a "high-minded conscientious English gentleman" of justifying an act of poltroonery by a systematic course of mis-representation. The accusation is not, on the face of it, a probable one. How far it is borne out by facts I must leave others to judge.

H. M. DURAND.

---

## ART. X.—AMONG THE CONTINENTAL JAILS. (Concluded.)

AS the first article under the above heading was published six months ago, it may be necessary to re-state that the writer's intention has been, not to enter into minute details of prison and convict management, so as to deter readers, "not in the department," from a subject in itself not unforbidding, but simply to put in writing what would have attracted the notice of an unprofessional visitor to the Continental jails. He also maintained that discipline is more severe in many respects in India than in any other civilized country, not only from the privation of all luxuries, but from the excessive punishments generally obtaining in the former. A kindly critic of the first article would saddle the writer with a burden of proof which he had not been pledged to carry. His facts are allowed to plead for the inference which is their legitimate sequence. Whether the severer discipline of the Indian jails has a corresponding effect on the incidence of crime, is another question, about which there may be as many different opinions as there are people to hold them. The truth is, that imprisonment, be it severe or otherwise, is only one factor and a smaller one than is generally supposed in the prevention of crime. Early training, the massing of population, the want of efficiency, or *per contra*, great detective ability in the police, dearness of provisions, social habits and ethnological peculiarities, determine the number of criminals. Comparative statistics are incapable of embracing the Irish woman, who was about 257 times convicted for petty thefts and drunken rioting, in the same page with the wretched *Dome* who is working out his seventh sentence for theft, but was probably never drunk in his life, certainly never riotous. A Hindoo, even if he had the same brutal disposition has no clogs like the Lancashire rough, to kick his wife with, nor has he ever employed the flexors of his fists except as the prehensile organs nature had intended them to be. Even in his *lathee fights*, when his blood is warm, the noise is out of all proportion to the execution.

Supposing, however, that a comparison could possibly be instituted between the Teutonic criminal and his Aryan brother, it supports the writer's position. In Benares, which is criminally about the worst district in Northern India, re-committals average 21 per cent. of the prison population; Agra and Allahabad only 6 and 5 per cent. respectively. In Belgium, where the system is partly cellular, re-committals are 78 per cent. The "Moabit" in

Berlin receives 38 per cent. and the associated prisons no less than 88. In the Mountjoy convict establishment in Ireland, 201 prisoners were admitted in 1873, the last annual report to hand. Out of these only 31 were sent for the first time, giving an average of about 85 per cent. of habitual criminals. Seventeen of the Mountjoy convicts were in prison more than 15 times each, and thirteen of them had been over 10 times each. In India, among thousands of prisoners, only one man came under observation who had been more than seven times convicted. As has been stated, within certain limits the nature of the discipline will be seen to have little effect in enabling us to compare the criminal statistics of races so widely divergent as those of Europe and India. Even taking the same country as a basis of comparison, it does not follow that the discipline in Benares is lax, because there are 21 per cent. and severe in Agra or Allahabad, because there are only about 5 or 6. The conditions that determine the prevalence of crime cannot be formulated—each district must have, so to speak, its own criminal biography. We are far from undervaluing the deterrent effect of a stern prison *regime*, we only desire if possible to assign to it its proper place as a preventive.

An order from Lord Lyons, countersigned by the Minister of the Interior and the Chief of Police, admitted me into the French prisons. In Paris there are eight, but only three belong to the advanced system. The *Mazas* was the first visited. It is on the cellular plan, the barracks radiating from the centre like the spokes of a wheel. In this centre on the second floor is the chapel. The prison is not unlike that of Pentonville, but is intended more particularly for untried prisoners. The authorised diet is meagre in the extreme—about a pound and a half of bread with thin soup and vegetables, to which is added, on Sunday, a quarter of a pound of meat. This fare can, however, be supplemented by the prisoner's friends, and a canteen Scale is hung up in each cell detailing the prices at which extras, such as wine and tobacco, can be obtained. If an under-trial prisoner chooses to work, the half of his earnings are put down to his credit, and a certain moiety of this can be expended in the canteen. The cells are 10 feet by 6. and about 8½ feet high. They are warmed by hot air pipes in winter and ventilated in summer. Strict silence is enforced, not even the warder on duty being allowed to talk to the prisoners, unless there is some urgent necessity. At the time of my visit there were about 1,100 in confinement; but there is ample accommodation for 1,500. The administrative staff comprises a governor, deputy governor, 7 head warders and over 80 ordinary warders. There are 5 soldier sentries by day and 11 at night, while a reserve of 40, armed with Chassepot

rifles, are stationed at the main-gate. Altogether there are about 100 soldiers on duty connected with the prison. The industrial pursuits are various—tailoring, shoe-making and mat-making—articles of jewellery, brass and iron turning. The chapel, as has been mentioned, is in the centre, and the cell doors are so opened, that each inmate can hear the service and witness the mass without leaving his cell or seeing any of his fellow prisoners.

How they avail themselves of the spiritual food supplied to them may be judged from the description of a visitor who had the curiosity to investigate the subject—"I wished" he says "to see how they listened to the mass, so I ran along one gallery and looked into thirty-two cells. Three prisoners were reading the service, one standing up, with *head covered*, was staring at the altar; another was on his knees—one more, having opened his prayer-book for show, held in his hand a pamphlet which appeared to be a pictorial Magazine—while there was yet another who, leaning his arm on the shutter of his door with his head sunk in his arms, was weeping and sobbing so violently that his whole frame shook. The remaining 26 sat at their tables working or reading." Among the thirty-two, therefore, that our inquisitor visited, there was only one whose heart was touched with the feeling of repentance—if repentance it could be called—seeing that the aesthetic memories of youth could have been brought by the association of ideas into the cell of a criminal who may have had a gentle up-bringing and a sensuously cultivated mind. Remorse for a false step not to be regained is widely different from repentance. The ordinary *Mazus* jail-bird is not to be reformed, nor will he be even affected by the diapason of an organ or the chanting of a Gregorian hymn rolling along the familiar corridor. He takes them as a portion of the prison programme, which his French "beak" (as he probably calls him) has assigned to him. The most philosophical "evolutionist" does not manifest more good-natured indifference to the homilies of an old school puritan, than our professional law-breaker does to the priest and his acolytes. His warders are paid and so are his spiritual advisers—they are all fused into one system of restraint, hard work and a monotonous life. In every Christian nation, be it Catholic or Protestant, religious ordinances are more or less depended upon as a lever to raise the prisoner's moral tone, but if he has arrived at adult age to be effective, it must be complemented by the more powerful influence of a deterrent discipline. If an adult is ever to be converted from the evil of his ways by moral suasion, it must be by the voluntary enthusiasm of those who unselfishly desire his good and not by the usual "Sunday services." The cases are, however, few and far between, for it is only in "revival" periods that we hear of converted thieves and prize-fighters. The kernel of good within the convict's heart is so

encrusted with an accumulation of evil influences, increasing with his years and "professional" experience, that the mild tapping of conventional services has as little effect upon him as a pistol bullet could have upon an iron-clad !

As an inducement to good behaviour after a certain term of the convict's sentence is expired in the *Mazas*, he is promoted to be a work-master. His cell door is left open and he is allowed a certain amount of range within the corridor. Each cell has a gas-burner, which is turned off from the outside something like the lamp in a ship cabin. It has a work bench, a bed which folds up and a water closet. Except for the hour's exercise, the prisoner has no occasion to leave his cell, nor is he allowed to do so for the first eighteen months of his confinement. He can communicate his wishes to the warder on duty by pulling a short bell-rope in the inside, which causes an iron blade to fall down with a noise which re-echoes in the still corridor. If the warder is unable to supply the convict's wants, he makes them known to the watchman in the central hall by means of a speaking trumpet, and he, in his turn, communicates by the same method to the main office. The routine is silent, precise, and grim ; and if the prisoner does not commune unto edification with his own spirit it is not from the distraction of any sight or sound. In addition to a falling shutter for the admission of food, there is in the door a round opening about an inch in diameter covered with coloured glass and called in jail slang the "Judas." Through this the warder can watch his victim unseen. For the first month or so of the prisoner's confinement until he has grown callous, nothing so aggravates his position as the consciousness of this "awful eye" from which he cannot by any possibility hide himself. He lives in a state of constrained tension knowing that his every movement is watched by his suspicious keeper who, with muffled feet, paces the gallery corridor. If the convict should be so rash as to rebel against constituted authority, within a few yards there are dark cells with only straw mattresses, where a three days' confinement on bread and water, will make him heartily sick of the company of his own thoughts.

After work hours, books are allowed to the better behaved among them, but the "standing" literature of the cell is a canteen price list and large extracts from the jail rules. Some of them have photographs in frames of their own carving, and others have their walls ornamented with pictorial cuttings from an illustrated paper. Following the instincts of his extramural life, the convict, for the moment forgetting his position, to "drive dull care away," breaks out into a lively whistle, but before he has concluded the second bar, the "awful eye" finds expression in a prohibition so peremptory, that the tune is suddenly

changed into a key more befitting the traditions of the place. The expedients that convicts often adopt as a change from the monotony of their life often partake of the ludicrous. The writer knew an eccentric Irishman, who used in the solitude of his cell to amuse himself at the oddest hours by practising national jigs in his fetters. He had gained a certain proficiency in the art as the "clinking" of the irons kept time wonderfully well with the rapid movements necessitated by the nature of the dance. When caught "in the act" of course he was punished, but his own opinion was that he did nobody any harm by an amusement so essentially unaggressive. He had not then learnt that imprisonment and amusement are incompatible terms in the minds of the prison authorities.

In the *Mazas* only the legal adviser of the untried prisoner is allowed to enter the cell, for relations and ordinary visitors there are *parloirs* provided. These contain stalls with an iron grating in front, which face similar stalls for visitors, with a passage between for a sentry, who keeps a watchful eye that no papers or other contraband articles can be passed to or from the prisoner. The less impulsive Hindoo requires no such elaborate parlour. He squats *more suo* within three yards of his visitors who squat opposite to him, and the conversation is carried on, as a rule, in a very undemonstrative tone of voice. At times, however, the old women raise the same exaggerated "coronach" they are paid to practise at funerals, and the student of comparative psychology is left in doubt as to the real depth of Oriental feeling.

The cook-house of the *Mazas* is in a separate enclosure. To facilitate the removal of the rations, there are little trucks on rails which run into the ground-floor of the barracks. These trucks are laden with trays containing pans of soup and loaves for distribution. The trays are hoisted by pulleys to the several floors. On the top of the balustrades, that run along the galleries, the trays are carried on lighter trucks and as they pass each cell the food is handed in through the shutter in the door. The routine is speedy—there is no confusion or noise, and within ten minutes the eleven hundred prisoners are provided with the authorized allowance. The kitchen appears like the engine-room of a factory, the food being cooked by steam. The *chef* gave us a rehearsal of the process. He turned a number of stop-cocks, sending a full blast of steam into a boiler of hard potatoes and a "gentler breath" into another containing an *olla prodida* of vegetables. There is a stewards' department to look after the quantity and quality of the food and its proper distribution; but all the financial arrangements, contracts and accounts, are settled in the office of the Chief of Police.

In the yards between the wings, where factories are built in Indian circular prisons, are the *preau*, enclosures divided by walls

into twenty courts, where the convicts are allowed to take solitary exercise. The "eye" is still fixed upon them, however, for there it is, elevated on a central platform "like a priest surveying all" but armed with an authority that is not to be gainsaid. The prisoner neither sees nor is seen by any of his comrades going or returning, and even the "eye" cannot rest long upon him unless his conduct is eccentric. After an hour of this listless "exercise" he is brought back to the familiar cell there to be locked up till the same hour next day. From the day of his incarceration he is practically lost to the world. His name is merged into Arabic numerals, and there it remains till his sentence is expired and he is restored to some social circle that knew him by a Christian name. The annals of his prison life, like those of the poor, are short and simple. At grey dawn the bell tolls the *reveille* when he must be up and doing. His bed must be slung and the bedding neatly folded—his comb and brush, mug and glass, are to be placed in the corner cupboard, and he himself within half-an-hour standing to "attention" within his cell door. His tools and work for the day are handed over to him, and he resumes his last evening's employment till breakfast time. The miniature truck is heard approaching his door, down falls the shutter, the warder, without a word, gives him his beaker and loaf, shuts up his cell and is off to the next. Such is day by day the unvarying routine; excepting on Sundays, when he is allowed to hear mass and read all day. On Sunday evening he has a warm bath in a large room divided into little bathing cells smaller even than those on board ship. There is a biographical dictum to the effect that happy is the life which is uneventful; tried by the prison standard the rule does not seem without its exceptions.

From the *Mazas* we went to the "Petite Roquette," the juvenile prison in the *Rue de la Roquette*. It faces the prison of the condemned which is on the other side of the same street. This juvenile prison is like a miniature *Mazas* and has cell accommodation for about 500 boys. It is not necessary that a boy should commit a positive breach of the law to gain admittance. If a parent brings his son before a magistrate and swears that he is incorrigible, he is straightway sent for any period up to a year. This system of parental training by proxy is liable to abuse. A widower, intending to re-marry, finds this a feasible way of disposing of a mischievous youngster who might be the means of producing disunion in his future household. Dissipated fathers and heartless step-mothers frequently accuse the boys unjustly, and the enquiry regarding the truth of the charges made is not always rigidly followed out.

The jail system is a strictly solitary one. Excepting his warders, instructors, chaplain, and, occasionally visitors in the

*parloir*, the boy has no associates. In chapel and school the seats are enclosed in boxes, from which the pupils are seen by the chaplain and schoolmaster, but they cannot see each other. They describe each other, not by their features which they cannot have seen, but the tone of the voice and by individual peculiarities in pronunciation. The nicknames are based accordingly. One boy may be known in the schoolboy directory as *le criard*, another as *le toureau*, while a third is called by the French equivalent of "Lispy." The governor seemed on short acquaintance to be exceptionally well adapted for rather a delicate position. The unvarying stringency and modified "terrorism" that adult habituals require, would only develop cowardice and deception in a boy, qualities least suitable to make his way afterwards in the world. One of them had been ill and fell into a fit of convulsive crying, which the governor did not pass by, as not in accordance with the traditions of penal discipline, but cheered the boy up and we left him smiling through his tears.

Many Anglo-Indians will find the following assertion rather hard of belief. There is less truthfulness in the Parisian juvenile convict than in his less sophisticated Indian brother criminal. Many of these boys flatly denied the crimes laid to their charge, although their faces and character belied their statements. The Indian boy will, as a rule, frankly confess to having stolen a *latah* or cloth or money as the case may be, but generally with the qualifying excuse that he was hungry. Not so, however, the adult Indian convict. It seems as if with the Hindoo the advent of puberty determined the limit of truthfulness; as if coincident with the appearance of "down" upon his cheeks, came the disappearance of honest trust from his heart. Taking the convicts' own estimate of their characters stranger would fancy that a jail was a collection of persecuted saints. I have frequently amused myself by enquiring of a new admission, "Well my good man what have you done?" Among hundreds of such an enquiry I could count on my fingers the occasions on which the reply was not "O, I did nothing, Sir, but my enemies laid a net for my destruction and now, alas, they have succeeded." Even the "habitual" finds the same statement ready to his lips, although he is fully convinced not a word of it is believed. Perhaps this unburdening may soothe his conscience if he has such a thing, if not, he has plaintively asserted his innocence before the jail world, and will endure his punishment like a martyr.

The boys in the *Roquette* are exercised in the same kind of yard as in the *Mazas*. By way of inducement to exercise their limbs there are hoops provided, but by the time the momentum is fully established the hoop comes into collision with the wall of the

preau, and the amusement is therefore feeble, as compared with what the boy had been accustomed to.

After a certain period, varying from six to eighteen months, the boys, when not restored to their relations, are drafted to the agricultural reformatory of Mettray near Tours. This colony, as it is euphemistically called, was established about thirty-six years ago, by a Parisian barrister, named Demetz. The young delinquents are taught agriculture and various rural handicrafts, and this is combined with such a carefully organized discipline and up-bringing, as to modify, to a great extent, their want of home-training and healthy associations. Out of about 2,000 boys who have passed through Mettray, only some three per cent. lapse into confirmed and hopeless criminals. If these boys had been left in association with adult criminals probably the same percentage would not have been saved.

Opposite the juvenile prison, as has been mentioned, is the *Dépôt des Condamnés* with accommodation for about 400 prisoners. In spite of its name and ghastly associations, it seems to possess certain amenities over other common place jails, and is, therefore, rather a favorite with gentlemen convicts. Those condemned for crimes of a less heinous description may, on application to the Minister of the Interior and by the payment of about 200 francs per annum, obtain permission to pass their sentence here. Nearly half the inmates have nothing to do, as there is no demand in the labour market and they lounge in the yards, or, in the cold weather, crowd into the *chauffoir*. Quite apart from the others, there are cells for prisoners condemned to death, in one of which the notorious Troppmann was confined. On the 24th May, 1871, this prison was the scene of the most revolting tragedy of the Communist anarchy. In a cell, still pointed out, the Archbishop of Paris spent his last night on earth, and the place where he was forced to stand when fired at by the ruffian mob is enclosed by an iron railing, with the following inscription on a black marble slab : "Respect *ce lieu, témoin de la mort des nobles et saintes victimes, de XXIV Mai 1871*," with their names appended in full. It is a coincidence in appearance like a befitting retribution, that the scene of these "noble and saintly victims" murder, is close to the *Pere la Chaise*, where the Communists made their last stand and were shot down in hundreds, like hungry wolves as they were, by the avenging army of Versailles.

The other prisons remained unvisited as they belonged to the ancient type and were only retained on account of financial considerations. From enquiries it appears that they are something like the Indian Central prisons having a certain proportion of cell accommodation, and the prisoners working in association during the day. There is also a system of classification in force. For ins-

tance, in the female prison, St. Lazare, there are three sections, built quite apart ; the first containing under-trial, ordinary convicts, and young girls under 16, all the classes separate. The second section is given up to women of a professionally bad character, who are sentenced for breaches of sanitary or police regulations. There are also *pistole* cells containing each two or three beds where female prisoners, who are able to pay for it, can enjoy comparative comfort. The juvenile convicts are locked up in separate cells.

It is difficult to suggest an improvement on the French cellular system, except that it may be modified by careful association as in the Plotzensee, where better work can be carried on. The great expense prevents the adoption of either system in this country. Moreover, the conditions of race, climate, and social customs are so widely different from those of the West, that few of the adjuncts of civilized discipline are applicable. There are no words in our language capable of expressing any comparison between the *choula* of an Indian prison and the steam kitchen ranges of the Mazas. One might as well endeavour to compare a bullock hackery to a passenger train. A *purloir* is as unnecessary as worsted stockings, while a native official would not peril his caste, and therefore his eternal salvation, by applying his lips to a speaking trumpet. Still a beginning might be made by building large solitary cells wherein "the habitual" might chew the "cud of reflection" and work hard, during the cold weather months in any case.

It may not be uninteresting to devote a paragraph or two to show what wonderful advances have been made even in India within the last thirty years. Prior to that period, road-making was the only punitive labour exacted from prisoners, because, forsooth, weaving and carpet-making was supposed to interfere with their caste. They were paid a certain sum of money for their maintenance and, like the Egyptian prisoners of the present day, enjoyed the luxury of making their own bargains. Each man cooked his own food and took his own time over it, and the *hookuh* relieved his *ennui*, when he did not choose to work. Never was there congregated a happier set of labourers than the prisoner-gangs upon the roads. They laughed and they sang and they joked with their guards, with each other, and with passers by, and seemed to find the fulness of enjoyment in the daily picnic. That this description is not exaggerated, is painfully conclusive from the fact, that the value of their labour fell short by 22 rupees each man per annum of the additional expenditure involved in paying for more guards when working extramurally. How to employ them punitively and yet profitably became the vexatious problem. The prison Committee of 1838, with Lord Macaulay as one of its members despairing of solving the ques-

tion, recommended that tread-mills should be largely adopted, and that high caste prisoners should not be compelled to work at a mechanical trade "as that would inflict a dreadful punishment, not only on himself, but on every member of his family." Experience has since taught us that within jail limits caste is a very elastic institution, and that a plunge in the holy Ganges or Jumna can purify the heaven-born Brahmin from greater defilements than manufacturing Persian carpets. In any well disciplined jail it is only the fear of the lash that prevents many of the highest castes from throwing away a useless encumbrance for the sake of the comparative ease and ampler food of the jail sweepers. The messing system introduced very tentatively in 1841, was the first and most effective blow struck at the root of the abuses that existed. The guards were bribed and relations at home supplied with the money, which a benevolent Government had intended for the prisoner's food. We do not feel surprised, therefore, that the messing system was received in a very rebellious spirit not only by the prisoners, but by those in charge of them. In Chuprah, Behar, and Allahabad, the prisoners rose *en masse*, but were speedily and very properly shot down into submission.

There is no occasion to dwell long on the seemingly minor, but very essential improvements that have since been effected. The establishment of Central Prisons and the appointment of Inspectors-General, the Superintendence entrusted to medical officers, who had ample leisure for the work, the introduction of convict warders and the mark system, cleanliness, order, and discipline, replacing filth, idleness and disorder. These are some of the phenomena of the Kosmos that has arisen from the chaos of thirty years ago. An officer of wide experience as a superintendent, told me that even within the last twenty-five years no European would care to trust himself within a prison enclosure, but would satisfy his curiosity by staring through the iron bars as if he were in a Zoological garden. A prisoner in those days would no more be trusted with a razor than with a loaded rifle or the key of his own cell.

How much the North West Provinces has contributed to this advancement in criminal management may be found in Howell's "Note on Indian Jails" the most interesting book on the subject in Anglo-Indian literature.

Before crossing the channel, we may remark that many who have not visited the French prisons have a low estimate of them, because notorious political offenders, like Marshal Bazaine, contrive to make their escape. These critics forget that there are two keys that will open almost any prison door. One is gold, the other, patriotism. In a period of strong political excitement some of the guards insist, however wrongly, upon being citizens as well as State servants and act upon their convictions irrespective of

their duty. No one speaks scornfully of British Prisons, because Head Centre Stephens walked leisurely away from Dublin. The "Dugal creature" opened his chief's cell door, flung his keys at the gaoler's head, and would rather have his hand chopped off than turn a lock on his feudal master.

A word of irrelevant advice to the reader. If an exile for some years and, therefore, a comparative stranger to London, be provided with a list of fully half-a-dozen hotels in the same or contiguous postal divisions. If you arrive during a period of social excitement (for example the Czar or the Shah) you would find it much more pleasant to drive into the solitary *dâk* bungalow of Doodoo in Rajpootana, than into the great city of London. You try the Charing Cross Hotel as the nearest and when repulsed from want of room, you drive to and fro with a top-laden cab, cold and hungry and irritable, and are fain to deposit yourself and boxes in the first door-way that has the virtue of hospitality, if no other. An owl in a tropical sunshine is not more bewildered and dazed and helpless than you are, that is, if you are as I have been. You have left the land of contemplation, where the *dolce far niente* is exalted into a science, and you are thrown into the midst of men hurrying to and fro upon the earth as if life were a foot-race and the prize was to the swiftest.

A description of Millbank and Chatham is reserved for the close of this article, only remarking *en passant* the radical change within the last few years in the social status of the English prison governors. It is not so very long ago that the governor was called "gaoler" and was only a slight remove in public estimation from the hangman. In former days the prisoner was contracted for, and the gaoler could, and did, even more than the modern hotel-keeper, exact high charges for indifferent fare, while his guests had not the option of moving elsewhere for more suitable accommodation. A large proportion of the present governors are military officers, who have brought their professional training and *esprit de corps* to bear upon the routine of prison economy. The Governor of Chatham was a Bombay Cavalry Officer; one of his deputies is a Captain, and so are the deputies of Millbank and Perth. A man who at present rules over an Indian district was an unsuccessful applicant for the governorship of an English county jail. These instances are mentioned to show how singularly a once despised profession has risen in social estimation.

Leaving London early on a July morning the writer arrived late at night in Cologne *en route* for Berlin. The cathedral city is too well known to require description. The anatomical relics of the Magi and the virgin companions of our own St. Ursula were reverently gazed at, and the clerical father's enthusiasm became

epidemic even among the sceptical. Every moment however, was one of impatient restraint, until we were on the broad breast of the Rhine "mine own imperial river" which

" — nobly foams and flows,  
The charm of this enchanted ground  
And all its thousand turns disclose  
Some fresher beauty varying round,  
The haughtiest breast its wish might bound  
Through life to dwell delighted here."

It is not the volume of water nor the mighty force embodied in it that exercises the fascination, that "throws its spell" over those who have often sailed upon the still mightier Ganges. The colour is much the same in both, a muddy brown, not the rich Cerulean of the Arve and the Jumna. Its loveliness is not in itself, but in its *entourage*, winding amid vine-clad banks crowned with rugged towers most of which were ivy-clad and grey with age before Tamerlane invaded India. Bonn and Coblenz and Mayence, have had whole pages devoted to them in the written history of the world at a time when no one save savans can tell whether Brahmans, Buddhists or Aborigines inhabited the banks of the great Indian rivers. Therein lies the charm of historical scenery. It is not so much the mere objective existence of castles, crags and vineyard slopes that imprints an impression of freshened interest. It is the story of the people who have lived in and upon them; the romance of their lives, when life could have its romance before barons and baronial church dignitaries, were hammered into the same humble submission to law and social order as the very lowest of their feudal serfs. The castle of Dracheufels is now as still as a graveyard, except when invaded by prying travellers; but in the days of Count Roland the Crusader, no boat could have crossed its river base as we did without a challenge from the mail-clad warder. Will Calgong or Monghyr, or Prayag call up the enthusiasm kindled by the island of Nonnenwerth, whose nunnery was founded in the age of tradition, and in whose peaceful seclusion, uninvaded by steamers and their deck-loads of hurrying tourists of every kindred, tribe, and tongue the "peerless Hildegund" found a refuge for her sorrows and her youth, leaving behind her a story of faithful adherence to "truth and dear affection" which has been embalmed by the genius of Schiller?

But the Rhine is not the Berlin jail, and as the writer was almost as impatient to get in as its inmates to get out, he left the steamer at Bingen and took a through ticket, *vid* Frankfort to Berlin. Another word to the reader will introduce the second and last irrelevant advice. In any difficulty rather trust to good English

forcibly expressed than to bad German. The Frankfort guard, taking advantage of the meekness manifested in an imperfect knowledge of his guttural *patois*, after a deliberate survey of both ticket and physiognomy, decided upon placing me in a crowded and lower class of carriage than I had foolishly paid for. The solitary first-class compartment he had reserved for a spectacled compatriot of his own. It was not until the train was about to start that I discovered the imposition, when I sprang out, and in mother language more forcible than polite, expressed to the guard the unfavorable opinion I had suddenly formed of him. The compatriot, who could not have paid for his comforts, in disgusted dudgeon withdrew his wallets and I reigned in his stead for the rest of the journey.

Every one knows that Berlin is on the Spree, but those who have not visited it, are not perhaps aware how sluggish, foul and mephitic the river is. As you cross it from Unter den Linden, you ask the guide where the canal comes from, and are told in a consecutive sentence that it is the Spree and abounds in fish. Any one who has seen Hyde Park in the "season" or two miles of the Bois de Boulogne covered with gorgeous equipages four abreast, cannot fail to be struck with the "extraordinarily ordinary" appearance of the "upper-ten" of Berlin. He can count on the digits of one hand the number of handsome carriages that pass any given point of an evening between the Brandenburg gate and the bridge near the Museum. The magnificent wagon horses of Paris and London, that so delight even the non-equestrian Anglo-Indian, are painfully conspicuous by their absence in Berlin. The expression is deliberately written, for it is not a pleasant sight to see a huge lumber wagon drawn by an undersized horse of the species called in this country, "rat-tailed country-breds." The Germans, however, have taken a leaf from the Esquimeaux and make extensive use of dogs as a motive power for costermongers and country vegetable carts. As these dogs delight to bark and bite at other dogs similarly harnessed, they are necessarily kept muzzled. The breed is powerful and shaggy, not unlike the Bhutan dogs, but with a less treacherous expression.

The "credentials" mentioned in the former article, were presented at the Ministry of the Interior for permission to visit the jails. The conceited officials disdaining any assistance in translating the paper presented to them, transposed the writer's official title of Surgeon, Bengal Forces, into Surgeon of Marines. As the writer was as ignorant of the transposition as they were of his belonging to the land service, the mistake might have led to awkward results. When giving some details of Indian prison management to the Deputy Governor of the Plotzensee, he enquired how I could have obtained such varied jail experiences

when serving with the Marines? When we came into an explanation of the mistake, we had much pleasant converse about bureaucratic self-sufficiency among other subjects.

The first visit was paid to the Neue Strafgefängniss situated on the south bank of the Berlin and Spandau canal near the Plotzen Lake. It is called by the towns people the Plotzensee, and is as yet only about half built. It forms an embodiment of the newest theories of prisons and prison management—that the State is to be repaid for the convict's expense, and that he himself is to learn habits of steady hard work which are to be the means of his moral reformation. Idleness, says the German theorist, is the *fons et origo* of all sins against property: teach the prisoner to work for a lengthened period, and the habit acquired in his confinement will become his second nature on release. The prison is to have accommodation for 1,500 convicts and the sanctioned estimates amount to nearly 40 lacs. A prison in India for the same number would be considered expensive if the net cost was more than 5 lacs.

The entrance gate-way is flanked by a pavilion on each side. In the one is a detachment of soldiers on duty, the other is a minor office for checking persons and property passing in and out of the main-gate. There is also a telegraph line connecting the prison with the city, with the view of speedily summoning armed assistance from the Chief of Police should occasion demand it. It ought to have been mentioned that the prison is more than half an hour's drive from Berlin, along a road as sandy and barren as any in the neighbourhood of Lahore. The sand is drifted into the same wave-like forms, and the vegetation is equally scraggy and inedible. Out of India such extreme barrenness is quite unexpected.

After entering the gate-way we pass through an open court tastefully laid out in flower beds with a fountain in the centre. Beyond it is the central block in which are the offices, chapel, school-room, &c. Right and left from this central block are corridors leading to long ranges of barracks three-storeys high from the middle of which smaller ranges spring, each side of the central block appearing like the letter "T" inverted. On one side of the main enclosure there is a prison for boys; the hospital occupies a corresponding position on the other side. The lower storey of the long range contains coal stores, heating apparatus, blacksmith's forges, bath-rooms, and dark cells for the refractory. On the upper floors are compartments of sizes, each containing from eight to thirty prisoners with workshops and lavatories. In the shorter ranges, represented by the upstroke of our inverted letter, are solitary cells, 120 already built, each 15 feet long by 9 broad, provided with gas, heating pipes and bell for calling the attention of the warden. It is also provided with a water closet, flushed by a self-

acting apparatus. At the time of my visit there were 850 prisoners guarded intermurally by 50 warders. Among the prisoners was the Editor of the *Germania* (I was told) an Ultramontane paper, who was confined for his violent attacks on the ecclesiastical policy of Prince Bismarck. He was not treated as an ordinary prisoner, but allowed to walk in the gardens behind the office with his visitors, and to wear his own clothes. He has since been a second time convicted for the same offence, and the circulation of his paper has increased enormously in consequence. Verily, even political martyrdom hath had its reward for this tall long-haired man of thirty-five.

The Plotzensee system is unique in one respect, the prisoner's labour is contracted for. He is handed over to the contractor in the factory, who teaches him and supplies materials for the work. In the workshops devoted to picture frames and billiard tables, there was a foreman in civilian clothes instructing and directing the prisoners. For the first month or so the contractor receives the prisoner's service *gratis* if he is ignorant of any trade, after that period the Government is paid from four annas upwards for his daily work. Even now in its rudimentary stage the labour refunds about a third of the gross cost besides the allotment of another third to the prisoner's credit, part of which (two silbergoschen about  $1\frac{1}{2}$  annas) he may expend in such material comforts as beer, cheese, and snuff. Every man must work be his term long or short. The latter are mostly engaged in punching out ornamental paper borders for confectioners' *bou-bons* or in common printing with a stamping machine. As the prison beer costs only a half-penny per pint a little money goes a long way in supplying it. One cannot say much for its "body" which is said, however, to improve by keeping, but which the prisoner, of course, cannot do. Tobacco smoking is strictly forbidden, but unlimited snuffing is allowed consistently with the state of his conduct and finances. Deprivation of full diet and snuff in the dark cells, is the severest punishment awarded for gross misconduct. The warders not being allowed to smoke on duty take snuff as only Frederick the Great could do, in pinches huge and sonorous. A garrulous old warder in the "Moabit" prison tapped his "mull" with the solemn precision of a Scotch highlander, and offered the writer a pinch in parting as a proof of his unexpressed opinion that, upon the whole he approved of his visitor.

Even the laundry of the Plotzensee affords an interesting study of mechanical appliances. Huge presses of clothing run out upon rails and are raised bodily by winch and pulleys to the upper floors for the distribution of their contents. The clothes, after being washed, are placed in a hollow cylinder which is made to

revolve an incredible number of times per minute, and the centrifugal force drives out the particles of water through perforations in the sides of the cylinder. After a few minutes of this whirling motion the clothes are only a little damp when they are placed in a recess heated by means of hot air pipes. An hydraulic press used to be employed for the purpose of squeezing out the water, but it had the disadvantage of squeezing out all the buttons as well as the water.

As in India, all the "domestic work" is performed by the convicts. The clerks of the stewards, and administrative departments are convicts, others cook and bake the bread (each roll of which has its weight stamped upon it to facilitate distribution) some wash and sweep, others are stokers, gas-makers and gardeners. Among the industries carried on in the cells and workshops are picture-frames, upholstery of all kinds, printing, billiard tables, locks, brass work, shoe-making, tailoring and book-binding. In England, for obvious reasons lock-making is not a jail industry, in the Plotzensee they seem to have less distrust. On the prisoner's admission he is at first sent for two or three months to the solitary cells, where his character is quietly but minutely studied. If he is an incorrigible reprobate there he remains for the three years allowed by law; but if not, he is removed to a compartment containing convicts somewhat akin to himself in disposition. As I have mentioned, the dormitories vary in size, so there is no difficulty in applying the principle of selection. A man who has not lost the mental refinement of his education and home-training, is not forced to associate with vulgar roughs, who are wanting in every condition of humanity except its physical shape. The restraint of incarceration is to many, but a sip as compared with the draught of bitterness represented by daily association with a degraded thief. The law may be broken under an impulse of passion, which no more rough-hews the mind than it moulds the features like unto the "mug" of the professional house-breaker. In the Plotzensee an inmate is not considered a mere numeral to be manipulated like an arithmetical quantity, but a human being with a history character and hopes for the future, to be dealt with according to his individual case and the good of the body politic. If a man is to be simply *deterring* from a fresh commission of crime, argues the philosophical German, appoint a drill sergeant over him with detailed instructions to let him feel the yoke every moment of consciousness. Let his sleep be disturbed, let him drink the water of bitterness and eat the bread of affliction, let his work be heavy and his food light, and his whole prison life a burden grievous to be borne, and then your theories are carried out to their logical sequence. But, if you admit that a prisoner is not beyond the pale of reformation, your jail system must stand to him "*in loco*

*parentis*," and he must be treated according to his individual requirements. You can no more reform your criminal by sending him through a uniform prison mould, than you can make a sincere Christian by forcible attendance at a certain number of Christian services.

In India the field is too great and the labourers too few. In a large administrative staff there may be two or three whose motives are disinterested, but what are they among so many? If the head native official is a follower of the prophet, it is found that all the odour of sanctity in the jail is exhaled from his own co-religionists. Another, wiser in his generation, reserves his commendations for the mammon of unrighteousness, and the superintendent is driven in despair to regard, as the most hopeful case of punitive reform, the man who gives least trouble, and weaves an extra yard of cloth for his daily task. The Indian "habitual" is to be carefully excluded, however, from the application of any theory which has physical amenities for one of its conditions. The system in his case is to be deterrent in the sense of extracting as much hard, profitable work out of him as possible, for moral reform is hopeless and the fear of punishment the only motive that influences him. Like his brethren in the West, he cannot have the plea of starvation on his admission in a country where his stomach can be filled to repletion by the expenditure of one pice. He aims at more ambitious objects and finds himself (not much to his regret, unless he has had a hard time of it previously) in his "father-in-law's house" as the jail is called in the slang dictionary of the Hindoo.

The next prison visited was the Zellengesangniss or the "Moabit" as the guide called it. It is built on the model of the Pentonville prison, and is also pretty much the same in build as the Mazas. It has accommodation for 500 and every cell was occupied. Solitary confinement is restricted to three years unless the prisoner elects to remain alone for the whole period, which many of them do. I saw one who had spent six years in solitary confinement and he preferred to remain the other four in the familiar cell. There is no mark system as in England by which on account of hard work and good conduct a prisoner may obtain a fixed period of remission, but in exceptional cases, if his friends petition for his release and his conduct has been satisfactory, he may obtain a remission of nearly a fourth. The cells were 15 by 9 as in the Plotzeusse and similarly provided. Each man's tools were handed out in the evening contained in a case so arranged that a glance would show if any one was missing. The beds were constructed so as to fold up into a work table during the day. Some had lathes as fixtures in their cells, others vices and stamping machines. In the French prisons there were boards at every

corner containing rosters of guards for duty and of prisoners detailed for every kind of work, school included. The Germans were less official. The only writing in the corridor was the prisoner's jail and class numbers on the cell doors. Each convict has three hours' schooling a week, and seats so arranged that they cannot see each other. In school chapel and at exercise in the solitary yards, each man wears a mask besides being obliged to remain ten paces distance from his comrades when going and returning. In all the German prisons the Würtemberg Control Watch has been introduced rendering it impossible for the night watchman to sleep on his post without detection. Smoking is forbidden here also, but almost every prisoner has a black *papier mache* snuff box on his work table. As I have mentioned in the former article, in England and India alone are tobacco and every dispensible luxury absolutely forbidden, and I have detailed some of the ingenious devices adopted in this country for supplying the illicit gratification, without the risk of a flogging. In India smoking was not forbidden till 1852, and in the light of wisdom after the event, it is amusing to recall the fact that the doctors violently opposed the withdrawal of the prisoner's beloved *chillum*, urging the probability of gastric and other complications as a result from an enforced abstinence from the habitual sedative.

A mere enumeration of the various industries pursued in the "Moabit" would fill nearly half a page of the *Calcutta Review*. After ordinary work hours the convict is allowed to pursue any study or art to which he has a partiality. Some are fond of languages, others affect mathematics or the applied sciences, while a few devote their spare time to drawing or carving on wood. Some have their cells ornamented with family photographs or engravings—others have, in addition, flower pots and bird cages, while a few clod-hoppers are content with the authorized "plenishings" worth about nine shillings, including bed and bedding.

The most serious objection that has been urged against the cellular system is, that it has an injurious effect on the convict's mental condition leading to lunacy or suicide. According to the "Moabit" statistics, however, the phlegmatic German is not the more inclined to "shuffle off this mortal coil" in that it is immured in a cell, for only four cases of suicide have occurred within the last seven years; and only two cases of permanent lunacy within the same period. The French *Mazas* does not show so favorably. According to M. Robin there were no less than 61 cases of suicide between 1850 and 1865. In the face of contrary results obtained in the German solitary prisons, it is hard to divide the responsibility between the system and the impulsive national character. Solitary confinement for any lengthened period with-

out occupation, is an experiment that has been too disastrous in its results to be ever again attempted in any civilized country. The prisoner sinks under the infliction, or becomes a drivelling idiot, either alternative not comprehended in his original sentence.

The theocratic city of Calvin has so fallen from its ancient estate as to possess two prisons. To a lover of the picturesque, however, jail inspecting alone on a first Continental trip would be misapplied enthusiasm, so the opportunity was taken to visit some noteworthy places between Berlin and Geneva. Did not the want of space forbid, the title of this article could be made sufficiently comprehensive to include a description of the quaint old town of Eisenach odorous of tanneries and breweries, and of factories of soap and oil, but having on a lofty wooded eminence in its neighbourhood the Castle of Wartburg, where Luther, as a prisoner, translated the Bible. Here, too, the legend goes, he put to ignominious flight no less doughty a foeman than the enemy of mankind himself by hurling an inkstand at his head. Have we not much wondered, as we sat in Luther's chair, at the singular re-productive power of the ink stain on his study wall, for although pieces of the stained plaster have been taken away for generations by pious pilgrims, there it remains like the widow's cruise of oil, not in the least diminished in size or colour by the daily process of spoliation. It would be opening a door for historical scepticism to nurse the suggestion, that the grim custodian replenished the loss by a splash from his own inkhorn, were it not that his services, as keeper of the Lutheran relics, did not go unrewarded in *silbergroschen*. With much more enthusiasm was a donation given to a poor organ-grinder, who on the battlements of Wartburg ground "Ye banks and braes of bonnie Doon" in the midst of his limited musical repertoire. We would fain dwell on Heidelberg, Baden-Baden, and Carlsruhe, the sleepy old capital of the Duchy, built like the *Mazas*, but with a palace for the nave, where a cab is not to be seen in the streets, and every fourth man is a soldier. But we must be off, after our usual Sunday rest, to Bâle the gateway into Switzerland from the North. No one remains, if he can help it, more than a night at Bâle, and the two hundred who dined with us at the "Three Kings" were replaced by the same number next evening. The table talk was of glaciers, passes and peaks, of guides, mules, and Alpenstocks, of daring feats of mountain climbing and of hair-breadth escapes from *diligences* and *crevasses*. If there is wisdom in the multitude of counsellors, there is also some degree of mental confusion and consequent indecision, for each *canton* had its own stout advocates, and with the prisons of Geneva for a base of operations, we had no definite campaign. Fortunately, taking the advice of a veteran traveller, we posted through the Münsterthal to Bienne, whence by rail to Neuchâtel. The river

Birs flows through this valley which is considered the grandest in the Jura range. The road winds through a succession of defiles and narrow gorges, with perpendicular cliffs rising from the stream through which it has been in places rock-hewn. The cliffs are clothed with huge pines on the crest and in every crevice where their roots could get even a bushelful of earth. On each side of the *Birs*, the rocks appear in exaggerated lines of fortification, as if they were reared by rival dynasties of Titans to serve as impregnable defences. There were scarps and bastions with embrasures of dimensions meet only for the "artillery of the heavens" the roll of which in these narrow and deep gorges is said to be awful in the extreme. The peaceful and picturesque loving traveller will regret to hear that a railway is now being constructed through this valley defacing with *debris* a road as old as the Roman occupation of Helvetia. The engineers have by this time fallen to with axes and with hammers and have rough-hewn the Münsterthal beyond all recognition of its having once combined in its entire length the grand, the picturesque and the soft graces of the lovely, more emphatically than any valley in Switzerland. In the words of a modern poet slightly altered :—

" Along these mountains we can never more  
See silver mists unmixed with railway steam,  
Nor hear without the trains intruding roar,  
Pure voice of wind and stream."

The prison de l'Eveche in Geneva is not far from the cathedral. It was once a Cardinal's palace and has a massive though very unornamental appearance. It would be difficult to say, judging from its exterior, what the building was : a large glass case, filled with boots and shoes close to an ordinary looking door-way, might suggest that an ambitious shoe-maker was the tenant. The prison contained only 64 inmates, all sentenced to penal servitude, for periods ranging up to twenty years. They work in association, making shoes, thick felt gaiters, and mats, and are supervised by a warden, who sits before an elevated desk in a corner of the work-room. They are supposed to work in silence, and the warden is armed with a cane for the purpose of enforcing it, but we need not hint that absolute silence is as unpleasant to the master as to the pupils. At night they sleep in separate cells. Their work is not contracted for, the superintendent disposing of it as is the case in this country. There was nothing worthy of notice in this prison except, perhaps, the marked repulsiveness of the convict physiognomy. The privations of life undergone in the rarified air and sudden climatic changes of their mountain homes, may induce a hardness of features that has no such predisposing cause in the case of those "who dwell

in the plains." The same characteristic has been observed among the Calabrian convicts in the quarries of Pozzuoli.

St. Antoine is the other prison, and is intended for untried and comparatively short term prisoners. Those who have been brought up to a trade may carry it on, but the greater number remain too short a time to learn any. The system is exclusively cellular. There is a refinement in the mode of communication with the guards in this prison, which I had never previously seen. The convicts had electric bells at their command with a metal stud which flew out revealing the number of the cell. The governor had a number of these in his office, connecting it with the different floors. There were only 90 prisoners confined in St. Antoine.

This was the last visited of the Continental jails. Two of the English prisons, although "not in the bond," will next be described.

Having earned some measure of self-approbation by visiting prisons when he might have been more pleasantly employed, the writer devoted the rest of his time to travelling here and there the "country thorough," from Chamouny to Schaffhausen.

The shortness of the leave and more pressing attractions prevented my seeing more than the prisons at Millbank and Chatham. The former is too well-known, externally, to require description; internally it baffles description. There are so many corridors, turnings, wings and staircases, that warders of several years' service are known to have been in difficulties about finding an exit, and obliged to "chalk" their way, like the guides when exploring catacombs. It is on the cellular system in the main, though at stated hours the military convicts are massed for shot-drill. There seems no lack of unproductive labour. Shot-drill and "cranks" in profusion. The crank has an endless screw to which an index is attached showing the number of revolutions. This index is frequently outside the cell wall, so that the unfortunate cranksman has not even the pleasure of knowing how his allotted task is being accomplished. As a rule the convicts only remain for nine months at Millbank, whence they are drafted to Chatham, Portland, Portsmouth, or Dartmoor. It may serve the purpose of "breaking in" the prisoners into absolute submission to an unaccustomed and disagreeable *regime*, but a visitor fails to see what other earthly reason can justify the useless expenditure of so much physical energy in turning cranks and lifting shot from one place to another. As a prison punishment for the maintenance of discipline it is necessary, but the same rule does not apply to a judicial punishment. The time passed in Millbank is too short to be effectively deterrent and too long to be almost wasted. It does not aim at reformation, though the grim self-sufficiency of the

place and people would suggest the inference that it was not "like unto others." It is with a sigh of relief that the visitor emerges from its gloomy portals to watch the merry play of the sunbeams on the paddles of the river steamers that rush to and fro past the embankment.

The Deputy Governor, Captain Griffiths, has lately published a most entertaining and instructive book on the history of English penal administration, the reading of which will induce a feeling of lively gratitude in the breast of an Indian superintendent that he has to supervise the "mild Hindoo." The following precious extract is taken almost at random, but it must be premised that flogging was not then administered at Millbank. "A prisoner having smashed his bedstead, demolishes also the iron grating to his window, and thrusts through it his handkerchief tied to a stick, shouting and hallooing the while loud enough to be heard in Surrey. The same day another notorious offender returning from confinement in the dark, is given a pail of water to wash his cell out, but instead, discharges the whole contents over his warden's head. Before he could be secured he had destroyed everything in his cell and had thrown the pieces out of the window. Next, a number of prisoners during the night take to rolling their cell blocks and rattling their tables about . . . . Early next morning, Stephen Harman breaks everything he can lay his hands on, the window-frames and all its panes of glass his cell table, stool, shelf, trencher, salt, box-spoon, drinking-cup and all his cell furniture. He had first barricaded his door and could not be secured till all the mischief was done." Others take up the riotous epidemic, and the prison seems to have been for days in a state of mutiny. In India, the convict, be he European or native, would find himself trussed to the triangles within half an hour after a title of such gross misconduct.

After Millbank the convict establishment of Chatham kindles a glow of honest enthusiasm. As has been mentioned, Major Farquharson the Governor, belonged to the Bombay Cavalry, and the effects of his professional training are manifested in the minutest details of the administration. There are two deputy governors, and the total civil guard numbers about 230. Some of them, armed with cutlasses, accompany the convicts to the work, others, with loaded rifles, form a cordon round them. The population amounted to 1,645, but there is accommodation for 1,800. It is, therefore, the largest in Britain. In passing it may not be uninteresting to mention that Lahore and Allahabad are, in all probability, the largest convict establishments in the civilized world.

The cells at Chatham are small, only seven feet by four and a half, but as the ground floor partitions only rise to a small height, there is no deficiency in the ventilation. They have white-washed

walls and a flooring of slate or asphalte, and are lighted from a small window of frosted glass. The cell door has a "Judas," and the warder on duty a muffled tread, so the prisoner never feels himself relieved from observation, the most effectual preventive against escapes, and not a multiplicity of bolts and bars.

As the prisoners are engaged in hard out-door employment, their food is proportionately liberal. On the kitchen table was arranged a sample of the daily fare ; for breakfast, three-quarters of a pint of cocoa with a roll of bread weighing 11 oz ; for dinner a basin of thick soup, cabbages, potatoes, and a slice of bread and cheese. A pint of gruel for supper will not, however, readily induce dyspeptic night-mare. The prisoners are engaged in large public works with the view of extending the dockyards. They have excavated basins and built huge sea walls and dock walls, besides the preparatory operations of draining and levelling. Bricks are turned out by the million, and there are extensive carpenteries and iron-works. Shoe-makers and tailors are reserved for their own professional work, but the great majority are engaged as navvies. The better behaved convicts, in a distinctive uniform, drive carts and small locomotive engines about the docks, without being always under the vigilant eye of the warder. But no man can pass the cordon of sentries un-attended by a responsible keeper. These sentries are elevated on platforms and have an extensive range within an uninterrupted view. No prisoner can make a " bolt " of it where a Saider could have running shots at him for several hundred yards. One man escaped for a time by swimming across the river. There is a pre-arranged code of signals to give immediate notice of an escape, "a shrill note on the whistle, a single shot from the sentry's platform sounds the alarm, "a man gone." Next second the whistle re-echoes—shot answers shot, the parties are assembled in the twinkling of an eye, and a force of spare officers hasten at once to the point from whence came the first note of distress. It is next to impossible for the fugitive to get away, if he runs for it he is chased (or shot at) if he goes to ground they dig him out, if he takes to the water he is soon overhauled. The cases are few and far between of successful evasion. In every case the luck or the stratagem has been exceptional, as "when a man was buried by his comrades brick by brick beneath a heap and the interment was completed before the man was missed." In going to, and returning from work, the administrative arrangements are perfect. The governor has brought his corps of 1,600 ruffians to move with as much stillness, steadiness and precision, as if he had the handling of a brigade in his old presidency. The slovenliness of appearance and movement, the shouting, pushing, and general confusion that drives an Indian superintendent into despair, had scant measure in Chatham. Each warder as he returned called

out his number and the number of the convicts under his charge to the "officer on duty" who checked them off his roll as they marched past him. At a stated hour there is "orderly room" as in a regiment, where a similarly calm and judicial decision is given on the cases presented. Only the worst characters are fettered, while those who have assaulted their warders, or have threatened to do so, are clothed in parti-coloured garments, which renders them at once conspicuous for singularity and a fierce temper.

Chatham presents a marvellous example of organized discipline. The very scum of a strong and energetic race is kept in absolute submission, not by physical force, which is not ten per cent. of the convict average, but by mutual distrust, and a steady unbending and judicious authority which has all the force of law and social order to back it. Even in India it is wonderful what persistent and impartial discipline, when combined with want of opportunity for conspiracy, can effect among its heterogeneous castes and creeds. In many jails one can see more than seven hundred prisoners working beyond the jail walls, guarded by only some six or seven per cent. of warders (the greater part of whom are convicts) and unprotected by a single armed sentinel. The *regime*, moreover, is far from being slipshod. The prisoner must perform his allotted task of by no means a low standard, nor can he, much as he loves it, secrete a piece of tobacco the size of an almond without speedy detection and consequent punishment. When the prisons in course of erection are finished, and a certain percentage of cells provided, of a size and construction suitable for strictly solitary confinement, and with fewer and better paid guards, we shall have little to learn applicable to this country, from the more pretentious prisons of the West.

JOHN MACGREGOR, M. A.

---

## ART. XI.—LORD MAYO, FOURTH VICEROY OF INDIA.

*A Life of the Earl of Mayo, Fourth Viceroy of India.* By W. W. Hunter, B.A., LL.D., of Her Majesty's Bengal Civil Service, London : Smith, Elder and Co., 1875.

IT seems but yesterday that the largest company of Europeans that ever gathered together at an Indian funeral, followed with slow steps, the gun-carriage which bore the body of Lord Mayo from Chândpâl Ghât to Government House, Calcutta. But though the memory of that day remains and must ever remain fresh in the mind of every one who formed part of the sad procession, the sands of time have not ceased to run, and four February's have passed since the *Daphne* carried the remains of the assassinated Viceroy to the land of his birth—their last resting-place. These years have been well occupied by Dr. Hunter in collecting, arranging and condensing the materials for the biography which is now before us. The work has been looked for with an interest very rarely excited by the announcement of a forthcoming Indian book. And this for three reasons. In the first place, no Indian Viceroy ever made for himself so many personal friends ; and by each of these the appearance of this biography has been eagerly expected. Then the somewhat unreasonable outcry made by the press, both of England and India, against Lord Mayo's appointment to the Viceroyalty ; the rapid revulsion of feeling in his favour as he gradually became better known ; and the cruelty of the fate by which his career was so suddenly ended ; —all combined to make the public, both at Home and in India, look with more than ordinary interest for a review of the life and work of a man who had so ably filled one of the most honourable and important, as well as one of the most difficult and responsible posts to which an English Statesman can aspire. And, finally, literary men, both in England and in this country, looked forward with considerable interest and curiosity to the appearance of a biographical work by an author who had earned his brilliant reputation in an entirely different department of the field of letters.

We may at once say that the book is in every way a success, and that it forms a permanent and very valuable addition to the standard literature of India. Lord Mayo's numerous personal friends will find in the work much that will deeply interest them, and some things which will surprise those of them who did not know him thoroughly. By the larger body of his admirers, who did not personally know him, the book will be read with gratification, as showing on what good grounds their admiration of his character rests. And we venture to say that no political opponent

of Lord Mayo, no one in India or England, who disagreed or disagrees with any part of his policy as Viceroy, will close this biography without feeling that India was governed from 1869 to 1872 by one of the most conscientious, high-minded, able and genial men, who ever occupied the Viceregal seat. To the general reader, Dr. Hunter's book will be full of interest. It may without flattery be said of the author, *nihil quod tangit non ornat*; and we only hope that his success in this new direction will not seduce him from the field in which he earned his early laurels. The readers of the charming *Annals of Rural Bengal* and *Orissa*, will recognize in many places throughout the two luxurious volumes now before us, the delicate touches which they have learned to look for and like, and will join with us in the hope we have just expressed.

Dr. Hunter's first chapter is devoted to an account of the early years of his hero. No life of a descendant of one of the oldest and most prominent Irish families, would have been complete without some account of the ancestors from whom he sprang, and Lord Mayo's biographer accordingly carries us back, with the help of the heralds, to the time of Charlemagne and William the Conqueror, with whom the noble family of the de Burghs was closely connected by marriage: 'The de Burgh of 1066 fought by the side of his half-brother William, at Hastings, and received, as his share of the spoil, the Earldom of Cornwall with 793 manors.' From him Dr. Hunter briefly traces the descent to the present Earls of Mayo; and the retrospect proves distinctly enough that the family was a highly respectable one, and had a very decent number of ancestors, who were hanged or otherwise violently put to death. There was also a certain Mistress Graine-ni-Mhaile (pronounced, of course, by the English, 'Granny O'Malley') in the family—mother, indeed of the first Viscount,—who must, according to all accounts, have been a lady of singularly advanced views, having 'a portable husband, three galleys, and two hundred buccaneers' and being consequently in those days, as Dr. Hunter justly remarks, 'a person to be cultivated.' The genealogical sketch is judiciously brief, and Dr. Hunter's readers will readily acquit him of 'an idle love of genealogy,' for which interesting but perhaps somewhat frivolous study, we must ourselves confess to a certain fondness.

Richard Southwell Bourke, Sixth Earl of Mayo, was born at Dublin on the 21st February 1822. His early years were spent at Hayes, the house of his father, about 22 miles from the Irish capital. The pages in which his biographer describes the family-circle and the doings at Hayes, are, to our thinking, among the best in the book. The boy is the father of the man. No truer word was ever written, and we have therefore read with the greatest interest this charmingly written account of Lord Mayo's early life. He was as wild and mischievous as other boys, and had no preten-

sions to being a genius. ‘ He rejoiced in a long succession of dogs and ponies ;’ and specially affected the carpenter’s shop and a certain cow-shed, where each member of the family had an animal of some kind which was his very own. Richard passed through all the usual phases of a boy’s life, and took his place with proper pride as eldest son. He fitted up ‘ a small Blue-beard closet’ as a museum, and worked therein with a lathe. He played cricket, swain, shot, rode, and generally lived a thoroughly healthy outdoor life under the auspices of his father, of whom a most pleasant picture is given, and who was his children’s companion and friend as long as he lived. Richard was blessed with a mother, whose ‘ figure stands out from among the robust open-air group at Hayes, as something of a paler and more spiritual type than the warm colouring of the life around her.’ She was filled with an overwhelming love for her children and exercised a highly beneficial influence over them all. “ Long after we were out in the world,” writes one of her sons, “ we used to resort to her when in doubt or difficulty. Not so much for advice, which she was chary of giving ; but for an interchange of opinion upon a step to be taken or avoided, which might make our course more clear, or our resolution more strong.” Richard, we have said, was no genius, but what he did read he understood ; he was fond of history and natural science, and, when thirteen years old, gave a lecture on astronomy to the servants and farm people whom he had collected in the Hall. At a still earlier age he wrote a series of sermons and ‘ a preface to the Holy Bible,’ in which ‘ he gives an historical introduction to each of the books of the Old Testament as far as the Psalms, with notices of their authors and contents.’ His parents were both exceedingly pious people, and at this time and ‘ for several years, the future world filled his imagination.’ “ On one occasion,” writes his tutor, “ he had for some days been busily employed all by himself in making a little secluded arbour in a clump of trees, a very retired spot, concealed from view and not easily found. When I asked him what it was for he answered ‘ It will be a quiet place for me to pray in, and I mean it for that.’” Of course he wrote verses, principally addressed to his sister, regarding which his biographer says : ‘ They are good of their kind, with nothing about the Muses in them, but a great deal of natural affection, and some gracefully turned thoughts.’ At fifteen, he left home for the first time, to visit a relative. Then he had a two months’ cruise in a yacht. In 1838, when he was 16, his mother fearing, ‘ lest the home-breeding of her sons should place them at a disadvantage on their entry into life,’ brought about a migration of the whole family to the continent of Europe. In Paris he learnt French and dancing. In Switzerland he climbed mountains, and went long walking excursions. At Florence he took singing

lessons, and at Rome, Naples, Venice and Verona, he spent days in the galleries—‘the mother, now as ever, leading him on in all noble culture.’ At this time, too, he entered into the world, went to balls, and, of course, fell in love. ‘This he did with characteristic vigour, ending in a heart-broken parting, which was, however, happily mitigated by a more than usually copious flow of verse, among which certain lines on Juliet’s tomb almost deserve to live.’ After spending two years in this way abroad he returned to England in 1840, and in that year obtained a Captain’s commission in the Kildare Militia. The following year he entered Trinity College, Dublin, and after the usual course took ‘an uneventful degree.’ In 1843 he came of age.

About this time Mr. Richard Bourke spent a considerable portion of his time in London and saw a good deal of society there. He is thus described : ‘A very young man with a fine bearing ; one of the best waltzers in town, and a great deal made of.’ The summer of 1845, he spent in Russia, and on his return he published an account of his visit in two volumes\* ; ‘a very fair specimen,’ says his biographer ‘of a young man’s travels, modestly written, full of eye-sight, and not overlaid with general reflections.’ We must quote one passage only from this work. The author describes the horrible punishment of the execution by the knout of the serf who shot Prince Gargarin, and adds :—“This man was a criminal, guilty of a heinous crime ; but it is on all sides agreed that the punishment of death is, and ought to be considered as an example to the survivors, and not as a means of vengeance on the criminal. Such a scene, as I have related, is a disgrace to a country calling itself Christian, and contrary to all right principles of Government.” ‘These words,’ says his biographer, ‘have become memorable from the appalling fate, then lurking among the tragedies of coming time, to which their writer was destined. It is something that we can also remember how, amid that paroxysm of amazement and wrath, the views here expressed by a generous youth became the policy of a great empire, of an empire three times more populous than all Russia in Europe and in Asia put together. This is not the place to speak of the impulsive tread with which retribution then measured each step to punishment ; how, amid the cries for vengeance by many races and in many tongues, the pulse of justice beat not one throb more or less, and law neither raised nor lowered her voice by a semi-tone. But the words of a brave and merciful man do not wholly die. The same trial, the same delays of the courts, the same safe-guards of evidence and the

\* *St. Petersburg and Moscow : By Richard Southwell Bourke, Esq., A visit to the Court of the Czar.* 2 vols. Henry Colburn, 1846.

same penalty for his crime, were awarded to the assassin of Lord Mayo, as if the murdered man had been the humblest among the 250 millions of subjects and feudatories over whom the Viceroy ruled.'

It was after his return to Ireland, that the serious work of Mr. Richard Bourke's life began. The outbreak of the potatoe disease in Ireland in 1836, brought heavy work upon the Irish gentry, many of whom devoted themselves with great earnestness to the relief of the sufferers. At the same time, Mr. Bourke's father gave him a small farm which occupied a great deal of his time, and altogether he had his hands full of work of one kind or another. In 1847, he was appointed by Lord Heytesbury, then Lord-Lieutenant of Ireland, to "the little post of 'Gentleman at large' on his staff, an office which brought him pleasantly into contact with the society at the Castle, but entailed no duties except attendance at ceremonials and levées" The same year, being then twenty-six years old, he was returned a Member of Parliament for his own county Kildare; and in 1848 he married Miss Blanche Wyndham, whose father afterwards became Lord Leconfield. Six months after his marriage, his grand-uncle, the Earl of Mayo, died. Mr. Bourke of Hayes became fifth Earl, his eldest son taking the courtesy-title of Lord Naas, and it was under this title that he was known in Parliament. We can only very briefly notice his Parliamentary career; Anglo-Indians do not, as a rule, take a very earnest interest in English politics, and our readers will not probably care for details of the part taken by Lord Naas in political discussions a quarter of a century ago. As a matter of fact he did not take any part in discussions on general questions, but confined himself to subjects with which he was acquainted, and on which he was therefore able to speak with some confidence. In the first two years he did not speak at all, and his maiden effort was not made until February 1849, when the subject before the House, was the suspension of the Habeas Corpus Act (Ireland). Of course he was congratulated by his friends, including Mr. Disraeli, and equally of course he discovered that his speech had been very badly reported. Although he had no brilliant oratorical qualities he attracted the notice of the chiefs of his party, and generally spoke when Irish subjects were under discussion. In 1850 when the ministry changed, Lord Derby, much to his surprise, offered him the Chief Secretaryship for Ireland, a position in which he gained so completely the confidence of the Irish Conservative party, that he was offered the post a second time on Lord Derby's accession to power in 1858, and again in 1866. On accepting office, he desired re-election for Kildare, but found it advisable to retire from a struggle in which he had no chance of success, and was returned for Coleraine instead. He represented

that borough until 1857, when he was elected for Cockermouth, which place he represented until his departure for India in 1868. Throughout his parliamentary career he confined himself exclusively to Irish subjects and was virtually the leader of the Irish Conservatives in the House of Commons. A list of the measures which he brought forward would not interest our readers ; he especially insisted over and over again on the necessity of giving improving tenants in Ireland some compensation for their outlay, and brought in a tenants' compensation Act during his first term of office. He believed, says one of his colleagues, that any permanent improvement of the land ought to be for the benefit alike of the owner and of the tiller of the soil. His idea was : "If you really improve my land, you shall not lose by so doing, and any rule that says otherwise shall be done away with." He used to argue that if you prevent such reforms you injure yourself as landlord and you act unjustly to your fellow-men. Liberty of thought, of faith and of action he loved more than life itself. The exercise of spiritual or temporal power for purposes of intimidation or wrongful coercion was to him hateful. He had an unresting sympathy for all in want or in misery. For the lunatic poor, for prisoners and for the fallen, his heart was always urging him to work ; and for them he *did* work, and did good work. His Chief, the Earl of Derby, and several of his colleagues have written in the highest terms of his manner of doing business, his firmness, his sound judgment and his wonderful capacity both for doing real work himself and for getting the greatest possible amount out of those with whom he came in contact. We cannot with the small amount of space at our disposal quote the expressions of high praise from all who knew him, but we must give one extract from a letter written by one of his colleagues to show that in a very important respect he was particularly qualified for the high position to which he was so soon to be chosen. The writer says :—

He never lost his presence of mind. I well remember one morning in March 1867, I received a message at an early hour from Lord Naas, saying he would like to see me. When I entered his room at the Irish Office, he was sitting at a table writing a letter, looking uncommonly well and fresh, and quite composed and quiet. He handed me a telegram and went on with his writing. I read that during the night there had been a rising of Fenians near Dublin. I confess I was considerably agitated, and did not conceal it. I shall never forget the demeanour of Lord Naas. He had lost not a moment in sending a copy of the telegram to Her Majesty, and preparing the case for the Cabinet. What puzzled him more than anything was the sudden stoppage of any further news. We telegraphed again and again, but it was not till late in the afternoon that any clear answers were received. He issued all the orders with the same quiet and precision as if dealing with ordinary work. He had at once determined to go that night to Ireland and to remain there till order was restored. He had perfect confidence in his arrangements, and he declared that the insurrection could never assume

any serious importance. But he was uneasy for the safety of persons living in isolated parts, and about the small bands of villains, who would use a political disturbance as a shelter for local crimes. He said: "I dread more than anything else that a panic will be fed by newspaper reports, and that an outcry may get up that Ireland ought to be declared in a state of siege and military law proclaimed. To this I will never yield although I know my refusal will be misrepresented, and may for the moment intensify the alarm." It is unnecessary in a personal narrative to repeat what followed in the Fenian camp. The insurrection, if it may be dignified by that name, was immediately stamped out. Lord Naas put it down in his own way, yielding neither to threats nor entreaties, acting wisely and firmly, and allowing himself to be influenced neither by newspaper panics nor by patriots in the House of Commons, nor by rebels outside it. When he returned to London he went on with his Government Bills precisely as if nothing had happened, and no fewer than eighteen of his measures prepared in that year received the Royal assent.

And in a public speech to the Buckinghamshire electors, Mr. Disraeli, alluding to the same matter, said:—"With regard to Ireland, I say that a state of affairs so dangerous was never encountered with more firmness, but at the same time with greater magnanimity; that never were foreign efforts so completely controlled, and baffled and defeated, as was this Fenian conspiracy by the Government of Ireland, by the Lord Lieutenant and by the Earl of Mayo. Upon that nobleman, for his sagacity, for his judgment, fine temper and knowledge of men, Her Majesty has been pleased to confer the office of Viceroy of India; and as Viceroy of India, I believe he will earn a reputation that his country will honour, and that he has before him a career which will equal that of the most eminent Governor-General who has preceded him." These qualities are precisely those which would be required by a Viceroy in such emergencies as have unhappily arisen in India, and it is easy, after reading Dr. Hunter's book, to understand Lord Mayo's nomination to the high office in which he died. When the subject of that appointment was first broached to him, he hesitated a great deal, but at last consented to accept the Viceroyalty of India in preference to that of Canada, which he was offered at the same time.

Our readers need not be reminded of the torrent of abuse which was poured on the Government in connection with this appointment. It is interesting to read how this hostile criticism affected himself. 'I am sorely hurt,' he wrote to Sir Stafford Northcote, 'at the way in which the Press are abusing my appointment. I care little for myself, but I am not without apprehension that these attacks may damage the Government and injure my influence if ever I arrive in India. I am made uneasy, but not daunted.' Again: 'I did not accept this great office without long and anxious consideration. I leave with a good confidence, and hope that I may realize the expectations of my friends. I was prepared for hostile criticism, but I thought that my long public service

might have saved me from the personal abuse which has been showered upon me. I bear no resentment and only pray that I may be enabled ere long to show my abusers that they were wrong.'

Again he writes to a friend :—" I know India is 'a big thing,' but I am not afraid of it, and feel confident that, if I get there in health and strength, I can with God's help show these bitter scribblers that they are wrong. Indian experience is very valuable. But I believe that twenty years of the House of Commons, five years' labour in the most difficult of offices, with two in the Cabinet, form as good a training as a man could have for the work " And in addressing his constituents at Cockermouth he said :—" Splendid as is the post, and difficult as will be my duties, I go forth in full confidence and hope that God will give me such strength and wisdom as will enable me to direct the Government of India in the interests and for the well-being of the millions committed to our care. In the performance of the great task I ask for no favour. Let me be judged according to my acts. And I know that efforts honestly made for the maintenance of our national honour, for the spread of civilization, and the preservation of peace, will always command the sympathy and support of my countrymen."

It was in October 1868, that Lord Mayo was appointed to the Viceroyalty of India ; on the 20th December he landed at Bombay ; and on the 12th January 1869, he entered Government House, Calcutta, for the first time. To this period—October to January—Dr. Hunter devotes one of the most interesting chapters in his book. The moment Lord Mayo accepted the Viceroyalty he commenced with characteristic energy to prepare for the important work before him. His biographer in this chapter uses freely the very interesting diary kept by the Viceroy-elect. The extracts show how conscientiously he used the time at his disposal. One day immediately after his acceptance of the appointment, he has 'a long talk on Indian matters' with some one who calls ; he then goes to the India Office and discusses railways, army organization, the state of the North-West Frontier, and irrigation works. Next day there is a 'long talk on railway matters,' a discussion on gaols and the partial decentralization of Indian finance—a visit to the Home Office—then to the India Office, where there is another long talk on frontier matters. Another day he has 'a long and interesting conversation' on the subject of Indian Finances with Mr. Massey ; and the ex-Finance Minister seems to have touched on most of the difficult points connected with the financial administration of India. Mr. Massey is followed by the Chairman of the Sind Railway, with whom another 'very long talk,' the salient points of which are all noted. " After he went away," the diary proceeds : " Sir Arthur Cotton came, with

whom I had a most interesting conversation for two hours and a half on irrigation matters ;' then follow the heads of the conversation, which alone occupy more than two pages of Dr. Hunter's book. After this a "Mr. M." came 'with whom,' writes Lord Mayo, 'I had a long talk, principally upon social matters in Calcutta. He forms, apparently, a very low estimate of the Bengali character, and gave me some very interesting details of the Mutiny. He is strongly in favour of the influence of hospitality.' All this in one day. And the other days are the same. The amount of work of this kind recorded in the diary between 20th October and 10th November is extraordinary. And his sense of the heavy responsibilities of his position did not cease when, on the 11th of November 1868, he looked for the last time on the Dover Cliffs.' At each stage of his outward journey, there is some one to be seen, or something to be done, having a bearing on his future work. The lengthy extracts from the diary regarding the Suez Canal, through which he was taken by M. Lesseps, are specially interesting both in themselves and as showing how retentive Lord Mayo's memory must have been, and with what readiness he acquired information on technical subjects, with which he can have had little acquaintance. At Aden there is much about the defective principles on which the fort is constructed, the deficient water-supply, &c., and the conclusions at which he arrived regarding this important place are summarized. At Bombay, the drainage, gaol system, harbour works, port defences, municipal taxation, sanitation, customs, cotton-presses, barracks, water-works, and many other matters are noted. At Puna there is something about the powder manufactory, the Deccan College, the Sassoon Hospital, the Jiranda gaol, the Native Infantry lines, the barracks, the bakery, &c. During his three clear days at Madras he visited the Model Farm, the Horticultural Gardens, the Monegar Chaultri, the Lock Hospital, the Gaol, the General Hospital, the Fort, the Barracks, the Red Hills Tank, the Cathedral, and in fact every place worth visiting. He stayed up late at balls and dinner parties, and was out early at the races or hunting. He discussed Public Works, irrigation, decentralization of finance, the police system, the officering of the native army, the 'proceedings and movements of the Carnatic family,' and so forth. He himself admits that 'during our short turn I managed to see a great deal.' So much, indeed, that the first entry in the diary after leaving Madras runs : 'Madras to Calcutta, 8th January. Paid the penalty of my imprudence and over-exertion at Madras, being attacked sharply by fever this morning.'

Lord Mayo landed at Chandpal Ghât, Calcutta, on the afternoon of the 12th January 1869. He was received with the usual honours, and went at once to Government House. 'I walked,' he writes,

'straight with Sir William Mansfield (Commander-in-Chief) and the members of Council into the Council Room, where I was immediately sworn in and took my seat at the Board. This is his own description of the event, but we must quote his biographer's account. It is one of the finest passages in the work :—

The reception of a new Viceroy on the spacious flight of steps at Government House, and the handing over charge of the Indian Empire which immediately follows, form an imposing spectacle. On this occasion it had a pathos of its own. At the top of the stairs stood the wearied, veteran Viceroy, wearing his splendid harness for the last day ; his face blanched, and his tall figure shrunken by forty years of Indian service ; but his head erect, and his eye still bright with the fire which had burst forth so gloriously in India's supreme hour of need. Around him stood the tried counsellors with whom he had gone through life—a silent, calm semi-circle—in suits of blue and gold, lit up by a few scarlet uniforms. At the bottom, the new Governor-General jumped lightly out of the carriage, amid the saluting of troops and glitter of arms ; his large athletic form in the easiest of summer costumes, with a funny little coloured neck-tie, and a face red with health and sunshine. As he came up the tall flight of stairs with a springy step, Lord Lawrence, with a visible feebleness, made the customary three paces forward to the edge of the landing-place to receive him. I was among the group of officers who followed them into the Council Chamber ; and, as we went, a friend compared the scene to an even more memorable one on these same stairs. The toilworn statesman, who had done more than any other single Englishman to save India in 1857, was now handing it over to an untried successor ; and thirteen years before, Lord Dalhousie, the stern ruler, who did more than any other Englishman to build up that Empire, had come to the same act of demission on the same spot, with a face still more deeply ploughed by disease and care, a mind and body more weary, and bearing within him the death which he was about to pay as the price of great services to his country. In the Chamber, Sir John Lawrence and his council took their seats at the table, the Chief Secretaries stood around, a crowd of officers filled the room, and the silent faces of the Englishmen who had won and kept India in times past looked down from the walls. The clerk read out the oaths in a clear voice, and Lord Mayo assented. At the same moment the Viceroy's band burst forth with "God save the Queen," in the garden below, a great shout came in from the people outside, the Fort thundered out its Royal Salute, and the 196 millions of British India had passed under a new ruler.

Dr. Hunter considers separately the Foreign, Financial, Legislative, and Military Administrations of India during Lord Mayo's Viceroyalty, then devotes a chapter to his internal administration. We shall follow the biographer's order, and would merely premise that it is not our object in this review to criticise Lord Mayo's policy as Viceroy, but simply to state what that policy was.

The leading features of Lord Mayo's foreign policy, were an absolute objection to anything like annexation or extension of the frontier—the cultivation of friendly relations with the tribes along the entire frontier line of India—the preservation of the independence of their powers and the encouragement of friendly commercial relations with them, and absolute non-interference

with their internal affairs except when intervention was rendered necessary by gross mis-management. His dealings with the Feudatory powers were guided by the same principles. He desired to encourage them to manage their own affairs well, and let them to understand that if they did so they might depend on his support and friendship ; he discouraged all unnecessary interference or control in the case of rulers, who showed any desire or ability to govern well and peaceably. On the other hand, he let it be known, both by words and deeds, that he would not tolerate mis-government nor look quietly on oppression on the part of any of the Feudatories. He distinctly intimated that firm steps would be taken to prevent such mis-management or oppression—that, if a prince proved himself unworthy of his position, the Indian Government would at once step in and take the government out of his hands, not by annexing his territory, but by displacing him and appointing a competent successor, or, if necessary, an English agent. The remedy for mis-government was, he thought, not to be found in ' vexatious interference in minor matters, or by constant threats of deposition or sequestration of revenue,' but rather ' in a policy which would exalt the dignity, strength and the authority, and increase the personal responsibility of these families ; and, at the same time by showing them that that which they really value above everything, *viz.*, the support of the British Government in securing the permanency of their rule, is only to be gained by the exercise of justice, by the certain punishment of crime, and the encouragement of those who support our recommendations.' 'Should a well-disposed chief,' he writes on another occasion, ' while using his utmost endeavours to establish good government within his State, be opposed by insubordinate petty barons, mutinous troops, or seditious classes of his subjects, it is then our duty to support his authority and power.' But he never concealed the other side of the question, and firmly set his face against mis-rule of every kind. 'I believe,' he writes, ' that if in any Feudatory State in India, oppression, tyranny, corruption, wastefulness, and vice are found to be the leading characteristics of its administration, it is the imperative duty of the Paramount Power to interfere, and that we evade the responsibility which our position in India imposes upon us, and avoid the discharge of a manifest duty, if we allow the people of any race or class to be plundered and oppressed. . . . Further, I believe that under no circumstances can we permit in any State in India the existence of civil war, and that on such an occasion as this—he is writing of the gross mis-management of the Alwar Chief—it is plainly our duty to interfere, at first by every peaceful means which we have at our disposal ; but that, in the event of arbitration and mediation failing, it will be our duty to stop by force of arms anything approaching to

open hostilities between large classes of the people and their chiefs.'

These principles he carried out with consistency and firmness throughout the period of his Viceroyalty, and it is undeniable that the effect produced by this policy was most wholesome and excellent. His plan was to begin with kindness, but, if that failed, to quietly but firmly apply pressure. The speech which he addressed to the Princes and Chiefs of Rájputáná assembled in Durbár at Ajmír, expresses so clearly his views, and is so perfect a specimen of a good speech, that we give it here. It is for many reasons worthy of a permanent place in Indian literature:—

I, as the representative of the Queen, have come here to tell you, as you have often been told before, that the desire of Her Majesty's Government is to secure to you and to your successors the full enjoyment of your ancient rights and the exercise of all lawful customs, and to assist you in upholding the dignity and maintaining the authority which you and your fathers have for centuries exercised in this land.

But in order to enable us fully to carry into effect this our fixed resolve, we must receive from you hearty and cordial assistance. If we respect your rights and privileges, you should also respect the rights and regard the privileges, of those who are placed beneath your care. If we support you in your power, we expect in return good government. We demand that everywhere, throughout the length and breadth of Rájputáná, justice and order shall prevail; that every man's property shall be secure; that the traveller shall come and go in safety; that the cultivator shall enjoy the fruits of his labour, and the trader the produce of his commerce; that you shall make roads, and undertake the construction of those works of irrigation which will improve the condition of the people and swell the revenues of your States; that you shall encourage education, and provide for the relief of the sick.

Be assured that we ask you to do all this, for no other but your own benefit. If we wished you to remain weak, we should say, be poor, and ignorant, and disorderly. It is because we wish you to be strong that we desire to see you rich, instructed, and well-governed; it is for such objects that the servants of the Queen rule in India; and Providence will ever sustain the rulers who govern for the people's good.

I am here only for a time. The able and earnest officers, who surround me, will, at no distant period, return to their English homes; but the power which we represent will endure for ages. Hourly is this great Empire brought nearer and nearer to the throne of our Queen. The steam-vessel and the railroad enable England, year by year, to enfold India in a closer embrace. But the coils she seeks to entwine around her are no iron fetters, but the golden chains of affection and of peace. The days of conquest are past; the age of improvement has begun.

Chiefs and Princes, advance in the right way, and secure to your children's children, and to future generations of your subjects, the favouring protection of a Power who only seeks your good.

The subject of the preservation of our Indian frontier cost Lord Mayo much earnest thought. His system was, as it were, to insulate India by forming a belt of independent and friendly territories round the entire length of its frontier from the Persian Gulf

to Burmah. He thought our policy lay in encouraging by every means the independence of these trans-frontier Powers, in making of them staunch allies, who would have everything to lose and nothing to gain by giving up our friendship or by intriguing with any Central Asian power that might have designs on them. And he consistently and steadily carried out this policy. How he gradually established link after link of the chain, is well told in Dr. Hunter's book. We can only briefly follow him here. To begin with Kilát. When Lord Mayo came to India, Persia was virtually by constant encroachments, pushing her frontier eastward, until it seemed likely that ere long her territory would be conterminous with our own. In September 1869, the Indian Government wrote to the Secretary of State pointing out that, if this should happen, 'the safe and prudent policy which we deem essential to British interests would be rudely terminated.' They then urged, and continued to urge, the necessity of firm and decided steps being taken to prevent this. Not, however, until 1870 did Lord Mayo gain his point. In April of that year, the Shah consented to the marking out of a Persian frontier-line, by Commissioners appointed by England, Persia and Kilát. General Goldsmid was appointed to the duty of defining the eastern boundary of Persia, and his decision, which was not at first agreeable to either party, was eventually accepted by both. Thus the beginning of the great trans-frontier belt was made; and, at the time of his death, Lord Mayo was busily engaged—in accordance with his policy already described—in trying to secure for the Kilát State peaceful and good internal government.

With Afghánistán the same policy was followed. Just before Lord Mayo's arrival in India, Sher Ali had established his power firmly throughout that country, and had been recognized as the Amír by Lord Lawrence the Viceroy. It would be beyond our province, in this paper, to enter into the discussion which has been raised regarding the part which Lord Mayo took in carrying out his predecessor's policy. The views of the two parties are very fairly stated by Dr. Hunter, who also gives a very succinct and clear *résumé* of Afghán affairs from 1838. It is sufficient for our present purpose to state that, in all he did, it was Lord Mayo's object to establish a firm friendship between the actual ruler of Afghánistán and himself as Viceroy of India. The great Ambála Durbár did much to bring this about. Lord Mayo's winning manner, which never failed to charm the foreign Princes and Feudatories with whom he came in contact, the splendid reception given to him, the evidences of peace and prosperity which he saw on every side about him as soon as he passed into English territory, all deeply impressed the Amír, and he remained a firm and loyal friend to the Viceroy during Lord Mayo's life.

Thus the second link in the trans-frontier chain was established.

The third link was Turkestán. In the beginning of 1869, when Lord Mayo assumed the Viceroyalty, the Atálich Gházi had not established himself in Turkestán, and the State was in no way recognised by the Indian Government. But in the end of that year, the Atálich Gházi sent an envoy with letters to the Viceroy and the Queen. In March 1870, the envoy had an interview with Lord Mayo in Calcutta, and asked among other things, 'that a British officer might accompany him back on a friendly visit to his master, the ruler of Eastern Turkestán.' Having satisfied himself, as far as he could do so, that the Atálich Gházi was the actual ruler of Turkestán, Lord Mayo acceded to the request of the envoy, and deputed Sir Douglas (then Mr.) Forsyth to accompany him back to Yárkand. The visit was to be one of courtesy only. No question of politics was to be discussed; but Mr. Forsyth was at liberty to repeat the advice already given by Lord Mayo to the envoy, namely, that 'the Atálich Gházi would best consult the interests of his kingdom by a watchful, just, and vigorous government; by strengthening the defences of his frontier; and above all, by not interfering in the political affairs of other States, or in the quarrels of chiefs or tribes that did not directly concern his own interests.' Further, Mr. Forsyth was expected to collect as much information as he could regarding the state of trade in the country which he was to visit—its political condition, its relations to the neighbouring countries, and indeed everything that could be of interest to the Indian Government. He was not to stay in the country beyond the winter. The result of the expedition is fresh in the memory of our readers. As soon as Mr. Forsyth discovered, on his arrival in Turkestán, that the Atálich Gházi was engaged in fighting in a distant part of his territories, he resolved on an immediate return, and only stayed long enough at Yárkand to make the necessary arrangements. He had no choice but to do this, having received the most imperative instructions from Lord Mayo to do so, should he find the Atálich's assertion, that he was the established ruler of a peaceful State, in any degree incorrect. The visit, however, was not without fruits, Mr. Forsyth and his party had obtained much valuable information about the country they had visited, and one of the results has been the opening of a free trade route through the Chang Chenmu Valley; and Eastern Turkestán has become a valuable market for English goods. Our readers will also remember that, three years ago, at the request of another envoy from the Atálich Gházi, begging that an English official might be sent back with him with power to frame a commercial treaty, Sir Douglas Forsyth again visited Yárkand and signed a treaty

of the nature proposed. Thus, during Lord Mayo's Viceroyalty, the first steps were taken towards the establishment of this link in the trans-frontier chain of independent States.

With Nepál he had no difficulty ; and he confined himself to maintaining an attitude alike firm, friendly, and dignified, and consolidated the satisfactory relations he found existing with that State. On the North-Eastern frontier of Bengal and with Burmah he desired to carry out the same policy as that which we have already described ; but in the case of the Lushai frontier, he was obliged to adopt different means for establishing peace. In his Minute with regard to the Lushai Expedition, he gives fully his reasons for thinking the expedition necessary, and his views as to the manner in which it should be conducted.

We have devoted a considerable portion of our space to Lord Mayo's foreign policy, because it stands out most prominently as one of the strongest points in his administration, and because as he retained the Foreign and Public Works Portfolios in his own hands, it is from his management of these departments that we can best form an opinion of his powers as an Indian administrator. We have already said that it is not our province in this paper to criticise ; but, we may be permitted to say briefly, that the policy towards Feudatories and Frontier States so distinctly enunciated and followed by Lord Mayo is a thoroughly sound one, and that the firm and consistent way in which he carried it out, is alone sufficient to give him a very high position among Indian Viceroys.

We cannot lay aside Dr. Hunter's first volume which closes with Lord Mayo's foreign policy, without extracting from it a description of the mechanism of the Indian Government, which is exceedingly interesting, and, so far as we know, is not to be found in any other book.

The mechanism of the Supreme Government of India consists of a Cabinet, with the Governor-General as an absolute President, subject to the distant authority of the Secretary of State in England, and directly controlling the twelve Provincial Governments and the 153 Native States of India. Every order runs in the name of the President and the collective Cabinet, technically the 'Governor-General in Council.' And under the Company every case actually passed through the hands of each member of Council, circulating at a snail's pace, in little mahogany boxes, from one Councillor's house to another. 'The system involved,' writes a former Member of Council, 'an amount of elaborate minute-writing which seems now hardly conceivable. Twenty years ago the Governor-General and the Council used to perform work which would now be disposed of by an Under-Secretary. Lord Cauning found that, if he was to raise the administration to the higher standard of promptitude and efficiency which now obtains, he must put a stop to this. He remodelled the Government into the semblance of a Cabinet, with himself as President ! Each member of the Supreme Council practically became a Minister at the head of his own department, responsible for its ordinary business, but bound to lay important cases before the Viceroy whose will forms the final arbitra-

ment in all great questions of policy in which he sees fit to exercise it. 'The ordinary current business of the Government,' writes Sir John Strachey, 'is divided among the members of the Council much in the same manner, in which in England, it is divided among the Cabinet Ministers, each member having a separate department of his own.' The Governor-General himself keeps one department specially in his own hand, generally the Foreign Office; and Lord Mayo, being insatiable of work, retained two, the Foreign Department and the great Department of Public Works. Various changes took place in the Supreme Government even during his short Viceroyalty, but the following represents the *personnel* of his Government as fairly as any single view can:—

Departments.	Members of Council.	Chief-Secretary.
I. Foreign Department.	The Viceroy.	Mr. C. U. Aitchison, C.S.I.
II. Public Works Department.	The Viceroy.	Divided into branches.
III. Home Department.	Hon'ble Barrow Elli.	Mr. Clive Bayley, C. S. I.
IV. Department of Revenue, Agriculture and Commerce.	Hon'ble Sir John Strachey, K. C. S. I.	Mr. A. O. Hume, C. B.
V. Financial Department.	Hon'ble Sir R. Temple, K. C. S. I.	Mr. Barclay Chapman.
VI. Military Department.	Major-General the Hon'ble Sir H. Norman, K. C. S. I.	Colonel Burne.
VII. Legislative Department.	Hon'ble Fitz-James Stephen, Q. C.	Mr. Whitley Stokes.

Lord Mayo, besides his duties as President of the Council, and final source of authority in each of the seven departments, was, therefore, in his own person Foreign Minister and Minister of Public Works. The Home Minister (No. III), the Minister of Revenue, Agriculture, and Commerce (No. IV), and the Finance Minister (No. V), were members of the Indian Civil Service, along with the Secretaries and Under-Secretaries in those and in the Foreign Department; of the other two departments, the Military (No. VI) was presided over by a distinguished soldier, and the Legislative (No. VII) by an eminent member of the English Bar. Routine and ordinary matters were disposed of by the Member of Council within whose department they fell. Papers of greater importance were sent with the initiating member's opinion, to the Viceroy, who either concurred in or modified it. If the Viceroy concurred, the case generally ended, and the Secretary worked up the member's note into a letter or a resolution, to be issued as the orders of the Governor-General in Council. But in a matter of weight, the Viceroy, even when concurring with the initiating members, often directed the papers to be circulated either to the whole Council, or to certain of the members whose views he might think it expedient to obtain on the question. In cases in which he did not concur with the initiating member's views, the papers were generally circulated to all the other members, or the Governor-General ordered them to be brought up in Council. Urgent business was submitted to the Governor-General direct by the Secretary of

the department under which it fell ; and the Viceroy either initiated the order himself, or sent the case for initiation to the Member of Council at the head of the department to which it belonged.

This was the paper side of Lord Mayo's work. All orders issued in his name. Every case of any real importance passed through his hands, and either bore his order, or his initials under the initiating Member's note. Urgent matters in all the seven departments went direct to him in the first instance. He had also to decide what cases could be best disposed of by the Departmental Member and himself, and what ought to be circulated to the whole Council or to certain of the members. In short, he had to see, as his orders ran in the name of the Governor-General in Council, that they fairly represented the collective views of his Government. The 'circulation' of the papers took place, and still does, in oblong mahogany boxes, ir-tight, and fitted with a uniform Chubb's lock. Each Under-Secretary, Deputy-Secretary, Chief-Secretary, and Member of Council gets his allotted share of these little boxes every morning ; each has his own key ; and after 'noting' on the cases that come before him, sends on the box with his written opinion added to the file. The accumulated boxes from the seven departments pour into the Viceroy throughout the day. In addition to this vast diurnal tide of general work, Lord Mayo had two of the heaviest departments in his own hands, as Member in charge of the Foreign Office and of Public Works.

There is no part of his administration to which Lord Mayo's friends point with greater pride than his management of the finances of India, and the story told in Dr. Hunter's book is certainly full of the deepest interest. We once more find Lord Mayo sternly setting his shoulder to the wheel and doing with all his might, what he believes to be right, because he believes it to be right, with a noble contempt for unpopularity, and the outcry of people ignorant of the facts of the case. The two great measures round which the interest of his financial administration centres, are, of course, the raising of the Income Tax and the decentralization of Indian finance, or, as the Financial Secretary, in deference to Lord Mayo's objection to the term 'decentralization,' prefers to call it—the establishment of Provincial Finance. He was led to both of these measures by the same facts. The keynote to Lord Mayo's financial policy is to be found in a letter written to Sir Henry Durand in August 1869 : '*I am determined not to have another deficit*,' he writes, 'even if it leads to the diminution of the Army, the reduction of Civil Establishments, and the stoppage of Public Works.' In the three years preceding Lord Mayo's first budget, there had been an aggregate deficit of nearly six millions sterling, and the total excess of expenditure over revenue had been *more than eleven millions* sterling.\* Sir Richard Temple's first budget (March 1869) showed a deficit in the actuals of 1867-68 of £923,720 being 2½ millions less than the budget estimate for the year ; the regular estimate for 1868-69 showed a deficit of £889,598 instead of an estimated sur-

plus of £1,893,508—total difference, five and a quarter millions. The budget estimate was for a small surplus of £48,263. All this was bad enough, but it was not the worst. Lord Mayo soon found that, at the end of the financial year, the cash balances were lower than had been estimated by 1½ million sterling, and that, altogether, the real deficit for 1868-69 was £2,542,861 instead of £389,598 as estimated. This naturally alarmed him; the whole budget estimates were revised; and it became apparent that the current year must end with a deficit of £1,650,000 instead of the estimated surplus of £48,263 announced in March. Meanwhile Sir Richard Temple had gone home on six months' leave, and Sir John (then Mr.) Strachey was acting for him. Lord Mayo, assisted by Mr. Strachey, faced the difficulty with characteristic energy, and his enquiries showed 'that the financial collapse was due partly to a failure of the revenue estimates, especially of the opium duty, and partly to an undue expenditure on Public Works, the Army, and certain civil departments.' He rapidly decided what to do—first, *to prevent the anticipated deficit*; secondly, to re-adjust the finances, and so permanently prevent the recurrence of deficits. He at once cut down the grant for Public Works by £800,000, and reduced the expenditure for education, science, and art, by £350,000. Finding that he could do no more in the way of reduction, he reluctantly raised the Income Tax from 1 per cent. (at which he found it) to 2 per cent. and enhanced the salt-duty in Madras and Bombay, by these means hoping to increase the revenue by £500,000. This, in addition to the £1,150,000 saved in expenditure, would cover the estimated deficit of the current year, £1,650,000. The actual result was a surplus of £108,779, but this was only due to 'the unexpected adjustment in the accounts of the year of some important outstanding items,' but for which there would, after all, have been a (very small) deficit.

Having thus dealt with the current difficulty, he turned his attention to placing the finances on a permanently sound and satisfactory basis. His reforms in this direction are divided into three branches:—'First, improvements in the mechanism of the Financial Department of the Supreme Government itself. Second, the more rigid enforcement on the Local Governments of economy in framing their estimates, and of accuracy in keeping within them—while thus increasing their fiscal responsibility, Lord Mayo also extended their financial powers. Third, a systematic and permanent re-adjustment of the revenues and the expenditure.' Under the second of these heads, came a thorough consideration of the financial relations between the Supreme Government and the various local administrations. Before the issue of the well-known Resolution of 14th December 1870, grants were made for

specific purposes, and a Local Government could not expend any portion of a grant on any other object than that for which it was given ; any balance, unspent, being returned to the Imperial Treasury. The faults of such a system are patent ;—it causes unnecessary friction between the Supreme and the Local Governments, and is evidently not conducive to economy. By the Resolution of 14th December 1870, this was changed ; ‘a fixed yearly consolidated grant was made to each Government to enable it to defray the cost of its principal services, exclusive of the Army, but including Public Works. The grants thus made are final, being liable to reduction only in case of severe financial distress. They belong absolutely to the respective Local Governments. No savings from any one of them revert to the Imperial Treasury. Their distribution is left to the free discretion of the Local Governments, without any interference on the part of the Governor-General in Council. In fact, the only conditions imposed are those necessary to restrict the powers of the Local Governments within the limits assigned by Parliament and Her Majesty’s Secretary of State to the powers of the Supreme Government itself ; and to prevent a Local Government from embarrassing its neighbours by capricious or injudicious innovations.’

The system was, after four years experience of its working, reported an undoubted success. Mr. Barclay Chapman writes : ‘It is now generally acknowledged that its effects have been to promote a good understanding between the Supreme and the Local Governments ; to increase the interest of the latter Governments in their work ; to enlarge their power to do good, and to relieve the Imperial Exchequer from an old class of urgent demands.’ And Sir John Strachey writes : ‘In regard to the general success of the new system, so far as it has gone, there neither has been, nor is, any difference of opinion.’ The question of local taxation which, although not necessarily connected with that of provincial assignments, came to be considered at the same time, is discussed by Dr. Hunter, but into that question we cannot enter here. Dr. Hunter points out that ‘both of these great topics had engaged the attention of Indian Statesmen before Lord Mayo’s rule. What he did was to find a successful solution for one of them, and to place the second in a train for practical settlement.’

Dr. Hunter has, of course, much to say in connection with this part of Lord Mayo’s administration, on the subject of the Indian Income Tax. ‘Viewed by the light of after events, there seems little doubt that the Viceroy might have adopted a less stringent course,’ but his biographer shows how earnestly Lord Mayo considered the matter before consenting to raise the tax to  $3\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. for 1870-71, and how gladly he reduced it the following year to  $1\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. During the last few weeks of his life, the subject

was constantly in his thoughts, and the following words, written only a month before his death, seem to show that, had he lived, the tax would have been abolished :—

These papers throw more light upon the working of the Income Tax than anything I have yet read. I cannot accept the deduction that the 1 per cent. License Tax and the 1 per cent. Income Tax were not unpopular. With regard to the tax at the present [low] rate, all that is said is, that there is a feeling of relief. After such an *exposé* of the hardships that could be inflicted, we ought certainly to withhold our consent from any proposal which might continue the bare chance of such injustice, even if it effected a very limited number of people. It will rest with those who propose the continuance of the Income Tax in any shape to prove to demonstration that such a state of things can be effectively guarded against.

Regarding the suitability of the tax for India, Dr. Hunter gives, with his usual clearness, the views of the different schools of thinkers. We need only say here that we are of those who absolutely condemn it on the practical ground of the impossibility of realizing it without gross oppression. The press with one voice denounced it at the time of its imposition, and that Lord Mayo became strongly impressed with the same view, is shown by his letters to Lord Napier of Ettrick and the Duke of Argyll. To the former he wrote : "I am coming fast to the conclusion that we can hardly venture to impose, as a permanent part of our system, any direct taxation, whose collection cannot be placed almost entirely in the hands of European officials of good standing." And to the Duke of Argyll : "The feeling against the Income Tax continues in as great force as ever. There is much more reason than I at first supposed in the objections as regards its levy from the poorer natives, and I am inclined to think that no direct tax can be levied in India through the agency of native officials without causing much oppression. This is the real blot."

The following table given by Dr. Hunter shows 'to what extent the Earl of Mayo carried out his policy of economy and retrenchment':—

Year.	Revenue.		Ordinary Expenditure.
1867-68 ...	£48,429,614 ...	{ Years of Deficit preceding Lord Mayo's Rule ...	£49,437,339
1868-69 ...	51,657,658 ...	... }	54,431,688
1869-70 ...	50,901,081 ...	{ Year of Equilibrium ; his first year of office. }	50,782,413
1870-71 ...	51,413,685 ...	{ Years of Surplus ; his last two years of office. ... }	49,930,695
1871-72 ...	50,109,093 ...	... }	46,984,915

## 434 *Lord Mayo, Fourth Viceroy of India.*

From this it will be seen that 'the three years of Lord Mayo's rule left a surplus of 4½ millions (reduced to stg.) and nearly redressed the deficit of 5½ millions during the three preceding years.' We conclude our consideration of this part of Dr. Hunter's book by quoting from a letter addressed to the author by Mr. Barclay Chapman, three years after Lord Mayo's death :—

Lord Mayo's close personal attention to financial questions never flagged. He had, by decisive measures, established steady surplus for chronic deficit ; he had increased the working power of the Local Governments, while checking the growth of their demands upon the Imperial treasury. He had established a policy of systematic watchfulness, and severe economy. The time was now coming when the results of all his exertions and sacrifices were to be gathered ; when the Viceroy would be able to gratify his nature by granting relief from the burdens which he had reluctantly imposed. Lord Mayo was occupied with such questions on the very journey which ended so fatally. He had reason to hope that effective remission of taxation would soon be practicable, but he was still uncertain what shape it ought to take. It should never be forgotten that the welcome measures of relief, which the Government subsequently found itself in a position to effect, were possible only in consequence of Lord Mayo's vigorous policy of retrenchment and economy. His career was cut off just when the fruit for which he had made such sacrifices was ripening.

He found serious deficit and left substantial surplus. He found estimates habitually untrustworthy ; he left them thoroughly worthy of confidence. He found accounts in arrear, and statistics incomplete ; he left them punctual and full. He found the relations between the Local Governments and the Supreme Government in an unsatisfactory condition, and the powers of the Local Governments for good hampered by obsolete financial bonds. He left the Local Governments working with cordiality, harmony, and freedom, under the direction of the Governor-General in Council. He found the Financial Department conducted with a general laxity ; he left it in vigorous efficiency. And if the sound principles be adhered to, which Lord Mayo held of such importance, and which in his hands proved so thoroughly effective, India ought not again to sink into the state from which he delivered her.

The only important matter of military administration with which Lord Mayo was called upon to deal during his Viceroyalty, was the retrenchment of the expenditure on the Military Government of the country. Almost immediately after his assumption of the Viceregal seat, a despatch was received in India from the Duke of Argyll, pointing out that 'notwithstanding the numerical decrease in the forces since the mutiny, the expenditure on them had increased from 12½ millions sterling in 1856-57 to over 16 millions in 1868-69. He also alluded to the fact, that while a new and costly system of police had been organized, the expectations of any retrenchment based upon it had borne no fruit. The despatch concluded with a hope that the Viceroy would devise means to bring down the military expenditure in India by a million and a half sterling. Lord Mayo, assisted by Lord Sandhurst (Commander-in-Chief), Sir Henry Durand (Military Member of Council), and Sir Henry (then Colonel) Norman (Secretary in the Military Depart-

ment) carefully considered how the Secretary of State's wishes could be carried out without injuring the efficiency of the Army in India. They turned their attention to possible retrenchments in the Staff and in the Army departments, and to reductions in the European and Native Armies. They found it possible to retrench in the Staff to the extent of £46,065, and in the Military Department to the extent of £32,940—total £79,000 ; and this was promptly done. But the question of the reduction of troops was different and much more difficult to settle. After much consultation, however, and while earnestly protesting against the withdrawal of a 'single bayonet or sabre from India,' the Viceroy suggested measures which would result in a saving of nearly £950,000. Thus, he proposed that the number of European regiments should be reduced, but that each regiment should have its full complement of men, the total number of European soldiers remaining unchanged. The estimated annual saving in this way he put down at £297,220, in Cavalry and Infantry. A similar proposal to reduce the numbers of under-manned batteries of Artillery, and to render the remaining ones efficient by increasing their strength, would add £271,542 to the amount saved. Lord Sandhurst proposed in detail 'reductions, which he believed could be made in the Madras and Bembay regiments, with absolute safety as regards the military requirements of India, and with the minimum of irritation to the *esprit de corps* of local armies.' Sir Henry Durand went further and boldly proposed the entire abolition of the Madras and Bombay commands and of the Adjutant-Generals, and Quarter-Master-Generals of those Presidencies, and estimated that a saving of £60,000 would be the result. But 'the Viceroy felt that, however great the value to be attached to the opinions of military advisers like Lord Sandhurst and Sir Henry Durand, proposals of such magnitude might imperil the minor reforms and retrenchments which he felt within his grasp. The abolition of the costly three-fold organization of the India Army would injure the prospects of a large and an influential body of officers in India and at Home, and raise a tempest of opposition in which all hope of reform or retrenchment of any sort would be wrecked. These schemes were not therefore permitted to find entrance into the despatches in which Lord Mayo conveyed to the Secretary of State the deliberate decision of his Government with reference to the Native Army.' The following were the reductions in the Native troops recommended in those despatches :—

			Saving.
4 Batteries or Companies of Artillery	...	£	17,003
4 Regiments of Cavalry	..	"	59,009
16 Regiments of Infantry	...	"	224,474
Total	...	£	300,486

## 436 *Lord Mayo, Fourth Viceroy of India.*

We may briefly mention the result. The total annual saving which would have been effected had all the recommendations of Lord Mayo's Government been carried out, was £948,253 : the portion of the scheme carried out effected a saving of £591,440 per annum. The Secretary of State sanctioned the retrenchments in the Indian Staff and Army departments, 'but he did not see his way to adopt, in their entirety, either of the other two series of measures, namely, those which affected the British regiments serving in India, or the reductions of the Native Army'. From the extracts given by Dr. Hunter from the letters and minutes of the Viceroy and his advisers, we gather that Lord Mayo was actuated by the same high notions and feelings in his treatment of this military problem, as were evident in his foreign and financial policy. He took a special and practical interest in all matters affecting directly or indirectly the welfare and comfort of the British soldier in India in barracks, hill-sanitaria, hospitals, and the Lawrence Asylum. 'Regimental workshops, exhibitions, and every device for keeping alive the mental vitality of the British soldier under the strain of the Indian climate, found in him a constant friend.'

The chapter headed 'Legislation under Lord Mayo' consists entirely of a letter written to Dr. Hunter by Mr. Fitz-James Stephen, in which he defends Lord Mayo's Government from the charge of over-legislation, and gives a very interesting account of the legislative business done during the time he was legal member of the Governor-General's Council. A mere list of the acts passed during Lord Mayo's tenure of office would not interest our readers. Among the most important of them may be mentioned the Evidence Act (1 of 1872), the Contract Act (IX of 1872), and the Code of Criminal Procedure (X of 1872). Writing of these Mr. Stephen says : 'That the Government of India was able to pass in 1872 the three great Acts, to which I have already referred, was principally due to Lord Mayo personally. If he personally had cared less about legislation, and had taken a less vigorous line about it, it would have been impossible to pass any one of those Acts.' And he concludes his letter with the following sentences :—

I do not like to trespass on what is your peculiar province in telling the story of Lord Mayo's life. But I cannot leave the subject without saying that, of the many public men whom it has been my fortune to meet in various capacities at Home and in India, I never met one to whom I felt disposed to give such heart-felt affection and honour. I hope you will succeed in making people understand how good and kind, how wise and honest and brave he was, and what freshness, vigour and flexibility of mind he brought to bear upon a vast number of new and difficult subjects.

Dr. Hunter has succeeded, in this delightful and valuable book, which we lay aside for the time with real regret, in showing Lord

Mayo's many noble qualities of heart and mind. We have already so far exceeded the space we had allowed ourselves that we cannot attempt, at this time, to give our readers an insight into Lord Mayo's internal administration. We may only in one sentence summarize its principal features. He visited many parts of the immense territories he governed, and saw and heard and noted many things which could not otherwise have come to his knowledge ; he revolutionized the Public Works Department and shook it almost fiercely into something like order ; reducing at the same time its annual expenditure by nearly two millions sterling ; he organized a department of Agriculture, Revenue and Commerce ; he bent his mind to a hundred subjects which cannot even be enumerated now—Jails, Railways, Statistics, Irrigation, Minerals, Horse-supply, &c. Finally he exercised a magnificent hospitality, and did more than full justice to the social duties of his position. He made innumerable friends and but few enemies, and the feeling towards him of all those immediately about him was one which would probably be more correctly described by a stronger term than friendship. The Aides-de-Camp, who stood over his coffin in the gloomy, black-draped Throne Room of Government House when his body lay in state, were not the only men there who shed tears. We conclude our notice of Dr. Hunter's book by an extract which will always have a melancholy interest for Indian readers. It is also one of the finest and most touching things the author has ever written. It is the account of Lord Mayo's last evening :—

On his way he said : ' We have still an hour of daylight, let us do Mount Harriet.' This had originally formed part of the day's programme, but the Private Secretary, according to his regular practice of so arranging each day's work as never to let it keep the Viceroy out after dark, had managed to get the visit postponed till next morning. Mount Harriet is a hill rising to 1116 feet, a mile and a half inland from the Hopetown Jetty. Its capabilities as a sanitarium had been much discussed, and Lord Mayo was anxious to compare the conflicting opinions he had received with his own impression on the spot. Malaria was the one enemy of the colony which remained, and the Viceroy was resolved to get the better of it. He desired, if possible, to provide a retreat where the fever patients might shake off their clinging malady. No criminals of a dangerous sort were quartered at Hopetown, the only convicts there being ticket-of-leave men of approved good conduct. However, the Superintendent at once despatched a boat with the guards from Chatham Island to the Hopetown Jetty, and followed with the Viceroy and party in the launch.

On landing at Hopetown a little after 5 p.m., the Viceroy found gay groups of his guests enjoying the cool of the day ; and had a smile and a kind word for each as he passed. ' Do come up,' he said to one lady, ' you will have such a sunset ! ' But it was a stiff climb through the jungle, and only one recruit joined him. His own party was dead tired ; they had been on their feet for six blazing hours, and Lord Mayo, as usual the freshest after a hard day, begged some of them to rest till he returned. Of course no one liked to give in, and the party dived into the jungle. When they came to the foot of the

hill, the Viceroy turned round to his Aide-de-Camp, who was visibly fatigued now that the strain of the day's anxiety had relaxed, and almost ordered him to sit down. The Superintendent had sent on the one available pony, but Lord Mayo, at first objected to riding while the rest were on foot. When half way up, he stopped and said: 'It's my turn to walk now; one of you get on.' At the top he carefully surveyed the capabilities of the hill as a sanatorium. He thought he saw his way to improve the health of the settlement, and with the stern task of re-organisation to make a work of humanity go hand in hand. 'Plenty of room here' he cried, looking round on the island group, 'to settle two millions of men.' Presently he sat down, and gazed silently across the sea to the sunset. Once or twice he said quietly, 'How beautiful!' Then he drank some water. After another long look to the westward, he exclaimed to his Private Secretary; 'It's the loveliest thing I think I ever saw:' and came away.

The descent was made in close order, for it was now dark. About three-quarters of the way down, torch-bearers from Hopetown met the Viceroy and his attendant group of officials and guards. Two of his party who had hurried forward to the pier saw the intermittent gleam of the torches threading their way through the jungle; then the whole body of lights issued by the bridle-path from the wood, a minute's walk from the jetty. The *Glasgow* frigate lay out on the left with her long line of lights low on the water; the *Scotia* and *Dacca*, also lit up, beyond her; another steamer, *Nemesis*, was coaling nearer to Hopetown, on the right; the ship's bells had just rung seven. The launch, with steam up, was whizzing at the jetty stairs; a group of her seamen were chatting on the pier-end. It was now quite dark, and the black line of the jungle seemed to touch the water's edge. The Viceroy's party passed some large loose stones to the left at the head of the pier and advanced along the jetty, two torch-bearers in front, the light shining strongly on the tall form of Lord Mayo, in a grey tussor-silk coat, close between his Private Secretary and the Superintendent, the Flag-Lieutenant of the *Glasgow* and a Colonel of Engineers, a few paces behind, on left and right; the armed police between them, but a little nearer the Viceroy. The Superintendent turned aside, with Lord Mayo's leave, to give an order about the morning's programme; and the Viceroy stepped quickly forward before the rest to descend the stairs to the launch. The next moment the people in the rear heard a noise as of 'the rush of some animal' from behind the loose stones; one or two saw a hand and knife suddenly descend in the torch-light. The Private Secretary heard a thud, and instantly turning round, found a man 'fastened like a tiger' on the back of the Viceroy.

In a second twelve men were on the assassin; an English officer was pulling them off, and with his sword-belt keeping back the native guards, who would have killed the assailant on the spot. The torches had gone out; but the Viceroy, who had staggered over the pier side, was dimly seen rising up in knee-deep water and clearing the hair off his brow with his hand as if recovering himself. His Private Secretary was instantly at his side, helping him up the bank. 'Burne' he said quietly 'they've hit me.' Then in a louder voice, which was heard on the pier, 'It's all right, I don't think I'm much hurt,' or words to that effect.\* In another minute he was sitting under the smoky glare of the re-lit torches, on a rude native cart, at the side of the jetty, his legs hanging loosely down. Then they lifted him bodily on to the cart, and saw a great dark patch on the back of his light coat. The blood came streaming out, and men tried to stanch it with their handkerchiefs. For a moment or two he sat up on the cart, then fell heavily backwards. 'Lift up my head,' he said faintly: and said no more.

\* I use his own words.

They carried him down into the steam launch, some silently believing him dead. Others, angry with themselves for the bare surmise, cut open his coat and vest, and stopped the wound with hastily torn strips of cloth and the palms of their hand; others kept rubbing his feet and legs. Three supported his head. The assassin lay tied, stunned a few yards from him. As the launch shot on in the darkness, eight bells rang across the water from the ships. When it came near the frigate, where the guests were waiting for dinner, and jesting about some fish which they had caught for the meal, the lights in the launch were suddenly put out, to hide what was going on in it. They lifted Lord Mayo gently to his cabin. When they laid him down in his cot, every one saw that he was dead.

To all on board, that night stands out from among all other nights in their lives. A silence, which seemed as if it would never again be broken, suddenly fell on the holiday ship with its 600 souls. The doctors held their interview with the dead—two stabs from the same knife on the shoulder had penetrated the cavity of the chest, either of them sufficient to cause death. On the guest steamer there were hysterics and weeping; but in the ship where the Viceroy lay, the grief was too deep for any expression. Men moved about solitarily through the night, each saying bitterly to his own heart, 'Would that it had been one of us.' The anguish of her who received back her dead was not, and is not, for words.

At dawn the sight of the frigate in mourning, the flag at half-mast, the broad white stripe a leaden grey, all the ropes slack, and the yards hanging topped in dismal disorder, announced the reality to those on the other steamer who had persisted through the night in a sort of hysterical disbelief. On the frigate a hushed and solemn industry was going on. The chief officers of the Government of India on board assembled† to adopt steps for the devolution of the Viceroyalty. The trial of the murderer took place. And in a few hours, while the doctors were still engaged on their sad, secret task, one steamer had hurried north with the Member of Council to Bengal, another was ploughing its way with the Foreign Secretary to Madras, to bring up Lord Napier of Ettrick to Calcutta, as acting Governor-General. *Uno avulso, non deficit alter.* The frigate lay silent and alone. At half past nine that night, the partially embalmed body was placed in its temporary coffin on the quarter-deck, and covered with the Union Jack.

The assassin received the usual trial and the usual punishment for his crime. Shortly after he had been brought on board, in the launch which carried his victim, the Foreign Secretary asked him why he had done this thing. He only replied, 'By the order of God.' To the question, whether he had any associates in his act he answered, 'Among men I have no accomplice; God is my partner! Next morning, at the usual preliminary inquiry before the local Magistrate, when called to plead, he said, 'Yes, I did it.' The evidence of the eye-witnesses was recorded, and the prisoner committed for murder to the Sessions Court. The Superintendent, sitting as Chief Judge in the settlement, conducted the trial in the afternoon. The accused simply pleaded 'not guilty.' Each fact was established by those present when the deed was done; the prisoner had been dragged off the back of the bleeding Viceroy with the reddened knife in his hand. The sentence was to suffer death by hanging. The proceedings were forwarded in the regular way to the High Court at Calcutta for review. On the 20th February, this tribunal confirmed the sentence; and on the 11th March, the assassin was taken to the usual place of execution on Viper Island, and hanged.

The man was a highlander from beyond our North-Western frontier,

\* Sir Barrow H. Ellis (Member of Aitchison, C.S.I., Foreign Secretary, Council) presiding, with Mr. C. U. and others.

who had taken service in the Punjab Mounted Police, and been condemned to death at Peshawur for slaying his enemy on British soil. The evidence being chiefly circumstantial, his sentence was commuted to transportation for life to the Andamans. In his dying confession, years afterwards, he stated that although he had not struck the blow, he had conspired to do the murder. But the slaying of an hereditary foe in cold blood was no crime in his eyes ; and ever since his conviction, in 1869, he said he had made up his mind to revenge himself by killing 'some European of high rank.' He, therefore established his character as a silent, doggedly well-behaved man ; and in due time was set at large as a barber among the ticket-of-leave convicts at Hope-town. During three years he waited sullenly for some worthy prey. On the morning of the 8th February, when he heard the Royal Salute, he felt that his time had come, and sharpened a knife. He resolved to kill both the Superintendent and the Viceroy. All through the day the close surveillance gave him no chance of getting to the islands which Lord Mayo visited. Evening came, and his victim landed, unexpectedly, at his very door. He slipped into the woods, crept up Mount Harriet through the jungle side by side with the Viceroy ; then dogged the party down again in the dark ; but still got no chance. At the foot he almost gave up hope, and resolved to wait for the morrow. But as the Viceroy stepped quickly forward on the jetty, his grey-suited shoulders towering conspicuous in the torch-light, an impulse of despair thrilled through the assassin. He gave up all idea of life, rushed round the guards, and in a moment was on his victim's back. He was a hill-man of immense personal strength ; and when heavily fettered in the condemned cell, overturned the lamp with his chained ankle, bore down the English sentry by brute strength of body, and wrenched away his bayonet with his manacled hands. He made no pretence of penitence, and was childishly vain of being photographed (for Police inquiries in Northern India) as the murderer of a Viceroy. Indeed, some of the above details were only got out of him by a native officer who cunningly begged him for materials for an ode on his deed, to be sung by his countrymen. Neither his name, nor that of his village or tribe, will find record in this book. The last words spoken to him on earth were a message from the family whom he had stricken : 'God forgive you, as we do.'

The passionate outburst of grief and wrath which then shook India, the slow military pomp of the slain Viceroy's re-entry into his capital, the uncontrollable fits of weeping in the chamber where he lay in state, the long voyage of the mourning ship, and the solemn ceremonial with which Ireland received home her dead son—all these were fitting at the time, and are past. Earth shuts him in, with his glories and his triumphs. Yesterday, said one of the Dublin papers, we saw a State solemnity vitalized, 'by the subtle spell of national feeling. Seldom are the two things united in an Irish public funeral. When imperial pomp is displayed, the national heart is cold, when the people pay spontaneous homage to the dead, the trappings of the State are absent, its voice mute ; yesterday, for once, this ill-omened rule was broken, Government and the people united in doing homage on earth to an illustrious Irishman.' The Indian press had given vent to the wild sorrow of many races in many languages ; the English newspapers were full of statelier, nobly expressed tributes ; Parliamentary chiefs had their well chosen utterances for the nation's loss. But Lord Mayo, as he sat on the top of the sea-girt hill, and gazed towards the West, where his dear home lay beyond the sunset, would have prized that united silent mourning of his countrymen above any articulate panegyric. They laid him at last in the secluded graveyard which he had chosen on his own land.

## ART. XII.—THE BLACK PAMPHLET.

*The Black Pamphlet. The Famine of 1874.* By Ubique. Calcutta : W. Newman and Co., 3 Dalhousie Square.

THE author of this pamphlet is very much afraid lest his production should be regarded as a political squib. "This is no political squib ; we write in thorough earnest." One is irresistibly reminded of the boy who was afraid that he had been satirical when he had called one of his schoolfellows a big fool. If *The Black Pamphlet* is anything of the nature of a squib, it must have been left out in the rain and got wet ; it certainly sputters a little, but we fail to discover a single spark of genuine fire. Here we have sixty pages of the dreariest and most stupid abuse that we have ever read, spiteful without point, the outpouring of stolid Boeotian malice ; and the author has the impudence to call himself **UBIQUE**, and to be afraid of being thought satirical ! How are the sprightly fallen, when the *nom de plume* so well known to Calcutta readers of a dozen years ago is disgraced by being assumed by a tedious and conceited libeller ! Poor Tom Anderson—he might have forgiven the libels, if the man who stole his name would only consent to be witty or even amusing ; but it would make him turn in his grave to know that his *avatar* gives himself the airs of a Junius in the language and with the wit of a penny-a-liner.

Under ordinary circumstances, we should not have cared to notice such a production in these pages. As a literary performance, it is beneath contempt. The author seems to have got a glimpse of this truth by the time he comes to his last paragraph ; with a modesty that is laughable after so much naive assumption, he apologises for "many short-comings" with the excuse that "these pages have been written in haste"—rather a curious fact, considering that the pamphlet is published in the last days of 1875 whilst the final Report on the Famine was published in November 1874. However, we may be thankful for small mercies ; if Junius Junior writes "in haste" with such wearisome prolixity, what might he not have done if he had taken his time about it !

We think it right to point out the real nature and animus of the pamphlet, mainly for the sake of our readers in England—where Ubique, with a cunning discretion that does him credit, proposes (he tells us) to make his *tour de force*. English readers, in their ignorance of the facts, may not improbably be all the more ready to swallow the mis-statements of the pamphlet, because of its stupidity ; such a writer, they will argue, would hardly

come forward except for a very good cause this must be the feigned drivelling of a Brutus, playing the fool for his country's good. If we can prove to the satisfaction of these readers that the *raison d'être* of the book is only the gratification of the petty spite, probably of a disappointed man—if we can prove that the statements made in it are as false as they are malicious, and that the conclusions are arrived at by deliberately dishonest processes—we shall be satisfied.

We must be careful not to gratify Ubique's vanity and give his venom and folly undue importance, by any lengthy examination. We shall content ourselves with typical instances only: to wade through the whole tangled mass would be unnecessarily to disgust our readers, and we must have some consideration for our Bengal readers with whom the farce has long ago been played out. Every artifice known to Grub Street has been tried to awaken and keep awake the interest of Calcutta in the book, and in vain. The only good things about it—its title, and its author's pseudonym suggestive of Captain Anderson's pleasant writings—were freely advertised day after day in all the papers. Then came the *canard*, industriously circulated, that Sir Richard Temple was engaged on an answer to *The Black Pamphlet*; and again recently, the still more ridiculous and audacious statement, that a Royal Commission was likely to be the result of this tremendous satire! We shall soon be told that the Queen spends her days and nights in studying it, and that the Pope is preparing an annotated edition with the kind permission of the author. Audacity is in some things the secret of success; but Ubique has overshot the mark—his audacity is too much like the inflation of the frog in the fable.

The title is obviously plagiarized from the well-known *Red Pamphlet* of Colonel Malleson. Opinions differ widely as to the justice and the accuracy of the gallant Colonel's views; but no one, we believe, has ever disputed the keen point and wonderful power of his satire. The *Red Pamphlet* was nothing if not severe: and it is up to this that Ubique is obviously writing. "We shall have, we ourselves confess, to be severe in our references to Sir Richard Temple. We regret having to do so. We shall, as far as possible, stay our hand." Says Bobadil, "Pon my soul, I do not wish to do thee a mischief, but zounds! beware my valiant spirit." Ubique figuring as Colonel Malleson is something of a burlesque. The lion's skin is there, and the lion shall roar you like any sucking dove; but the ass's ears peep out.

After this magnanimous resolve not to demolish Sir Richard Temple all at once, we are not surprised to find the mud flying fast and thick. Sir Richard, of course, comes in for the bulk of

it ; but the splashes that fall to the share of the others, are not bad specimens of the art of vituperation. Lord Northbrook has shown "invincible ignorance," p. 9 ; he "has not been able to obtain any of the more honoured posts in England which success in politics gives to English Statesmen," p. 10 ; English and Indian charity was prostituted, and "so prostituted with full knowledge of Lord Northbrook," p. 20. When we read, p. 11, that the members of the Civil Service are in the habit of making an "after-dinner" jest of the "once respected name and motives" of Sir Richard Temple, we expect to find civilians at any rate secure from the abuse of a writer who thus appears so anxious to drag them in as his allies. Let us see what *Ubique* has to say about the Civil Service. First, the Commissioners of Division. The Commissioners, we are informed at p. 11, are the men "who winked at the estimates." But perhaps these grave and reverend seniors are not included among the after-dinner jesters by *Ubique* ; what has he to say about the District officers ? The answer is at p. 15 :—"Was there no one to enlighten him in his pitiable ignorance ? Where were the Collectors, the well-paid Executive Officers ? *We shall never know the cause of their silence.*" What, both Divisional and District officers hopelessly gone astray ? Then we shall doubtless find the faithful Abdiels in the Sub-Divisions ? Let us see ; at p. 18, "the Sub-divisional officers shrieked that the rates were ludicrous, and Sir Richard Temple produced their valuable opinions in a very pathetic minute !" What, all gone wrong ?—Commissioners, Collectors, Assistants, all ? Commissioners winking, Collectors treacherously silent, Assistants shrieking ! This is *Ubique*'s picture of the Civil Service.

But the Executive may be otherwise divided than into Commissioners, Collectors and Assistants : there are Haileybury men and Competition-Wallahs. *Ubique* is determined that no fish shall escape his net. Of the Haileybury men he says, p. 14, "amongst the good things these gentlemen have secured for themselves are all the best appointments in Béhar, which has a much more pleasant and healthy climate than the swampy and feverish districts of Bengal Proper." Selfish wretches ! We must put you out of Court ; we must look for honesty and courage only among the Competition-wallahs. Once more let us see what *Ubique* has to say : at p. 14, "Indeed we must say that many of the new civilians do not come at all well out of this famine business. They were pre-eminently the bears of the occasion. It is not without some pity we observe this fact. They are mostly rather down in the Indian official world, they are poor, and it is to be feared that when they saw the chance of distinction they rushed blindly on."

Alas, this is worse than ever! The state of Denmark seems hopelessly rotten; from winking Commissioners to "bearing" Competition-wallahs, the whole official world of Behar is hopelessly corrupt. But stay, there is hope yet; perhaps amongst the non-officials of Behar, the princely planters, whose hospitality, generosity and public spirit have been proverbial—amongst these we shall find the ten righteous men to save the province from the wrath of Heaven? Ubique's settlement of this point has the merit of being singularly terse and pithy, so that we are not kept long in suspense: at p. 11, the planters—"POCKETED THE LOOT!"

We think we have said enough to show the animus of this nameless and secret libeller, who first declares that there is a "oneness of condemnation risen up against Sir Richard Temple," and then vilifies in turn every class of Englishmen in the country for their support of Sir Richard Temple's actions. The arguments by which he pretends to show that the Famine expenditure was extravagant, are such as might be expected from such a writer. Let us consider for a moment the argument which he allows to be the fundamental one: and that we may be quite certain of putting it before our readers correctly and impartially, we will quote the passage *in extenso*.—

As to the so called famine of 1874, we declare it was *an impossibility from the beginning*. It was said to arise from drought, but there was no such drought as in 1865. *In fact there was as much rain in 1873, as in at least a dozen years during the twenty from 1855 to 1875.* Let us take a single district as an instance, one marked by both Sir George Campbell and Sir Richard Temple as a famine tract. We will give many more further on, but only one at present. There is a single first-class meteorological station in Behar. It is situated at Monghyr. For many years, even before the time of the Orissa famine, a special establishment has been employed to register its rainfall. Its returns therefore may be taken as more correct than those of ordinary districts where the Civil Surgeon and his clerk keep rainfall registers, and not always very carefully. Getting only 30 Rupees a month for doing so, a pittance which, we lately heard, is to be withdrawn, they have not had much reason to think very highly of the importance of this part of their duties. In the sixteen years, from 1860 to 1875, the total rainfall of each year has been:—in 1860, 27 inches; in 1861, 60 inches; in 1862, 40 inches; in 1863, 41 inches; in 1864, 42 inches; in 1865, 37 inches; in 1866, 45 inches; in 1867, 43 inches; in 1868, 32 inches; in 1869 37 inches; in 1870, 71 inches; in 1871, 58 inches; in 1872, 41 inches; in 1873, 42 inches; in 1874, 60 inches; and in 1875, 46 inches.

Need we comment on these returns? The total rainfall of 1873, was greater than that of 1860, of 1862, of 1863, of 1865, of 1866, of 1868, of 1869, and of 1872: and equal, or nearly equal to that of 1861, of 1864, of 1870, and of 1871; and only 5 inches short of the average fall of the sixteen years, which was 47 inches. But we will be told that the late rice crop depends on rain in the latter rainy months of August, September, and October. We are willing to consider the position of things in 1873 as tested by the rainfall of these months. The average fall of the sixteen years from 1860 to 1875 during August, September, and October was 27 inches. During

the same months of 1860 it was 13 inches; of 1864, 12 inches; of 1865,  $7\frac{1}{2}$  inches; of 1867, 17 inches; of 1868, 16 inches; of 1869, 15 inches; of 1873, the year of the drought ! ! ! 19 inches. We are really afraid the public will not believe our figures, yet, we hereby challenge Sir Richard Temple to produce authentic ones differing one-half inch from them. Excepting the years of excessive rainfall, 1861, with 60 inches, and 1870 with 71 inches, we declare the rainfall of 1873 both in its total amount and in the quantity, which fell in the important months of August, September, and October, a good average rainfall.—pp. 7, 8.

Now, what are the real facts—facts perfectly well-known and indeed familiar to every one who has taken the slightest interest in the matter—facts which no stress of charity can possibly suppose Ubique to be ignorant of? We do not dispute his figures, we have not even taken the trouble to examine them—they are entirely outside the question, as Ubique probably knows, though he marshals them with so much solemnity. The great, the fatal cause of the Famine was, not the deficient rainfall of the whole year—though even at Monghyr (artfully chosen by Ubique as a comparatively favourable instance)\* it was terribly deficient; not the deficient rainfall on the total of the three months of August, September, and October—though still at Monghyr, and with Ubique's own figures, it is seen to have been *thirty per cent* short of even an average rain-fall: but it was the fact that whilst, throughout a great part of the distressed districts, so much rain fell during the early part of the quarter as to do a great deal of damage (and to afford Ubique his honest, his ingenuous average for the quarter!), not one drop fell during the whole of October and part of September!† Let our readers keep this simple fact in their minds whilst they read over again the words of Ubique quoted above; we willingly leave them to form their own conclusions about Ubique's honesty.

The charitable will perhaps think that he must have been ignorant of the fact: let them turn to his account of Dinagepore at page 46:—“The rain in the months of August and September 1865, was 17 inches, in 1873 it was 16 inches. In neither year was there any in October!”

\* Compare with it Bogra, with an average rainfall of  $88\frac{1}{2}$  inches, rainfall in 1873, 37 inches; Bhagulpore, average 48-6, in 1873, 28-9; or Rajmahal, average 50, in 1873, 24 inches!

† The rains virtually ceased about the tenth of September! Before that date, there had been such an excessive rainfall in many districts (and notably in Monghyr!) as greatly

to injure the prospects of the crops! Every Bengali knows that, for good crops, we need light rain in August and a heavy downpour in September. In the whole history of pamphleteering, we doubt whether a more dishonest statement could be found than this precious *average* of the rainfall “in the important months of August, September, and October.”

We have promised our readers only to take typical instances of Ubique's mis-statements, for fear of wearying and disgusting them ; so we will only briefly indicate some other points in which *The Black Pamphlet* is blacker than usual. The author proves that the relief operations in Behar were extravagant, from the cheapness and comparative insignificance of those in the adjacent districts of the North-West Provinces ; whilst everyone knows that all the border authorities were of opinion that the mortality in Busti, Gorakhpore, and the adjoining districts would have been frightful, but for the proximity of the Behar relief operations. Again, no responsible writer has ever hitherto dared to hint that the scarcity of 1865-66 (though it carried off 32,000 people in Chum-parun alone) approached in intensity, for Behar and North Bengal, that of 1873-74 ; Ubique calmly argues as if they were very much of the same nature—the former for choice being probably worse than the latter ! But perhaps the most amusing, because the most stupid, part of the whole pamphlet is that which sets forth an elaborate series of calculations based on this supposed similarity between the scarcities of 1866 and 1874. Taking the actual number of people who died of starvation in each district in 1866, Ubique gravely declares that it would have been sufficient in 1874, if Government had provided relief for a certain multiple of this number—proposing in this way not only to save those who would otherwise die, but also to relieve those who would otherwise suffer severe privation.\*

\* To make this point clearer, we will take a district and suppose it dealt with according to Ubique's wishes. Ubique shall freely write himself down an ass ; we will take his own figures, grant all his assumptions, and then see where he would land us.

Let us take the district of Tirhoot, with its huge population of four and a half millions. Let us assume that only half the population of Tirhoot depends on rice for food ; and that the remaining half, feeding on other grains, millets, &c., will be in no way affected by the loss of the rice crop —i.e., that the price of other food-grains will not be affected. Let us assume that the people who do feed on rice, only consume half-a-sker a day (which is Ubique's liberal allowance !) a head—rich consuming no more than poor. Our readers will allow that we are giving Ubique a good long tether. Taking even these

figures, Tirhoot requires rather more than 28,000 maunds of rice a day, or about 850,000 maunds a month. Ubique is willing to allow that more or less relief may be required for eight months, because in 1866 the 24,000 deaths that occurred from starvation were distributed over the months from April to November, inclusive. During those eight months the total requirements of Tirhoot, taking Ubique's figures, are about 6,800,000 maunds. Now Ubique (making his computation in the way indicated above) declares that Government ought to have provided, as relief, not more than 187,027 maunds—or say, 200,000 maunds ; and is triumphant when he shows that this amount would feed twenty times the whole number of people that died in 1866 ! That is, he proposes that the relief provided should be rather less than 3 per cent. of the actual requirements (even on his

This prodigy of administrative wisdom is ignorant of the fact, which would be patent to the youngest and most inexperienced Assistant in Bengal, that the relief thus doled out could not by any possibility be assigned to the exact people who may be destined by Providence to suffer or die unless it be given. The prophet has never yet arisen who could make such a selection—or indeed *any* selection amongst the myriads of a poverty-stricken population, except the very rough and elastic one that can be effected by a judicious arrangement of the conditions of relief. Ubique's dole would in practise be spread over, not only the thousands who would suffer or die without it, but also the millions who are pinched by the scarcity; and under such circumstances, how much relief, we would ask, is likely to reach each famine-stricken wretch? Systems of relief may doubtless be devised, and indeed were successfully worked in the late famine, by which the greatest sufferers *in posse* may absorb the lion's share of the relief; but only the greatest ignorance or stupidity could hope to restrict the relief to such.

We have neither time nor patience to analyse this precious production further: but the reader will find on every page fallacious statements not less absurd than those we have now pointed out. The author concludes with a hope "that some allowance will be made for a pamphlet *dedicated to the one object of advancing the truth!*" As the grocer said to his assistant, "John, have you sanded the sugar?"—"Yes, sir." "Have you dusted the pepper?"—"Yes, Sir."—"Have you watered the vinegar?"—"Yes, Sir."—Then John, *come to prayers.*"

own showing) of the district!—or, stores and crops in the district or to put it in another way, in every from' relief), Government should see that is absolutely required to provide against any deficiency by keep a man from starvation (and that affording relief to the extent of—must be provided either from the half a chittack !



THE  
*CALCUTTA REVIEW.*

VOLUME LXII.

1876.

EDITED BY E. LETHBRIDGE, M.A.

---

*No man who hath tasted learning but will confess the many ways of profiting by those who, not contented with stale receipts, are able to manage and set forth new positions to the world: and, were they but as the dust and cinders of our feet, so long as in that notion they may yet serve to polish and brighten the armury of truth, even for that respect they were not utterly to be cast away.*—MILTON.

---

CALCUTTA :

THOMAS S. SMITH, CITY PRESS, 12, BENTINCK STREET.

BOMBAY: MESSRS. THACKER, Vining & CO.

MADRAS: MESSRS. HIGGINBOTHAM & CO.

LONDON: MESSRS. TRÜBNER & CO., 8 AND 60, PATERNOSTER ROW,  
AND TO BE HAD OF ALL BOOKSELLERS IN CALCUTTA.



# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

—  
No. CXXIII.  
—

## CONTENTS.

	PAGE
ART. I.—INDIA IN THE SEVENTEENTH CENTURY.	
Travels in India in the Seventeenth Century: By Sir Thomas Roe and Dr. John Fryer. London: Trübner & Co. 1873 ... ... ...	1
„ II.—THE HINDU CUSTOM OF 'SITTING DHARNA.'	
Lectures on the Early History of Institutions. By Sir Henry Sumner Maine, K.C.S.I., LL.D. Author of 'Ancient Law,' and 'Village Communities in the East and West.' London. John Murray, Albemarle Street: 1875 ... ... ...	37
„ III.—THE BHAGAVAD-GITA AND CHRISTIANITY. ...	53
„ IV.—PROTESTANT MISSIONS IN INDIA.	
The History of Protestant Missions in India. By the Rev. M. A. Sherring, M.A., LL.B.: Benares. Trübner & Co. 1875 ... ... ...	83
„ V.—CEYLON PAST AND PRESENT.	
1.—Ceylon Blue Books, 1870 to 1873. 2.—Report of Cattle Disease Commission, 1870. 3.—Report of Irrigation Committee, 1817. 4.—Administrative Report, 1848 to 1864. ... ...	106
„ VI.—SOME SUGGESTIONS FOR UNIVERSITY RE- FORM IN INDIA.—( <i>Independent Section.</i> ) ...	126
„ VII.—THE EDUCATION OF THE INDIAN CIVIL SERVICE. NOTE ON THE PRECEDING ARTICLE. ...	141
„ VIII.—INDIAN WISDOM.—WITH A SKETCH OF INDIAN META- PHYSICS.	
Indian Wisdom: or Examples of the Religious, Phi- losophical, and Ethical Doctrines of the Hindus. With a Brief History of the Chief Departments of Sanskrit Literature, and some Account of the Past and Present Condition of India, Moral and Intellectual. By Monier Williams, M.A., Boden Professor of Sanskrit in the University of Ox- ford: London; W. H. Allen & Co. ...	153

## IX.—THE 'NINE ISLANDS' OF THE MALAYS.

1.—Vocabulary of Dialects spoken in the Nicobar and Andaman Isles. With a short account of the Natives, their customs and habits; and of previous attempts at Colonization. 2nd Edition. By F. A. de Röepstorff. Calcutta. 1875.	
2.—Selections from the Records of the Government of India. Home Department. Vol. LXXVII. Calcutta. 1870	185
„ X.—THE NINE-LAKH CHAIN : OR THE MARO FEUD : BEING THE FIRST PORTION OF THE LAY OF ALHA	209
„ XI.—MR. EDWIN ARNOLD'S GITAGOVINDA.	
The Indian Song of Songs. From the Sanskrit of the Gitagovinda of Jayadeva. With other Oriental Poems. By Edwin Arnold, M.A., F.R.C.S., of University College, Oxford; Formerly Principal of the Poona College, and Fellow of the University of Bombay. London : Trübner & Co. 1875	234

## CRITICAL NOTICES :—

## 1.—VERNACULAR LITERATURE :—

Mrinmayi : Sequel to Kapálakundalá. By Dámodar Mukhopádhyáy. Calcutta. New Sanskrit Press. 1874.	i
Anuvíkshana : or the Microscope :—a Monthly Magazine of Hygiene, Practice of Medicine, and other Topics. Part 1, No. 1. Edited by Harish Chandra Sarmá. Calcutta, Anuvíkshana Press : Srávan 1282	iii
Lalítá Sundart. By Adhárlál Sen. New Bengal Press, Calcutta : Samvat. 1931	iv
Menká. By Adhárlál Sen. New Bengal Press, Calcutta : Samvat. 1931	ib

## 2.—GENERAL LITERATURE :—

A Comparative Grammar of the Dravidian or South-Indian Family of Languages. By the Rev. Robert Caldwell, D. D., LL. D., Honorary Member of the Royal Asiatic Society, Fellow of the University of Madras, Missionary of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel at Edeyengoody, Tinnevelly, Southern India. Second Edition; Revised and Enlarged. London : Trübner & Co., 1875.	ib
A Comparative Grammar of the Modern Aryan Languages of India: to wit, Hindi, Panjábí, Sindhi, Gujaráti, Marathi, Oriyá, and Bangáli. By John Beames, Bengal Civil Service, Fellow of the University of Calcutta, Member of the Royal Asiatic Society, the German Oriental Society, etc., etc. Vol. II. The Noun and Pronoun. London : Trübner & Co., 1875.	v
A Dictionary of the Páli Language. By Robert César Childers, late of the Ceylon Civil Service, Professor of Pali and Buddhist Literature at University College, London : Honorary Member of the Ceylon Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society. London : Trübner & Co., 1875.	ib

The Jataka, together with its Commentary. For the first time published in the original Pali. By V. Fausboll, and translated by R. C. Childers. Text, Vol. I., Part I. London : Trübner and Co. 1875. ...

On the Establishment in connection with the Indian Museum and Library of an Indian Institute for Lecture, Enquiry, and Teaching ; its influence on the promotion of Oriental Studies in England, on the progress of Higher Education among the Natives of India, and on the Training of candidates for the Civil Service of India. By J. Forbes Watson, M.A., M.D., LL. D., Reporter on the Products of India, India Museum, London : W. H. Allen & Co. ... ... ...

How to speak and write English. By Major W. R. M. Holroyd, B. S. C., Director of Public Instruction, Panjab. For the use of Natives of India ; English-Urdu Edition. Lahore ... ... ...



052  
CAL  
VOL. 62  
PT. 1



THE  
CALCUTTA REVIEW.

NO. CXXIII.

ART. I.—INDIA IN THE SEVENTEENTH CENTURY.

*Travels in India in the Seventeenth Century*: By Sir Thomas Roe and Dr. John Fryer. London: Trübner & Co., 1873.

A BOUT the time that Milton composed the opening lines of his second book of *Paradise Lost*, where he speaks of

“the wealth of Ormus or of Ind,  
Or where the gorgeous East with richest hand  
Scatters on her kings barbaric pearl and gold,”

a solitary Englishman, Dr. Fryer, was wending his way to the capital of the Moghul King, to realise for himself the splendid pageantry of an Eastern court, of which historians had written and poets sung. From the earliest times the spirit of enquiry had never slept, and strenuous exertions were made to extend the knowledge of India, then scarcely known but by name, and to acquire some accurate information regarding the manners and customs of the various races of men by whom it was inhabited. The fabulous opulence and the unheard-of magnificence of Indian potentates always had a fascination for Englishmen thirsting for adventures in foreign lands. Allied to this, the fame of that myth known to the readers of modern history as Prester John also led a great many enterprising characters to seek premature death in their fruitless attempts to penetrate into the wildest and least accessible parts of the globe. Somewhere between the confines of China in the east and of America in the west imagination had located the dominion of this creature of the fancy, though what particular locality it embraced was not known with any degree of precision. Travellers and others had heard of the monarch, and the report of his conversion to Christianity helped to lend additional stimulus to their already excited imagination. It was only gradually, and when the light of reason broke upon the Dark Ages, that the ideas of the wildest visionaries came to be sobered down to the realities of every-day existence. To sit by one's fireside and in

the enjoyment of a sense of security to read of hair-breadth escapes and perilous adventures by field and flood is at all times an exciting occupation of the mind, hence books of travel are eagerly sought after by almost every section of the reading public. But their value and charm are enhanced if they describe the manners, customs and institutions of a people in whose mental and material progress we are deeply concerned. To acquaint ourselves with the details of their private life, what they did, how they contrived to exist, in fact to see the Indian of a couple of centuries back brought face to face with us in the writings of one of our own flesh and blood, who paints this age for the reader such as no other writer has done,—“the very form and pressure of the time”—must ever be an interesting subject of speculation to Englishmen generally. Such observations, if correctly made, apart from prejudice, throw considerable light on sociology and primitive culture, two of the most important branches of human knowledge which are attracting a good deal of attention at the present day. In the volume before us we have the actual experiences of Indian life by two Englishmen related in the popular style of the seventeenth century.

At the time Sir Thomas Roe, Ambassador from King James I of England to the Emperor Jahangir, paid it a visit, the modern island of Johanna, which supplied most of the stones used in constructing Fort William and Fort St. George, was governed by a Sultan who had more liberal ideas of free trade than are entertained by some of the sovereigns in civilized Europe. To Captain Keeling's present of “a piece and a sword blade” the Sultan returned “four bullocks,” and gave “free liberty to buy and sell, and signifying so much by a messenger to the inhabitants round about, promised to send down his own cattle, but professed he had no power to compel or make price for others, but left the trade open to every man's will.” At this interview our traveller for the first time observed the habit of chewing *pán*, which he so quaintly describes. “He sent for cocoanuts to give the company, himself chewing betel and lime of burnt oyster shells with a kernel of nut called *Aracea*, like an acorn ; it bites in the mouth, avoids rheum, cools the head, strengthens the teeth, and is all their physic : it makes one unused to it giddy, and makes a man's spittle red, and in time colours the teeth, which is esteemed a beauty.” He shared in the belief current in his day that the tribe of Bedouin Arabs are a sect of Jacobite Christians. And his reasons for inclining to the opinion of Maginas, Purchas, and others is, that one of his *compagnons de voyage*, Boughton by name, saw an old church of theirs at Socotra in ruins and the gate closed. On expressing a desire to enter it he was told by the Shaikh that it was full of spirits. In spite of

all remonstrances he did effect an entrance into the edifice, and found there an altar with several images and a cross upon it which he brought away. In these days of the irrepressible shoe question and the humble pie our politicals have to eat in the courts of petty Rajahs, it is quite refreshing to read of the indomitable pluck and energy of an isolated Englishman insisting on conforming to the ceremonies of his native land and occupying a seat by the side of the son of the Great Moghul. On showing a bold front to the governor of Brampore, the latter condescended to come down from his high estate and occupy a seat alongside of Sir Thomas Roe, but a slight *contretemps* marred future proceedings. Among the presents offered to the governor was a case containing bottles of European wines, of which he imbibed so copiously that the visit ended rather abruptly, and the ambassador was told to call the next day. It was here that the latter had the first taste of an Indian climate in the shape of a bad fever which confined him to his bed for some days.

He speaks by report of the ruins of Dely (Delhi) and of a pillar erected by Alexander "the Conqueror" with a great inscription. "The present Moghul and his ancestors, descendants of Tamerlane, have brought all the ancient cities to ruin, having dispeopled them and forbidden reparation, I know not out of what reason, unless they would have nothing remembered as greatness beyond their beginnings, as if their family and the world were equals."

The ambassador was received by Jahangir at Adsmeere (Ajmere) in great state. It happened to be on the festival of Nowroz, and the reception was on a grander scale than usual. Among the decorations of the throne were "the pictures of the King of England, the Queen, the Lady Elizabeth, the Countess of Somerset and Salisbury, and of a citizen's wife of London, below them another of Sir Thomas Smith, Governor of the East India Company."

After the usual return of compliments the Englishman disclosed the object of his mission, which "was to conclude a firm and constant love and peace between their majesties, and to establish a fair and secure trade and residence for my countrymen." He, however, experienced great difficulties from the beginning to the end, owing to the machinations of Asaph Khan, the father-in-law of the Emperor, who was all the while throwing obstacles clandestinely in his way, to the extent even of bullying his interpreter by means of threatening gestures. Jahangir was very much pleased with the presents brought for him from England, but expressed great desire to possess an English horse, for which he offered a lakh of rupees, and would not be satisfied with the explanation that the dangers by sea were so great that it would be impossible to land one

safely in his dominions. The Portuguese, who were jealous of the rise of the English power, in the meantime raised a faction against them by means of bribery and corruption among the courtiers, which was also joined by one of the princes, and it required all the persuasion of the honest Englishman to continue in the good graces of the Emperor.

On what a slight thread hangs the life and liberty of even a king's nephew under a savage potentate, will best appear from the following anecdote :—“ The King commanded one of his brother's sons (who was made a Christian in policy to bring him into hatred with the people) to go and strike a lion on the head, which was brought before the King, but he being afraid, refused it ; so the King bade his youngest son to go touch the lion, who did so without any harm, whereat the King took occasion to send his nephew away to prison, where he is never like to see daylight.”

Here is a pleasant episode in the history of an Eastern monarch :—

“ A gentlewoman of Nourmehal's was taken in the King's house with a eunuch ; another capon that loved her killed him ; the poor woman was set up to the armpits in the earth, hard rammed, her feet tied to a stake, to abide three days and two nights without any sustenance, her head and arms exposed to the sun's violence ; if she died not in that time, she should be pardoned. The eunuch was condemned to the elephants. This damsel yielded in pearls, jewels and ready money sixteen hundred thousand rupees.”

The natives of India seem to have attained to some perfection in the art of painting. Sir Thomas Roe having made a present of a picture to the Emperor, one of his cavaliers executed half a dozen copies of it, which bore so great a resemblance to the original that Sir Thomas had great difficulty in recognising the one he got from Europe.

Religious scruples, then as now, operated to prevent his eating at the same board with the Musalman nobles of the court, but a curious ceremony of eating bread and salt was gone through between him and one of the grandees in token of a lasting friendship laid between them from that day forward.

The second of September being the anniversary of Jahangir's birthday, a levée was held in the palace with much pomp and show, in which elephants richly caparisoned did obeisance to His Majesty by touching the ground with their huge heads. On this occasion he was “ weighed against some jewels, gold, silver, stuffs of gold and silver, silk, butter, rice, fruit, and many other things of every sort a little, which is given to the Brahmans.” The chains and scales were made of massive gold, the edges of the latter being set with rubies and other precious stones. The King came in gorgeously decked out in ‘ barbaric pearl and gold,’ and took his seat in one of the scales. He was first weighed

against bags of silver, and His Majesty was not by any means a feather weight, for it took nine thousand rupees to keep the cross-beam in a horizontal position !! The bags of rupees were then replaced by bags of what were said to be gold and jewels, but the Englishman is rather sceptically inclined on this point, for he "saw none; it being in bags might be pebbles." These were again changed for "cloth of gold, silk, stuffs, linen, spices, and all sorts of goods." Lastly "meal, butter, and corn were substituted;" these were subsequently given away to Banians (Brahmans ?). At night the King called for the poor people, and distributed the silver among them. After the weighing was completed, he ascended the throne, and had "basins of nuts, almonds, fruits, spices of all sorts made in thin silver, which he cast about, and his great men scrambled prostrate upon their bellies." Seeing that Sir Thomas did not join in the *melée*, he reached him one basinful, and poured it on his cloak, but the greediness and boldness of the courtiers left him little by way of his share, for although he managed to save several thousands of pieces, they were so thin that the whole quantity did not weigh twenty rupees. This he retained "to show the ostentation, for by my proportion he could not that day cast away above one hundred pounds sterling."

An exhibition of his impatient childishness was manifested rather strongly by an incident which occurred that very night. The English ambassador had scarcely retired for the night when word was sent to him that the King wanted to see him urgently. On entering the royal presence he was told by His Majesty that he had heard the great traveller had a picture with him which he very much wanted to see. On its being shown to him, he took such a fancy to it that he expressed a wish to keep it. Being the likeness of a deceased lady friend of Sir Thomas (probably that of his wife or some near relative), the latter, "who esteemed it more than anything he possessed," was reluctant to part with it; but the importunities of the Emperor could not be withstood, and when at last his wish was gratified he replied "that he would not take it, that he loved me the better for loving the remembrance of my friend, and knew what an injury it was to take it from me; by no means he would not keep it, but only take copies, and with his own hand he would return it, and his wives should wear them: for indeed in the art of limning his painters work miracles." The day wound up with a drunken bout, in which the Englishman was offered wine in a cup of gold set with rubies. The contents of it were so strong that it made him sneeze, at which the Emperor and his court burst into roars of laughter.

Here is an instance of "wisdom and patience in a father, faith in a servant, falsehood in a brother, impudent boldness

in a faction that dare attempt anything, when the highest majesty gives them liberty either beyond the law of their condition or the limits of policy and reason." A faction composed of Prince Caronne, Queen Nourmehal, Asaph Khan the well-known intriguer, and Etman Dowlut, compassed the death of the king's eldest son, Sultan Corforonne, whom they wished to get into their clutches in order to administer to him poison. Taking advantage of a drunken moment of his father, they persuaded him to give an order on one Anna Rah, who had custody of the prince's person, to make him over to them under the pretence that he would naturally prefer his brother's company. The Rashboote Gentile, however, divined their object and refused to part with his charge until the next day, when he laid bare their purpose before Jahangir, who changed his mind and recalled his orders. But this state of things did not last long, for in a short time the eldest son was made over to the keeping of Asaph Khan amidst the grumblings of the nobility, the tears and execrations of his sisters and other ladies of the royal household, and the rage of the common people. A few nights after, six ruffians were sent to murder the prince, but the porter refused them the keys of the prison. The king's heart melted at this, and he soon availed himself of a slight pretext to give Asaph Khan a good rating for not having treated his charge with the reverence due to his rank. About this time Mahomed Roza Beg, ambassador from Shah Abbas King of Persia, came over to India with the avowed object of seeking peace for the people of Deccan, against whom the Moghul was preparing to take the field; but in reality asking succour of money against the Turks. After the mutual interchange of presents and civilities, the Emperor gave a present of Rs. 25,000 to the Persian ambassador. He seems to have repented him of his generosity, for he shortly after hit upon an expedient for repaying himself the amount. It was customary in the reign of this monarch for the nobility to get drunk only by permission of the king. One day it was brought to his notice that several of his courtiers had been seen in a state of inebriety, and a happy thought struck him. Although he had himself on that occasion freely indulged in liquor and had given them license to go and do likewise, he pretended not to have done so; and the result was that every one of the grandees who was suspected of drunkenness was arraigned before the bar of His Majesty. Some were fined "one, some two, some three thousand rupees, some less, and some that were near his person he caused to be whipped before him, receiving one hundred and thirty stripes with a most terrible instrument, having at each end four cords, irons like sparrowwells, so that every stroke made four wounds. When they lay for dead on the ground, he commanded

the standers-by to foot them, and after the porters to break their staves upon them. Thus most cruelly mangled and bruised they were carried out, of which one died in the place." Sir Thomas' curiosity about the ladies of the royal household was once satisfied by a glance which he had of two of the king's principal wives who had approached within an inconvenient distance of the durbar. The light from the pearls and diamonds they wore sufficed to show their outlines, the colour of their hair and their complexion.

Before undertaking a journey it was customary for His Majesty to go through a ceremony presaging good fortune. A huge carp was brought to his presence, followed by a dish of starch, into which he put his finger and rubbed it on the forehead of the fish.

An affray which took place between two Englishmen and seven Portuguese is thus humorously described : " Five of the latter set on an English boy in Camboza, and disarming him ; upon rumours whereof John Browne and James Bickford went to his rescue, and were assailed by seven of them. One shooting a pistol hurt Browne in the hand, but his heart lay not there ; they defended themselves bravely, honestly like Englishmen, killed one, hurt some others, and chased them up and down the town like beasts to the great shame of such villains and reputation of our nation." Matters took rather a serious turn, and there would have occurred some more deaths, but for the timely interference of the governor, who expelled the Portuguese and took the English under his protection.

Indian princes and their neighbours used to send each other presents, not only of pearls and rubies, horses and elephants, but of men's heads also. Sir Thomas Roe in his progress through the country " overtook on the way a camel with three hundred men's heads sent from Candahar by the governor in present to the king, that were out in rebellion." On one occasion the English ambassador found the king seated on his throne with a beggar at his feet " a poor silly old man, all ashed, ragged and patched, with a young rogue attending on him. With these kind of professed poor holy men the country abounds, and are held in great reverence, but for works of chastisement of their body and voluntary sufferings they exceed the brags of all heretics or idolaters. This miserable wretch clothed in rags, crowned with feathers, covered with ashes, His Majesty talked with about an hour, with such familiarity and show of kindness that it must needs argue an humility not found easily among kings. The beggar sat, which his son dare not do ; he gave the King a present—a cake, ashed burnt on the coals, made by himself of coarse grain, which the King accepted most willingly, and broke one bit and ate it, which a dainty mouth could scarce have done."

A story which Sir Thomas heard during his stay in court is quite characteristic of the cruelty and injustice of these savage rulers. One of the Gentile Kings of Mandoa having accidentally fallen into the river Sepra in a state of drunkenness, a slave that was close by dived after him and saved His Majesty from a watery grave. On being asked to reward the domestic, he enquired why he dared to lay his hands on the royal head and ordered them to be struck off. Shortly after he slipped once more into the river, but this time it was while in the company of the queen ; on coming out of the water he questioned his spouse as to why she remained a passive spectator of his misfortune ; she replied, that she was not sure whether she would have her hands cut off or not.

Jahangir, in common with the generality of Eastern monarchs, was susceptible of being swayed by suspicious emotions on the paltriest of occasions. Among the presents intended for him was a picture of Venus leading a Satyr by the nose. It excited his fancy a good deal, and he asked his courtiers to divine its moral. Each of them put his own interpretation on it, but he was evidently dissatisfied with their explanation, and adopted the precaution of commanding the interpreter not to divulge the drift of their conversation to the Englishman. However, disguise it as he would, his gestures and outward feelings betrayed his inward thoughts, which were that the Satyr was meant to represent an Asiatic being led into captivity by a white woman. Sir Thomas caps the relation of this occurrence with the following shrewd observation :—"This I repeat for instruction, to warn the Company and him that shall succeed me to be very wary what they send, may be subject to ill-interpretation : for in that point this King and people are very pregnant and scrupulous, full of jealousy and tricks."

Prince Caronne was a bitter enemy of the English embassy, and unsparing in his endeavours to put every manner of obstacle in the way of Sir Thomas Roe obtaining from his father certain privileges for the British residents and factors of Surat. That his father was a puppet in his and Nourmehal's hands will appear from the following. Before the presents for the King reached the palace, they had to pass through the dominions of the Prince, who levied a black-mail on them, and appropriated some of the packages to his own use. On Sir Thomas bringing to the notice of the father the conduct of his son, he merely laughed and said that he would send immediate orders to his son to desist from molesting the caravan, and that "the Prince, Nourmehal and he were all one." But his assurances went for nothing. The latter was exasperated at the conduct of the foreigner, and told his father that the English purposed taking Surat in the following year. To add to their embarrassments, an incident occurred which gave a colour to this

plausible story. An ordinary brawl having taken place among some of the factory people, a hundred sailors from the vessels lying in the harbour were despatched towards Surat. These, out of mere 'lark,' gave out on the way that they were going to take the town. But its impracticability is thus exposed by Sir Thomas Roe :—"This absurd bravado for a handful of men to pass twelve miles to a walled town, able to put out a thousand horse armed, and as many shot, a river to pass, which a few men would descend against a good army, gave just occasion of scorn and offence."

The officers of the Great Moghul to whom the revenue of the various districts was farmed, did not exercise much discretion in the choice of means for compelling payment of illegal cesses exacted from the 'Naturals' (meaning thereby cultivators or ryots, we presume) by "ordinarily hanging them by their heels to confess money, or to ransom themselves from no fault," and were consequently very loath to allow the King to come to a knowledge of these nefarious practices.

Whenever he chose, Jahangir could condescend to be the meanest of the mean in his dealings with strangers, for about this time one Aganoor, an Armenian gentleman of great respectability attached to the Persian embassy, communicated to Sir Thomas Roe that the representative of Shah Abbas was unceremoniously dismissed by the King for a supposed insult offered to His Majesty. It appears that the ambassador had made a present of thirty-five horses to the King just before his departure, for which he was paid three thousand rupees. Having expressed his astonishment at such an inadequate return, he incurred the King's displeasure, who valued all that the former had given at unprecedented low rates, while he put high prices on the things which he had given to the Persian, "even to the slaves, drink, melons, pines, plantains, hawks, plums, and elephants;" the bill for these he pleaded as a set-off against the other, and combining in his own person the judge, jury, advocate and witness, it is not surprising that the verdict was against the opposite party, who had ultimately to "make up the balance in money."

Over and above the trials and troubles of the Englishman at the hands of royalty and his myrmidons, his patience was further taxed by the depredations committed in the quarters assigned him for his residence by a lion and wolf, which kept up a constant feast upon his goats and sheep. His servant made short work of the wolf, but as the lions were under the King's immediate protection, previous permission was necessary before any hostile steps could be adopted against the king of the forest. This was granted, but not before a little "Island dog" was carried away from under the very nose of its master.

The spirit of free trade did not pervade the court of Jahangir and personally he had peculiar ideas on the subject. A complaint having been made to him against certain parties who had purchased goods from the English, but had not discharged their liabilities, he gave the foreigners distinctly to understand that he would, in this instance assist them in recovering their just dues, but in future, if they failed to conform to his orders, he would not be answerable for the debts of his subjects. His instructions were, that an inventory of the commodities intended for sale should be first submitted to him; after making his choice, the rest of the goods would be offered to the public; that an officer of the court would register the names of the purchasers, while another would appraise the goods; and lastly, that unless these requisitions were complied with he could not undertake to have their claims satisfied. The law of creditor and debtor, however, seems not to have been very accurately defined, and the mode of serving a process of the court was quite in keeping with the other barbarous characteristics of the times and was accompanied with heavy costs, though not strictly in accordance with equity or good conscience. No notice having been taken by the debtors of the first call for payment, the *Kutwal*, or head of the police, was entrusted to carry out the King's commands. This worthy limb of the law surprised the delinquents at midnight in their tents, and having caught some of them, the principal debtor was sent to jail at once, and the next in importance was given three days' liberty to satisfy his creditors. As the amount was only forty-four thousand rupees, it was expected to be paid within ten days.

Although Sir Thomas Roe had been in the country for two years, and had learned by sad experience the easiest and the shortest way of securing the liberty to trade and other privileges for his countrymen, he resisted to the last the importunities of the courtiers to gain over to his side the father-in-law of the King. Failing in his endeavours, and not until he discovered that all the avenues to royal favour were closed against him, did he condescend to enlist the services of Asaph Khan, the greatest intriguer and the most barefaced timeserver that ever disgraced an Eastern despot's court, by the bribe of a valuable pearl. The sudden change in his bearing was manifested by an abject obsequiousness towards the Englishman; and he was unremitting in his solicitations to the Prince, at times even playing on his fears, to expedite the grant of the Firman which had been two years in preparation!

Ladies were then, as now, costly necessaries of life, and the wife of one of the officials was the cause of some anxiety to the Englishman. It appears that she was extravagantly inclined, but who were her tailors and milliners we are not told. It is, however, evident that she was neither useful nor ornamental. Sir Thomas Roe

blandly says—" For his wife, I dealt with him clearly, she could not stay with our safety nor his master's content ; that he (the husband) had ruined his fortunes, if by amends he repaired it not ; that she should not travel nor live on the Company's purse. I know the charge of women, that if he were content to live himself like a merchant, as others did frugally, and to be ordered for the Company's service, and to send home his wife, he was welcome : otherwise I must take a course with both against my nature. Having to this persuaded him, I likewise practised the discouragement of Captain Torverson about his wife, (you know not the danger, the trouble, the inconvenience of granting these liberties) to effect this I persuaded Abraham, his father-in-law to hold fast."

The employés of the East India Company although working avowedly for the interests of their masters did not scruplo to feather their own nests at the expense of the former. Sir Thomas Roe in citing certain cases that came under his notice naively adds :— " You discourage all your old servants, some may do all things for fair words, some nothing for good actions : I could instance some gone home two years since, that only employed their own stock, did no other business and live now at home in their pleasure, others that raise their fortune upon your moneys from port to port."

There were no definite rules for regulating the internal economy of crowded jails in India in the beginning of the seventeenth century ; and Jahangir made short work of the men that were incarcerated in them whether as criminals or as civil prisoners.

" The King, when his prisons were full of condemned men, some he commands to be executed, some he sends to his Amraos to redeem at a price ; this he esteems as a courtesy to give means to exercise charity ; but he takes the money and so sells the virtue." On one occasion three Abbassines (whom the Moslems consider Christians) were sent to Sir Thomas to be sold as slaves at forty rupees each ; but the humane Englishman paid sixty rupees in all for the lot and gave them their liberty. Shortly after this occurrence, two Englishmen named Spragge and Howard got into trouble on the barest suspicion. It appears that the *Kutwal* had called at their residence, and having indulged in drink along with his men, one of the latter died suddenly, upon which the foreigners were accused of poisoning and without even the show of a trial were cast into prison, their house and property being confiscated. On information sent to Sir Thomas of their lives being in danger, he lost no time in repairing to the court at once, and after three days' toil obtained an order for their release with this admonition to the *Kutwal* " that if the Moore came into their (Spragge and Howard's) house to drink, if they killed him with a dagger, he had his just reward."

The journal of Sir Thomas Roe here comes to an abrupt termination.

The next Englishman of note that paid a visit to India accredited with authority by the East India Company was Dr. John Fryer. This was in the year A. D. 1672 when the 'merry monarch' reigned in England. The English and the French were at this time in open war with the Dutch, and it was necessary that a convoy of men-of-war should escort the East Indiamen to their destination, or as far down the Atlantic Ocean as was consistent with their safety, especially now that the Hollanders were in temporary possession of the Island of St. Helena. Our traveller met with very heavy weather beyond the English Channel, and he thus accounts for the 'mountain' seas in the 'sleepless Bay of Biscay' :—

"What makes these seas in such a turmoil is imputed to the falling in of the whole force of the Western Ocean into this Sinus without any impediment, till it recoil against its shores; so that in the calmest season here are always high-swelling billows." The fleet soon fell in with the Trade Winds, which for mariners "has yet this inconvenience, giving them leave now to fall into those distempers idleness contracts, *viz.*, the scurvy, and other ill habits; unless roused by an active commander either to sports or to more useful employments." At the Island of St. Iago, one of the Cape Verde group, some trade was done with the natives, who crowded to the shore and fearlessly mixed with the Europeans, bartering cocoes, oranges, limes, &c., "all at the price of a cleanly rag or a bunch of ribbons." It was here that Dr. Fryer for the first time enjoyed the luxury of a primitive bubble-bubble, which is thus described:—"A long reed as brown as a nut with use, inserted in the body of a cocoe-shell filled with water and a nasty hole just pressing the water, they ram tobacco in it uncut, out of which we make suck as long as we please, but for anything tell us as the poet did.

*Vina mihi non sunt Gazetica, chia, Falerna, Quæque serptano  
palmitæ missa bibas.*"

A curious disease termed 'calenture' broke out among the crew when the fleet had passed the equator, and which thinned their ranks. It was "a malignant fever with a frenzy, so that, if not watched, the patients leap into the sea." Those who survived the attack and were in a state of convalescence, were sent ashore when the ships arrived at the Island of Johanna, which they reached after a tempestuous voyage round the Cape of Good Hope. A change for the better in the health of the men was effected in an incredibly short space of time

"by feeding on oranges and fresh limes, and the very smell of the earth." Those whose case was considered desperate and who were carried to land in cradles, could take up their beds and walk in the course of twenty-four hours. The only precaution taken was to fetch them on board before nightfall, "that the misty vapours might not hinder the kind operation begun on their tainted mass of blood by these specific medicines of nature's own preparing." The inhabitants of Johanna, although Muhammadans, were like their prototypes on the coast of Africa, slaves to fetishism. One day while Dr. Fryer was walking in the country admiring its beauty, he happened to enter a house ; here he saw a man "writing with a pen made of cane, in the bottom of a bowl besmeared over with black ; considering awhile, at length I observed he made Arabian characters and aimed to draw a scheme, which when he had done, he poured water upon, and stirring it round with his finger, wiped it out again, and as he did this, muttered seriously to himself, doing it thrice. I watched what he intended, and found that a woman lay sick there, and this charm was her physic."

They had schools for educating their youth in Arabic, with the ultimate object of teaching them to read the Koran. In their places of instruction they were taught to write "by bundle of characters tied together to ape printing." What they made their impression upon our informant does not say, but paper was "not a despicable commodity among them."

Although flesh was quite common in the island, the usual diet of the people were the fruits of the earth. The way in which they killed fowls is thus described :—" Pulling first their feathers off to the wings, they by degrees raise the skin, after which torture they as slowly cut their throats, till they have finished a short litany, which is the priest's office, if at hand ; otherwise the good man of the house says grace."

Speaking of the cattle sometimes used as food by the inhabitants, he observes that the oxen were not as large as those to be found in Wales, "yet have this peculiarity, a bunch of fat betwixt their shoulders, which, eaten, tastes like marrow."

On reaching Mechilapatam (Masulipatam), the treasure sent out from England was landed on shore, and Dr. Fryer paid the town a visit. It was then under the occupation of the Moors. The way they contrived to obtain possession of the country from the Gentoos was this. The latter were distinguished by their different callings, and a member of a superior profession would neither marry nor associate with one of an inferior position in the guild. This consequently led to great discontent through the length and breadth of the land. The Brahmans, and next to them the Rashwaws or soldiers, lorded over the rest of the

population and treated them with contumely. The artificers, through whom the disaffection permeated to the other bodies of the community, called in the aid of the Moors, and thereby compassed not only the ruin of their enemies, but indirectly involved their own slavery, for no sooner was the Moorish General once safely ensconced on the throne than his real character developed itself. Instead of treating those by whose instrumentality he was raised to his present position with any degree of consideration, he treated all alike, and by constant demands on their purse squeezed them to penury.

The English factors at Mechlapatam used to keep great state, and were well attended both at home and on occasions of ceremonious visits to the governor of the place, or other functionaries ; but they had to exercise great caution in the preparation of their food, which was served up in plates of China. The Anglo-Indians of the seventeenth century shared in the belief current in some parts of India to the present day, that a peculiar composition of China when brought in contact with poison of any description cracks, and thus betrays the nature of the food. During the second occupation of Lucknow by our troops in 1858, a large quantity of these wares were destroyed in the royal palace. It is said that the king lived in such a wholesome terror of foul play that he never took his meals but out of these vessels. Whatever truth there may be in these popular beliefs, says Dr. Fryer, "since it (poisoning) is so much practised in this country by way of revenge, it is a necessary caution, by all means, to avoid." The modes in which the Moors executed justice on culprits were similar to those which prevail in other parts of the East. In capital cases the sentence was carried out suddenly, either by impaling them on stakes, or by cutting them in pieces, "which for murder is always begun by the nearest relation, who must be both prosecutor and executioner," assisted by the rabble which usually collect on such occasions. But the way in which the nobles of the land were punished was singular in the extreme. When one of them was adjudged an offender he was sent to a place called "Port," and made over to the tender mercies of the master of the Port, who first made him drink largely of a mixture of *bhang* and *datura*. This made him raving mad. In this state he was let loose in a splendid garden, there to make choice of the company of "apes and cats, dogs and monkeys," who were his only attendants and over whom he exercised his "humour of an assassin, usurper, miser, or what his genius led him to, whilst himself." He was thus kept incarcerated "during the pleasure of the king or he order his cure, to restore him to his senses again."

Bugs and mosquitoes were the plagues of the foreigners then as now, but net curtains and *punkhas* were unknown, for we are

told that "to arm themselves against this plague those that live here have fine Calicut lawn thrown over their beds, which though white as snow when put on shall be in an hour besmeared all over, which might be tolerable, did not their daring buzzes continually alarm, and sometimes more sensibly provoke, though, clothed with long breeches to their toes, and mufflers on their hands and face, and a servant to keep them from them with a fan, without which there is no sleeping. . . . . Chincus stick among the cotton and in rotten posts, whose bitings wheal most sadly, and if they strive to take a revenge for that abuse, and chance to squeeze them, they leave stink enough to choke them."

The Dutch fleet having left the Madras Roads, there was a safe passage for Dr. Fryer, who had the treasure re-shipped and proceeded to Madras. The town was then in the hands of the English, having been made over to them by one of the Naiks, or Prince of the Gentoos, ninety years before the period referred to, and forty years before the Moors possessed themselves of Mechlapatam. A sum of seven thousand pagodas was yearly paid to the King of Golcouda for royalties and customs. Sir William Langham, a "gentleman of indefatigable industry and worth," was then the agent of the Company, as well as the superintendent of all the factories on the Coromandel Coast as far as the Hooghly river. He was assisted in the government of the country by a court presided over by justiciaries, who exercised jurisdiction over all the inhabitants of the town with the exception of passing sentence of death on any of the "King's liege people of England." He had a bodyguard of three or four hundred native soldiers, and "a band of fifteen hundred men ready on summons." Of the population 300 were English, and as many thousands Portuguese, who had taken refuge there ten years previously, when the Moors wrested from their hands the Fort of St. Thomas. This latter was a city second in importance to none in India for riches and luxury, and had been the theatre of a conflict between the French, the Dutch, and the Moors, engaged in a death-struggle for the mastery of Southern India. Here it was that Dr. Fryer saw a tribe of people every one of whom was suffering from elephantiasis in one of the legs, which phenomenon was ascribed by the superstitious Portuguese to a visitation of Providence for the sins of their ancestors who had murdered 'the blessed Apostle St. Thomas.' Elsewhere he ascribes other reasons for this unnatural appearance in a whole community; (1) "by the venom of a certain snake, for which the jaugies or pilgrims furnish them with a fictitious stone (which we call a snake-stone) and is a counterpoison to all deadly bites; if it stick, it attracts the poison; and put it into milk, it recovers itself again, leaving its virulence therein, discovered by its greenness;" (2) "by drinking bad water.

(to which, as we to the air, they attribute all diseases) when they travel over the sands, and then lying down when they are hot, till the earth at night is in a cold sweat, which penetrating the rarified cuticle, fixes the humours by intercepting their free concourse on that side ; not to be remedied by any panacea of their Esculapian sectators."

Of the great Ruth at Tribleta four miles north of Madras he speaks thus :—" To this mother pagod at certain seasons of the year long pilgrimages are set on foot, at what time there is an innumerable concourse, whereat some of the visitants count it meritorious to be trod to death under a weighty chariot of iron made for the carriage of their deities, and with themselves lay their wives and children to undergo the self-martyrdom."

On the 1st of September 1673 a naval engagement took place between the Dutch and the English off the Bay of Pettipolee between Mechlapatam and Madras, in which the odds were greatly in favour of the former. The English might have avoided them if they chose, but preferring " to lye a battery for them than cowardly to flinch," intercepted the enemy's fleet, and regardless of the authority of the general, drew up in line-of-battle array. The first British vessel that suffered was the *Bombaim*, which bore off with eighty shots in her hull and was never more seen above water. Vice-Admiral Captain Hide of the *President* was taken prisoner after being wounded, and the *Sampson* was captured, but not till Rear-Admiral Captain Ernnig had been killed. But the hero of the day was the gallant Commander Golsbery of the *Antelope*, who fought to the last, and when he could no longer maintain his position, he sank the vessel rather than see it taken to Batavia. He and some of his men were however saved. The French were at hand and might have assisted the English, but the latter disdained to ask any help from them.

Dr. Fryer, in instituting a comparison between the policy of the East India Company and that of the Dutch in this country, expresses himself unfavourably of his countrymen. The latter, " as they gain ground, secure it by vast expenses, raising forts and maintaining soldiers. Ours are for raising auctions, and retrenching charges ; bidding the next age grow rich as they have done, but not affording them the means. . . . . who are for the present profit, not future emolument."

Neither *khush-khus tatties*, nor ice, that indispensable necessary in a tropical climate, were known in those days, and the methods devised to keep the room and liquor cool were of a primitive type. The excessive heat of the weather was repelled " by a coarse wet cloth, continually hanging before their chamber windows ; which not only resists the ambient air, but by the afflux of nitrous particles from within does cast a chilliness over the room ; without

which, the walls that for that intent are plastered, would be as hot, you could not abide your hand on them ; the same way they have of cooling their liquors, by a wet cloth wrapped about their gurgulet and jars, which are vessels made of a porous kind of earth ; the best of Mecha, reasonable good from Goa, which are carried with them in this nature wherever they travel."

Calicut was once the most flourishing mart on the Malabar Coast, but with the departure of the Portuguese to Goa its glory departed. The power and greatness of this people were all owing to the trade they carried on with this port. When they first visited it, upwards of 500 vessels carried the exports periodically all along the coasts of the Red Sea and the Persian Gulf overland to Aleppo or Constantinople, and thence to Venice, from which place the goods were sent to other parts of Europe, but after the passage to India by the Cape of Good Hope became the great highway of commerce, the overland trade declined for obvious reasons. Added to this, the jealousy of the Zamerhin (head of the Mahomedan clergy,) who ruined the Portuguese fortifications, compelled them to migrate to Goa.

The rivers in this part of the country swarmed with alligators, and the jungles were infested by tigers, but our traveller was told they committed no ravages either on human beings or on cattle, owing, as the natives supposed, to a charm which the Brahmins laid them under.

The next port visited was Bombay, of which a short history is appended. After Vasco de Gama had rounded the Cape and laid the seas open to traffic, the Portuguese took possession of it, along with the other islands on the coast, till the year 1661, when, on the marriage of Charles II. of England with Donna Infanta Catherine, sister of the reigning King of Portugal, they were made over to the English as a portion of her dower. Even at that time Bombay was considered to be the key of the East Indies, not only as regarded the protection it afforded to ships trading with the country, and facilities for commerce, but also for keeping in check those who disturbed our trade. The Government of James II sent out a fleet of five royal ships with a viceroy on board, under the command of Lord Malbery, to take possession of the settlements in the name of the British nation, but the Portuguese governor and his advisers taking advantage of the distance of the mother country from India, and treating these ports as their own property, and consequently at their disposal, refused to allow the viceroy to land. Lord Malbery perceiving his critical position changed his tactics, landing 500 men with Sir Abraham Shipman on the barren and inhospitable shore of Swally near Surat. The sight of the troops and the manœuvres they went through after the European fashion so awed the Moors, that the

English governor of the latter place begged of them to disembark, failing which the factory would fall a sacrifice to the Moors. Lord Malbery next landed his men at Angadiva, an unhealthy and uninhabited island. After a little parleying, the Portuguese consented to evacuate Bombay and the Bay in favour of the English upon condition that the "Royalties" should belong to the new arrivals, but "every particular man's estate to the right owner, and the liberty of their own ceremonies in religion, upon their oath of allegiance." In the meantime Sir Abraham Shipman and 300 of his troops succumbed to the influence of the noxious climate, the violence of the rains, against which they provided no protection, but mainly to their intemperate ways of living. Mr. Cook was then sent to succeed him, and he returned in A.D. 1664 to Bombay with the men that were left. They found the place scantily provided with the means of defence; for the former occupants, having been enervated by a long residence in a warm climate, abounding with wealth and undisturbed by war, had declined in manly virtues, and had given themselves up to pleasure and its concomitant evils, lust, rapine and riot. The only relic of their ancient worth was represented by four brass guns, an ill-fortified house, and a few chambers in small towers which were used for driving away the natives who paid periodical visits to these settlements, carrying fire and sword to the villages, destroying those who offered opposition and dragging the rest into eternal and intolerable captivity. Mr. Commandant Cook was the first governor of Bombay, but owing to some malpractices was replaced by Sir Gervis King from England. This able administrator, who promised to settle the affairs of the Company, died on the passage out. Captain Gary succeeded him, but he too was displaced for playing into the hands of the commanders of Her Majesty's ships, to whom he rendered accounts, and not to the King. In this emergency the government was entrusted to the keeping of the respectable merchants of the island. The interests of the military, however, being opposed to those of the merchants, there was consequently an interruption of good feeling between them, and with it a corresponding loss to the Company. Sir George Oxendine was the first governor under the new constitution. As it was necessary for the interests of his employers that he should remain at Surat, he appointed Mr. Goodyear his deputy at Bombay. Sir George having shortly after "finished his days, together with his presidency at Surat," Goodyear hastened thither in hopes of advancing his future, but his avarice cost him his former post as well as that which he now coveted. An interregnum followed, and a body of merchants, five in number, constituted themselves the government until the appointment of the Hon'ble Gerald.

Aungier to the office of president. He was obliged to change his deputies pretty often for one reason or another, and lastly, owing to the insolence of the Moghul governors of Surat, and fearing fresh troubles in Bombay, came over there in 1671, after narrowly escaping shipwreck, and undertook the personal management of the island. But such a change had, in the meantime, been effected in strengthening the defences of the place, that when the Dutch attempted to descend upon it in the spring of the same year, they found it so strong that they were glad to escape without striking a blow. During the early period of our occupation of the fort, the residents were put to great straits for want of water. Rain water was generally collected in tanks and as the quantity thus preserved was generally consumed before the next monsoon, they had to dig wells, but their contents were generally brackish, and those who could afford had it brought all the way from Massegoung (Mazagon).

At Maijam there was the tomb of a Mohammedan peer, a prophet held in great veneration by the natives who crowded to it in numbers to lay their offerings at his shrine. To this worthy was ascribed the miraculous gift of pluri-presence, for it was said by his devotees that during his lifetime a great fire had occurred in Mecca, which he was instrumental in quenching before the flames spread to the prophet's tomb, although he was at the same time present in body at Maijam.

Now for a description of the legal machinery of the Government of Bombay as it was in the days of Dr. Fryer. The soldiers were governed by martial law, the freemen by the common law, the chief arbitrator being the president with his council at Surat. Under him again was the judiciary and court of pleas, with a committee for the regulation of affairs and presenting all complaints.

"The President has a large commission, and is *vice regis*; he has a council here also, and a guard when he walks or rides about, accompanied with a party of horse, which are constantly kept in the stables, either for pleasure or service. He has his chaplains, physicians, chyrurgeons, and domestics; his linguist and mint-master. At meals he has his trumpets to usher in his courses, and soft music at the table. If he move out of his chamber, the silver staves wait on him; if downstairs, the guard receive him; if he go abroad, the Bandarines and Moors under two standards march before him. He goes sometimes in his coach drawn by large milk-white oxen, sometimes on horseback, other times in palanquins carried by *Kahars*, Musulman porters." Under all this outward magnificence and prosperity there was a serious drawback in the climate of the place, which was so unhealthy as to earn the designation of a 'charnel house.' At first it was

attributed to rotten fish, but though this was prohibited it still continued to be deadly to an extreme degree. Among other causes, Dr. Fryer ascribes the noxiousness of the climate "to the situation, which causes an infecundity in the earth, and a putridness in the air, what being produced seldom coming to maturity, whereby what is eaten is undigested." But he imputes all the miseries of the people to the two fruitful evils of every large town, *viz.*, immoderate consumption of spirits, and prostitution with its attendant contagious diseases. To prevent the latter, or rather partially avert its consequences and to propagate the colony, the Company sent out English women, but these begot a sickly generation, "which (not to reflect on what creatures are sent abroad) may be attributed to their living at large, not debarring themselves wine and strong liquor, which, immoderately used, inflames the blood, and spoils the milk in these hot countries, as Aristotle long ago declared. The natives abhor all heady liquors, for which reason they prove better nurses," and as the Dutch shrewdly observed, those thrrove well who came of a mixed parentage, that is, of a European father and Indian mother. Notwithstanding the heavy mortality among the English, the country people and the naturalized Portuguese, according to the testimony of Dr. Fryer, lived to a good old age, which was the reward of their temperance, neither drinking hard nor living exclusively on meat. After describing in detail the horrors of the climate and the miseries of an Anglo-Indian existence, questioning the sanity of his motives in exchanging the comforts of his island home with its bracing atmosphere, for the vile climate of the East, Dr. Fryer yet finds that there is balm in Gilead, for he says, "in this difficulty it would hardly be worth a sober man's while, much less an ingenuous man's, who should not defile his purer thoughts, to be wholly taken up with such mean (not to say indirect) contemplations; however, a necessary adjunct, wealth, may prove to buoy him up on the surface of repute, lest the vulgar serve him as Æsop's frogs did their first revered deity."

Our traveller next paid a visit to Bassein, a Portuguese settlement, being invited thither by one John de Mendos, of a noble family, to afford medical relief to his only daughter, a handsome girl betrothed to the Admiral of the North, though she had not completed her twelfth year. Within a week he effected a cure and returned to Bombay. In describing the natural beauties of the place, he takes especial notice of the nest of the bird familiarly known as the *baya*, which "is not only exquisitely curious in the artificial composure of its nest with bay, but furnished with devices and stratagems to secure itself and young ones from its deadly enemy, the squirrel; as likewise from the injury of the weather; which being unable to oppose, it eludes

with this artifice, contrives the nest like a steeple hive with winding meanders ; before which hangs a pent-house for the rain to pass, tying it by so slender a thread to the bough of the tree, that the squirrel dare not venture his body, though his mouth water at the eggs and prey within ; yet it is strong enough to bear the hanging habitations of the ingenious contriver, free from all the assaults of its antagonists, and all the accidents of gusts and storms. Hundreds of these pendulous nests may be seen on these trees." He was so much struck by the exquisite ingenuity displayed by these animals in the construction of their nests, that he questions the theory which denies reason to the lower orders of creation, unless on the absurd supposition that an undue share of it having been reserved for humanity, there was scarcely any left in which the others could participate.

About this time the renowned robber chief Sivaji had, by the aid of his bold and adventurous spirit, possessed himself of a principality, and it was deemed necessary by the English to send to his Court an ambassador and two factors to ask some concessions for the advancement of trade, and to urge the conclusion of a peace with the Syddy of Banda Rajapur, who was besieged in his stronghold. Sivaji being away from Rairee, his capital, the English envoy was met at the foot of the hills by his procurator Narainji. On the return of the former from Pertabghur, where he had gone on a pilgrimage to visit the shrine of the god Bhavani preparatory to his coronation, the Englishmen were received with every mark of respect suited to their position, and were referred to Moro Pundit the Peishwa. After the usual exchange of compliments, and the present of bribes compulsory on such occasions, the business of the day commenced. The Raja agreed to ratify all their demands with the exception of two, which showed rather plainly that he was not an indifferent financier and political economist. He refused to allow coin issued from the British mint to go current in his dominions, and to restore any wrecks that might be cast ashore on his territories, belonging to England and to the inhabitants of Bombay. The reasons he gave for his refusal were very sound. Although he did not object to "the passing of any manner of coins," he yet could not insist on his subjects accepting the money of the English at a price not commensurate with their weight or value ; but if their coin be as fine an alloy, and as weighty as the Moghul's and other Princes, he will not prohibit it. With regard to the other point, if he granted them the concession asked for, he would be compelled, out of equitable considerations, to grant the same privilege to the French, the Dutch, and other merchants, and thus break through a custom not only sanctioned by the lapse of ages, but which at the same time yielded a handsome yearly

revenue. Ultimately he proved more pliable and was prevailed upon to concede the point about the wrecks, though he would not on any account consent to a forcible adoption of their current coin. The favourite food of the people of Rairee was *cutchory*, "a sort of pulse and rice mixed together and boiled in butter, with which they grow fat." As such a diet could not be palatable to Englishmen, the Raja ordered meat to be supplied for their use, and the services of the only butcher in the place were called into requisition. The ambassador and suite consumed half a goat a day, and the butcher was so well pleased with his earnings, that although an old man, he took the trouble of climbing the hill to gratify his curiosity with the sight of the gentlemen "who had taken off his hands more flesh in that time they had been there than he had sold in some years before; so rare a thing it is to eat flesh among them; for the Gentiles eat none, and the Moors and Portugals eat it well stewed, baked, or made into pottage; no nation eating it roasted so commonly as we do. And on this point I doubt we err in these hot countries, where our spirit being always upon the flight, are not so intent on the business of concoction, so that those things that are easiest digested and that create the least trouble to the stomach, we find by experience to agree best here."

According to Dr. Fryer there were two descriptions of vermin in Surat—fleas and banians. It was a treat to see one of the former fasten on a banian, what shifts he had recourse to, to get rid of his tormentor, which he dare not destroy for fear of unhousing a soul, in accordance with the notion the natives of the country entertain in regard to the transmigration of the soul. The only way to get rid of this pest was to give it a smart pinch and hold a small piece of cotton-wool over it, into which the flea immediately ensconced itself. But this was nothing compared to the banian himself. If a flea sucked one's blood only, and caused a slight irritation, the other in addition cheated him out of his money into the bargain. They are indigenous to the soil of India where they thrive remarkably well. From time immemorial they have lived on the fat of the land. In every large town the irrepressible *dullals* were seen proffering their services to strangers. No sooner a European set his foot on shore, he was immediately beset by a crowd of these harpies, who harassed him with their importunities, and unless one was prepared to show a bold front to them they never ceased in their solicitations till they draw something from him however small in the form of a gratuity. Although acknowledged to be worse than Jews in their dealings, yet no business could be transacted without their assistance. They were exclusively employed by the servants of the Company as brokers, and were allowed two per cent in the

bargain, besides what they could secretly squeeze out of the articles purchased by the English, of which the latter were ignorant for want of knowledge of the language. But this, in the opinion of the doctor, was a matter for congratulation, as in the event of any of their employers trying to pry into their actions they ran the risk of being poisoned. To prevent being cheated on any large scale, the Company entertained the services of a Hindustani teacher, and offered encouragement to young men, by the presentation of annuities, to master the art of reading and writing the vernacular languages, which few attempted and fewer still attained. European sailors who frequented the ports were the unsuspecting victims of the banian, who regularly fleeced them before they had been any length of time in the country. As a body, the *dallals* were "the absolute mass of sordidness, faring hardly and professing fairly to entrap the wary enduring servilely foul words, affronts and injuries, for a future hope of gain, expert in all the studied arts of thriving and insinuation, so that lying, dissembling, cheating, are their masterpiece: their whole desire is to have money pass through their fingers to which a great part is sure to stick: for they well understand the constant turning of cash amounts both to the credit and profit of him that is so occupied."

The trading establishment of the East India Company was composed of three classes, merchants, factors, and writers, besides blue-coat boys, who were first entertained as apprentices for seven years, and if, after the term of probation, proved themselves useful, were employed on pay on furnishing security. The writers were obliged to serve for five years on a salary of £10 per annum, giving a bond for £500 for good behaviour. On proof of competency, they were promoted to the rank of factors, their wages being increased to £20 annually. The next step, after a further period of three years' trial, was to the merchant's class on a yearly salary of £40. The council in Surat were selected out of the last mentioned class. The members, five in number, composing it took their oaths of office and were permanent residents of the place. The president was selected out of the members of the council, but subject to confirmation by the East India Company. He drew £500 a year, half of which was paid here and the other half in England as a check in case of his being guilty of any misdemeanour. The council always supplied deputy governors to Bombay and agents to Persia, the former a place of great trust and the other one of profit. The Presidency of Surat was superior to that of any other in India, with the exception of the agency of Bantam which, owing to its importance and the heavy responsibilities attached thereto, was subsequently created a distinct charge. An extensive trade in cloth was diverted to this

channel, in exchange for dollars. But notwithstanding the keen competition of the latter, Surat was, nevertheless, the Queen of Eastern Seas. From China rich cargoes of sugar, tea, porcelain, lacquered ware, quicksilver and copper, were wafted periodically to the western shores of India; cowries and sea-shells from Siam and the Phillipine Islands, gold and elephant's tusks from Sumatra, in exchange for corn. Persia supplied drugs; Carmania wool, and Mocha coffee. These were some of the chief sources from which the Company derived their profits, besides inland trade with Agra, Calicut, Rajapur, Carwar and other towns. The exclusive monopoly, however, interfered with the profits, for during some years previous to the arrival of Dr. John Fryer they hardly covered the expenses, till Bombay was thrown open as a free port. This concession was granted shortly after the restoration, when a president was sent out to carry into effect the Company's charter, and to establish a gradation among the servants, the want of which had created a good deal of heart-burning and jealousies among them. The inhabitants of Surat were an orderly and respectful set, with the two exceptions of soldiers and sailors, and wandering mendicants. It was perfect madness to oppose the former when in a state of inebriety, but if left to themselves, they generally vented their fury by opening a vein or two with their own swords, at times cutting themselves most barbarously. As for the latter, the immunity they enjoyed owing to their being held in veneration by native society, emboldened them at times to the extent of openly defying the majesty of the law; for on a certain occasion one of their fraternity having offered violence to a nobleman of the Moors, was taken up by the police; but they unanimously rose in defence of him, and rescued the aggressor from the punishment he so richly merited, in the teeth of a body of troops, mustering more than four hundred horse and foot, which attended the Court of the governor every morning to guard his person and assist the police in carrying out his orders on refractory delinquents. But it must not be supposed that the poor people who earned their bread by the sweat of the brow escaped punishment however unmerited. The slightest pretence was made use of to extort money from them, the most fruitful source of oppression being the impressment into the service of the governor of artizans and labourers. A short episode on the everyday life of the people is given by Dr. Fryer, a bare perusal of which makes one's blood run cold with horror. On one occasion it led to a serious *émeute* in which several lives were lost. It was thus brought about. A Pathan having employed a tailor in his house, a soldier usually hanging about the Court forcibly seized him for his master's service, and on the Pathan attempting to release him, the soldier ran his sword

through the body of a younger brother of the Pathan, who was standing by an unconcerned spectator of the scuffle. This so exasperated the other brother that he wrenched the sword out of the assailant's hand, killing him and two others who came to his rescue. Then, entering his house, he killed his own wife, sister, and a son, knowing full well what would be their fate if they fell into the clutches of the governor and his myrmidons; thus saving them from an ignominous death which surely awaited them at the hands of the infuriated soldiery. The tailor taking courage at the conduct of the Pathan slew his own father and mother. News of the affray having reached the governor, he came with a large body of troops to despatch these two men; but although more than a thousand armed soldiers faced the Pathan, they dare not attack him, standing with his sword open at the entrance of the house. An unconditional pardon was then offered by a nobleman, and while they were holding a parley, two men who had been posted on the top of a house above their heads armed with matchlocks, fired at and wounded them mortally. But the game was not yet finished. In their desperation and while their life-blood was oozing out, they made a last and successful dash in which they not only despatched the false nobleman but some of his attendants too. It must not be supposed that these were rare occurrences; on the contrary, there was nothing so common as blood-shed in the streets of an Indian town on the most trivial of occasions. Those who could afford to buy off punishment by the payment of a sum of money, as a matter of course compounded for their offences in this way. Taxation upon sin was, in those days, not an inconsiderable branch of the public revenue, and nearly all misdeeds were punished by the payment of money. As these imposts helped to swell the king's treasury, it was not to be expected that his officers would be very vigilant in checking crimes which augmented the royal income. On the contrary, every inducement was held out to offenders to persist in their iniquities. The general sentiment of reverence for law gradually died out, and brute force alone addressed itself to the understanding of the multitude. Although our moral sense is outraged at the idea of identifying a ruler's interests with the crimes of the people, yet it was desirable that offences should be punished in some shape or other, rather than not punished at all. A case in point is cited by Dr. Fryer. A rich man having surprised his wife in the act of adultery with her paramour, killed her and a child three years old, and was excused on the imposition of a pecuniary fine. But a boy was let off with commendation for sticking a Moor through the heart with his own dagger for attempting to commit an unnatural crime. It must not, however, be supposed that the vindi-

cation of the law was altogether ignored in the case of those who could not afford to pay for their offences, or for heinous crimes when they were brought to the notice of the Emperor. A goldsmith having manufactured counterfeit rupees, the officers of the law had his head and beard first shaved "as our countrymen," says Dr. Fryer, "do bailiffs when they presume to arrest in privileged places." They then put a fool's cap on his head, set him on an ass with his face towards the tail, attended by a man of a low caste beating a drum. In this manner he was led up and down the city where the boys and soldiers treated him with all ignominy until his return to prison, where his hands were cut off and he was detained during the governor's pleasure.

*Thugs* were in those days the terror of the country. The way they went about their murderous work was to lurk about the bushes along the highways, and "as they found opportunity, by a device of a weight tied to a cotton bowstring made of guts (with which they tew cotton) of some length, they used to throw it upon passengers so, that winding it about their necks, they pulled them from their beasts and dragging them upon the ground strangled them and possessed themselves of what they had." Fifteen of these were once captured, among whom was a juvenile Dick Turpin, a Jack Sheppard, who would have been an honour to any band of outlaws that ever cumbered the earth with their malignant existence. Although not yet fourteen years of age, he proudly boasted while being led to execution that he had already committed fifteen murders. The banians tried every manner of means to have their offences commuted to fines, but an express arriving from the emperor, they were all hanged close to the scene of their dastardly exploits; before life was extinct, the arteries of the feet were divided with a knife, while they were in their death-struggle. The bodies were allowed to remain suspended from the trees, food for carrion and crows, as examples to evil-doers.

Outside the town of Surat were the English, Dutch and Moorish cemeteries. Among the men of note whose remains lay interred there, were those of a Persian ambassador who had paid a visit to England in company with Sir Anthony Shirley, and on his return having committed himself in the management of his affairs, poisoned himself rather than fall a victim to his master's rage. At a short distance from this grave were the last resting-places of "Tom Coriat, our English Fakier (as they name him), together with an Armenian Christian, known by their graves lying east and west. He was so confident of his perfection in the Indostan tongue, that he ventured to play the orator in it before the great Moghul. In his return from him he was killed with kipp-

ness by the English merchants, which laid his rambling brains at rest."

Dr. Fryer's account of the austerities practised by Hindu devotees, would appear apocryphal at first sight, but that we have his assurance that he was an eye-witness of what he describes in his work. He saw a faqeer whose nails had grown through the flesh, he having kept his fist closed for a great length of time; another with his arms dislocated, the extremities of the joints being inverted, and the bend of the bone lying in the pit of the arm. The arms being deprived of nourishment hung as useless appendages to the body. But the man who accomplished the following feat of enduring the "purgatory of five fires" for a whole day, was not only an object of great veneration with the common people who worshipped him as a demi-god, but was looked upon with wonder by our worthy doctor, who is at a loss to account for this surprising performance. A festival being about to be solemnized, a large concourse of people gathered from early daylight, when the faqeer who was to undergo the ordeal ascended "a four square stage or altar, with three ascents, some two feet high and as many square."

As the sun began to grow warm, he rose from his seat, "blessed himself with holy water and threw himself along on the lowest square, still muttering to himself on his knees; he at length, with one leg bowed upright between his thighs, rises on the other, telling his beads, (which both Mooromen and Gentoos wear), which he had in his hands a quarter long, and stands, like a goose, unmoved all the time; then casting himself down, he exercised himself as wrestlers do here very briskly, but guarding the position of his leg, which he kept so fixed as if it had grown in that nature, as well when he rose as he grovelled on the ground; acting thus a quarter more, it had the same operation as the stork's bill used as a suppository, for it brought him to a stool; he taking a purifying pot in his hand, marched on one side, where he tarried not long before he returning took up his beads he had left; and in this interim four fires being kindled (anyone of them able to roast an ox) at each corner of the upper and least square, he having finished some fopperies with his pot, Scavola-like with his own hands he increased the flames by adding combustible stuff as incense to it, when removing from his neck a collar of great wooden beads, he made a coronet of them for his head; then bowing his head in the middle of the flames, as it were to worship holding the other beads in his hands, with his head encircled between his arms, his face opposite to the sun, which is the fifth fire, he mounted his body with his feet bolt upright, and so continued standing on his head the space of three hours very steadily, that is from nine till twelve; after which he seats

himself on his bench cross-legged after their way of sitting, and remains so without either eating or drinking all the rest of the day, the fires still nourished, and he sweating (being one of a good athletic habit and of a middle age) as if basted in his own grease."

The science of medicine was but imperfectly understood in India during the last quarter of the seventeenth century, and surgery was completely unknown. As there were no tests of proficiency for practitioners, anyone who was bold enough to impose on the credulity of his countrymen set up as a physician, though at times the practice of physic was looked upon as hereditary in certain families. Quacks multiplied *ad libitum*, and where every one ventured, there every one suffered. Cholera was then, as now, the scourge of the land. It was called *mordisheen* by the Portuguese, who applied "cawteries most unmercifully," but what was the nature of this remedy, we are not told, nor the mode of application. In fevers, cooling draughts were prescribed, "till they extinguished the vital heat," and such of the patients whose constitution enabled them to conquer both the disease and the remedies, contracted jaundice, dropsy, and other chronic maladies. Owing to a belief current among the natives and the Moors that to dissect a corpse was to desecrate "the human form divine," anatomy was not even known by name among them. Phlebotomy or general bleeding was consequently ignored; but they "worried themselves to death by leeches, clapping on a hundred at once, which they know not how to pull off, till they have filled themselves and drop of their own accord." Any regular system of pharmacy was neglected, the apothecaries being perfumers or druggists, who made up their own medicines "which are generally such draughts, that if their own energy work not, yet the very weight must force an operation." A barber who undertook to cure a case of bloody flux, pretended that the "guts of the patient were displaced, and laying him on his back, and gently tickling his veins, thrust on each side the abdomen with all his strength: then placing a pot filled with dried earth, like that of Samos, upon his navel, he made it fast by a ligature; and on some bodies thus treated he had gained credit, but this died." Midwifery was in esteem among the rich; "the poorer, while they are labouring or planting, go aside as if to do their needs, deliver themselves, wash the child, and lay it in a clout or hammock, and return to work again."

On the right bank of the river on which Surat is situated, there was a small settlement of Parsees; the tract of land occupied by them was not considerable, being confined to forty miles along the sea-coast, and twenty miles inland. These were the descendants of the ancient Persian fire-worshippers, who, flying from their

native country before the Caliphs, found a safe refuge in western India, and were allowed to settle there on condition that they did not "kill any beasts or living creatures." On the Moslem conquest of the country, they considered themselves no longer bound by their former obligations, and returned to their old habits of living on fish and meat; out of respect, however, for the religious feelings of their new masters, but more probably from a motive of policy, they refrained from eating pork.\* Their manners and customs find prominent mention in Dr. Fryer's book. He says, "they worship the sun and keep at Nundarry a Delubrium, where is always a fire (first kindled by the sun) kept alive as the Holy Vestal Nuns were wont; they adore all the elements, and if at any time they go to a voyage, will not exonerate on the sea or on the water, but have jars on purpose; if their houses be on fire, they quench them not with water, rather choosing to load them with dust or sand." One of the wives of the governor of Jeeneah, a garrison town in the dominion of the great Moghul, having been taken ill, Dr. Fryer was invited to his court, not very far from Bombay. Accompanied by a strong escort of horse and foot, the doctor arrived at his destination after some adventures by flood and field. As the customs of the country would not permit a woman of position, even in a case of emergency, to appear unveiled before a stranger, he was conducted to an apartment where a thick curtain hid from his sight the patient whom he was to treat. An arm then protruded from behind the hangings. On feeling the pulse, the disciple of Galen immediately discovered that it was an imposition, as it was that of an individual "sound and free from disease." Another arm was then held out "which demonstrated a weak and languid constitution," and collecting the signs and symptoms he gave his opinion of her complaint which met with their approbation. The next day his services were again brought into requisition, as another of the governor's wives was suffering from plethora, and he recommended bleeding. A gorgeous curtain was once more extended across the room and "an arm held forth at a hole," but the cords that held the curtain being very slight, the pressure against it of so many ladies, whose curiosity led them to seek a glimpse of the Englishman, made the silken supports snap, and discovered "the whole bevy, fluttering like so many birds when a net is cast over them; yet none of them sought to escape, but feigned a shame-facedness, continued looking through

\* What was at first obedience to double abstinence has had time to authority became a second nature, grow into a custom of their tribe, and the Parsees to this day abstain and custom in the East is a religion. from beef and pork. Though not Mill on Liberty, note to page 50. recognized by their religion, the

the wide lattice of their fingers." His patient, however, "summoning the remainder of her blood to enliven her cheeks (for among the darkest blacks, the passions of fear, anger, or joy, are discernible enough in the face) and she bearing a command, caused it to be hung up again: pouring upon her extravasated blood a golden shower of pagodas which I made a man fish for."

During his stay in this part of the country, he visited the ruins of the once famous city of Dungeness, an interesting place from an antiquarian's point of view. It was entirely cut out of a solid rock, containing a temple of great antiquity and other spacious buildings. Time, however, had not dealt very cruelly with it, and the lines of its beauty and magnificence were preserved and still legible, though in old characters. At the time of the doctor's visit it was a desolate place frequented by bats and wasps, to disturb which was dangerous, the latter pursuing the aggressors to a great distance, for which reason our traveller had to beat a hasty retreat, as well as to secure himself "from the surprise of any disturbed idolator who might bellow the report" of his having violated the sanctity of the temple. On his way back to Bombay, he had to pass at night through a forest, such as abounded in these parts. Suddenly some of the trees appeared to be in flames, and the next moment all was dark. This wonderful sight struck the coolies with horror and amazement, and they unanimously made up their mind to set him down and shift for themselves. He, however, cut one or two with his sword, and by bleeding a man who was said to be possessed with the devil, let *shitan* out. On approaching within a reasonable distance, he found the cause of these fitful flashes to be fire-flies, "which the sultry heat and moisture had generated into being, the certain prodromers of the ensuing rain that followed from the hills."

At a place called Hubly on the western coast, he came across a people called *Linguits*, among whom it was customary to bury the dead in an upright posture. When their wives desired to offer themselves sacrifices to the manes of their deceased husbands, they descended into the pit intended for the latter, and were covered up with earth to their shoulders. After certain ceremonies were gone through, their necks were wrung and the pit filled with earth.

Dr. Fryer had evidently a wholesome dread of the Inquisition, for while on a visit to the Portuguese settlement of Goa, he was shown a church on the walls of which was painted the story of a ship, how it was brought all the way from the Cape of Good Hope by miraculous agency, during the short space of one night, and fixed on the site where the church had subsequently been built. As there was a great scarcity of wood, the miracle was performed with the sole object of supplying timber for the roof.

The traveller did not ask any questions for fear of being victimized by the minister of that "horrible tribuual," the Inquisition. This institution, which was originally devised for the extermination of the Jews and Moors, whom the Christians of the earlier centuries looked upon as little better than the beasts of the field, was afterwards carried to every corner of the globe where the standard of Ferdinand and Isabella had been planted. From punishing pagans its use extended to heretics. When the jurisdiction of the Holy Office of condemning unoffending humanity to the stake and the gallows was enlarged, its baneful influences were felt far and wide, and the savages of India and America were taught to shudder at the very name of Christianity, under pretext of advancing the cause of which benign religion such enormities were perpetrated. In the principal market-place of the town Dr. Fryer saw a structure of great height, like a gallows, with a pulley at the top, and steps leading to it. On enquiry he found it was the strapado, an invention for dislocating with torture the joints of the inquisitor's victims, who would not recant, or against whom existed the slightest suspicion of having 'relapsed.' Opposite this place was the Jesuit's Golgotha, where those condemned were consigned to the flames, after being exposed to the insults of the multitude, dressed in the most horrid shapes of imps and devils, and delivered to the executioner. Others who had been branded with the names of 'jetisceroes' or charmers, were released to work at the powder mills. St. Jaines being the titular deity of Goa, a general gaol delivery was made of those unhappily entrapped into the inquisition on the day consecrated to this saint, and that nothing might mar the ceremony or detract from its awfulness, a great cavalcade of priests and laymen proceeded to the cathedral, previous to honouring the *auto da fe* with their presence, and on every fidalgo who took part in the procession was conferred the honour of being the patron of one of these wretches.

Among the Rajas of Southern India was one at Sarampatam whose mode of warfare was so different from that of any of his neighbours that Dr. Fryer goes out of his way to notice it in particular. This potentate being troubled with religious scruples as to the justification of killing any living animal, and yet being compelled to take up arms in self-defence, he trained his soldiers to use with great dexterity an instrument with which they seized the noses of their enemies, whether in camp or in the field, and cut them off. This, because it deformed them, so abashed the remainder that few cared to engage with this humane Raja's forces.

Chapter VI. of Dr. Fryer's book, containing "a summary

rehearsal of the whole," is by far the most interesting portion of it, the only drawback being that it does not extend beyond twenty-five pages. If the traveller had enlarged on the subjects he treats of here, instead of wasting his valuable labours in describing with minuteness the petty wars in the Deccan, it would have enhanced its value, and not merely excited our curiosity.

The Indians of the seventeenth century divided the day and night throughout the year into twelve hours of equal length. They had no watches to mark the divisions of time, but measured it by "the dropping of water out of a brass basin, which held a ghong, or less than half an hour." When once the water ran out, they struck one and so on, till the number eight, which answered to a 'prohore'; this was sounded on the brass vessel. At midday they sounded another 'prohore,' which was repeated at the end of every three hours according to our calculation. At the end of each of the former divisions of time, the priests ascended the steeples of the mosques, calling the faithful to prayers.

The year was divided into three seasons:—*Neu colla*, the rainy season, *Ger colla*, the cold season, and *Deup colla*, the hot season. With the exception of a few wet days in May, the rains did not set in till the middle of June, during which period there was a good deal of sickness all over the country, but when the rainy season once fairly commenced, the general health was good, continuing so throughout the cold weather with the intermission of a few days in October, when "the sun exhaling vapours, the earth grows muddy and stinking," though abundantly productive. There were two harvests gathered during the course of the year, one towards the latter end of January and the other about the beginning of October when the rains ceased. Another harvest in March is also spoken of, but it was rather scanty and produced with great difficulty, as the great heat dried up the water and the fields were irrigated by means of aqueducts.

Dr. Fryer was deluded into the belief that the jungles were inhabited by solitary beings called "men of the woods," and the rivers by nereids. The latter, he says, died as soon as they were brought out of their native element, but as specimens of the former he saw a couple imprisoned in a parrot-cage. They generally slept throughout the day, and when in a wild state roved about at night hunting for their food. The head resembled that of an owl, the body that of a monkey but without the tail. The first finger of the right hand was armed with a claw similar to that of birds of prey; in other respects they were like human beings, having hands and feet as we have, and walking upright, "not pronely as beasts do." Their colour was like that of a fox, but they were of diminutive form, the length not being over half a

yard, though they were said to increase in size till their twelfth year, at which age they reach maturity.

Dr. Fryer divides the population of India into five distinct classes or 'sects':—

- I Gentoos. (Considered by him the aborigines.)
- II Moghuls. The conquerors of India by land.
- III Portuguese. The conquerors of India by sea.
- IV Dutch, English, &c. Strangers, partly by conquest, partly by trade.
- V Parsees. By permission.

He further divides the Gentoos into gymnosophists, Brahmins or book-men, Rashpoots or soldiers, merchants and mechanics, laborers, peasants, combies, coolies, frassies, and holeucores.

The Brahmins were distinguished by the two divisions of Butts and Sinais. In ancient times they were all one, but the difference was occasioned by a famine in the low countries, in which for want of any other food some of them were compelled to eat fish to avoid the alternative of starvation. For this they were despised by the other class who adhered to abstinence from all living creatures, even at the risk of their lives, and retained their reputation for holiness unsullied. To the Butts were confided the profound mysteries of their religion, some devoting their entire existence to meditation alone, while others took to the practice of physic and to imparting instruction to pupils in the Hindu canon law. They were also the repositories of such of the sciences as were then understood.

The Sinai's were trained for secular offices generally. This class supplied their fighting bishops, descis or farmers of king's revenue, pundits, governors of towns and provinces, physicians, accountants, scribes and interpreters. The Brahman's ideas of the Supreme Being were, as a matter of course, peculiar to the times in which they lived. The Godhead was, in their opinion, incomparable, but in some of their languages the name of hell was unknown. Their notions of cosmogony were curious in the extreme, founded on puerile stories and fables. The transmigration of the soul was one of the principal items of their faith, which they derived partly from Plato and partly from Pythagoras. It was accordingly a current belief among them that princes and rajas appeared again on earth, after a revolution of time, and in proportion to their merits or demerits, their soul took the forms of different animals as a means of expiating the sins committed in the body. Fortified by these assurances the women freely immolated themselves on the funeral pyres of their husbands, in hopes of returning to the scenes of their former labours great and famous, "after they had passed the limbo of transmigration with their lords and masters." In the

meantime they were canonized by their relatives and kindred. The Brahmans cultivated magic and judicial astrology, and were consulted on all occasions by their countrymen as well as by the Moors. Grammar and rhetoric were also their favourite studies, some of them being masters of Persian, Hindustani, Arabic and Sanscrit and the dialects of Southeru India. Their sonnets and poems were written in the Carnatic tongue, which "being softer and more melting than the others," was specially adapted for such species of composition. The Gentoo philosophers "maintained an Aristotelian vacuity."

Dr. Fryer declares himself ignorant of the desired perfection to which the natives attained in the science and art of music, as he confesses his incompetency to judge of such matters; yet they observed time and measure in their singing and dancing, "and were mightily delighted with their tumbling and noise." On the other hand they disliked English music, and stringed instruments in particular, which "failed to strike their hard-to-be-raised fancies, but our organs were the music of the spheres with them, charming them to listen as long as they play." Arithmetic being in great vogue amoung all classes of the community, it was best understood by them, and they had such a natural gift for acquiring it that, without the help of pen and ink, they could count up the most intricate sum in an incredibly short space of time, without once hesitating. There were not a great variety of materials used for writing purposes. Some wrote on dried cocoa-leaves by means of an iron style, such as the Ooriahs of the present day commonly use; others again wrote with pens made of reeds enclosed in a brass case, which held the ink also. These they carried about in their girdles.

Next in rank to the Brahmans were the Rashpoots, who supplied the ranks of the fighting class, never embracing any other profession but that of arms, of which they had the sole monopoly. Being born and bred soldiers, their services were always brought into requisition when the princes of India had any conquest to undertake, or a defence to offer against external aggressions. They acknowledged no commanders, but of their own choosing and of their own caste. Their mode of warfare was not a regular system, but they fought pell-mell, and with more or less resolution in proportion to the pay they received. The arms used by them were sword, shield and pike. A soldier who put on a crocus dye, avowed his determination to conquer or to perish. As a rule they plied themselves with opium and a preparation of *bhang*, and embraced one another by way of taking final leave before engaging with the enemy, esteeming it more honourable to be killed than to survive and submit to the lust of the conqueror. Those who turned their backs on the enemy—a rare occurrence—

were treated as outcasts by the whole tribe, and their wives disdained to own them as their husbands. A characteristic story in point of one of these women is related by Dr. Fryer. Her husband having come home after a prudent retreat, asked his spouse for some meat which was served out to him with a brass ladle. On enquiring the reason of her extraordinary conduct, he was told that she was afraid the sight of iron would turn his stomach from his food, as it had done from fighting.

The Banyans were classed next to the Rashpoots. They were most tenacious of the outward rites and ceremonies, paying exclusive homage to the mint, cummin and anise of their religion at the expense of the weightier matters of the law, and were so superstitious withal and strict in the observance of omens, that while travelling they would avoid the usual road and cover double the distance rather than meet a string of loaded asses, or pass near a herd of goats or cows grazing. In the rains they avoided riding in coaches for fear of killing the insects generated in the cart-ruts. So far in matters of religion, but "in case of trade," says Dr. Fryer, "they are not so hide-bound, giving their consciences more scope, and boggle at no villany for an emolument."

Land was cultivated by the peasants and combies, who employed oxen to draw the plough. Iron being scarce and the soil soft, the ploughs were constructed entirely of wood which was effectual for the purpose of turning the surface of the earth. The Gentoos thrashed their corn, but the Moors used cattle to tread it out by fixing a pole in the ground, in the middle of a heap of corn, and yoking to it three or four of these animals carefully muzzled, made them go round and round till the work was completed.

The Moghuls are next noticed by Dr. Fryer. Although the invaders of the country, which they held with the help of the sword, they permitted great toleration to the conquered race at the time of his visit. They prided themselves on their fair skins, and by way of derision called the natives 'blacks.' Aurungzeb, who was then on the throne of Delhi, followed out his peculiar policy in the matter of government. His favourite maxim was to distribute the loaves and fishes derived from the conquest among his nobles, at the same time adopting the precaution of bestowing on them the administration of distant provinces, lest being in close proximity to the troops at or near the capital, they might be tempted to join in rebellion against him. As a further safeguard against their plots and machinations, and as security for their good behaviour, they were compelled to leave their wives and children as hostages in the hands of the emperor, who always took good care to fleece them of all their ill-gotten gains which were pressed out of the territories entrusted to their keeping.

In the opinion of Dr. Fryer, the Portuguese would have

## 38 *The Hindu Custom of 'Sitting Dharna.'*

*Manus injectio* it was the creditor himself who laid his hands on the debtor and arrested him, but the graphic description of the proceeding given by Gaius, is only an illustration of what ordinarily took place in the case of a debt already decreed by the magistrate. The plaintiff, laying his hand on the debtor, said, 'Whereas you have been adjudged or condemned to pay me ten thousand sesterces which you fraudulently have failed to pay, therefore I arrest you as judgment-debtor for ten thousand sesterces, and the debtor was not allowed to resist the arrest or defend himself in his own person, but gave a *vindex* to advocate his cause, or, in default, was taken prisoner to the plaintiff's house and put in chains.' But the right of caption was frequently allowed to be exercised without a previous appeal to the law. Various provisions were, from time to time made, which allowed *Manus injectio* against *quasi* judgment-debtors. A surety, for instance, who had paid the debt of the principal, was permitted this right without suit in court; but the party exercising it was compelled in any case to state in a set form of words, whether the prisoner was arrested as a judgment-debtor or a *quasi* judgment-debtor. At the time of the XII Tables, when legal procedure was both rude and scanty, the right of arrest was not confined to the case of judgment debts, but was extended to debts that were *acknowledged*. If the debt had originated by the old and solemn form of the contract called *nexum*, it was placed on the same footing as a judgment debt. This is evident from the formula spoken of by Gaius, which was held indispensable in releasing a debtor. "There must be present" says Gaius "five witnesses and a holder of the scales, and the debtor to be released must say these words: 'Whereas I am condemned to thee in so many thousand sesterces by such and such a *nexum*'—or 'by such and such a judgment'—'that debt I pay and discharge by this ingot and balance of bronze. When I have struck the scale with this first, this last, ingot of bronze, no further obligation by the terms of the *nexum*'—or 'by the judgment'—'remains in force.' Then he strikes the scale with the ingot and gives it to the creditor as if in payment." The debtor pledged his own person to his creditor in the *nexum*, and the right to arrest him, in case of default, was exercised as an extra-judicial act. It must be remembered, however, that in the case of the judgment-debtor, and also in the case of the acknowledged debtor, the arresting creditor was bound, before removing the prisoner to his private prison, to take him before the public assembly in the *Comitium* where a magistrate always sat on a market day. It is interesting to place this illustration of the early practices of mankind, side by side with what appears to have been the most ancient and venerable customs recognised in the Hindu law-books.

Turning to the Institutes of Manu where he treats of the remedies open to a creditor for the recovery of his debt, we find that among others, he recognises the right of distress or seizure of the debtor's goods as an extra-judicial act. In the *Pignoris Capio* of the Romans, this right was limited to a small and special class of demands, while the body of the debtor was from the first always held liable to caption. There is in the Hindu law-books a comparative silence on the remedy of distress, whereas the right of arrest is considerably enlarged upon, and various provisions exist for its regulation. In the less advanced native States at the present day, this right is frequently exercised. The creditor proceeds to the house of his debtor, situated probably in an adjacent village, and loudly demands the debt in the presence of neighbours. Failing to obtain it, he either sits *dharna* at the debtor's door, or awaits the day when the debtor is found in the market place or elsewhere, when he puts into practice the old *Manus injectio* of the Romans, with very little of its formalities. It is curious to observe how instinctively in our own streets, the poorer classes attempt to enforce payment from a debtor by the primitive method of fastening a *chudder* or body-cloth round his neck, and appealing to the bystanders. In less enlightened days, this proceeding if allowed to take its course, would have led to the imprisonment of the debtor in the house of the creditor; but it is now frequently interrupted by the sudden appearance of a policeman on the scene, who invariably arrests both the parties for an obstruction of the public thoroughfare. Considerable difficulty was experienced in the early days of British rule in suppressing this exercise of unbridled force against a debtor. By an old regulation passed in the year 1793, landholders and farmers were prohibited from placing in confinement, or inflicting corporal punishment on any under-farmer, ryot, or dependent talookdar or their sureties, to enforce payment of arrears of rent or revenue, and the infringement of this rule gave the sufferer a right to damages. These practices, however, find ample authority in the writings of the Hindu sages. "By the mode consonant to moral duty," says Manu, "by suit in court, by artful management, or by distress, a creditor may recover the property lent; and fifthly by legal force." Legal force or violent compulsion is explained by Brihaspiti thus:—"When having tied the debtor he carries him to his own house, and by beating or other means compels him to pay;" and the gloss of the *Retnacara* sanctions the same proceeding. It is recognised in most of the Hindu law-tracts as a mode of enforcing payment, 'according to the immemorial usage of the country.' There is sufficient ground, however, for asserting that the right of caption was sanctioned only in the case of a debtor of equal or lower caste. It will be

remembered that under the Roman law the *Manus injectio*, (or putting on of the hand) was allowed only in the case of a judgment debt or an acknowledged debt, originating by the solemn ritual of the *nexum*. Brihaspiti, in commenting on the right of caption, limits its exercise to the case of an *acknowledged* debt, and provides that "when the debtor appeals to judicature, or when the demand is unliquidated, he shall never be constrained by the mere act of the creditor; and he who constrains a debtor thus exempt from such constraint, shall be fined according to law." This may be regarded as the first step, by which the law interfered with the right of caption; but we shall find that the arm of the State went further still, and regulated its exercise by a proceeding which furnishes another striking parallelism between the Roman and the Hindu law. By the Roman law, a creditor was compelled to take his captured debtor before a magistrate on a market day, and the Hindu sage Catyayana directs that "a debtor, being arrested, may be openly dragged before the public assembly and confined until he pay what is due, according to the immemorial usage of the country." The gloss of the *Retnacara* speaks of this dragging before the public assembly as nothing more than what, under the Roman law, was a reference to the magistrate sitting in the *Comitium* on a market day. Both in the Hindu and in the Roman practice, the capture of a debtor led to his imprisonment in the house of his creditor. In Rome, the horrors perpetrated in these private prisons often placed the Republic in danger, and there can be no doubt that in India the right of caption was productive of the most barbarous cruelties. Let us turn from this picture to the practice of sitting *dharna*, where the creditor is found to abandon all show of force, and to sit at his debtor's door fasting until the debt is paid.

It is a curious fact that this Hindu institution closely corresponds with an old Irish form of distress spoken of in the *Senchus Mor*. When properly understood, it will doubtless be found to substantiate in some measure the assertion of Sir Henry Maine, that wherever we have any knowledge of a body of Aryan custom either anterior to, or but slightly affected by the Roman Empire, it will be found to exhibit some strong points of resemblance to the institutions which are the basis of the Brehon laws.\* A remarkable illustration of this occurs in the institution called *Literary Fosterage* as recognised in the Brehon law-tracts. The

\* For an account of the Brehons, the reader must refer to Sir Henry Maine's work. It will be sufficient to state here, that they were among the ancient Celts of Ireland, very much what the Druids were among

the Celts of the Continent. As a class of professional lawyers whose occupation was hereditary, they are supposed to have produced that remarkable collection of law-tracts which are known as the Brehon laws.

relationship established between the teacher and his pupil is that of actual kinship, and closely resembles the relationship insisted on in the Hindu law-books as existing between the spiritual guide and his *cheyla* or disciple. So far does this identify itself with blood-connection, that both in the Brehon and in the Hindu law, the preceptor and the pupil are counted among the kinsmen entitled to inherit property. The custom of sitting *dharna* is only another instance of the close resemblance which may be found to exist between certain Eastern and Western institutions. But it will be observed that the Irish practice of fasting at the door preceded the seizure of the debtor's goods; and in this it differs from the Indian practice. Sir Henry Maine borrows from the Editor of the first volume of 'Ancient Laws of Ireland' the following epitome of the old Irish law on this subject, as laid down in the *Senchus Mor* :—

"The plaintiff or creditor having first given the proper notice, proceeded in the case of a defendant or debtor, not of chieftain grade to distrain. If the defendant or debtor were a person of chieftain grade, it was necessary not only to give notice but also to fast upon him. The fasting on him consisted in going to his residence and waiting there without food. If the plaintiff did not within a certain time receive satisfaction for his claim, or a pledge therefor, he forthwith, accompanied by a law agent, witnesses and others, seized his distress. The distress when seized was in certain cases liable to a stay, which was a period varying according to fixed rules, during which the debtor received back the distress and detained it in his own keeping, the creditor having a lien upon it. Such a distress is 'distress with time'; but under certain circumstances, and in particular cases, an 'immediate distress' was made, the peculiarity of which was, that during the fixed period of the stay, the distress was not allowed to remain in the debtor's possession, but in that of the creditor, or in one of the recognised greens or pounds."

It must be borne in mind that the fasting at the door here described, formed a part of the proceeding, which, under the Brehon laws, a creditor adopted for the purpose of seizing upon the goods of his debtor. It claimed no connection whatever with the right of caption or arrest. In giving various descriptions of the practice of fasting at the door in India, I shall at once show that it differed from the Irish practice insomuch that it formed no part of the proceeding known as *distress*, but was a modification of the primitive right of caption or *arrest*. It is highly probable, however, as I shall attempt to show presently, that sitting *dharna* was only the adoption of a practice long resorted to by the Brahminical priesthood to obtain sacrificial or charitable gifts by fasting, and which, under the sanction of law, actually

preceded a limited seizure of the worshipper's goods. In this respect the Brahminical expedient, resembles the Irish form of distress more closely than sitting *dharna*, where fasting does not precede the seizure of the debtor's goods at all. Meanwhile I shall quote Sir Henry Maine's account of the proceeding :—“The Irish rules of distress very strongly resemble the English rules, less strongly resemble the Continental Teutonic rules, but they include one rule not found in any Teutonic rule, almost unintelligible in the Irish system, but known to govern conduct even at this hour all over the East, where its meaning is perfectly clear. This is the rule, that a creditor who requires payment from a debtor of higher rank than himself shall fast upon him. What possible explanation will cover all the facts, except that the primitive Aryans bequeathed the remedy of distress to the communities which sprang from them, and that varieties of detail have been produced by what Dr. Sullivan in his Introduction has happily called Dynamical influences? Here is the leading provision of the *Senchus Mor* on the subject (1.113)”—

“Notice precedes every distress in the case of the inferior grades except it be by persons of distinction. Fasting precedes distress in their case. He who does not give a pledge to fasting is an evader of all; he who disregards all things shall not be paid by God or man.”

“Mr. Whitley Stokes was, I believe, the first to point out that the institution here referred to was identical with a practice diffused over the whole East and called by the Hindus sitting *dharna*. I will presently read you a passage in which the proceeding is described as it was found in India, before the British Government, which has always regarded it as an abuse, had gone far in its efforts to suppress it. But perhaps the most striking examples of the ancient custom are to be found at this day in Persia, where (I am told) a man intending to enforce payment of a demand by fasting, begins by sowing some barley at his debtor's door, and sitting down in the middle. The symbolism is plain enough. The creditor means that he will stay where he is without food, either until he is paid or until the barley seed grows up and gives him bread to eat.”

“The corresponding Indian practice is known, I before stated, as ‘sitting *dharna*.’ *Dharna*, according to the better opinion, being exactly equivalent to the Roman *Capio*, and meaning detention or arrest. Among the methods for enforcing payment of a debt described in the collection of rules attributed to the semi-divine legislator Manu, (viii, 49) is one which Sir William Jones renders ‘the mediation of friends’; but more recent Sanscrit scholars assert that the expression of the original text signifies ‘*dharna*.’ And in the *Vyavahara Mayukha* a Brahminical law

book of much authority, *Brihaspiti*, a judicial writer sometimes classed with *Manu*, is cited as enumerating among the lawful modes of compulsion by which the debtor can be made to pay, confining his wife, his son or his cattle, or watching constantly at his door. This remarkable passage not only connects Hindu law with Irish law through the reference to 'watching constantly at the door,' but it connects it also with the Teutonic, and among them with the English bodies of custom by speaking of the distress of cattle as the method of enforcing a demand. We have not in the Western world, so far as I am aware, any example of so strong a form of distress as seizing a man's wife or children, but it is somewhat curious that we have evidence of its having been common in Ireland to give a son as a pledge to the creditor for the purpose of releasing the distressed property."

"Lord Teignmouth has left us a description (in *Forbes' Oriental Memoirs*, 11, 25) of the form which the 'watching constantly at the door' of *Brihaspiti* had assumed in British India before the end of the last century: 'The inviolability of the Brahmin is a fixed principle with the Hindus, and to deprive him of life, either by direct violence or by causing his death in any mode, is a crime which admits of no expiation. To this principle may be traced the practice called *dharna* which may be translated caption, or arrest. It is used by the Brahmins to gain a point which cannot be accomplished by any other means, and the process is as follows: The Brahmin who adopts this expedient for the purpose mentioned, proceeds to the door or house of the person against whom it is directed, or wherever he may most conveniently arrest him; he then sits down in *dharna* with poison or poignard or some other instrument of suicide in his hand, and threatening to use it if his adversary should attempt to pass or molest him, he thus completely arrests him. In this situation the Brahmin fasts, and by the rigor of the etiquette the unfortunate object of his arrest ought to fast also, and thus they both remain till the institutor of the *dharna* obtains satisfaction. In this, as he seldom makes the attempt without the resolution to persevere, he rarely fails; for if the party thus arrested were to suffer the Brahmin sitting in *dharna* to perish by hunger, the sin would for ever lie upon his head. This practice has been less frequent of late years, since the institution of the Court of Justice at Benares in 1793; but the interference of the court and even of the Resident has occasionally proved insufficient to check it."

"You will observe that the old Brahminical writer merely speaks of confining a man to his house by 'watching constantly at the door' as one among several modes of extorting satisfaction. He classes it with forms of distress more intelligible to us—the seizure of the debtor's cattle, of his wife, or of his child. Though

## 44 *The Hindu Custom of 'Sitting Dharna.'*

the ancient rule has not descended to us along with its original context, we need not doubt that even in the earliest times it was enforced by a supernatural sanction, since every violation of the Brahminical code was regarded by its authors not only as a civil offence, but as a sin. Thus a Brahmin might well be conceived as saying with the writer in the *Senchus Mor* : ' He who does not give a pledge to fasting is an evader of all ; he who disregards all things shall not be paid by God or man.' Many centuries then elapse which it would be vain to calculate, and almost in our own day we find the ancient usage practised in India, but with modifications corresponding to a great deal of change which is suspected to have occurred in Hindu theology. The indefinite supernatural penalty has become the definite supernatural penalty incurred by destroying life, and particularly human life. The creditor not only 'watches at the door' but kills himself by poison or dagger if the arrest is broken, or by starvation if payment is too long delayed. Finally we have the practice described by Lord Teignmouth, as one peculiarly or exclusively resorted to by Brahmins. The sanctity of Brahminical life has now, in fact, pretty much taken in Hindu idea, the place once occupied by the sanctity of human life, and 'sitting *dharna*' when the English law first endeavoured to suppress it, was understood to be a special mode of oppression practised by Brahmins for a consideration in money."\*

The description given by Lord Teignmouth of sitting *dharna* does not seem to fall strictly within the terms of the law enunciated by Brihaspiti. It is not simply watching constantly at the door of the debtor, which is just another mode of arresting him. We have introduced here, the significant element of *fasting* at the door, which after all is the only feature which helps to place it side by side with the Irish practice spoken of in the *Senchus Mor*. Brihaspiti thus lays down the law :—"By the interposition of friends, by mild remonstrance, by importunate following or by staying constantly at the house of the debtor, he may be compelled to pay the debt : this mode of recovery is called a mode consonant to moral duty." The importunate following of the debtor wherever he may go, and watching constantly at his door, are a species of torture under which the debtor is in no fear of supernatural penalties ; but it is evident that as soon as the creditor commences by *fasting* at his debtor's door, the whole character of the proceeding is changed, and the debtor is coerced by a supernatural sanction to pay the debt. In the Dekhun provinces, where the *Vyavahara Mayukha* is the leading authority, we find that the 'watching constantly at the door' spoken of by Brihaspiti, was a proceeding distinct from sitting *dharna*. Captain James

---

\* 'Early History of Institutions,' 206.

Grant Duff (*History of the Mahrattas*, 254) describes it thus:—  
'The mode of recovering a debt is by a species of dunning called *tugazu*; the most common practice is, to hire a few of those men who make it a trade. They sit at the debtor's door, follow him wherever he goes, and crave with humility or demand with insolence according to time and circumstance. By the invariable rule of the country, the debtor is obliged to subsist the dun thus placed upon him, and as they are adepts at the art of tormenting, protected also by the great power of opinion, they soon contrive to render the debtor sufficiently miserable. But if the debtor be obstinate, and the creditor thinks himself equal to the task, he may undertake the *tugazu* by placing his debtor in *dharna*. The creditor seats himself by his debtor or at his door, during which, while the former abstains from food, it would be accounted infamous and dishonorable for the latter to eat or drink.  
\* \* \* I have known the *dharna* practised, but never very rigorously; and I do not think that fear of the creditor starving himself to death would have much effect in a Mahratta debtor; his stomach would be much sooner affected than his conscience.'

It is evident from the account given by Mr. Steele of the custom of *tugazu*, that it admitted of considerable variation according to the caste of the parties; and the torture to which the debtor was subjected depended a good deal upon the temper and tastes of the duns who were employed to inflict it. 'If the parties were *sahookars*,' says Mr. Steele, (*Law and Custom of Hindu Castes*, &c., 267) or the debtor a man of fortune, it was usual for the creditor to demand payment verbally, or bring the debtor to his own house; then to send a *gomastah* to his house to demand payment, then to seat a man near his house: and should the debtor not request his creditor to take him off by a *munuachithee*, he would be obliged to comply with the man's demand for daily subsistence (4 annas, &c.) the owner fasting the whole time from morning till evening and accusing the debtor as the cause thereof. Should the debtor persist in not coming to some agreement, the dun would forbid any water to be brought inside the house, and subsequently plant several hired men of the debtor's caste at his door, who would forbid the cooking of food within the house from morning to evening, and receive their hire from the debtor. This practice continued daily until the parties came to some settlement of the debt. Among Tylung Brahmins and Gossaeens it was not usual to place any hired person at the debtor's door, but the creditor himself remained on the spot fasting, abusing him, and demanding payment, or he stood with a stone placed on his head, or his *sendee* (lock of hair, unshaven) platted and fastened to a peg at the debtor's door; he even threatened to hang himself, or confined the debtor in a room. The sin of these self-inflicted acts is

considered to rest with the debtor who is the cause of them. Nevertheless men in power would repel such attempts to obtain payment, by violence.

The question arises, what is the origin of the practice of 'sitting *dharna*?' If we turn to the pages of Manu we shall find that it has no sanction there. 'By the mode consonant to moral duty,' says Manu, 'by suit in court, by artful management or by distress, a creditor may recover the property lent, and fifthly by legal force.' Sir William Jones explains the '*mode consonant to moral duty*' as meaning '*the mediation of friends*,' but Sir Henry Maine asserts, that more recent Sanscrit scholars have found the expression of the original text to signify *dharna*. Brihaspiti, however, who is classed sometimes with Manu himself as a legislator, and who certainly reflects in his writings the spirit of Manu's laws, explains the mode consonant to moral duty as consisting of '*the mediation of friends*,' mild remonstrance, importunate following, or staying constantly at the house of the debtor.\* It will also appear that, although the 'staying constantly at the house of the debtor' was a species of *dharna* which finds countenance in the text of Brihaspiti, it is wanting in the chief element of *fasting*, which characterizes *dharna* as described by Lord Teignmouth, and which the British Government found necessary to suppress by legislation. *Dharna*, as such, is not, therefore, recognised by Manu. It is spoken of later by Brihaspiti as one of the modes consonant to moral duty, and was literally an arrest of the debtor by confining him in his own house, and was still the exercise of force. The 'importunate following' of the debtor, and 'staying constantly at his house,' was in practice carried out by hired men who, so far from fasting, were entitled daily to subsistence from the debtor, which, by the rigor of the custom, he was bound to supply. It is highly probable, therefore, that *dharna* was originally only a modification of the old law of force which sanctioned the arrest of the debtor, and his removal to the house of the creditor. It was practised, probably, whenever the forcible arrest became either dangerous or inconvenient to the creditor. A wealthy debtor, or one of superior caste, could not be arrested and carried to the creditor's house without some risk. He was therefore kept to his own house by *dharna*. Fasting, however, formed at this time no part of the proceeding, and it becomes necessary to inquire how so significant an element came to be introduced into it. It is remarkable that from a very early age fasting at the door of the worshipper, was a practice resorted to by the Brahminical priest-

\* Professor Monier Williams, in his 'later' practice of *dharna* is not recent work (*Indian Wisdom*. 270n.) mentioned or recognised by Manu. states without hesitation that the

hood to obtain charitable donations. If we turn to that portion of the code of Manu where he treats of penance and expiation (xi, 11-14) we shall find that for the purpose of sacrifices, the Brahmin was vested with authority to seize upon the goods of the worshipper. It is probable that when animal sacrifices were more common than they are at present, this right was frequently exercised. A similar right was sanctioned by the early Roman law in the case of the debtor who had failed to contribute towards the public fund for sacrifices. His goods were distrained by the process called *Pignoris Capio*, which was, properly speaking, the seizure of the worshipper's goods without any appeal to the ordinary tribunals. 'It is a significant fact,' writes Mr. Talboys Wheeler, that 'religious development often runs in the same groove as political development. In patriarchal times, as in the days of the Rishis, the head of the family or tribe performed the duties of the priest. But when monarchical government assumed an organized form, it was generally accompanied by an ecclesiastical hierarchy having a similar organization. The sovereign made known his will by means of edicts, the deity made known his will by means of oracles. The ministers claimed a share of the harvest and flocks, and the payment of tribute or taxes for the service of the sovereign. The priests in like manner claimed first-fruits, firstlings, and tithes for the service of the deity. Again, the ministers chastised offenders by fine and punishment; and the priests chastised sinners by enforcing alms-giving, sacrifices and penances.\*' The Brahminical priesthood had a right to enforce contributions, not only for sacrifices, but for their own subsistence. 'Thus likewise,' says Mauu, 'may a Brahmin, who has not eaten at the time of six meals, or has fasted three whole days, take at the time of the seventh meal, or on the fourth morning, from the man who behaves basely by not offering him food, enough to supply him till the morrow. He may take it from the floor, where the grain is trodden out of the husk, or from the field, or from the house, or from any place whatever; but if the owner ask why he takes it, the cause of the taking must be declared.' We have here the foundation of the practice of 'fasting at the door.' The mendicant priest seats himself at the door of the worshipper and fasts; and if within three days food is not given to him, he seizes upon the grain of his *quasi* debtor wherever it can be found. It will be remembered that Lord Teignmouth speaks of the practice of sitting *dharna* as one specially and exclusively resorted to by the Brahminical priesthood. The regulation of 1795, which was intended to suppress it, also speaks of it as a practice confined to the Brahmins of the

province of Benares. And it will be observed that it is spoken of as being resorted to, not only for the recovery of a debt, but for the purpose of extorting some *charitable donation*. I quote the whole preamble as a curious relic of the past:—

“The reverence paid by Hindus to Brahmins, and the reputed inviolability of their persons, and the loss of, or prejudice to, caste that ensues from proving the cause of their death, have in some cases in the province of Benares, and more especially in the pur-gunnahs of Kuntil and Budhoee, been converted by some of the more unlearned part of them into the means of setting the laws at defiance, from the dread and apprehensions of the persons of the Hindu religion, to whose lot it must frequently fall to be employed in enforcing against such Brahmins any process or demands on the part of Government. The devices occasionally put in practice under such circumstances by these Brahmins, are, lacerating their own bodies, either more or less slightly, with knives or razors; threatening to swallow, or, sometimes actually swallowing, poison, or some powder which they declare to be such; or constructing a circular enclosure called a *koorh*, in which they raise a pile of wood or of other combustibles, and betaking themselves to fasting, real or pretended, place within the area of the *koorh*, an old woman, with a view to sacrifice her by setting fire to the *koorh*, on the approach of any person to serve them with any process, or to exercise coercion over them on the part of Government or its delegates. These Brahmins likewise, in the event of their not obtaining relief within a given time, for any loss or disappointment that they may have justly or unjustly experienced, also occasionally bring out their women or children, and causing them to sit down in the view of the peon who is coming towards them on the part of Government, or its delegates, they brandish their swords, and threaten to behead, or otherwise slay these females, or children on the nearer approach of the peon; and there are instances in which, from resentment at being subjected to arrest or coercion, or other molestation, they have actually not only inflicted wounds on their own bodies, but put to death with their swords the females of their families or their own female infants, or some aged female procured for the occasion. Nor are the women always unwilling victims; on the contrary, from the prejudices under which they are brought up, it is supposed that, in general, they consider it incumbent on them to acquiesce cheerfully in this species of self-devotement, either from motives of mistaken honor, or of resentment and revenge, believing that after death they shall become the tormentors of those who are the occasion of their being sacrificed. On similar principles, these Brahmins, to realise any claim or expectation, such as the recovery of a debt, or for the purpose of extorting some charitable

donation, frequently proceed either with some offensive weapon, or with poison, to the door of another inhabitant of the same town or village, and take post there in the manner called *dharna*; and it is understood according to the received opinions on this subject, that they are to remain fasting in that place until their object be attained; and that it is equally incumbent on the party who is the occasion of such Brahmin's thus sitting, to abstain from nourishment until the latter be satisfied. Until this is effected, ingress and egress to and from his house are also more or less prevented, as, according to the received opinions, neither the one nor the other can be attempted but at the risk of the Brahmin's wounding himself with the weapon, or swallowing the powder or poison, with which he may have come provided. These Brahmin's, however, are frequently obliged to desist, and are removed from sitting *dharna* by the officers of the courts of justice, without any ill consequences resulting, it having been found by experience, that they seldom or never attempt to commit suicide, or to wound themselves or others, after they are taken into the custody of Government.\*

We have seen that the Brahmin who fasted at the door of the worshipper obtained his wants either by voluntary gift or by forcible taking. The rule had evidently been perverted by the priesthood, when fasting was undertaken not (as originally) to extort a charitable donation but to recover a debt, or to 'gain a point' as Lord Teignmouth puts it. A faint trace of the origin of the practice will be found in the fact that the creditor who resorted to *dharna*, often found it necessary to hire a Brahmin to starve himself vicariously. It may easily be imagined that the rule of Brihaspiti, which allowed an importunate following of the debtor and watching constantly at his door, was attended by some risk to the creditor. Mr. Steele shows that men in power often resisted with force such attempts to obtain payment. At this juncture, it is more than probable that the creditor arrested the arm of the debtor by hiring a Brahmin whose person was always held sacred, and who could not be resisted with violence. The Brahmin thus retained, adopted his own peculiar method of fasting at the door, and even put the debtor under immediate fear by providing himself with some instrument of suicide. This would appear to be the most probable explanation of the introduction of *fasting* into the earlier proceeding of 'watching constantly at the door' of a debtor, and we may well imagine the Brahmin saying with the Breton lawyer, 'he who does not give a pledge to fasting, is an evader of all; he who disregards all things shall not be paid by God or man.' The older practice of

\* Regulation XXI. of 1795.

'importunate following' and 'watching constantly at the door,' had given way to the new method, which probably acted far more effectually, inasmuch as it left the obdurate debtor to undefined visitations and punishments by the hand of an offended deity. At the same time the Hindu scriptures heap the richest rewards, both in this life and in the next, upon those who maintain virtuous *Snatusas* or priestly mendicants who are learned in the *Vedas*. 'Let every man,' says *Manu*, 'according to his ability, give wealth to Brahmins detached from the world, and learned in scripture: such a giver shall attain heaven after this life. He alone is worthy to drink the juice of the moon-plant, who keeps a provision of grain sufficient to supply those whom the law commands him to nourish for a term of three years and more. But a twice-born man who keeps a less provision of grain yet presumes to taste the juice of the moon-plant shall gather no fruit from that sacrament even though he taste it at the first or solemn, much less at any occasional, ceremony.' The mendicancy of the Brahminical priesthood is a characteristic which clings to them from their earliest history. The services they rendered as astrologers, school-masters, sacrificers and expounders of the law, vested them with prodigious power over the people, and were paid for only by a voluntary system of alms-giving. Buddhism, however much it may have differed from Brahminism, was in perfect accord with it in this teaching of charity. Alms-giving with both, was classed among the cardinal virtues, and the feeding of a *Sraman* was an act as meritorious as feeding a Brahmin. The legend which speaks of *Sakya Mouni* having often given himself up as a substituted victim to satisfy the appetites of hawks and beasts of prey, taught a lesson of self-sacrifice, which powerfully recommended Buddhism to the Hindus, with whom the pious poor were already a sacred class. The spirit of Buddhism is best illustrated in the celebration of the great quinqueunial expiation at *Prayaga*, where it is said a million of pious monks and mendicant Brahmins received food and gifts in what was called the 'field of alms.' The Greek accounts also speak of the Brahmin philosophers as a mendicant order, who enjoyed the right of taking whatever they pleased in the market place. Throughout the whole East, mendicancy has received the highest encouragement under the teachings of religion. To permit a man to starve or fast at your door without relieving his wants, was always looked upon as an act which, in the next world, placed the beggar in enjoyment of heaven, and reversed the condition of the rich man to that of deplorable misery. It was a dread of this supernatural retribution which, in India, made fasting at the door such a powerful instrument in extorting charitable

donations to the Brahminical priesthood. And it will be observed that sitting *dharna* was always undertaken where the debtor was a man of wealth or of superior caste to the creditor. In the Brehon laws similarly, fasting is enjoined only where the debtor was a man of chieftain grade; and he who did not give a pledge to fasting was an evader of all; he who disregarded all things was not to be paid by God or man.

In accounting for the practice of fasting at the door, as it is recognised in the Brehon laws, it is impossible to keep out of view the connection which has frequently been attempted to be established between the Celtic Druids and the Indian Brahmins. The Druidical priesthood spoken of in the verse of Lucan and in the prose of Cæsar, professed and taught the doctrine of the metempsychosis, which was again the foundation of the Brahminical theology. Their institutions distinctly point to an Aryan origin. Were the Druids then a colony of Oriental priests? The reader is aware that a great deal of wild speculation has hitherto classed this question among the most doubtful of historical problems. The philosopher who supposes that the Druidical learning was directly communicated to the sages by Pythagoras himself, is scarcely less extravagant than the Welsh antiquary who insisted that the Brahmins of India derived their system of the metempsychosis from a band of emigrants from Wales. It is certain, however, that recent attention to the ancient Brehon laws, tends to establish an undoubted connection between the Druids and Irish Brehons on the one hand, and the Brahmins of India on the other. Some of their institutions support the most striking and curious resemblances. The fasting at the door, as mentioned in the *Senchus Mor* and as practised in India, tempts the inquirer to seek in the religious practices of the Brahmin and the Brehon, some common element, which will serve to account for its existence among both these priestly castes. If the Brehons were the successors of the Druids, it is highly probable that as a sacerdotal class, they were maintained by a system of charitable donations and alms-giving like the Brahminical priesthood. A Druid may very well have taught that penal consequences in another world would follow the debtor's death by starvation, but an 'Irish Brehon' says Sir Henry Maine, 'could scarcely make any distinct assertion on the subject, since fasting had now become a specific ordinance of the Christian Church, and its conditions and spiritual effects were expressly defined by the Christian priesthood.' But it must not be forgotten that pious mendicity was a characteristic of the Christians from a very early age. *Ebionism*—that is, the doctrine that the poor (*ebionim*) alone shall inherit the kingdom of God—was the tendency of the teaching of the earliest churches, and the

## 52 *The Hindu Custom of 'Sitting Dharna.'*

name "poor" (*ebion*) had become a synonym of "saint" or of "friend of God." To allow such to starve or fast at your door would certainly entail penal consequences in another world. The New Testament abounds with teachings of this kind. 'Thrown into the centre of human society,' writes M. Renan, 'Christianity very easily consented to receive rich men into her bosom, just as Buddhism, exclusively monkish in its origin, soon began, as conversions multiplied, to admit the laity. But the mark of origin is ever preserved. Although it quickly passed away and became forgotten, ebionism left a leaven in the whole history of Christian institutions which has not been lost. \* \* \* Poverty remained an ideal from which the true followers of Jesus were never after separated. To possess nothing was the true evangelical state; mendicancy became a virtue, a holy condition.' It is certain that long before the rise of the numerous mendicant orders in the thirteenth century, mendicancy more or less became a profession among the pious poor of Christian communities. Fasting at the door, in order to obtain some charitable donation, received encouragement by the Christian priesthood. The Christian Brehon, like the mendicant friar, probably excited a superstitious people to acts of charity much in the same fashion as a Brahmin or a Buddhist Sraman. The alms-bowl, which was so indispensable in the paraphernalia of the heathen priest, was also a necessity to the mendicant friar, and probably to the Brehon priest. If fasting at the door, therefore, was a relic of Druidism which was preserved in the Brehon laws, the only inference that can be drawn from the fact is, that the Christian Brehon found in it an element which in no way militated against Christian doctrine or Christian practice. It is highly probable, therefore, that sitting *dharna*, in ancient Ireland and in ancient India, received its chief characteristic of *fusting* from the mendicant priesthood.

---

### ART. III.—THE BHAGAVAD-GITA AND CHRISTIANITY.

IT has often been observed that the indifference to the systems of Hindu metaphysicians, too often exhibited by European philosophers, is partly due to the ostentatious disregard of style which characterizes their writings. Most of our readers are no doubt aware that the principal philosophical systems of India were originally promulgated in the form of terse aphorisms, the obscurity of which has necessitated the compilation of numerous commentaries. Such a method of communicating knowledge is by no means favourable to literary excellence, and we must not expect to find in the works of Hindu sages that perfection of form, which characterizes the dialogues of Plato, and is apparent even in the baldest translation. Fine passages, however, are occasionally to be met with in Hindu philosophical treatises, and European students of all shades of opinion seem to have been especially fascinated by those which set forth, with a profusion of striking imagery, the doctrine of an all-pervading soul of the world, familiar to them in classical authors, and which always seems to evoke the highest poetical powers of its exponents. One of the most remarkable exceptions to the prevailing neglect of style in Indian philosophy, is the celebrated episode of the *Mahâbhârata* called the *Bhagavad-gîtâ*. It has exercised the talents of Schlegel, Burnouf, Lassen and Thomson, and has arrested the attention of some of the foremost thinkers of Europe. The sublime character of its doctrines, and the pleasing form in which they are presented to the reader, remind the classical scholar of the philosophic fervour of Lucretius or the gorgeous Platonic myth. This philosophic or theosophic poem has lately been translated into German by Dr. Lorinser with an elaborate commentary and an introduction and appendix. In this work Dr. Lorinser upholds the theory, that many of the ideas and expressions in the *Bhagavad-gîtâ*, are borrowed from the New Testament and the early Christian writers, and that its most characteristic doctrine, that of the devotion due to Krishna as the supreme lord, was originally suggested by the teaching of Christian missionaries. The evidence which the learned author accumulates in favour of his view is very striking

\* 1 Die *Bhagavad-gîtâ* übersetzt and erläutert von Dr. F. Lorinser. Breslau : 1869.

2 A paper in the *Indian Antiquary*, March 1875, "On Dr. Lorinser's *Bhagavad-gîtâ* and Christian writings" by J. Muir, Esq., DCL, LLD.,

PH. D.

3 Weber on the *Krishna Janmâsh-tani*, *Indian Antiquary*, January 1874.

4 Pahlavi Inscriptions in Southern India, by A. C. Burnell. *Indian Antiquary*, November 1874.

## 54 *The Bhagavad-gita and Christianity.*

and seems to have produced a considerable sensation in learned circles in Germany. In India also it has aroused a good deal of comment, though the learned of this country are not prepared to receive readily such a doctrine, as tending to degrade one of the text-books of their religion, and one of the glories of their literature into a faint echo of the sacred writings of their European conquerors. No one, who is acquainted with the feelings of the natives of India, would, we think, doubt that religious feeling has a tendency to make them pre-judge any question of the kind. Of course the small group of learned Hindus who have accepted Christianity would be ready to give a patient or even a favourable hearing to Dr. Lorinser's theory. Indeed, the Rev. K. M. Banerjea long ago expressed views with respect to the modification of Krishna-worship by Christianity identical, in the main, with those set forth in the work we are at present considering. The subject does not appear to have attracted much attention in England, but whether Dr. Lorinser's main thesis be right or wrong, the striking coincidences which he points out between the doctrines and language of the New Testament and those of the *Bhagavad-gītā* ought, we think, to prove interesting to all who look forward to the evangelisation of India, as well as to students of philosophy and literature. To draw attention to the *Bhagavad-gītā* itself and to Dr. Lorinser's translation and commentary will be the object of the following pages. In so doing, we shall endeavour, as far as possible, to avoid the technical terms of Hindu philosophy. Christianity is not a system of philosophy, and it is on its theological and spiritual side, that the teaching of the *Bhagavad-gītā* approximates most nearly to Christianity.

It is well-known that the Hindu philosophical systems are based upon the doctrine of metempsychosis. To avoid an endless series of transmigrations is the avowed object of them all. No doubt, some of the Hindu philosophical writers, like their *confrères* in Europe, may have speculated from a natural turn for metaphysical investigations without feeling very deeply the loathing for life, and dread of endless births, which was with the founders of the schools, the *raison d'être* of all philosophy. Still it is difficult to avoid the conviction that a profound hopelessness weighed upon the Indian people at the time when its philosophical systems were elaborated. Works evil and good are alike harmful in the eyes of these systematists and their modern disciples.\* The

\* Pandit Nehemiah Niilakantha S'astri Gore informs us that the dogmas of these Hindu systems are the root and life of the Hindu religion and as a Christianised Brāhman he has written a volume to refute them.

It seems to be allowed that from his Rational Refutation, and the Rev. K. M. Bauerjea's dialogues, more real knowledge of them is to be gained than from the writings of European scholars.

fruit of demerit is 'hell and a subsequent return to earth in some vile form, while the result of acquiring merit is little more desirable in the eyes of the wise. Good works procure for their doer a sojourn in Elysium. But this sojourn is not of eternal duration. After a time the stock of merit becomes exhausted ; and the soul of the virtuous man returns to earth, is born again in the body of a man of noble descent, or belonging to some family renowned for piety, and is subjected once more to all the miseries of worldly existence. To free oneself from the fetters of virtue and vice, to escape the perpetual recurrence of births, to attain emancipation, a state of immunity from misery, of absolute unconsciousness or absorption in the Supreme Soul, is the object of every one who takes a just measure of human life. All the systems maintain that the emancipation of the soul is to be attained by knowledge of some kind or other. The Sâṅkhyâ, which is by many scholars thought to be the oldest of all, teaches that the important matter is to distinguish clearly between the soul and nature. According to the doctors of this philosophy (which acknowledges no God, and but two ultimate bases of all existent things, nature and the soul), to do and to experience are not functions of the soul at all, but of the internal organ which is a part of nature, and the happiness and misery which men suppose that they feel in their souls are merely reflected from the internal organ.\* As soon therefore as a man perceives that his soul is in every way distinct from nature, and really experiences neither happiness nor misery, he is emancipated, and his accumulated works are consumed like chaff by the fire of right apprehension. But a section of this school, commonly-called the Yoga school of Patanjali, differs in many respects from the Atheistic branch. Not only do the followers of Patanjali believe in a God, the ruler of the world ; but finding apparently that "the tree of knowledge is not that of life," they endeavour to supplement knowledge by ascetic practices of various kinds, such as rigid fasting, suppression of the breath and prescribed postures. A devotee, we are told, should remain quiet, with passionless soul, free from anxiety, holding his body, head, and neck all even and immovable, regarding only the tip of his nose, and not looking round in different directions.† By these exercises the adept attains powers com-

\* This is illustrated by the way in which a China rose imparts to crystal its own roseate hue. The notion of a soul which is not bound, but at the same time is bound, because the bondage of the internal organ is reflected in it, is sufficiently absurd, but scarcely more so than "sensible species," and "intelligible species,"

and the other figments of European philosophies.

† Compare Gibbons' description of the quietists of Mount Athos (chapter 63.)

The opinion and practice of the monasteries of Mount Athos will be best represented in the words of an abbot who flourished in the eleventh

## 56 *The Bhagavad-gita and Christianity.*

pared with which those of modern spiritualists are insignificant. He is enabled to fly in the air, float in the water, and dive into the earth, and assumes at will an atomic or a colossal bulk. We know that, during the most flourishing ages of India, the life of a hermit was exceedingly popular. Kings retired into the woods in their old age, and the great Râma himself, with his brother Lakshmana and his wife Sîtâ, wandered for fourteen years in the forest of Dandaka. Still these young princes do not seem to have denied themselves the sport of hunting, or the excitement of occasional brushes with the wild aboriginal inhabitants of the forests and hills of Central India. Indeed it may be doubted whether these retirements into the forest, of which courtly poets make so much, were always such a very great sacrifice to a ruler sated with the joys of empire. Even in Europe kings "have cast crowns for rosaries away," and we are inclined to think that in many cases an old Indian râjâ, who had seen his son safely enthroned as his successor, felt it a positive relief to withdraw into the heart of the jungle, and leaving behind him the dust and flies and other innumerable annoyances of an Oriental town "fleet his time carelessly as they did in the golden world." No doubt in many cases, as we know from the history of Buddha, there was combined with this feeling a deep disgust at the short-lived character of human pleasures; a sense of the vanity of all worldly things, and of the miserable destiny of mortality. Whatever the cause may have been, we are justified in assuming as almost a certainty that, in some periods of Hindu history, kings and princes instead of clinging to their thrones with the tenacity of modern sovereigns in this part of the world, refused altogether to take upon themselves the duties and splendour of their offices, preferring to live as anchorites in the woods. If this religious mania spread extensively among the warrior-caste, as seems to have been the case, it must have been very disagreeable to the Brâhmans. They seem to have been always jealous of ascetics not of their own caste; indeed we are told that Râma himself was directed by a voice from heaven to decapitate a Sûdra, who was caught presuming to mortify his low-born flesh with the hope of attaining Elysium. To meet this evil, which was sapping the organization of society, and destroying the cherished system of caste, a new modification was introduced into the popular philosophical creed.

century. "When thou art alone in thy cell," says the ascetic teacher, "shut thy door and seat thyself in a corner; raise thy mind above all things vain and transitory; turn thy eyes and thought towards the middle of thy belly, the organ of the navel, and search the place of the heart, the

seat of the soul. At first all will be dark and comfortless; but if you persevere night and day, you will feel an ineffable joy, and no sooner has the soul discovered the place of the heart than it is involved in a mystic and ethereal light."

For the *Jñāna-yoga* or devout worship of the deity by means of knowledge, the system of Karmayoga or devotion by means of works was substituted, and this doctrine it is the special object of the Bhagavad-gītā to inculcate. At the same time it may be considered a manual of the Yoga and Sāṅkhyā philosophies, (for on most points there is no difference between these schools), and a theological tract advocating the worship of Krishna as the highest incarnation of the Supreme Being.

In certain passages we may detect a desire to trim with the Vedānta school which admits no existence but Brahma the supreme soul, and ascribes the supposed existence of the individual soul and of the world to Māyā or delusion. The Bhagavad-gītā should therefore be looked upon as one of those conciliatory works, of which the *Svetāśvatara* Upanishad is the most striking example.\* But it is with its theological character that we are principally concerned at present, as this forms the chief object of Dr. Lorinser's work. We propose to give a short abstract of the poem, with a metrical translation of some of the more striking passages, before proceeding to consider those minute resemblances upon which Dr. Lorinser appears principally to rely.

The Bhagavad-gītā is a noble instance of the disregard of probability which characterises Sanskrit literature, the most striking exemplification of which is perhaps furnished by another episode of the Mahābhārata, in which Bhīshma pierced with arrows, and lying on a bed of arrows, conveys to Yudhisthira, who comes to visit him, comfort, consolation and instruction on all subjects relating to this world and the next in about 20,000 verses. It commences with a question put by the old blind king Dhritarāshtra, father of the Kaurava princes, to his charioteer Sanjaya :—“ What did my followers, and what did the sons of Pāndu do, when assembled for the purpose of fighting on the sacred plain, the plain of Kuru”? Sanjaya gives a vivid description of the preparations for the struggle, tells how the chiefs blew their war conchs, and shouted for the battle, and how Arjuna, oppressed with melancholy at the thought of having to slay relations and friends, poured forth his soul to Krishna his charioteer, whom he supposed to be only a trusty comrade, the hero of the Yadu race, but who was really an incarnation of Vishnu the all-pervading soul of the world.

“ When I behold my valiant kin all thirsting for the fight,  
My knees are loosed, my mouth is dry, and tear-drops dim my sight ;  
My hair all upright stands from fear, slips from my hand the bow,  
My stalwart limbs with horror quake, my skin is all aglow.  
Oh ! Kess'ava, I scarce can stand, for giddy whirls my brain,  
And strange ill-boding sights I see, and monstrous shapes of pain ;

\* The *Svetāśvatara* Upanishad with the Prakriti or first productive identifies the Māyā of the Vedānta principle of the Sāṅkhyā.

No heavenly bliss can be my lot, the slayer of my kin ;  
 How can I long for victory or empire, dashed with sin ?  
 Those for whom kingly power we prize, and joys and wealth and life,  
 Leaving their wealth and happy lives, stand ranged for mortal strife.  
 Preceptor, fathers, grandsires, sons, though foes, I could not slay  
 To gain three worlds—much less for this, the empire of a day.  
 If we slay Dhritarashtra's sons, though dead to sense of right,  
 Shall we not lose those blissful worlds, and sink in endless night ?  
 Though these, with minds obscured with lust of gold and kingly state,  
 Shrink not from slaughter of their tribe, fear not the awful fate  
 Of those whose hands are red with blood of kinsman and of friend,  
 Shall we not dread their fearful crime—their still more fearful end ?  
 When falls the tribe, then long-revered primeval custom fails ;  
 When law is broken and o'erthrown, the lawless will prevails ;  
 When lawlessness infects a tribe, then women are made base ;  
 When women sin, then springs to light a mixed unhallowed race.  
 Then sink to hell alike defiled the slayers and the slain,  
 Nor longer can departed sires their blessed world maintain,  
 Cut off from holy offerings, they fall and curse their sons ;  
 Thus upward, downward, through the race the foul infection runs.  
 Then awful is our sin, who, drunk with blind ambition's wine,  
 Can long to shed the sacred blood of our own royal line :  
 Ah ! better far, if standing here with undefended head,  
 Unshielded breast, unsworded hand, some foe should strike me dead.

" Having thus spoken in the front of battle, Arjuna flung aside  
 " his bow and arrows, and sat him down on the seat of the  
 " chariot, having his mind distracted with grief." Here the first  
 canto entitled " the despondency of Arjuna" ends and the second  
 begins with the answer of the incarnate god. " Then to him thus  
 " despondent, penetrated with compassion, with his eyes filled and  
 " dimmed with tears, Krishna, the slayer of Madhu spake as  
 " follows :—

Though wise thy words, thou weep'st for those for whom men may not weep;  
 The sage shed no tears for those who live nor those who sleep.  
 For never was when thou, and I and all this mighty host  
 Did not exist, nor can we cease, in vacant darkness lost.  
 As in this mortal frame the soul sees childhood, youth, and old,  
 So after death it wanders on through myriad births impelled.  
 These elemental contacts, king ! the source of joy and woe,  
 These thou shouldest bear with steadfast mind, for these but come and go ;  
 For whom these move not, undisturbed in pleasure and in pain,  
 That man is fitted. Lord of men ! for an immortal reign.  
 That which is not can never be, nor that which is, decay,  
 That mighty soul which all sustains unresting, none can slay,  
 These dying bodies are instinct with one undying soul,  
 How can that kill or die which aye informs this mighty whole ?  
 It is not born, it does not die, it was not, nor will be ;  
 Though pierced its shell, eternal still, from all destruction free.  
 For as a man flings off his robe by constant service worn,  
 Even so the soul flings off its slough, in other bodies born.  
 It is not whelmed in floods, nor parched with blasting whirlwind's breath,  
 It does not fear the rushing flame, nor hissing bolt of death.  
 Then weep not thou for that which holds secure its changeless state ;  
 Pervading all, though unperceived, it laughs at time and fate.

Hindu poets, like those of other nations, have their *purpurie punni*, and the Bhagavad-gita does not always keep at this high level. It never descends to the puerile like too many Sanskrit poems, but those passages in which the bard teaches peculiarly Indian doctrines, do not possess the grandeur of this Pantheistic outburst, the spirit of which we have endeavoured to transfuse into our version. After exhorting Arjuna to perform the duties of his caste by fighting, and somewhat unphilosophically taunting him with the ridicule which he will incur if he retires from the battle, Krishna proceeds to set forth at length the great doctrine of Yoga or devotion. In his description of a *muni* or devotee, there is nothing sectarian, it probably embodies the usual Indian conception of an anchorit. "The true *muni*" we are told "is of undisturbed mind in affliction, has put away all desire of pleasure, is free from passion, fear, and anger, and of constant soul. Whosoever has no attachment to anything, and neither exults when any prosperous, nor is depressed when any adverse circumstance befalls him, in such a one wisdom is established. When he draws in his senses from the objects of sense, as a tortoise draws together its limbs, in such a one wisdom is established." Krishna, however, does not lose the opportunity of inculcating the great theological truth, that he is the proper object of all devotion. "Sometimes, O son of Kunti, the bewildering senses carry away violently the mind of a wise man, even though he struggle hard. Restraining all these he should sit, devout, *intent on me*, for whosoever has his senses under control, in such a one wisdom is established." The reward of continuing in this state of pious meditation is said to be absorption in the Supreme Being (*Brahma-nirvâna*), which the devotee attains if he remain faithful unto death.

The third canto of this poem illustrates, in a striking manner, the powerlessness for good of all Hindu speculations. We are surprised to find that the only practical out-come of this noble theosophy is, that a man should perform the duties of his caste, in other words that he should act as he would have done supposing he had never speculated at all.\* The canto gives us the key to the whole history of India, exemplifying that weakness in the Hindu character which makes it possible for the most noble theories even now to exist side by side with the vilest practices. It shows us that the great moral reformer, who goes by the name of Buddha, was wise in denouncing the caste-system; as tending to fetter the mind, and make moral progress impossible. Arjuna asks the god why, if mental devotion is such a blessed state, he

\* Many may have experienced a similar disappointment on reading that eloquent passage in the Theaetetus (175 E.) in which Plato seems to speak as if the only result of his philosophy was to produce "a graceful Greek gentleman."

still urges him to action. The answer practically amounts to this, that Arjuna, being a Kshatriya, is bound to fight, for such is the duty of a Kshatriya. There is, however, an attempt at argument. Even if a man tries to exist without action, it is impossible for him to do so, and if the deity were not indefatigable in action, mankind would perish. Therefore, Arjuna should put away his morbidness and imitate the deity. "It is better to do one's own duty in a defective manner, than to do another's well, it is better to be slain in the performance of one's duty; the duty of another is perilous to meddle with." And here comes in one of the distinctive doctrines of the Bhagavad-gîtâ, that action coupled with indifference is equal in merit to devotion. This is repeated again and again in the poem, and according to Thomson, who apparently looks upon the Bhagavad-gîtâ as a reactionary pamphlet, was invented by the pious zeal of some Brâhman, who wished to preserve the privileges of his caste, and to confine Kshatriyas to the occupation of war, which they appear sometimes to have neglected for theological speculation. The precept "do your own duty without self-interest," seems true and sublime, but cannot of course be reconciled with the doctrine of the supreme blessedness of Yoga, without assuming the eternal fitness of the caste-system, which Buddha had the audacity to impugn. The conclusion of the whole matter is, that the only doctrine appropriate to a member of the warrior-caste is devotion by means of works, an unselfish discharge of the duties of his caste, though in recommending this devotion to Arjuna, Krishna appeals to selfish motives. It is impossible to resist the conviction that a vein of insincerity runs through this exhortation, and that it was intended to throw dust in the eyes of the Kshatriyas.

Canto iv. commences with a conversation which Dr. Lorinser compares with that at the end of the 8th chapter of St. John. Krishna informs Arjuna that he taught the doctrine of Yoga to Vivasvat or the sun, the father of Manu, and that it was handed down from generation to generation until at last it became lost. Arjuna naturally asks for an explanation of this hard saying, since the birth of Krishna was posterior to that of Vivasvat. The god replies.—

Many births hast thou beheld here, many too have been my lot,  
All are from thy memory faded, I alone have not forgot;  
Though un-born and never-dying, though Almighty Lord of all,  
By my mystic power\* engendered I descend at duty's call;  
Oft as justice is in danger, and the wicked rule the earth,  
I forsake my lofty station, and in human form take birth,  
Wreak on evil-doers vengeance, rescue the downtrodden saint;  
Thus from age to age appear I, virtue to preserve from taint:

He who knows my birth and working, sets himself for ever free  
From the bonds of transmigration, and dwells undisturbed in me.\*

From this passage down to the end of the sixth canto, we meet with little that is new, except anticipations of what is subsequently stated in far more impassioned language. The only important points that are affirmed are the identity of the Yoga and Sāṅkhya philosophies, and the superiority of devotion by means of works to the renunciation of works. The continual repetition which characterises the *Bhagavad-gītā* will produce different effects upon different readers. Some remembering that it is found in most Sanskrit works, may regret that this truly noble poem is not free from the ordinary defects of Hindu literature, others will seem to detect in the persistent energy with which spiritual doctrines are reiterated "line, upon line and precept upon precept, here a little, and there a little," the true prophetic furor.

The sixth chapter ends with a very interesting passage, in which Krishna states most clearly the advantages of a loving devotion to himself, showing how it eventually brings about the emancipation of the man of strong passions, who, though intent on devotion, dies without attaining perfection.

Neither in this world nor yonder can such hero ever fail,  
None that doeth righteous actions ever sees the realms of bale,  
He shall dwell for countless ages in the blissful worlds on high,  
But through want of true devotion must again be born and die  
In some family of Brahmins or of kings appears on earth,  
Or perchance of holy hermits, (hard to win that glorious birth).  
With such virtues as he ended he begins once more the race,  
Towards the goal of high perfection turning resolute his face,  
For the might of former habits speeds him onward like the wind,  
Leaving slavish text-adorers, letter-worshippers behind ;  
So, through many births aspiring, purified at length from sin,  
He attains the wished-for mansion, and in peace doth enter in.  
Penance yields to high devotion, better be devout than wise,  
Better such than virtuous action, then do thou devotion prize ;  
First of devotees I hold him, who doth choose the better part  
And in humble faith adoring, cling to me with perfect heart.

Here we have what Dr. Lorinser considers the cardinal doctrine of the *Bhagavad-gītā*, *Bharti* or devotion to Krishna, extolled in the highest terms, and this out-burst forms a fitting prelude to the mightier melodies which follow :—

With the beginning of Canto vii. we enter upon the most interesting part of the *Bhagavad-gītā*. Dr. Lorinser observes that "the section containing Cantos vii.—xii. is the kernel of the whole poem. While the first six cantos are principally a development

\* I find that in these translations, original poem is written in two I have made use of two different diff-rent metres, one slightly longer metres. My excuse must be that the than the other.

"of the tenets of the Yoga philosophy, softened down and adapted "to the requirements of practical life, and in many respects modified "by Christian conceptions ; the second section treats principally of "the nature and attributes of God, and his relation to the world "and to men. The fundamental ideas of this portion are borrowed "partly from the theistic Sâṅkhyâ, partly from the Vedânta philosophy, but they have been so modified by Christian influences that "the Pantheism which is set forth in them assumes, in many respects, the appearance of a highly spiritual Monotheism. In opposition to the pure Monism of the Vedânta, we find the doctrine "of the distinction of the Supreme Spirit from the world ; and in opposition to the Sâṅkhyâ, which ascribes productive power only "to nature (*prakriti*), the doctrine of the creative might of the Divinity firmly maintained. The coping-stone of the whole edifice "is, however, the great truth that Vishnu, who has become incarnate "in the person of Krishna, is this Supreme Divinity, and that, "therefore, faith in him and adoration of him are necessary conditions of salvation. It is obvious at first sight that such a doctrine must have facilitated the introduction of Christian "ideas into the system. It is equally clear that as the leading "tenets of Indian philosophy are in general adhered to, we must "expect to find in it irreconcileable contradictions. These are, "however, very skilfully concealed, and we cannot deny that "Cantos vii. to xii. (inclusive) of the Bhagavad-gîtâ contain some "of the noblest speculations with regard to the Supreme Being "ever published in the heathen world, though we should not "put out of sight the fact that the knowledge of Christianity, "which the author possessed, imperfect as it was, had much to do "with the production of the really admirable and valuable portions of the poem."

The viith and viiith Cantos tell us that Krishna is the Supreme Spirit of the Universe, upon whom it is threaded, like beads upon a string, the flower and essence of all natural objects, the soul of that which exists, the father of spirits, the God of gods, and the Lord of Sacrifice.

It is obvious that in this part of the poem Dr. Lorinser finds an ample foundation for his theory, but it must be remembered that it is impossible to translate Sanskrit terms into German or English without inextricably introducing ideas and associations really foreign to the Indian mind. A translation to be intelligible must be a little unfaithful. We subjoin an attempt at a metrical version of the ixth Canto, which in the original is a noble Pantheistic hymn, but seems to us to lose something of its essential spirit in the English prose of Thomson and the Latin of Schlegel :—

---

Mark the blessed truths I utter : for with undivided will  
Whoso holds this mystic knowledge, shall redeem his soul from ill—

This the only lore of princes, this the secret of their sway ;  
Siu-destroying, light-infusing, that shall never pass away :  
Easy yoke, but unbelievers, who receive it not, shall range  
Swept away, by me unheeded, down the whirling stream of change.  
I, whose form no eye beholdeth, I stretched out this mighty whole :  
In me live and move all creatures, of all life the living soul :  
Yet in me they live and move not, (list my riddle hard to read),  
Though in mortal frames I dwell not, yet I all uphold and feed ;  
As the ever-moving ether in the bosom of the void,  
So in me they are and are not, now created, now destroyed :  
Sink in me, when ends each cycle, heaven and earth together rolled,  
These at each new age's dawning from my essence I unfold :  
I am spirit, I am matter, I absorb and I renew,  
Unconcerned ; though all regarding, yet untroubled at the view :  
Through my care live birds, beasts, fishes ; through my care are rocks  
All this changeful world of being still revolveth as I please : [and trees ;  
But the sons of darkness scorn me wearing thus a human frame ;  
Blind with idle pride of knowledge, swoll'n with idle lust of fame ;  
Knowing naught, intent on action, still unable to discern  
Veiled in flesh the lord of creatures, to their devilish creeds they turn :  
Hero souls, by me instructed, grasp the secret of my might,  
See in me the fount of being, see in me the source of light :  
Firm of purpose me they worship with the worship of the heart :  
Others serve with pious offerings me who dwell in every part :  
Undivided, all-pervading, I am rite and I am priest,  
Holy chaut, and holy incense, holy fire and holy feast,  
Of this world both sire and mother, word inspired, and mystic creed.  
Lord, sustainer, way, and witness ; birth, death, home, exhaustless seed :  
I pour forth the gladdening sunshine, I withhold and give the rain ;  
I am that which is and is not, I am nectar, I am bane :  
Those who reverence the three Vedas, and who pour the *soma* wine,  
By me led to Indra's heaven, drink their fill of joys divine,  
But when spent their stock of merit, down they fall again to earth :  
This the fate of Veda-lovers, ceaseless death and ceaseless birth.  
But whoe'er, with mind enlightened, plants his faith on me alone,  
Firm, all other gods rejecting, him I cherish as my own ;  
Blind are those who in my essence all the god-head fail to see,  
Worshipping the host of heaven, yet they worship only me,  
For me only smoke their altars, unto me their knees they bend,  
But by unbelief distracted to the lower worlds descend :  
With the gods are god-adorers, fiend-adorers in their hell,  
With the saints are saint-adorers, with me those who love me dwell ;  
Flowers, leaflets, fruits, and water if thou give with pious mind,  
I receive them, I consume them, to my chosen ever kind :  
What thou eatest, what thou drinkest, eat and drink as in my sight,  
Mine thy alms and thy oblations, for I claim them as my right.  
So released from bonds of action, nor on being's ocean tossed,  
Thou by pious meditation in my essence shalt be lost.  
Though indifferent to all creatures, I approve not nor condemn,  
Yet my true devoted servants in me are, and I in them.  
Men of sinful thoughts and actions, who all human laws despise,  
If with constant mind they serve me, yet are perfect in my eyes,  
Soon to saintly peace attain they, sunk in everlasting calm ;  
Rest assured, thou son of Kunti, him that serves me naught can harm.  
Those who seek to me for refuge, though conceived and born in sin,  
Base mechanics, slaves, and women, find a home my arms within ;

If such wretches I desert not, if I leave them not unblessed,  
 Then of priests and royal sages far more glorious is the rest.  
 In this world of change and trouble fixed on me thy spirit keep,  
 So absorbed in pure devotion in my bosom thou shall sleep.

The xth Canto, as Mrs. Manning observes in her *Ancient and Mediæval India*, goes over much the same ground as the ixth. Dr. Lorinser considers it, in spite of occasional Antinomian touches, such as, "I am the game of dice among things that deceive," as setting forth a truly noble Pantheism, "which differs *toto caelo* from the modern material Pantheism, which in reality is neither more nor less than a skilfully veiled Atheism." It cannot be effectively translated into English, as it requires for its comprehension an intimate knowledge of Indian mythology. Dr. Lorinser discovers in some passages striking resemblances to the language of the New Testament, but the consideration of these must at present be reserved.

In the xith Canto we have a striking description of the form of Krishna, which Dr. Lorinser considers to be an imitation of the account of the transfiguration of Christ given in our gospels. The parallel is no doubt striking, but it must be admitted that in the generally sublime description of the vision which Arjuna beholds, there is much that to European taste seems to border on the repulsive. On Arjuna's humbly entreating Krishna to reveal to him his celestial form, if it be lawful for him to behold it, Krishna consents to do so; at the same time he bestows on him the power of spiritual vision—"I give to thee a divine eye, behold my sovereign mystery."

Speaking thus, Oh king ! great Hari, to the Chief's enraptured gaze,  
 Mystic lord, his mystic god-head and transcendent form displays,  
 Thousand-eyed, and thousand-visaged, wondrous, awful to behold,  
 Armed with many threatening weapons, decked with gems of heavenly  
 mould.

Bearing heavenly robes, and garlands fragrant with celestial dew,  
 All-amazing, all-resplendent, flashed the god-head on his view.  
 Such the splendour as if kindled midst the darkness of the night  
 Twice five hundred suns together should confound the aching sight.  
 In that form divine the hero saw this universal frame,  
 Which, in myriad forms developed, one abideth, still the same,  
 Prostrate, then, the son of Pändu trembling, with upstarting hair,  
 Stretching hands of supplication, thus addressed his humble prayer.

*Arjuna speaks:—*

All the gods I see within thee, creatures of the earth and main,  
 Brahmā on his throne of lotus, sages and the serpent train ;  
 Infinite in all directions thousand-armed, and thousand-eyed,  
 End thou hast not, nor beginning, Lord in whom we all abide.  
 Bearing club and crown, and discus ; fount of life, abyss of light,  
 Dazzling like the noonday splendour, glory that forbids the sight.  
 Thou art undivided Being, highest object of all thought,  
 Stay of justice, source of order, who can praise thee as he ought ?  
 Yes, I see thee, and I feel thee, but I cannot tell thy name,  
 With thy eyes like sun and moon, and with thy lips of vital flame

Cherishing this world of nature ; filling heaven, and earth and sea,  
Without end, beginning, middle, the one infinite to-be.  
See the gods approach thee humbly, muttering with uplifted hands,  
Hail to thee ! exclaim the sages, heroes, and angelic bands ;  
All the demi-gods and demons, and the spirits of our sires.  
All the Titans and the giants, and the blessed heavenly quires.  
Praising thee in hymns of worship, still they tremble as they praise :  
All the worlds like me are awe-struck as upon thy form they gaze,  
Towering to the vault of heaven, filling all the space beneath,  
Fierce with flaming eyes and weapons, gaping mouths and jagged teeth.  
All my senses are confounded, prostrate in the dust I fall,  
I adore thee, world-upholder, spare thy suppliant, Lord of all.  
Lo ! towards thy mouths are rushing Dhritarashtra's impious brood.  
Bhishma, Drona, and the chieftains that upon their side have stood,  
And the noblest of our army, lo ! they enter with their foes ;  
Mangled limbs and heads are clinging midst thy teeth's tremendous rows  
As the streams are ever hastening onward, downward to the sea,  
As the moth towards the candle ever flies with thoughtless glee,  
So, by fate impelled the heroes crowd between thy blazing jaws,  
Eager rushing on their doom, "like birds the charming serpent draws."  
Licking up the tribes of mortals with thy greedy tongues of fire,  
Thou dost fill the world with death-flames rolling round in many a spire.  
Tell me all thy name and nature, and what means this shape of fear,  
For I know not what thou bringest, Lord, or what thy errand here.

*The Holy One speaks.*

I am Time, the all-devouring, in its fulness come to slay,  
None but thou, of both these armies, shall survive this fatal day.  
Dead are Drona, Bhishma, Karna ; dead is Kuru's impious line ;  
Rise, and slay them without mercy, thou art but a sword of mine,  
For, whom I have marked for slaughter, dies before his latest breath  
Rise and conquer ! I am with thee ; and my chosen name is Death.

If this passage is based upon the gospel narrative of the transfiguration, it must be admitted that there is much in it very alien from the spirit of our religion. Dr. Lorinser's book, however, is written with the intention of proving that the *Bhagavad-gita* is, to borrow a striking expression of Mr. Talboys Wheeler's, "a travesty of Christianity," a translation of Christian doctrines into the language of Hindu philosophy. At this point Arjuna's fear almost overmasters him: he entreats Krishna to pardon his previous ignorant familiarity, and with a passionate outburst of devout adoration supplicates him to resume his ordinary four-armed shape, retaining still tiara, club and discus. Krishna consents and comforts the terrified hero by assuming a "loveable form." He then informs him that he has beheld a sight that "angels desire to look into."

"E'en the gods are ever longing that transcendent sight to see,  
Which erewhile thou sawest, monarch, the eternal form of me,  
Not by arms, nor yet by penance, sacrifice, nor sacred lore,  
Is it given to behold me in that shape thou did'st adore ;  
Steadfast faith and firm devotion, these alone confer the power,  
Rightly knowing, to approach me in the body's dying hour :  
He who acts as I would have him, free from passion and unrest,  
Hating nought I have created, him I welcome to my breast."

The purport of the xiith Canto is thus stated by Dr. Lorinser : " Arjuna asks whether it is better to worship the manifested form " of Vishnu (or Krishna,) *i.e.*, that form under which he is " generally represented, or whether the purely abstract adoration " of a Supreme Being, attained by philosophical meditation, is " more meritorious ?

" It is clear from the answer which Krishna gives, that the " author of the Bhagavad-gîta, though he favours above all the cult " of Vishnu, does not wish to quarrel with the various philosophi- " cal schools, for he simply identifies that Supreme Being, which " they all worship in a more or less Pantheistic fashion, with " Vishnu, in the same way as he before identified with him all the " other gods. But he decidedly prefers the worship of God under " the form of Vishnu, as he declares it to be easier, and more " suited to the natural man ; whereas it is absurd to expect the " vulgar herd to occupy themselves with abstract metaphysical " speculations. This notion, too, is remarkably akin to Christian " ideas. The Incarnation has made the one true God, who, without " the help of revelation, was only perceived by a few favoured spi- " rigs in Pagan times, capable of being understood and approached " by all, whereas without this manifestation of himself he would " have remained a hidden mystery to the mass of mankind."

With the xiith Canto begins the third and more absolutely speculative division of the Bhagavad-gîta. Dr. Lorinser considers it to be a late addition of the same author as it destroys the unity of the poem. Internal criticism of this kind is very unsatisfactory, as Hindu compositions seldom aim at unity. It bristles with the technical terms of Sanskrit philosophy, being little more than a *r  sum  * of the S  nkhya system, with occasional re-affirmations of doctrines previously stated. A considerable portion of this section is devoted to explaining the nature of the three qualities : goodness, passion and darkness, the equipoise of which makes up Nature, a favourite tenet of Hindu thinkers. In Br  hmans the first quality, in Kshatriyas the second, in Vaisyas and S  dras the third is predominant. The presence of these qualities influences even our choice of food. For instance, passionate men prefer bitter, acid, salt, pungent and burning food. The same distinction runs through the faith and religious observances of different individuals. Those who possess the quality of goodness, worship the gods ; the passionate worship the demons called Yakshas and R  kshasas ; those in whom darkness predominates, adore those degraded spirits which haunt cemeteries and animate dead bodies. Here we have an instance of the ingenuous puerility which often characterises Hindu speculations, but, as a rule, is kept in the background in the Bhagavad-gîta. The truly wise man recognises no agent but these qualities ;

and at the same time is totally indifferent to them: he lets them take their course, being similarly affected with respect to clods of earth, stones, and gold; indifferent to praise or blame; free from interest in all undertakings, having his heart exclusively devoted to Vishnu, the home or representative of the Supreme Spirit. He hews down with the strong axe of indifference the fig-tree,\* the roots of which grow upwards and its branches downwards, whose leaves are the hymns of the Vedas, and whose shoots are the objects of sense, and whose roots are the binding works in the world of men. Having done this, he sets forth towards that place from which there is no return, the world not illuminated by sun, moon, or fire, the august home of Vishnu.

It is evident that even in this section we have fine and almost Christian thoughts mixed up with the characteristic doctrines of Indian speculation.

In the xvith Canto there is a satirical outburst worthy of being compared with those in the 3rd and 5th books of Lucretius. After stating the qualities of men who resemble the Devas, or gods, the poet describes *con amore* those who resemble the Asuras or demons. Unfortunately, there is next to no history in Sanskrit, literary or political, otherwise we might, perhaps, have learnt many interesting details about this polemic against the unbelievers.†

Nor to act, nor to abstain, do those of devilish nature know,  
 Not one seed of truth or virtue in their stubborn breasts can grow ;  
 Say they " Soul-less, unsubstantial is this world, a mere pretence,  
 " Sprung without divine causation for the pleasure of the sense;"‡  
 Clinging fast to this opinion, doltish, of perverted mind,  
 Still they practise evil actions for the ruin of mankind :  
 Harbouuring lust that's never sated, full of folly, pride and guile,  
 Blindly nursing wrong conceptions, following courses that defile,  
 Hugging this supreme delusion, that death ends the spirit's strife,  
 Glorying in sensual pleasures, crying " let us live our life,"  
 Bound with hundred cords of longing, slaves of anger and desire,  
 Piling up ill-gotten riches, fuel for their passions' fire ;  
 " This my object is attained now, this to-morrow I'll attain ;  
 " So much wealth I've heaped together, so much more I'll strive to gain,  
 " This foe, from my path I've swept him, others also I will slay ;  
 " I am king, and I'm enjoyer, wealthy, powerful, and gay,  
 " High-born, evermore successful ; who on earth can vie with me ?  
 " I will offer, give, and squander "—Thus insanely they decree,  
 Lost in vain imaginations, as in folly's net they fell,  
 Clinging fast to foul indulgence, down they sink to murky hell.  
 Stiff-necked, self-esteeming madmen, swollen with lawless pride of purse  
 Offer they unholy offerings which shall turn unto a curse.

\* The As'vattha, or Pippala (*Ficus Religiosa*), the roots of which, as Mrs. Manning observes, " grow as firmly up wards as downwards, and sprung forth as irrepressibly from brick-work as from earth." The same

comparison is found in the *Katha Upanishad*.

† Probably Chārvākas.

‡ Or perhaps created by Kāma (love). So the Greeks connected E. Os with the creation of the universe.

Self-conceit, and lust, and anger o'er their souls dominion claim,  
 Me they hate and torture present in their own and others' frame ;  
 These I hold my bitterest foemen, lowest in this circling world ;  
 These by my almighty *fiat* into devilish wombs are hurled ;  
 Born again in devilish natures, at each birth they downward tend,  
 Never finding me, till hopeless they to deepest gulfs descend.  
 Three-fold is the gate of Tartar, soul-destroying gate of woe,  
 Anger, lust, and greedy avarice, all these three thou should'st forego,  
 He who shuns these three temptations, gloomy mouths of the abyss,  
 He achieves his own salvation, and attains to sovereign bliss.  
 He who scorns the law of scripture, and is led by blind caprice,  
 Never shall behold perfection, heaven, nor the soul's release :  
 Then be thou by scripture guided, take it for thy rule of right,  
 Whate'er deed's enjoined by scripture, do that deed with all thy might.

The deed enjoined by Scripture, or, at any rate, Scripture as interpreted by the Brâhmans, was, in Arjuna's case, the slaying of his enemies in battle. The same note is struck again at the end of the poem, and Arjuna is informed that he cannot help fighting, even if he wishes to do so, for his nature will impel him thereto. The Bhagavad-gîtâ concludes with the following speech of Sañjaya : "Thus did I hear this conversation of Krishna and "the great-hearted Arjuna, wonderful, causing the hair to stand on "end.\* After hearing by the favour of Vyâsa† that transcendent "mystery, namely devotion, from Krishna, the Lord of devotion, "who himself in person revealed it : as often as I call to mind, "O King, this wonderful holy dialogue of Krishna and Arjuna, "I rejoice again and again. And as often as I call to mind that "wonderful shape of Vishnu, I am greatly astounded, O King, "and I rejoice again and again. Wherever are Krishna, the "Lord of devotion, and the bow-bearing Arjuna, there good for- "tune, victory, and power are assured, such is my opinion."

Those who have had the patience to follow us thus far, must have been struck by the general similarity of the thoughts to those which we find in the Christian Scriptures, and especially, as Dr. Lorinser observes, to those familiar to us in the Gospel of St. John. The earlier editors of the Bhagavad-gîtâ, following the prevalent Indian belief, attributed to it a high antiquity. But the general tendency of modern criticism has been to abate the extravagant pretensions to antiquity of Sanskrit writings, and the judgment of Lassen is, that the Bhagavad-gîtâ is post-Buddhistic. On the other hand, as Sankara Achârya, the famous philosopher of the Vedânta school, who is supposed to have lived in the eighth century, has left a commentary upon it, we may assume that it had attained a wide circulation and great influence in India before his time, especially as he is said to have written with the express object of controverting previous expositors,

\* Probably from delight.

† The author of the Mahâbhârata.

Lassen accordingly fixes on the third century as a probable date for the composition of the poem. Dr. Lorinser adopts the date fixed by Lassen as denoting the very earliest period at which the Bhagavad-gîtâ can have been written, and remarks that it is quite possible that the author may have been acquainted with the Christian Scriptures as Eusebius\* tells us that Pautaenus, who travelled as a missionary to India in the second century, found there a copy of the Hebrew Gospel of St. Matthew, which was said to have been carried there by the Apostle Bartholomew, and that he brought it back with him to Alexandria. Moreover, we learn from St. Chrysostom that the New Testament was translated into some Indian language. The passage which, as Dr. Lorinser remarks, has been overlooked by other scholars, is found in the 1st Chapter of St. Chrysostom's Homilies upon the Gospel of St. John, and runs as follows:—

“ Moreover, the Syrians and the Egyptians, and the Indians, “ and the Persians, and the Ethiopians, and countless other “ nations, having translated into their own languages the doctrines “ promulgated by him, have learnt, though barbarians, to philosophize.”

The expression “ countless nations ” (*unpia ἔθνη*) might, observes Dr. Lorinser, have weakened the force of this testimony, if we did not know that all the other translations mentioned by St. Chrysostom are now actually extant. Dr. Lorinser accordingly comes to the conclusion that the author of the Bhagavad-gîtâ was not only to a certain extent under the dominion of Christian ideas, but was actually acquainted with the Greek text of the New Testament; and, as Professor Windisch puts it, “ learnt it by heart.” The former proposition seems to us, though not absolutely proved, to be in accordance with what is known of the action and re-action upon one another of Indian and Alexandrian thought; but we cannot bring ourselves to believe that a Hindu can have united such an intimate acquaintance with the New Testament, with a bigoted adherence to an Indian religion and Indian philosophy. We will proceed to consider them in order.

There can be no doubt that by the labours of Weber, Lorinser, Talboys Wheeler and others, a strong case has been made out for the theory that Christianity largely modified Indian theological thought. It is indubitable that the development of Christianity was in its turn considerably modified, especially among the less orthodox schools, by the introduction of Indian ideas. The lively intercourse which subsisted between Alexandria and Western India, during the first five centuries of the Christian era, resulted in an interchange of ideas as well as commodities. It has often been

asserted that some of the Gnostic systems were formed under Indian influence. We will take first the system of Bardesanes, a Gnostic of the Syrian school, as described by the late Dr. Jeremie, and point out some of the parallels which it furnishes to the Indian systems. We read that "the human soul formed "after God's image, pure and innocent, was not clothed with flesh, "but with a subtle and ethereal body, conformable to its "nature." This opinion Dr. Jeremie supposes to have been of Jewish origin, but it reminds us in a striking manner of the *linga-sarira* of Indian philosophy.\* "This subtle frame," we read in Colebrooke's Essay on the Sâṅkhyâ system, is primeval "produced from original nature at the earliest or initial development of principles. It is unconfined, too subtle for restraint "or hindrance." The soul, according to Bardesanes, is afterwards imprisoned in a gross or carnal body. Similarly in the Sâṅkhyâ philosophy, the soul clad in its subtle person is invested in the grosser body for the purpose of fruition.

Bardesanes depended on abstinence, fasts, and meditation to break the power of the passions; it is unnecessary to point out the similarity of his teaching in this respect to that of the Yoga philosophy.

The system of Valentinus, a Gnostic of Alexandria, reminds us in a still more striking way of Indian philosophy. To begin with, he divides men as well as substances into three classes: spiritual, (or pneumatic), material (or hylic), and animal (or psychical). This is a striking parallel to the three qualities of all Indian systems: goodness, darkness, and passion. The doctrine of Aeons, or emanations, which he shared with Basilides, may have been derived from the twenty-five principles of the Sâṅkhyâ. Or, possibly, the Indian philosophers may have borrowed from the Gnostics, though this seems much less probable. In any case, the resemblances are so minute that they can hardly be accidental. The Manichæans have always been supposed to have been indebted to India for some of their views. Though they called themselves Christians, many of their doctrines were certainly almost identical with those of Indian theosophy. For instance, Manes admitted the transmigration of souls, but asserted that those which are not purged by a certain number of transmigrations are delivered to the demons to be tormented and tamed by them, and that after this discipline they are sent into other bodies; moreover, he required of his elect to live in voluntary poverty without interfering in temporal matters. The Neoplatonists of Alexandria, though not Christians, illustrate the wide diffusion of Indian ideas in the East of the Roman Empire. We

\* It is distinctly mentioned by Hippolytus in his *Philosophumena* I., p. 29, as a doctrine of the Brâh- mans. [Colebrooke's Essays vol. p. 395, Editors' note.]

read in Dr. Jeremie's account of Plotinus, who is said by his friend Porphyry to have endeavoured to acquire a knowledge of Persian and Indian philosophy, that "from the first principle proceeds Mind, or intellect, its lively image." In the same way, in the Sâṅkhyâ system, from Nature, the plastic origin of all, proceeds Intelligence, called *Mahat*, or the great one. Plotinus speaks of the soul as diffused throughout all bodies,\* much in the same way as Krishna does in the Bhagavad-gîtâ. The importance attached to Theurgic practices as leading to immediate communications with superior beings, enabling men to acquire power over Nature, and to attain to the enjoyment of the Divine vision, forms a fitting parallel to the extravagances of the Yoga philosophy. One is not surprised to find heathen philosophers indebted to the Indian systems, but Weber and others go so far as to say that certain points in the ceremonial and discipline of the Roman Catholic Church are probably borrowed from Buddhism. It is, at any rate, strange that monasteries and nunneries, celibacy, the worship of relics, the tonsure, rosaries, and the use of church-bells, should be found in both religions.

If the West received so much from the East, we can scarcely consider it *a priori* unlikely that the West should have imparted something in turn. And it is the opinion of Drs. Weber and Lorinser, and of Mr. Talboys Wheeler, that Christianity exerted a considerable effect in bringing about some of the modern developments of Brahmanism. Without adopting quite literally Mr. Wheeler's trenchant expression, that Krishna-worship is a "travesty of Christianity," we shall find it extremely probable that Christianity introduced into the Krishna-cult, which already existed in India, certain new elements. The introduction of these new elements may have been due to intercourse with the so-called Thomas Christians on the Coast of Malabar, or to direct communication by sea with Alexandria. Indeed, we have a tradition in the legends of the Hindus which seems to point in the latter direction. In a passage from the Mahâbhârata quoted by Weber,† there is an account of an unsuccessful voyage made by Ekata, Dvita and Trita, to S'veta-dvîpa, the White Island, or the Island of the White Men, in obedience to an invisible voice, to learn there the monotheistic doctrine of its white inhabitants; and of a pilgrimage subsequently undertaken by the sage Nârada to the same place with a more fortunate result. The passage to which Weber refers is found in the S'ântiparva of the Mahâbhârata,‡ the longest canto

\* πῦσαι ἀτ ψυχαὶ μία Ritter and Preller, Hist. Philos., p. 497.

† Indian Antiquary, vol. iii., p. 21.

‡ Mahâbhârata, xii., 12, 776 ff.

This reference is given in the iii. vol. of the Indian Antiquary p. 24, where some part of the extracts will be found in Sanskrit.

in the poem, being that in which Yudhishthira is comforted by the dying Bhishma. It may be worth while to give a free translation of the more remarkable passages in the description to which Dr. Weber refers. We begin with the voyage of Ekata, Dvita, and Trita :

" Then when we had completed our vow, a voice in the air spake  
 " with sweet and deep tones, delighting our hearts, ' You have per-  
 " formed your penance, Oh Brâhmans, with tranquil mind, how are  
 " you, who are his devoted worshippers and desirous of knowledge,  
 " to behold that supreme lord ? On the other side of the Sea of  
 " Milk lies the glorious S'veta-dvîpa, there are men glistering like  
 " the moon, devoted to Nârâyana ; those worshippers of the supreme  
 " soul have attained to the knowledge of the Divine Unity ; they  
 " enter into the god of a thousand rays, not being subject to their  
 " senses, abstaining from food, immoveable, sweetly perfumed.  
 " Those inhabitants of S'veta-dvîpa are worshippers of the Divine  
 " Unity, go there O *Munis*, there my true nature is revealed.' Then  
 " we all having heard that voice in the air went to that country by  
 " the appointed way. When we arrived at that country, thinking of  
 " Nârâyana; and desirous of beholding him, though the sight of our  
 " eyes was unimpaired, we did not behold him as we were dazzled  
 " by his splendour. Then there arose in us discernment, the fruit  
 " of devotion, by which we knew that without performing fresh  
 " austerities we should not be able to behold the god. Then we  
 " performed another penance, lasting one hundred years, and at the  
 " end of the time we beheld glistering men, white, appearing like  
 " the moon, adorned with all the auspicious marks, with their  
 " palms ever joined in supplication, praying to the Supreme Being  
 " with their faces turned to the East ; the prayer which is offered by  
 " those great-hearted ones is called the mental prayer. *Hari*\* is  
 " pleased with that intentness of devotion to him. Such as is the  
 " brightness of the sun at the destruction of the world, such was  
 " the brightness of each one of these men ; that island is the home  
 " of brightness, thus we thought—none surpassed other, all were  
 " of equal brightness. Then we suddenly saw a glory diffused, like  
 " that of a thousand suns shining at once, and those men quickly  
 " advanced towards that glory, with hands joined in supplication,  
 " joyfully exclaiming—Hail to Thee ! We heard the loud sound of  
 " them exclaiming, and knew that those men were offering the  
 " oblation to the god ; but we were rendered suddenly unconscious  
 " by his splendour and saw nothing, deprived of the use of our eyes,  
 " void of strength and senseless. But we only heard a loud cry  
 " uttered, Thou art victorious, Oh Lotus-eyed one.† Hail to Thee,

\* A name of Krishna regarded as identical with Vishnu.

† An epithet of Vishnu.

" Oh Creator of the Universe, Hail to Thee, the Eldest Son of  
" the Supreme Soul.

" Such was the sound heard by us, accompanied with teaching.  
" In the meanwhile, a pure wind, laden with all perfumes, brought  
" heavenly flowers and healing drugs. When those men who know  
" the five times of sacrifice, worshippers of the Divine Unity,  
" earnestly devoted to Vishnu, in speech, mind and action, uttered  
" that cry, the god himself of a truth came to that place. But  
" we did not behold him, being bewildered by his deluding  
" power.\*"

The story then goes on to tell how the three pilgrims were not saluted by any of the inhabitants of S'yeta-dvipa, and were eventually dismissed by a celestial voice, which promised them great honour at a future period, though they had not attained the main object of their journey. But to Nârada was vouchsafed a revelation of the glory of Krishna, similar to that which, as we read in the Bhagavad-gîtâ, it was granted to Arjuna to behold.

Nârada, the holy sage, having arrived at the White Island, saw those very men, white, glistening like the moon : he saluted them with head and mind, and was saluted by them in return. He stood absorbed in prayer, performing all kinds of austerities, in concentrated meditation, intent only on the god, with his arms aloft, desiring to behold him, and chanted a hymn of praise to him." This hymn we shall pass over as it contains little besides the various titles of the god, which extend over 17 long lines of print.

" That god, the supporter of the universe, being thus praised by those secret and true names, revealed himself to Nârada." It is not necessary to extract the description of his form, as the passage, though reminding us of the similar one in the Bhagavad-gîtâ, is not equal to it in poetical merit. There is much that is astonishing in the account of the voyage of the three hermits, who might, as Weber says, if their voyage had been successful, have reminded us of the three *Magi*.

It is scarcely too daring a conjecture to suppose, that the passage contains a description of the effect produced upon some Indian pilgrims by witnessing a Christian service. The burning of incense, and the celebration of the Eucharist, are sufficiently clearly indicated, and Dr. Lorinser would, no doubt, take the word which we have translated "teaching" to refer to a sermon, or to the instruction of catechumens. The connection of the voyage with the present worship of Krishna is supported by the clearest proofs. The Rev. K. M. Banerjea remarks that in remembrance of that pilgrimage an important part is still

devoted in the Krishna ritual, to the honour of Nārada, of the sea of milk, and of the S'veta-dvīpa; and Dr. Ballantine informs us that a native commentator on the *Sāndilya Sūtras*, refers the peculiar doctrine of this work concerning *bhakti*, the power of faith, to the same legend, and indicates S'veta-dvīpa as the home of the doctrine. Weber contends that S'veta-dvīpa must be Alexandria, and he attempts to fix the date of Nārada's voyage at a time when the birth and baptism of Christ were celebrated on the same day, as the *nāma-karanam*, or giving of a name, is an integral part also of the celebration of Krishna's birth-day. Now the custom peculiar to Egypt of celebrating on the 6th of January the birth and baptism of Christ ceased about the year 431. This conclusion would, of course, fall to the ground, if there should ever be reason to think that the S'veta-dvīpa of the legend does not represent Alexandria. The details of what the three pilgrims saw there, upon which Dr. Weber lays no stress at all, seem to us to make it extremely likely that some Christian country is intended. Without reposing implicit faith in all the learned German's conclusions, we may safely adopt his assertion, that it is highly probable that many legends connected with Krishna owe their origin to Christianity, whether learned in Alexandria by Indian pilgrims, or taught in India by Christian missionaries, of which latter influence some obscure traces have been discovered in Sanskrit literature.

Dr. Weber remarks "that the birth and childhood of Krishna are embellished with notices that remind us irresistibly of Christian legends. Take, for instance, the statement of the *Vishnu Purāna*, "that Nanda, the foster-father of Krishna, at the time of the latter's birth, went with his pregnant wife Yas'odā to Mathura to pay "his taxes, or the pictorial representation of Krishna in the "cow-stall, or shepherd's hut, that corresponds to the *manger*, and "of the shepherds, shepherdesses, the ox and the ass that stand "round the woman as she sleeps peacefully on her couch without "fear of danger. Then we have the stories of the persecution of "Kansa, of the massacre of the innocents, of the passage across "the river (Christophorus,) of the wonderful deeds of the child, "of the healing virtue of the water in which he was washed, &c." Dr. Weber also considers "the accounts given in the *Jaimini Bṛhmaṇa* of the raising to life by Krishna of the dead son of "Duḥsala, of the cure of Kuljā, of her pouring a vessel of ointment over him, of the power of his look to take away sin, and "other subjects of the kind," as certainly of Christian origin.

Equally certain, according to him, is the assumption—"that the "later exclusively monotheistic direction of the Indian sects, "which honour a distinct personal God, pray for His grace, and "believe in Him, has been influenced by the acquaintance

" which the Indians had with the corresponding doctrines of Christianity."\*

It is not necessary to accept in their entirety these latter conclusions, which have been impugned with some success by native and European scholars ; but it seems that the legendary particulars of Krishna's infancy and childhood must have been borrowed from a Christian tradition. That all these coincidences can be accidental it is difficult to believe. It may be regarded, therefore, as no less probable that the Indian worshippers of Krishna took some elements of their faith from Christianity than that the Gnostics borrowed many of their doctrines from Hindu philosophy. The notion that "the sanctity of Christianity will be lost," if something borrowed from it is found in Hindu literature, is as absurd as the indignation which the learned of India show at the bare suggestion, that the worship of the hero Krishna has been in any degree modified by foreign elements. The similarity of the names, no doubt, made the transference to Krishna of stories borrowed from the canonical and apocryphal Gospels easy and natural.†

There seems, therefore, to be so far nothing improbable in Dr. Lorinser's theory of a familiarity on the part of the author of the Bhagavad-gita with Christian ideas ; but it seems to us that he weakens rather than strengthens his case, when he states his belief that he was a diligent student of the New Testament, and of the Wisdom of Solomon, and consciously imitated several passages in them. Dr. Lorinser brings forward a long array of parallel passages in support of his view, but in most of them the resemblance seems purely accidental, and we fail to trace in some of them any resemblance at all. He arranges these passages in three classes : (1<sup>st</sup>) those which vary in expression, but agree in sense ; (2<sup>nd</sup>) those in which a characteristic expression of the New Testament is found in a different sense ; (3<sup>rd</sup>) passages in which sense and expression correspond. He lays great stress upon the second class, but the verbal resemblances seem to us to prove nothing. That Krishna should speak of his worshippers as "going to him," and Christ of His as "coming to Him," (in totally different senses be it observed,) is an insufficient basis upon which to erect a theory. And the resemblances of the first class can, after all, only be of subordinate importance. We will, therefore, extract some of the most striking resemblances of the third class, as being those upon which the author's theory principally depends. We may observe that we have not followed exactly Dr. Lorinser's translations, as we do not consider them sufficiently literal.

\* Indian Antiquary, vol. iii. p. 52. necessarily imply any want of enlightenment in the ancient Hindus as those

† Dr. Weber has shown that the Hindus were probably acquainted with Greek astronomy. Nor does this of the present day seem to imagine.

## 76 *The Bhagavad-gita and Christianity.*

### BHAGAVAD-GITA.

I am exceedingly dear to the wise man, and he is dear to me in return. vii., 17.

To be understood at first sight—easy to perform. ix., 2.

I am way (or perhaps more correctly, *destination*) home, asylum, origin. ix., 18.

I give warmth, I withhold or pour forth the rain. ix., 19.

Those who worship me with true devotion are in me, and I in them. ix., 29.

No one devoted to me perishes. ix., 31.

I am the beginning, and the middle, and the end of creatures. x., 20.

Among letters I am the A. x., 33.

I will deliver you from all sin; do not grieve. xviii., 66.

It has been already mentioned that our author sees in the revelation of the divine form of Krishna a direct imitation of the narrative of the transfiguration, and he compares the confession of St. Peter to that of Arjuna in the 10th chapter of the Bhagavad-Gita. The resemblance is no doubt striking.

### *Bhagavad-gita.*

Thou art the Supreme Brahma the highest home, . . . all sages call thee the everlasting divine soul . . . I consider all this true which thou sayest to me. x., 12, 14.

### NEW TESTAMENT.

He that loveth me shall be loved of my Father, and I will love him, Johu. xiv., 21.

My yoke is easy and my burden is light. Matt. xi., 30.

I am the way. John, xiv., 6.

I am the first and the last. Apoc., i., 17.

He maketh His sun to rise on the evil and the good, and sendeth rain on the just and on the unjust. Matt. ix., 45.

I in them and they in me, that they may be made perfect in one. John, xviii., 23.

He that eateth my flesh and drinketh my blood dwelleth in me and I in him. John, vi., 56.

That whosoever believeth in Him should not perish but have everlasting life. John, iii., 16.

I am the first and the last. Apoc. i., 17.

I am Alpha and Omega, the beginning and the end. Apoc. i., 8.

Son be of good cheer, thy sins be forgiven thee. Matt ix., 2.

### *New Testament.*

And Simon Peter answered and said, Thou art the Christ the Son of the living God. Matt. xvi., 16.

Simon Peter answered him, Lord to whom shall we go? Thou hast the words of eternal life. And we believe and are sure that Thou art that Christ the Son of the living God. John, vi., 68, 69.

Dr. Lorinser has, at any rate, brought out into clear light the remarkable similarity that exists between some of the conceptions and expressions in the *Bhagavad-gītā*, and those with which we are familiar in our own sacred writings. But Dr. Muir and others have shown that there is, after all, grave reason to doubt whether this similarity can fairly be considered as proving that the author of this poem was familiar with Christian ideas.

Dr. Muir, who is very zealous for the religious independence of the Hindus, remarks that in the *Rig-veda* "we meet with a variety of expressions in which the worshipper's trust in, and regard for, the god Indra are indicated ; his friendship and guidance are said to be sweet; he is spoken of as a father, and the most fatherly of fathers; and as being both a father and a mother ; he is the helper of the poor and has a love for mortals." Indeed, we believe that no one who has any acquaintance with Sanskrit literature can help being struck with the remarkable echoes of Christian thought found in it. The ancient Hindus seem, more than any other nation of the heathen world, to have been oppressed with a feeling of the exceeding sinfulness of sin. In this respect they differed very widely from the Greeks, to whom spiritual wrestlings and agonies were almost unknown, and whose melancholy was generally of a less elevated character ; taking the form of regret for the short-lived bloom of youth and beauty, and vain repinings at the irresistible march of unsparing destiny. Then we have the whole doctrine of incarnations, which writers of Dr. Lorinser's way of thinking, of course, supposed to be directly borrowed from Christianity. Admitting that they are so borrowed, as being connected with Vishnu, whose cult is most nearly allied to Christianity, we have still many expressions that cannot be so explained. In the *Yoga* philosophy "devotion to the Lord" is spoken of as conferring "perfection in meditation," which makes it possible that many of the expressions in the *Bhagavad-gītā*, supposed to be due to Christianity, are merely taken from the *Yoga* system. It is clear that if we accept the view that the revelation of the divine form of Arjuna is borrowed from the narrative of the transfiguration, we shall have to refer the similar passage in the *Sāutiparvan* to the same source. Considering the great probability there is that the Krishna legend is indebted to the gospel narratives, it may be possible to admit that all passages in Sanskrit theological works expressing devotion to Vishnu are imitations of some Christian model. But there are numerous resemblances to Western thoughts in Sanskrit literature which cannot be accounted for in this way. Possibly some of the fables of the *Panchatantra* may be borrowed from *Aesop*, or both from a common African source, as the lion is always represented as the king of beasts in them, but what are we to

## 78 *The Bhagavad-gita and Christianity.*

make of the resemblances between Hindu and Greek philosophy? Greek scholars will never admit that the Greek philosophers borrowed from the Hindus, and we believe that most Sanskrit scholars are also of opinion that the Hindu systems are a purely native growth. Professor Max Müller will not hear of Hindu logic having been modelled on Greek, and the weight of so great an authority will, I think, be supported by an impartial examination of any Hindu logical treatise. We have no satisfactory evidence of any communication between India and Greece in the days of the early Greek philosophers. And yet the similarity of their tenets to those of the Indian systematists has often been remarked. Colebrooke, who considers that the Greeks borrowed from the Hindus, ascribes to Pythagoras ideas which may have been of a later date. But there can be no doubt that he held the doctrine of metempsychosis, of which Plato makes such splendid use. The following speech, which Ovid puts into his mouth, might well have been addressed by Krishna to Arjuna\*:

Omnia mutantur, nihil interit. Errat et illuc  
Huc venit, hinc illuc et quoslibet occupat artus  
Spiritus, eque feris humana in corpora transit,  
Inque feras vester, nec tempore deperit ullo.  
Utque novis facilis signatur cera figuris,  
Nec manet ut fuerat nec formas servat easdem,  
Sed tamen ipsa eadem est : animam sic semper eandem,  
Esse, sed in variis doceo migrare figuras.

Innumerable such parallels might be drawn between the speculations of Greek and Hindu philosophers. The notions of an infinite primary substance, of an endless succession of worlds, and of natural opposites, found in Anaximander, remind us at once of similar tenets in Hindu systems; atoms and elements play as important a part in Hindu speculations as in those of the Greeks. Certain portions of the Upanishad read like a Platonic myth. Dr. Roer long ago pointed out the similarity between the fine comparison in the *Katha Upanishad*† "of the body with a car, the soul with the charioteer, the senses with the horses, the mind with the reins, &c.;" and the allegorical description in the *Phædrus*, (p. 246,) so well known to all students of Plato. If we apply Dr. Lorinser's method of reasoning, we shall have to suppose here a borrowing on one side or the other. Indeed, we believe he considers this Upanishad, and one or two others which resemble in style the *Bhagavad-gita*, as equally with that poem indebted to Christianity, and believes it to have been composed at a much later date than that generally assigned to it.

\* Ovid. *Met.* XV., 165, quoted by *Philosophia.*

Ritter and Preller in their *Historia* † *Bibliotheca Indica*, vol. xv., p. 81.

But of all the Greek philosophers, Parmenides and Empedocles remind us most vividly of Hindu thinkers. The fact, that they considered verse the natural vehicle of philosophic truths, makes them the nearest European representatives of those sages who first heard the divine voice and "chanted" to submissive pupils the Indian scriptures. The high prophetic character which Parmenides adopts, and the oracular majesty of his language, fascinate us in much the same way as the authoritative utterances of the Bhagavad-gîtâ.

Take, for instance, the following passage, in which he sets forth his system of Monism, a system which, judging from the fragments we possess, might well have been elaborated in the solitudes of some Indian jungle :

Thought and thought's object are the same in kind,  
Nor deem thy thought lives only in the mind,  
Nor canst thou from existence separate thought,  
For all without existence is but nought.  
So firm hath fate its strict foundations cast,  
That by itself it ever standeth fast,  
While round it peer we creatures of a day,  
And boldly cry—these wax, and those decay ;  
These are, those are not, this hath changed its place,  
Or marred the splendour of its former face.

Here we have the one entity, the Brahma of the Vedanta philosophy, which, by reason of our ignorance, appears to us as the world. Parmenides held also in the true spirit of Oriental Pantheism, that nothing comes into existence, and nothing decays, but all ever is. The same doctrine of the impossibility of birth and dissolution is found in Empedocles, who, while in some points he seems to have anticipated the latest conclusions of European science, has in others made as near an approach as a Greek could make to the doctrines of Hindu philosophy. Indeed, his personality was almost as much Hindu as Greek. He was a priest, a prophet, and a physician ; he often was seen at magic rites, and he was proved to have worked mighty miracles. Even in his lifetime he considered himself to have purified his soul by devotion ; to have purged away the impurities of his birth ; to have become, in fact, *jivanmukta*. He embraced the doctrine of metempsychosis in all its absurdity.

" For I have been ere this a youth and a maiden, and a bush, and a bird, and a voiceless fish in the sea."† Such was the fruit of sin, which compelled the erring soul to wander an outcast from heaven. A natural result of this belief was his aversion to animal

† I must apologize for extracting a large number of passages from so well-known a book as Ritter and Preller's *History of Philosophy*. Writing, as I am, in India, I cannot help hoping that this Essay may be read by learned Hindus, to the majority of whom a book written in Latin and Greek is one with seven seals.

food. He thus expresses his loathing for the carnivorous habit of his compatriots.

"The father seizes his dear son who has assumed another form \* and slays him, offering prayers over him; deluded wretch that "he is: and the son goes along appealing in vain to his sacrificer; "but he, deaf to his prayers, hounds him on, and having slain "him in his home, provides for himself an abominable feast. In "like manner, the son takes his father, and children their mother, "and tearing out the life they devour kindred flesh."

It would be easy to multiply passages from the fragments of Empedocles, which remind us of Hindu thought; indeed, it is our firm belief that Dr. Lorinser's method, if perniciously applied to Greek literature, might produce most surprising results.\*

It was formerly supposed that all these striking coincidences might be accounted for by the fact, that early Greek philosophers visited the East, and learned the doctrines of the Indian gymnosophists. This theory is no longer fashionable. Mr. J. A. Symonds expresses the opinion now generally prevalent, when he says†— "There is no reason to suppose that Asiatic thought had any marked or direct influence upon Greek philosophy. It is better to refer such similarities to the working of the same tendencies in the Greek and Hindu minds." Modern science is inclined to look upon the metaphysical, ethical, and religious systems of various nations as independent developments. Those who have imbibed this view will not admit the theory of borrowing, without convincing proof of intercourse. Now there is absolutely no satisfactory evidence that any of the early Greek philosophers had any intercourse with the sages of India. It follows that in this case the theory of borrowing is not applicable. The germs of these various growths may have been brought by both Greeks and Hindus from the primitive Aryan home, but it is not necessary to suppose that Greek philosophy is a copy of Hindu thought, any more than that the Greek language was built up in imitation of the Sauskrit. Nor need the many striking resemblances between the Hindu epic and Homer, and the fact that both nations have developed the drama and elaborated systems of rhetoric, arouse our wonder. Indeed, as Greeks and Hindus probably spring from the same Aryan stock, we might, perhaps, have expected to

\* There is much in the meditations of that famous *rājārshi*, Marcus Aurelius, that reminds us very forcibly of Indian γνῶμαι. c. p. γνῶσσος πᾶν τὸντο καὶ λνθρον ἐν θνλακη (VIII., 37.) with Hitopadesa, I. vv., 48, 49. Many such parallels might be adduced, but nothing would be

gained by it. The striking similarity of thought and expression between the meditations of the Roman Emperor and Ecclesiastes does not prove that Marcus Aurelius studied the Jewish Scriptures.

† The Greek Poets, p. 41.

find greater similarity between their intellectual products than actually seems to exist. Besides this resemblance does not stand alone. It has often been remarked that the ideal of European society in the middle ages is precisely that which the Brâhmans seem at about the same time to have done their best to establish in India. The knight of mediaeval romance and chronicle, who smote the infidel without condescending to argue with him, confessed himself regularly, and was in all things submissive to the church, resembled very closely the pious Kshatriya, who always acted according to the *Sâstras*, honoured Brâhmans and religious mendicants, and implicitly obeyed his spiritual guide.

If these numerous points of resemblance between European and Indian civilisation at various epochs of their development are not considered to imply the mutual inter-dependence of the two systems, we must be careful how we account for similarity in ethical or religious conceptions by the theory of borrowing.

Even supposing that the poem we have been considering should be satisfactorily proved to have been written some time after the Christian era, which has certainly not been proved as yet, it is doubtful if we should be justified in making it an exceptional case and supposing it to be largely leavened with Christian thought. Even Dr. Lorinser would admit that the Christian doctrines, which he supposes himself to have found in the *Bhagavad-gîtâ*, are sadly distorted and mixed up with much that is erroneous and even immoral. The case is quite different to that of the more modern developments of the Krishna legend to which Dr. Weber refers, where there are such striking resemblances of detail that the probability of their being borrowed from the Gospel narrative seems very high indeed. There are no incidents in the *Bhagavad-gîtâ* which we can set beside similar incidents in the Gospels, nor does the theology of the poem, when calmly considered, remind one very forcibly of the New Testament. The resemblances are in feeling and expression, in the religious sentiment and the form of its manifestation, rather than in the objects to which it is directed. On the whole, we cannot help coming to the conclusion that Dr. Lorinser's theory cannot be considered to be as yet established on any solid basis, and that his treatise, however interesting, forms but one more addition to the mass of plausible conjecture which Sanskrit scholars have in this century presented to the world.

It does not, however, follow that the author's labour has been wasted. If after further investigation his theory should be dismissed as untenable, or, as we rather expect, considered not to admit either of satisfactory demonstration or refutation, the striking similarity which he has pointed out between the ideas and expressions of the *Bhagavad-gîtâ*, and those of the New Testament, must

## 82 *The Bhagavad-gita and Christianity.*

have an abiding interest for the critic and theologian. If we cannot look upon the teaching of the great Hindu philosophical poem as a distorted copy of Christian doctrine, we may still welcome its noble outpourings of devotion as being no less than the elevated morality of the Roman stoic—

*Testimonium animæ naturaliter Christianæ.*

ART. IV.—PROTESTANT MISSIONS IN INDIA.  
*The History of Protestant Missions in India.* By the Rev.  
M. A. Sherring, M.A., LL.B.: Benares. Trübner & Co., 1875.

“THE aim of this work is to show historically what Protestant Missions have accomplished in India since their commencement in the beginning of the last century. In pursuance of this object, I have collected together all the important events of these missions, and have presented them in a succinct and consecutive narrative, thus striving to give a complete view, as in a panorama, of their operations and achievements.”

Such is the brief and appropriate account which Mr. Sherring, in his preface, gives of the aim and nature of this very interesting book. It consists of successive panoramic views of the efforts and successes or failures of those who, from different Protestant countries, came to India for the purpose of supplanting her ancient idolatry by the faith and the worship of Christ. To all who feel any interest in the welfare of India, the history of these efforts, written by such a candid, painstaking and competent man as Mr. Sherring, must appear of importance. And whatever view one may take of the value of Christian missions, a perusal of this book will at least leave no doubt in the mind of the reader, that they have accomplished a work of great magnitude. There are those who estimate the value of missionary labour by the amount of money which is expended in supporting it; and such persons usually conclude that the results of the labour are not at all proportionate to the pecuniary expenditure. At the outset we wish to repudiate this mercantile mode of thought as altogether absurd and unfair when applied to moral or spiritual problems; and in estimating the value of the efforts described in this book we shall adopt another standard.

The task which we propose to ourselves may be best accomplished by first passing in review some of the most striking series of events chronicled in this interesting history.

Denmark was the country whence the first Protestant Missionaries came; Bartholomew Ziegenbalg and Henry Plutschau were their names. In A. D. 1705 these two pioneers of Protestant missionary effort went forth to endeavour to plant reformed Christianity upon the shores of Tranquebar. In spite of persecution and sickness and loss, these two brave men and others sent to assist them, persevered in their self-denying labours. “Three years and a half after the arrival of the first missionaries the native Christian community numbered one hundred and sixty

persons, an amount of success truly astonishing, considering the gigantic obstacles against which they had to contend."

To learn how the Christian cause in Tranquebar, Madras and Tanjore progressed; how one distinguished man after another devoted himself to the self-denying labours involved at that time in mission work; how, especially, Christian Frederic Schwartz for a period of no less than forty-eight years, employed his remarkable abilities and great zeal for the advancement of Christian truth and right; and, how at his death in 1798, no less than fifty thousand converts to Christianity had been gathered in from heathenism: to learn this and much more regarding that interesting period the reader must consult the pages of Mr. Sherring's work. Suffice it to say that few pages of Christian history contain a record of greater self-denial, of more disinterested Christian zeal, or of greater natural abilities devoted to a good cause, than is to be found in the history of the first missionary efforts in Southern India.

But, unfortunately, the great success which was attained during this earliest period of Protestant missionary labour, does not appear to have been permanent. We should expect that the Christian faith, if truly planted in the hearts of such a great number of converts, would perpetuate and extend itself till it would become a living and permanent power in the community. "But what do we actually find? Instead of thousands of converts which the Tranquebar Mission possessed for many years in the last century, there were in 1850 only seven hundred and seventeen Christians, and twenty years later only seven hundred and seventy-one. Again, Tanjore, the principal scene of Schwartz's labours, contained in 1850, fifteen hundred and seventy Christians. In the same year, Trichinopoly had six hundred and thirty-eight; Cuddalore, three hundred and twenty-five; and Madras, probably not more than a thousand. It should also be remembered that many of these converts, perhaps the greater portion, were not descendants of the earlier Christians, but were the fruit of labours performed during the first half of the present century, through the instrumentality of a continuous series of missionaries connected with several societies. The truth is, there is strong reason for believing that the earlier Christians died off, leaving but an exceedingly small number of natural successors; and that, had it not been for modern efforts, by this time little would have been seen of the great results of former times."

We now approach a period in the history of Protestant Christianity in India in which the cause of missions had to endure the greatest trials, and began to assume an imperial importance. It was at the metropolis of India that the greatest difficulties in the way of mission enterprise had to be met, and, perhaps, the greatest

achievements effected. Calcutta, being the central seat of the paramount power, was, when the English people became thoroughly aroused to the importance of Christian missions, naturally chosen as the chief centre from which missionary labour should proceed. It was chiefly about the beginning of the nineteenth century that the cause of Protestant Christianity in India had to struggle for its establishment as an officially recognized instrumentality for the benefit of the people ; it was not till then that the ruling power gave up the selfish principle of Government which had prevailed from the beginning of its existence and acknowledged its obligation to aid, or at least authorize, the attempts that were being made to spread a knowledge of religious and moral truth amongst the governed. It was then that Carey, and Henry Martyn, and Marshman and others, manfully and zealously encountered the natural difficulties of their endeavour, and braved the narrow-minded hostility of Government officials, and laboured faithfully in their efforts to spread a knowledge of truth. The first thirteen years of the nineteenth century were years of hard struggle and great trial ; but at the end of that period, the cause of Christian truth triumphed, and India was opened to Christian Missions. "After a prolonged discussion in the House of Commons, sustained chiefly by Wilberforce on the one side, and retired old Indians on the other, the famous clause in the new Charter, introduced by Lord Castlereagh, under pressure from without, and overpowered by the immense multitude of petitions with which every night both Houses were inundated, was carried. The clause stated that " it was the duty of this country to promote the introduction of useful knowledge, and of religious and moral improvement, in India, and that facilities be afforded by law to persons desirous of going to and remaining in India, to accomplish these benevolent designs."

It is scarcely possible to estimate the importance of this clause in the Charter of 1813. The oppressive and short-sighted restrictions which had hitherto proved great obstructions to the progress of Christianity were now removed ; and a host of able and zealous men now found their way to India resolved to do what they could to establish in the hearts and the homes of the people of India the faith which they themselves prized so highly. The churches of England and Scotland, the various Dissenting bodies of Britain, the Presbyterians and Methodists of America, the Moravians and Lutherans of the Continent, and many other bodies besides sent numerous representatives to India to plant the standard of the Cross. Not only in the presidency cities, but in countless towns and villages throughout India, Burmah and Ceylon, amongst the aboriginal races speaking Dravidian tongues, amongst the Southern representatives of the great Aryan immigration, the Uriyas, the Marathas, the Bengalis, amongst the people of the great central

plains, speaking Hindi and Urdu, amongst the tribes of the distant North-East and the still more distant North-West, amongst the primitive hill tribes inhabiting the slopes of the mountains, Christian missions were established, Christian truth taught, and Christian influence exerted. This wonderful development of Christian enterprise takes its date from the opening years of the present century, and surely indicates a remarkable revival of Christian life and a remarkable phase of Christian thought amongst western countries. The various agents of different Christian churches devoted themselves in various ways to the accomplishment of the task which they had undertaken. The education of the young prominently engaged their attention. And, for the degree of educational advancement which at present obtains, India owes her thanks chiefly to the Christian missionaries. They were the first to open up the field ; they were chief actors in pressing upon the Government the responsibility resting upon them with reference to the education of the people ; they took a leading part in discussing and carrying out the educational policy which was ultimately decided upon. And the results of their labours in various departments during the past sixty or seventy years, are such that any body of men might well be proud of them. It would be impossible within our limited space to give even a very condensed account of Mr. Sherring's interesting historical review of the various missionary operations of the last half-century in India. But we must say something regarding the manner in which he appears to us to have accomplished his task. He writes with the calmness and candour of one who knows well what he is writing about, and who wishes to give a truthful impression of it to his readers. He does not hesitate to point out failures as well as successes. While he writes with vivacity, and sometimes even with enthusiasm, we observe none of that vapid rhetoric and hollow-sounding pietism which so often disfigure reports of Christian work, and which appear by some to be considered necessary to catch the ear of the Christian public at Home. And throughout the work we observe no traces of that narrowness of view which characterized too many of the earlier missionaries, and which unfortunately is not yet extinct.

We propose to refer to and discuss some of the important questions connected with Christian missions in India ; but before doing so we shall give ourselves the pleasure of quoting testimony as to the value, modes, and results of missionary effort which must be admitted as impartial. From the "statement exhibiting the moral and material progress and condition of India during the year 1871-72" drawn up by Clements B. Markham, Esq., and quoted by Mr. Sherring, we take the following :—

"The Protestant Missions of India, Burmah, and Ceylon are

carried on by thirty-five missionary societies, in addition to local agencies, and now employ the services of six hundred and six foreign missionaries, of whom five hundred and fifty-one are ordained. They are widely and rather evenly distributed over the different presidencies ; and they occupy, at the present time, five hundred and twenty-two principal stations, and two thousand five hundred subordinate stations.

“ The labours of the foreign missionaries in India assume many forms. Apart from their special duty as public preachers and pastors, they constitute a valuable body of educators ; they contribute greatly to the cultivation of the native languages and literature ; and all who are resident in rural districts are appealed to for medical help to the sick.

“ No body of men pays greater attention to the study of the native languages than the Indian missionaries. With several missionary societies, as with the Indian Government, it is a rule that the younger missionaries shall pass a series of examinations in the vernacular of the district in which they reside ; and the general practice has been, that all who have to deal with natives who do not know English, shall seek a high proficiency in those vernaculars. The result is too remarkable to be overlooked. The missionaries, as a body, know the natives of India well : they have prepared hundreds of works, suited both for schools and for general circulation, in the fifteen most prominent languages of India ; and in several other dialects. They are the compilers of several dictionaries and grammars ; they have written important works on the native classics and the systems of philosophy ; and they have largely stimulated the great increase of the native literature prepared in recent years by educated native gentlemen.

“ The great progress made in missionary schools, and the area which they occupy will be seen from the following fact. They now contain 60,000 scholars more than they did twenty years ago. The figures are as follows : In 1852 the scholars numbered 81,850 ; and in 1872 the number was 142,952.

“ The high character of the general education given in the college department of these institutions may be gathered from the following facts : Between 1862 and 1872, 1,621 students passed the entrance examination in one or other of the three Indian universities ; 513 passed the first examination in Arts ; 154 took the degree of B.A. ; 18 took the degree of M.A., and 6 that of B.L.

“ In 1852 the entire number of Protestant native converts in India, Burmah, and Ceylon amounted to 22,400 communicants in a community of 128,000 native Christians of all ages. In

1862 the communicants were 49,688, and the native Christians were 213,182. In 1872 the communicants were 78,494, and the converts, young and old, numbered 318,363.

“ But the missionaries in India hold the opinion that the winning of these converts, whether in the cities or in the open country, is but a small portion of the beneficial results which have sprung from their labours. No statistics can give a fair view of all that they have done. They consider that their distinctive teaching, now applied to the country for many years, has powerfully affected the entire population. The moral tone of their preaching is recognised and highly approved by multitudes, who do not follow them as converts. The various lessons which they inculcate have given to the people at large new ideas, not only on purely religious questions, but on the nature of evil, the obligations of law, and the motives by which human conduct should be regulated. Insensibly a higher standard of moral conduct is becoming familiar to the people, especially to the young, which has been set before them not merely by public teaching, but by the millions of printed books and tracts which are scattered widely through the country. On this account they express no wonder that the ancient systems are no longer defended as they once were ; many doubts are felt about the rules of caste ; the great festivals are not attended by the vast crowds of former years ; and several Theistic schools have been growing up among the more educated classes, especially in the presidency cities who profess to have no faith in the idol-gods of their fathers. . . . . This view of the general influence of their teaching, and of the greatness of the revolution which it is silently producing, is not taken by missionaries only. It has been accepted by many distinguished residents in India, and experienced officers of the Government ; and has been emphatically endorsed by the high authority of Sir Bartle Frere. Without pronouncing an opinion upon the matter, the Government of India cannot but acknowledge the great obligation under which it is laid by the benevolent exertions made by these 600 missionaries, whose blameless example and self-denying labours, are infusing new vigour into the stereotyped life of the great populations placed under English rule, and are preparing them to be in every way better men and better citizens of the great empire in which they dwell.”

Having seen the valuable testimony which the Government of India have borne to the importance of the labours of the missionary body, we shall now proceed to estimate, as accurately as we are able, the extent, kind, and value of the results of these labours. A difficult task this is, because in social and moral questions, in consequence of the complexity of the phenomena, it is not an easy matter to connect causes and effects ; it is not easy to separate

effects produced by other causes, or to trace the effects of the causes we are at present considering. A great deal of the enlightenment which is now passing over the surface of Indian society is, no doubt, the effect of missionary influence ; but a great deal of it is the effect of other causes. The effects of missionary influence, on the other hand, are not only traceable in educational results and in direct conversions, but also are to be seen in the great changes of thought and custom which are gradually over-spreading India. We have already repudiated the rough and ready method of estimating the value of missionary labour by the proportion between the money expended and the number of conversions effected as being utterly absurd, and as indicating that those who make use of it are either wilfully or stupidly ignorant of what they are speaking about. But we admit that, in endeavouring to employ a nicer and more accurate method, we encounter greater difficulties in arriving at a result.

There is another mode of estimating the value of missionary labour, frequently adopted by the friends of missions, which we must also set aside. It is assumed by many Christians that the salvation of a human soul is an achievement of infinite value, inasmuch as the soul in itself is of greater value than anything else pertaining to man, and is destined to an eternity of existence either in a condition of happiness or misery. And the value of missionary labour is estimated by the number of converts made, that is, of souls made happy through all eternity. Now we are not by any means of those who despise the immensities and eternities ; and we believe that there are motives to human action of the most ennobling kind which may be drawn from the contemplation of such sublime objects as heaven and eternity and immortality. But when we attempt to apply such a criterion as this to the results of Christian work, we simply land ourselves in obscurity and confusion. We are seeking in the region of the Unknown for what in our present condition we can never find. We are not at all sure of what proportion of professing Christians will find their way to the abodes of bliss ; as " Not every one that saith unto me Lord, Lord, shall enter into the kingdom of heaven " said the Founder of that kingdom. By adopting this criterion we would be employing a method the results of which we could never verify ; and those who employ it are generally guilty of what we wish to avoid,—making assumptions which are highly questionable, or descending to vague platitudes which are worse than useless.

We prefer to look for the results by which we shall estimate the value of missionary labour in a sphere within the reach of our present observation. We do not say that the criterion drawn from a future life may not be an important, or even the most

important standard of judgment ; but we do say that we are not at present in a position to apply it. We shall therefore content ourselves with studying some of the observable effects of the great development of Christian enterprise which Mr. Sherring chronicles.

The effects to be studied are to be found amongst two great classes of the people of India ; those who have professed Christianity, and those who, although not professing Christianity, have been influenced to a greater or less degree by Christian truth and Christian life. And as long continued contact between any two classes of people produces a *mutual* influence, as action is always counter-balanced by reaction, we ought to expect to see some change in the missionary body itself as the result of being so long brought into contact with heathenism. We have, therefore, three classes of effects to be studied : those to be observed amongst Christian converts from Hinduism ; those amongst the population of India not professing, but to a greater or less degree influenced by Christianity ; and those experienced by Christian workers in India in consequence of their contact with heathenism.

I. In judging of the effects produced amongst converts from heathenism, we have already decided to throw out of account the blessings hoped for in a future state of existence. We do so, because they in all cases constitute an unknown quantity ; and because we cannot be in all cases sure that professing Christians have fulfilled the conditions required to secure them. We confine ourselves solely to what is observable now or may reasonably be expected as the result of Christian training and instruction. And it is manifest at first sight, that a change from heathenism to Christianity supposes, or renders necessary, many important external changes of life and custom. It is now a well-understood thing that Christianity does not tolerate the performance of the various rites and ceremonies connected with idol-worship. Consequently to become a Christian means the giving up of idol-worship and everything connected with it. And as we know that the idol-deities of India indicate, and are the result of, very low and materialistic ideas of the Divine Nature, we have reason to believe, that those who cease to worship them, do so in consequence of having received much purer and more spiritual conceptions of the nature of the Divine Being. And at least we may conclude that the abolition amongst converted Christians of the forms and practices of idolatry will have the effect of greatly modifying and elevating their religious conceptions. Knowing as we do the influence of external forms and rites upon the mind, we cannot but conclude that the adoption of more rational forms and a more spiritual worship must have the effect of encouraging more spiritual ideas of God in the mind. And no one who has any

knowledge of the evils and the follies connected with idol-worship in India, can doubt the enormous benefits which would result from the adoption of the more spiritual forms and worship of the Christian faith. If it is a good thing for human beings to be freed from the power of a superstitious service which is degrading to their nature; if it is a good thing for them to cease being slaves of external rites; if it is a good thing for them to seek blessings from the God and Father of all, instead of worshipping the grotesque productions of their own uncultured imagination, it is good for them to join in the worship of the Christian faith. Even although they may not have deep and true conceptions of the nature and doctrines of Christianity, we believe that it is a good thing for them to be brought under that external discipline and instruction which the becoming a member of a Christian Church involves.

But if we would appreciate fully the effects of the Christian faith upon the minds and lives of the converts, we must go deeper than this. Even external conformity to Christian rites and Christian worship, involving as it does the abjuration of idolatrous practices, and a certain spiritualizing of the religious thoughts and feelings, is productive of good results. But these results are scarcely to be compared with those which must follow from a more or less true and genuine acceptance of Christian faith and morals. Mr. Sherring points out that the early converts in the Southern Peninsula, who were brought over to Christianity through the labours of Schwartz and his colleagues, did not produce that influence in their country which we might have expected. Many of them, or at least of their children, must have lapsed into heathenism; and had it not been for the labours of successive European missionaries, Christianity there would probably have long since become extinct. Mr. Sherring accounts for the ephemeral character of the results there by the admission amongst the Christian converts of caste distinctions; there is no doubt but these distinctions are inconsistent with the genius of Christianity, and, where tolerated, must go far to counteract the influences of Christian instruction and worship. And the probability is, that in the early days of Schwartz, there was not enough of discretion made use of in the admission of converts. Elements from heathenism were admitted into Christian life and practice which, like evil weeds, served to choke out the good seed. It is also, probably, a doubtful point how deeply Christian principles had taken root. Mr. Sherring tells us that in North-Western India the severe sufferings and persecutions endured by the native Christians during the mutiny, had not the effect of driving any considerable number of them from their faith. A test such as that must have been, was at least enough to demonstrate the

sincerity of those who endured it. And there can be no doubt but a faith thus shown to be sincere, must exercise a very ennobling influence upon the lives of those who possess it. They have something in their hearts which they deem of far greater value than external peace and comfort, something for which they are willing to suffer and exercise self-denial. And the possession of that something makes them, even humanly speaking, far better and nobler than they could be without it.

How sincerely and how intelligently the Christian faith has been received, as a general rule, by the converts, we have no very accurate means of knowing. But yet there are some considerations which may help to throw some light upon the question. We may, in a rough way, divide the people from whom converts are drawn into two great classes. We have, in the first place, the high-caste Hindus, who are proud of their position in society, surrounded by many social distinctions and social restrictions which make it exceedingly difficult for them to adopt a foreign faith with all its accompanying penalties, and possessed of a comparatively large share of intelligence and of the traditional lore of the country. We have, in the second place, a great variety of low-caste people both in the plains and amongst the hills. These are inferior in physique and in intelligence, belonging to races much lower in the scale of human progress than the former. They are not surrounded by so many social bonds; and their morals and customs are of a much simpler and more primitive kind. They are much more superstitious than their high-caste neighbours, and their superstitions are, probably, of a more degrading kind. In consequence of the simple conditions in which they live, the adoption of a foreign faith is not attended with so many disabilities as amongst the higher caste Hindus. Practically, it would not in all cases be an easy matter to say to which of these two classes particular persons belong; but we presume that, generally speaking, this division expresses a real and easily recognised distinction between the people with whom the missionary comes into contact.

Now, if we compare these two classes with reference to the readiness of their acceptance of the Christian faith, we would expect them to stand about as follows. The higher caste Hindus being surrounded by so many impediments in the way of any important change of life, would not be so readily convinced of the errors or the follies of their ancestral religion. Their conversion to Christianity implies alienations and sacrifices which must be admitted to be very great. Consequently we should suppose that they would not take such a decided step without a genuine conviction of its great importance. We should expect that, as a body, they would defend the fortresses of their national worship as long as possible; and that they would do what they could in the

way of attacking the Christian system offered for their acceptance. Being united so closely by caste ties, the *esprit de corps* amongst them must be intensely strong; and, even where reason and conscience compel them to acquiesce in certain elements of Christian truth, we should expect that they would be reluctant to admit that they had received them from foreigners and would strive to find them in their own ancient faith. As compared with the high-caste Hindus, we might expect that the inferior tribes would be much more easily influenced by Christian teaching. Being so far below the level of the Christian missionary, the spirit of opposition and disputation could scarcely arise. And the benevolent endeavours of the missionary to do them good, could scarcely fail to have a conciliating effect upon their minds, and thus to induce them easily to accept of the faith offered to them. Not being possessed either of much natural intelligence or acquired knowledge, they could not be very critical hearers of the Gospel; and their conversion would be brought about, rather by the exercise of a kindly moral influence, than by an appeal to evidences appreciable by the intellect. And, as the penalties of excommunication from caste are not so severe among them, a much lesser degree of conviction and moral force would have the effect of inducing them to become Christians.

This *a priori* view of the effect of Christian teaching upon the two great classes of Hindus is, we think, to a great extent confirmed by experience. The statistics of missionary results show that only a small proportion of the converts to Christianity belong to the higher castes. And, within the last few years, the success of missionaries amongst hill tribes, such as the Kols and Santals, has been something marvellous. About Calcutta, and probably in other places, only a very small number of Brâhmans of good position have become Christians. There, the greatest number of converts appear to belong to the lowest grades of the middle classes; although it is also undeniable that some of high position and great worth have united themselves to the Christian body. Thus, an examination of the rank and station of those who have professed Christianity appears to lead to the conclusion that Christianity in India has succeeded most where the difficulties in the way of becoming Christians have been least, and where the amount of knowledge and critical ability have been the smallest.

There may appear, at first sight, to be something in this fact disparaging to Christianity; and the fact has certainly been frequently adduced as an evidence of the want of success of missionary effort. But it is by no means so. Not only with reference to religious changes, but with reference to changes of every kind, the aristocracies of wealth and blood and learning in every country are conservative; are least easily affected by

any new influence. They have a position of which they are proud, and they do not wish to lose it. They have ancestral customs and traditions which have grown stronger in succeeding generations of their families, and which cannot be easily rooted out. No great social, religious, or political reformations have ever originated or readily found favour with the higher classes of any country. And it is thus manifest that the declinature of the higher classes of India to receive the Christian faith, cannot be taken as an evidence in any degree of the erroneousness or worthlessness of that which they reject. Their position, in fact, is just what we ought to expect. From our knowledge of how human nature acts in particular circumstances, we should be very much surprised if the native Indian Christian Church were at first composed, to any large extent, of the wealthy, the learned, or the noble.

We have now to consider the effects of the reception of the Christian faith which have been produced upon those who have submitted to its initiatory rite. It would be quite gratuitous for us to assume that these effects are the same in all, or that the hearts and lives of all have been equally influenced by the new doctrines and motives communicated to them. It would also be unreasonable to expect that amongst converts from heathenism there should be found those excellences of Christian life and character, which in Christian countries have been produced after generations or centuries of Christian training. Character is of slow formation ; the production of important changes in the life of the individual or of the society is, as a rule, not speedily accomplished. And those who expect amongst children all the traits of moral manhood, will not be more disappointed than those who expect amongst Hindu Christians the fully-developed principles of Christian maturity. Mr. Sherring in his book gives us no reason to suppose that the native Christians of India have attained to Christian manhood ; and the admission that they have not, is no detraction from the value of the work which has been accomplished. But, from a perusal of the work before us, we should say that, as a body, they have effected an enormous advance upon their pre-Christian position. Notwithstanding the fact that only a small proportion of them are drawn from the higher castes, they have already become a moral power of considerable importance in India. All over the country, from south to north, from east to west, they are collected together into smaller or larger congregations. They meet together for religious worship of a rational and purifying kind ; they listen to instructions which, whether completely understood or not, have naturally a certain enlightening and elevating influence upon their mind. And, although it may be said, that up to this time, as a body, they

are in a state of dependence and moral and spiritual childhood, it is still none the less true that in them India has a large and yearly increasing body of people whose lives and characters are being moulded for great achievements. And it would be well if missionary societies would direct more of their attention to the preparation of the native church for the future career of arduous, and, it is to be hoped, successful labour, upon which it must enter if Christianity is to be widely established in India.

With reference to the extent to which the native church has imbibed Christian doctrine, it would be hazardous to pronounce an opinion. When we enquire how far they have *imbibed Christian doctrine*, we do not mean how far they have become acquainted with the Christian doctrines taught them by missionaries. We mean to ask how far they have *assimilated* these doctrines, and made them their own ; how far they have taken them into their intellectual and moral being, recognized their truth, and made them the principles of their lives. It is only by obtaining an answer to this question that we could truly estimate the effects of missionary effort amongst them. But an answer is difficult to be got at. However, there is one test which we may apply, which may enable us to determine, in a remotely approximate way, the extent to which the native church has really digested Christian doctrine.

There is an important distinction between the passive reception of any system of doctrines, and the complete appropriation of them, so that they become, as it were, a part of one's own intellectual being. In the latter case, the student examines the doctrines communicated to him in all their bearings, subjects them to careful testing and criticism, rejects what will not bear such examination, and assimilates the remainder as believed truth. In this discussion and examination a certain amount of doubt is implied. People examine and criticise because they are in doubt ; doubt originates in the mind in consequence of there being an apparent inconsistency between that which is doubted and something else thought to be true. The critical mind examines the inconsistent elements to see which of them is best founded and which should be rejected or modified. Now, it appears to be necessary that people who pass intelligently from one system of beliefs to another, should pass through a transition state of scepticism and enquiry. It appears, in the ordinary course of nature, impossible that a human mind should give up one system of beliefs and accept another without a great deal of doubt and examination. And this ought to be the case, in an eminent degree, where the system given up and the system accepted are so widely different from one another, have so many and com-

plicated relations, and such important bearings on practical life as Hinduism and Christianity.

Now, we have no doubt whatever that, in individual cases, there is a good deal of enquiry made and instruction communicated before Hindus become Christians. Missionaries, as a rule, especially in modern times, require on the part of candidates for baptism a good deal of knowledge of the Christian faith, and some evidence of the sincerity of the convert. And, perhaps, they make the conditions of admission into the Christian Church as rigid as in the circumstances they ought to do. But it appears manifest that a complete transition from Hindu modes of thought to Christian, can scarcely be effected in the course of the few months or even the few years of enquiry through which converts have passed. And it appears also manifest that the nature and the bearings and the consequences of Christian doctrines could scarcely be intelligently apprehended and digested in the short transition stage between the Hindu *Thakurbari* and the Christian Church. And the fact that this change is so speedily and apparently so completely made, gives an impartial observer great reason to doubt its thoroughness and reality. In all the native Christian literature which we have read we are able to detect scarcely any traces of a past period of anxious doubt and critical enquiry. Stagnant, uncritical orthodoxy is to be found everywhere throughout the literature produced by the Hindu Church. This may be pleasing to those who wish merely to see an accurate facsimile of evangelical orthodoxy produced in the East. But, to one who would like to see independent life, intellectual, moral, Christian life springing up in India, a few traces of indigenous mental activity, even although *heretical* in its result, would be welcome signs. The great scarcity of signs of independent thought, the readiness and completeness with which, as a general rule, the standards of Western churches are accepted, appear to indicate the presence of little but that passive reception of Christian doctrine to which we referred.

This absence of independent life and thought is no doubt to be deplored, but at the same time it is, perhaps, what should reasonably be expected. If we study the history of Christianity in Europe, we see that for centuries there was nothing but a passive reception of transmitted Christian doctrines. And even in the present day when these doctrines are being subjected anew to careful and earnest examination, how many thousands are there in Europe and America who accept without criticism and profess without intelligent apprehension. This, too, is to be deplored, because it is a sign of the want of life. But, probably, it will always be true that the many will receive more or less passively the result which the few have reached by long and painful efforts.

In the Indian Church, however, we have yet to look for the few who, through doubt and difficulty, by careful enquiry and independent effort, will find for themselves and their fellow-worshippers the foundations on which they may build the future Indian Church.

It may, perhaps, be said that the foundations are already laid ; that no other solid foundations can be laid except those which support the European churches. But surely those who say or think thus are ignorant of the searching criticism to which the foundations of European churches are now being subjected. Whatever may be the result of this severe critical examination, it is, at least certain, that many doctrines held by Western churches are not characterized by that indubitable certainty which compels the belief of all reasonable and intelligent human minds. And, it might be well, if those churches would considerably diminish the number of fundamental articles to be presented for acceptance to the office-bearers of the native churches, so as to leave room in future for that free and honest enquiry which is the essential condition of attaining to a sincere and an intelligent faith.

II. We have now to study the effects of Christian effort as seen amongst those Hindus who have not openly embraced, but have to a greater or less extent been influenced by Christianity.

Mr. Sherring after summing up the statistical results of missionary labour in Benares goes on to say :—"These results, however, are no proper criterion of the great work which has been accomplished among the natives of Benares by Christian truth, education, just government, and the general civilising elements in operation in their midst. It is no exaggeration to affirm that native society in that city, especially among the better classes, is hardly the same thing that it was a few years ago. An educated class has sprung into existence, which is little inclined to continue in the mental bondage of the past. The men composing it may be compared to the bud ready to burst into the blossom under the united influence of light and heat. The religion of idolatry, of sculptures, of sacred wells and rivers, of gross fetishism of mythological representations, of many-handed, or many-headed, or many-bodied deities, is losing, in their eyes, its religious romance. They yearn after a religion purer and better. They want to honor God as He is, not as symbolized in these mystical associations. English education, based on the Bible, has thus produced a revolution of thought in their minds. In the Government college and schools the Bible is not permitted as a text-book ; yet it is none the less true that the English education they impart is, in no slight degree, Biblical. Thus it has come to pass, that the light which precedes and accompanies conviction, has been shed upon many minds in this seat of Hinduism. A new era of intellectual

freedom and religious life has already commenced. Of not a few it may be said, that 'old things have passed away'; and of the mass of the people, that 'all things are becoming new.' Such a change as has been wrought is full of promise and encouragement; and is of a much more satisfactory and genuine character than an addition of some scores or hundreds of mere nominal converts would be. On the other hand, stern and persistent opposition must be expected by the advocates of Christianity in a city like Benares, in which old creeds and customs exist, penetrating through and through the social and personal life of the people, and associated with their history for ages past; in which a powerful priesthood is ever on the alert to keep them attentive to their duties, and to mystify them by their magical charms and ceremonies; in which multitudes of persons read the sacred books, and reverence the mingled philosophy and religion they contain; and in which sensuous forms and symbols of the indigenous faith meet the eye in every direction. What wonder, if in such a city, a new and better religion, though derived from heaven, and bearing on its front the glory of its Divine original, should meet with special, unwonted and determined opposition! To reckon on the hasty and sudden downfall of the old religion, which harmonises so completely with the pride and vanity, and other evil qualities of the human heart, and on the rapid and universal spread of a faith which tends to destroy these qualities, and to bring the heart into an entirely new condition, is to indulge in mere quixotism, and to manifest an impatience at variance with the calmness of the Gospel." (pp 189-191.)

We have introduced this extract because it presents, with sufficient accuracy, the state of things not merely in Benares but at the principal cities and towns of India, where Christianity and secular education have been at work. From it we learn, what is indeed abundantly manifest, that the preaching of Christian doctrine, the exercise of Christian and moral influence, and the spread of secular knowledge, have produced wide-spread effects amongst the intelligent classes of the Indian people. But, in the examination of these effects, it is not easy to say how much of them should be ascribed to the direct communication of Christian doctrine and precept, and how much to the other influences social, moral, and educational which have been widely exerted. There can be no doubt, that the communication of secular knowledge, the imparting of a knowledge of the laws of nature, of the principles of science and of art, and of the thoughts which are stored up in a rich and healthy literature, must have the effect of destroying the superstitious beliefs of the people thus enlightened. But, it does not at all follow, that those in whom the destructive tendencies of secular knowledge have been exerted, are thereby

predisposed in favour of the Christian religion. In fact, we should say that in the majority of cases the result is quite the reverse. Secular knowledge destroys a belief in the superstitions of Hinduism ; but in the minds of Hindus it is also likely to create a prejudice against anything else in the shape of religion. And in cases where instruction in the Christian religion is given in combination with secular knowledge, as in the missionary schools and colleges, it is not generally the case that the Christian doctrines are received with favour. Christian morality is no doubt received with approbation, and, probably, does produce some effect in elevating the tone of morals in educated Hindu society. But, the *peculiar* doctrines of Christianity, those which give to Christianity its exclusive character, excite, as a general rule, a spirit of intense opposition in the Hindu mind. We might, perhaps, accurately classify those more or less influenced by Christianity and secular education as follows : those who reject Hinduism and every other system of religious beliefs ; those who reject Hinduism, but retain some of its moral elements along with some moral and religious doctrines taken from other sources, especially from Christianity ; and those who, rejecting Hinduism, become favourably disposed towards Christianity.

In the first of these classes we have an instance of the same result which has been produced in western lands by the spread of science. Science, professedly and wisely, confines its explanations to the region of phenomenal things, of things that may be seen and touched and measured. But while science, in this its defined sphere is supreme, scientific men have shown a strong tendency to assume that their own sphere of operations is the only one, with which as intellectual and moral beings we have anything to do. This exclusiveness of science, prevalent in Europe, has been imported into India, and as far as it has operated, has tended both to overthrow Hinduism and to drive out Christianity. The importation of this superficial phenomenalism is something greatly to be deplored, by all those who believe that there are interests and powers behind the veil of sense by which we are immediately surrounded, with which interests and powers we are most intimately concerned. Science has a much easier task in demolishing Hinduism than in overthrowing a belief in Christianity, and as the work of establishing the Christian faith in an uncongenial soil is by no means an easy one, we may expect that the class of scientific unbelievers in every form of religion, will likely become a very large one. At the same time the condition of this class may be a step towards something better.

There is also in Hindu society a large class of people who, rejecting many of the superstitions of Hinduism, do not cut themselves off from the sphere of religion altogether, but retain or obtain from

other sources principles of religion and morality which are no doubt of great importance. This class is represented by the Brahma Samâj; but it must be remembered that it contains a vastly greater number than can be counted as members of that body. Generally speaking, we should say, that the minds of the people composing this class are in a state of great uncertainty regarding religious subjects. They have but recently given up the old traditions of their fathers, and they are in search of something which will be more satisfying to reason and conscience. For various reasons they are unwilling to accept Christianity, that faith being, on social and national grounds, peculiarly repulsive to Hindus. And although they, perhaps unconsciously, imbibe many important elements from Christianity; it scarcely appears that they are individually on the way towards an acceptance of that faith. We should say that, generally speaking, their religious principles are of a mutually incongruous character; that they have not thought out for themselves a set of consistent foundations for their religious life; and that, as a class, they are in a state of religious instability, easily led away by any plausible doctrine which presents itself. At the same time, while those whom we place in this class, do not accept Christianity on the ground that they consider many Christian doctrines erroneous, there are yet many features in their position pleasing to the Christian missionary and philanthropist. They appear to be struggling towards freedom from error and superstition; and in doing so should excite the sympathy of all right-thinking men. They are not characterised by that spirit of dependence and subserviency which unfortunately marks, to so large an extent, the native Christian Church; they have imbibed, more or less, freedom and independence of thought, and are unwilling either to retain an old or receive a new creed upon authority, or out of respect to those who expound it. They are, probably, as a whole, to a great extent under the influence of strong national prejudice; they resent with impatience the assumptions of superiority of the rulers of India, and the very fact that Christianity is the religion of their foreign conquerors makes it almost impossible for them to study its doctrines with calm impartiality. But, even with the unfavourable influence of this strong prejudice, they generally avow an admiration for the person and character of Christ, which speaks well for their honesty of purpose, and which is also a very important testimony to the wonderful moral and spiritual power of the great Founder of the Christian religion. There are, however, some features in the Christianity which has been presented to them which appear to their minds insuperable difficulties. Foremost amongst these objectionable elements is the *exclusiveness* of the Christian claims. They have heard over and over again that it is only through Christ

that salvation can be obtained. "I formerly remarked," says Dr. Wilson of Bombay in his "Hinduism," "that God is the Father of all mankind, and no Father gives opposite laws for the government of his own children. God has given one law, and, therefore, there is but one true religion, and one true written rule of religion, in the same manner as there is but one sun for this earth" (p. 104) And again (p. 125) the Hindu religion "is to those who embrace it and adhere to it, the road to death and everlasting destruction. And in order to vindicate this doctrine, he says in the appendix (p. 164), "The statement made in the text may appear to some professing Christians as harsh and severe. It is consistent, however, with the doctrine of all the Reformed churches which have exhibited their creeds and confessions." This mode of presenting Christianity may be taken as the type of what was once common, and these extracts still represent the popular notions of the Christian Gospel amongst the Hindus. And the conclusion is just as manifest to the intelligent Hindu mind as to our own. If this Gospel, as preached by missionaries of whom we have taken Dr. Wilson as the type be true, then the vast majority of mankind have been condemned by One, who is still declared to be their Father, to hopeless destruction. The teeming millions of the Eastern world have never had the most remote opportunities of hearing about Christ; and they are to be condemned. And, it is scarcely to be expected that thinking Hindus would readily receive a faith which condemns their fathers and forefathers of all preceding generations to a destruction which they had not the means of avoiding. They would much rather believe the Christian claims to be false than that One, called a Father, would treat His children so partially. A small number of Christians may look with complacency upon the hopeless destruction of those who have not been so fortunate as themselves; but it is simply impossible that those who belong to the devoted host should contemplate the doctrine with the same degree of calm approval.

Amongst those influenced by Christian teaching, there is a third class to which we must refer, probably smaller in number than either of the others. They are favourably disposed towards the Christian religion, and might almost be described as unbaptized Christians. They have been brought under the influence of strong religious impressions; have compared their own with other faiths; and have come to the honest conviction that the life and the teachings of Christ are incomparably superior to those of any other of the world's religious guides. They may be represented by the late Rajah Rammohun Roy, who, although usually called the founder of the *Brahma Samaj*, was vastly nearer to Christianity than any of the present leaders of that body. The thoughts and lives of these Hindu Christians have been powerfully

moulded by Christian influence, and it is, probably, only prudential motives which prevent them from professing the faith in which they believe. Or, perhaps, it would be more correct to say, that prudential motives have led them to seek for reasons which will convince their minds that baptism is an unnecessary rite. Although described as Christians, they cannot be called *orthodox*, in the Western evangelical sense of that term ; as we have never met with any who were willing to admit the exclusive features of Christianity to which we have referred. The number of this class is difficult to estimate ; is probably not very great ; but is likely much greater than is usually supposed, as the present writer has some reason to believe. Whatever may be concluded with reference to their number, it is, at least, an important and significant fact that there is a considerable number of honest and intelligent men in Hindu society, who are not afraid to avow their belief in what is most valuable in the Christian religion, and who have drawn the best light of their lives from Him who has produced the greatest religious revolution that the world has ever seen.

III. We now approach an enquiry, probably more difficult than the preceding, regarding the effects upon the missionary body of coming into contact with Hindu beliefs and institutions. During the crusading period in the history of Europe, probably the crusading nations were just as much affected by the Saracens against whom they led their armies as the Saracens were by them. It is impossible for two peoples, differing in religion, customs, and institutions to come into intimate contact with one another without exercising a *reciprocal* influence. And the person who comes to India from Europe or America, and whose views and opinions are not greatly modified by coming into contact with the Hindu people, must be very immovable indeed. There can be little doubt but a great deal of the broadening of the lines of Christian thought, observable in our day, has been the result of getting better acquainted with the literature and the institutions of people called heathen. The early explorers in the fields of Hindu literature returned from their researches with very wonderful results which produced a great effect upon the minds of Christian thinkers. And although the ardent expectations of these early explorers regarding the great value of the mine which was opened up by a knowledge of the Sanskrit language have scarcely been realized, it is at least certain, that in India we have come into contact with a people who have a great historical past to be proud of, and who are as firmly persuaded as any Jews or Christians have ever been, that the moral and religious light by which their fathers have been led, is a light from heaven. An examination of the degrad-

ing superstitions of modern Hinduism appears to indicate a lamentable degeneration from the condition of the ancient Vedic times; but it should be remembered that this degeneration has been produced rather by the absorption of degrading elements from lower tribes than by a natural deterioration. However this may be, the Christian student of the best thoughts that have emanated from the Hindu mind cannot but see in them many things of an elevating kind, many things which might convince him that the people of this land have not been deserted by heaven, and that the Being who is believed in as the Universal Father never ceases to care for any of His children.

Now, we believe that the majority of those who now constitute the missionary body assume a very different position with reference to Hinduism from what was usually assumed, say, thirty or forty years ago. The following extract from Dr. Duff's work on Indian Missions is a fair specimen of the old illiberal way of thinking so common in former times, "The truth of Christianity having been demonstrated times and ways without number, to the entire satisfaction of thousands and tens of thousands of the most rational and enlightened men that ever lived, its adherents have, as they think, an indisputable title to proceed on the admission of its truth. Believing, therefore, as they do, on grounds that have never been invalidated, that Christianity is true, they are constrained to look upon every other religious system as erroneous, dishonourable to God, and destructive of the happiness of man. . . . . Accordingly, they must deny, absolutely and without reserve, the existence of any *natural right*, on the part of any parents to teach and perpetuate a system of *falsehood* and *delusion* so loathsome and deadly (as Hinduism) . . . . .

. . . . . Is it possible, is it for a moment to be conceived, that the God of Truth, the pure and the Holy God, Who cannot look upon sin but with abhorrence, could have conferred upon any of His creatures a *natural right* to inculcate any faith like that of Hinduism, *i.e.*, to impart the knowledge of a system of hideous error.—that by so doing, He could have enforced by the sanction of Omniscience, and the thunders of Omnipotence the exercise of a privilege to insult His own Majesty, to violate His own law, and to cover His subject with confusion, shame, and everlasting dismay?" (Duff on India Missions, p. 460ff.)

It is quite refreshing in the present day to recall the time when such vigorous declamation as the above was commonly indulged in, and, however much we may admire the eloquence and zeal of the "prince of missionaries," there is certainly not much to be said of his breadth of view. At the time, however, when he came to India, his view of the Gospel was the common one. The first word which the preacher of the Gospel uttered to the heaven-deserted

Oriental world was a word of condemnation. The gods of the Hindus were false deities; their religious rites were odious and degrading; their race, from first to last, had been on the downward course to eternal damnation; and even the few traditions they had of a primeval revelation, only served to make darkness visible and increase the misery of their condition. Such were the opening messages of something called a Gospel, which the earliest Protestant missionaries were sent to proclaim, and which, probably, the majority of them did proclaim. And we believe that the proclamation of this preliminary message of damnation, has done more to alienate the Hindu people from Christianity than anything else. Even now the popular conception of Christianity in India is that of a creed which dooms to destruction the vast majority of mankind, including the present and preceding generations of Hindus, and which promises safety only to those who submit to Christian baptism.

Now, we speak advisedly when we say that we believe a very decided change has taken place within the last ten or twenty years in the mode of presenting the Gospel to the Hindu people. It would be strange, indeed, if the great waves of religious thought, which have passed and are passing over Europe, should not influence the mind of the missionary body of India. It will be still more passing strange, if a body of good and intelligent men could remain for years in India, and look the people of India honestly in the face, and tell them that the Father of all mankind, having left their fore-fathers in ignorance of the only knowledge which could save them from destruction, now offered to them, of the present day, a Saviour, and that still that Father was the God of infinite *love*, and impartial *justice*; we say it would be passing strange, if a body of good and intelligent men could continue long to say such things in the face of the people of India, and we believe that, as a body, the Protestant missionaries have ceased to say them. We believe, that they are now willing to recognise whatever is good in the religious faith of the people of India, and anxious to lead them from that to something which is still better. If it be true that Christ is the Son of God, and "*the Light that lighteth every man that cometh into the world*," surely that Light has not been withheld from the vast majority of mankind; surely some rays of that Light have glimmered amongst the teeming millions of Asia long before the missionary spirit was kindled in Europe; and surely the spirit of Christ, in whom all earthly divisions and bars of separation are abolished, is not prevented from working and influencing men beyond the sphere of His visible Church. Probably sentiments such as these have found access to the minds of the majority of mission agents in India. At any rate, we have reason to believe that denunciations of the errors and superstitions of Hinduism are, to a great extent, given up; that Christ, the gift of divine love

and the giver of life, is preached rather than the dry-bones of theological dogma ; that the old damnable introduction to Christianity is omitted ; and that a message worthy of the name of the *Gospel* is delivered. And, we think that the change which has come over the spirit of evangelical preaching in India, is due just as much to the contact of the preachers with the people of India, as to the influence of the change in religious views which has been experienced by Christian Europe.

We must now close our discussion of the effects of missionary work in India ; but before doing so, we should recommend our readers to make themselves personally acquainted with Mr. Sherring's interesting and valuable work. The great Protestant effort, the history of which is chronicled by Mr. Sherring, has attained such dimensions, that it is neither to be sneered at nor treated with indifference. And those who wish to obtain a comprehensive view of the condition of the people of India, or to do anything in the way of improving their condition, cannot overlook a series of efforts so energetic, so wide-spread, and so fruitful of great and important changes, as the Christian missionary agencies.

---

## ART. V.—CEYLON, PAST AND PRESENT.

BY JOHN CAPPER.

- 1.—*Ceylon Blue Books*, 1870 to 1873.
- 2.—*Report of Cattle Disease Commission*, 1870.
- 3.—*Report of Irrigation Committee*, 1867.
- 4.—*Administrative Reports*, 1848 to 1864.

THE Island of Ceylon has of late years been brought frequently and prominently before the public by Parliamentary enquiries, by writers, and above all by two Royal visits. The interval which elapsed between the appearance of John Knox's account of the island two centuries ago, and that by Sir Emerson Tennent twenty-five years since, although sufficient to have witnessed many important changes in the government and industry of the country, was unaccompanied by any marked innovations in the habits, manners and customs of the majority of the people. Whatever may have been the facts in reference to the supposed physical connection of Ceylon with Southern India in former times, there can be no question that the two countries possess many characteristics in common; and that the people of the former, owing to frequent invasions and continued immigration, have become imbued with much that belongs to continental nationalities. Ceylon is largely indebted to India for arts long since lost or in the last stages of decay; and though the local chronicles tell of repeated disasters caused by Malabar invasions, they are equally profuse in accounts of public works undertaken by foreign kings, who snatched the reins of government from the feeble hands of native monarchs. There is so much similarity in the customs and habits of the continental and insular races, that it may be well for those who are endeavouring to think out "the Indian problem," to turn to Ceylon and note what has been done in reference to the government of the people and the development of their industry. Amongst the larger matters which nearly concern the future of India equally with that of Ceylon, and which in the latter country have in recent years been dealt with thoughtfully and sometimes successfully, may be mentioned irrigation, food supply, roads, railways, village government, employment for the people, and education. The contrast presented by the absence or the imperfect working of these in the Presidencies, is worthy of consideration. Before proceeding to notice the progress made in these things in "India's utmost Isle," during the latter half of the present century, we shall glance at the

system under which Ceylon was governed when Britain was an outlying dependancy of Imperial Rome, and notice the gradual decline of that system under the government of successive European rulers.

Twelve hundred years before the first Portuguese adventurers set foot on the western shores of Ceylon, the monarch of that island reigned in something more than barbaric pomp. His home was in a capital whose ruins to-day attest their magnificence in the past ; and though devoid of what in these modern times is judged the sure test of a country's prosperity, external commerce, the State was rich in natural resources, and the people were on all sides thriving and contented. Essentially despotic, the sovereign, though often a foreign invader or a domestic usurper, was rarely unmindful of his subjects' welfare, and only on few occasions do we read in native chronicles or ancient inscriptions of instances in which a king oppressed the people with excessive imposts. The exactions of an unjust monarch were speedily removed by his more considerate successor, as we read of one sovereign of whom it was said,—“ He enriched the inhabitants who had become impoverished by inordinate taxes, and made them opulent by gifts of lands, cattle, and slaves, by relinquishing the revenue for five years and restoring inheritances : and from an earnest wish that succeeding kings should not again impoverish the inhabitants of Ceylon by excessive imposts, he ordained that the revenue should be at the rate of five *pelus* with a fee of five *ridies*.” This king was so minded that injustice and oppression should cease, that not content with a record of his will in the official archives of the State, and anxious that it should be handed down to after-generations as a legacy to his successors, he caused the above words to be cut in the living stone of the rock-temple at Dumbool, in the Kandyan Province.

If the ancient laws of Ceylon were few, they were at least simple and effective, whilst criminals were even fewer, so few indeed that cases of any importance were heard and decided by the sovereign ; the headmen of the various districts dealt with offences of a minor character, whilst still more unimportant cases, involving personal disputes, or offences in reference to irrigation, cultivation, or cattle were disposed of by local committees called “*Gansubawas*,” or Village Tribunals. These rural municipalities were also entrusted with the framing and enforcement of rules for the regulation of all matters relating to the storage and supply of water for local cultivation, to cattle trespass, to the repair of water-courses, tanks and river bunds, to the care of common lands and grazing grounds, and to all other concerns of village life with which they were most competent to deal. Their constitution was popular, their action prompt, intelligent and

just, and their decisions were received without a murmur or a feeling of distrust.

Under native rule the ownership of the soil was vested absolutely in the sovereign who never alienated a foot of his territory. He held it in trust for the people and utilised it to their advantage. Thus it came to pass that every subject had allotted to him, according to his requirements, a portion of low land for rice culture, and of high land from which he might obtain wood for fuel, fences and buildings: so long as that land was cultivated, the tenant was at liberty to hold it, but no longer: one season of idleness and the neglected field reverted to the State. In return for the use of this land, the cultivator paid into the royal granaries one-tenth portion of its produce by way of rent, and in addition to this was bound to render service in labour whenever called upon to do so. This was termed *Rájákari*, literally "king's work;" and by means of this forced labour were executed all the great irrigation works, and royal and priestly edifices, which now, even in their ruin, fill the beholder with wonder and admiration. This labour, even when employed in the construction of tanks for irrigating the people's lands, was not altogether unrequited: no money-payment was made for it, but every man received food from the public granaries so long as he was employed away from his home, and thus the people were fed with the produce of the people's tithe whilst working for their own advantage.

Modern views as to the extreme hardships attending the compulsory employment of the people in the erection of temples and temple buildings, should receive some modification, when it is remembered that the *Pansela* or priestly residence attached to each temple, was not merely the dwelling of the priests, but a college in which was imparted gratuitously a knowledge of the arts, of literature, and of medicine: then as in more modern times, in the East as in the West, the priests were the sole depositaries of learning, the only instructors of the people, so that those who were called upon to labour under the law of *rájákari*, in the erection or repair of those buildings, felt they were engaged on a work in which they possessed some amount of interest.

Having regard to all these circumstances, it is not difficult to understand with what successful results such a system was worked, how prosperous and contented were the people, and with what deep regard their descendants of to-day cherish the memory of their ancient sovereigns. Without foreign trade, the State possessed within itself, the elements of wealth and greatness: a teeming population, far larger than in modern times, enabled the rulers of the land to convert vast tracts of barren wastes to fertile fields watered by means of tanks, some of which were of enormous

size, on the summit of whose earthen embankments, four horsemen may to this day ride abreast. The following allusion to the irrigation works of one sovereign, Prokroma Bahu, will furnish a tolerably correct picture of the industry developed in the agricultural resources of the country: it is from Sir Emerson Tennent's account of Ceylon:—"Fourteen hundred and seventy tanks by this king, in various parts of the island, three of them of such vast dimensions that they were known as the 'sea of Prokroma:' and in addition to these, three hundred others were formed by him for the special benefit of the priests. The 'Great Lakes' which he repaired, as specified in the *Mahawaneo*, amount to thirteen hundred and ninety-five, and the smaller ones which he restored or enlarged, to nine hundred and sixty. Besides these, by damming up rivers, he made five hundred and thirty-four water-courses and canals, and he repaired three thousand six hundred and seventy-one. The bare enumeration of such labours conveys an idea of the prodigious extent to which structures of this kind had been multiplied by the early kings: and we are enabled to form an estimate of the activity of agriculture in the twelfth century, and the vast population whose wants it supplied by the thousands of reservoirs still partially used though in ruins: and the still greater number now dry and deserted and concealed by dense jungle, in districts once waving with yellow grain."\* That such a dynasty succumbed before the disasters of many successive invasions, first by Malabar conquerors and afterwards by Portuguese adventurers, cannot be construed into any disparagement of the principles upon which the country was governed in olden times. The failures and disasters that have attended attempts to govern the island after European models, have arisen out of a disregard of the instincts and genius of the people. How these failures arose, and how, in more recent times, the British Government has striven to redeem the errors of the past and with what success, we will proceed to show.

From the date of the first Portuguese settlement in Ceylon, A.D. 1514, to that of their expulsion by the Dutch in 1658, the presence of Europeans was marked by perpetual warfare. The policy of these earliest occupants of the maritime districts of the island, comprised the extension of their rule to the interior and the compulsory conversion of the inhabitants to Christianity: for the attainment of these objects no device, no money, no bloodshed was spared during the century and a half of their rule. If but little progress were made in the acquisition of territory, the Portuguese were at any rate successful in their endeavours to add to the number of the nominal Christians within their influence, as

may be witnessed by the large number of native Catholics in the maritime districts of the island at the present day ; but at no time do they appear to have bestowed a thought on agriculture, or the material progress of the people under their rule, and when they resigned the dominion of the sea-border of Ceylon to the Dutch, the only vestiges of their rule were numerous churches and forts, and still more numerous graves scattered along the scenes of their fierce struggles with Kandyan armies. Their traffic in the products of the country was trifling in amount ; the collection of cinnamon was ever attended with difficulty and danger by reason of their incessant warfare with the natives : coffee was known to them only in the later period of their rule and then as a rare commodity, and the products of the cocoa palm were few and rude. Gems were always objects of their cupidity, but the regions in which these were found of any value, were in the hands of the Kandyan Kings who defended this portion of their territory against foreign foes with indomitable resolution.

In 1658, the Portuguese after a few struggles for supremacy resigned their sovereignty of the sea-border of Ceylon to the Dutch, who were influenced by higher motives and guided by more prudent counsels ; and, though theirs can scarcely be designated a peaceful rule, they cannot be charged with allowing aggression to become a guiding principle of their government. Commerce was to them what conquest had been to their predecessors, but they followed it with far more success. Ever anxious to foster and develop trade, they gave encouragement to industry and enterprise wherever these could be made conducive to the general welfare. Throughout the districts over which their rule extended, they were careful to extend the means of water supply, and with this view they executed some extensive canals and tanks. New products were cultivated, and great pains were taken with the extension and improvement of the growth of cinnamon and coffee, branches of industry which tended considerably to the enrichment of native cultivators and traders ; new and large factories were established in various parts of their territories for the encouragement of a trade in European goods ; schools were established throughout the country, and the general administration of affairs was placed on a footing conducive to the welfare of the inhabitants, so that when the British, in 1796, received a transfer of the government from the Dutch under capitulation, they found the maritime provinces of the island considerably advanced in general intelligence and material prosperity.

During the early British period the attention of the new rulers was mainly directed to securing their possessions against inroads by the troops of the Kandyan King ; and when at length, in 1815, the excesses and cruelties of the native sovereign compelled the

chiefs and people of the Kandyan territory to depose their tyrant and cede their country to the English, the latter found their new charge a heavy and engrossing responsibility. As usual in such cases, there were some restless spirits amongst the new subjects of the British sovereign, who still sighed for native rule, a feeling which in 1817 found vent in a rebellion of some magnitude which was not effectually quelled until far into the following year.

The result of consolidating the entire island, government under one power, was to impose a tranquillity throughout the country that had been unknown for centuries. But it soon became apparent that something more was needed than peace if the welfare of the various races of the population were to be secured. It was felt that the new state of things consequent on the acquisition of the Kandyan country, demanded a modification and extensions of the existing provisional form of government, which could only be the work of able councillors after the fullest examination. With a view to effect this object a commission of enquiry was appointed by royal authority, charged with the duty of reporting upon such changes as might be considered necessary in the constitution and administration of the government. The principal results of this enquiry were a new charter of justice with trial by jury, an extended legislature, the abolition of compulsory labour, and the abandonment of the State monopoly of the cinnamon trade. A notice of the effects of these various changes would occupy a larger space than can be given in this paper. It will suffice the present purpose to deal with one measure, the abolition of forced labour, or *rājdharia*, as having a direct bearing on the food supply and the material welfare of the people. The object and application of *rājākuria* under native sovereigns, have been already explained in connection with those vast irrigation works for the construction and maintenance of which, a supply of organised labour at all times, ample and reliable, was indispensable. This necessity is well explained in a passage of Tennent's Epitome of the History of Ceylon, wherein he says.—"There is not a single tank or canal in the island which is provided with an outlet for its surplus waters sufficiently secured with masonry. Consequently, after the heavy bursts of weather which usher in the rainy season within the tropics, the embankments of these tanks and canals were frequently overflowed and broken through. As the accident always occurred at the height of the rainy season, the means of retaining the water requisite for raising the crop for that year, was generally lost. If the authority of the ruling power at the moment was not equal to the command of the labour that would repair the injury in time, the loss of a second crop was the

result, which rendered the dispersion of the population which subsisted on the produce of that extent of irrigation, inevitable, in order to avoid the famine and consequent pestilence which ensue in all Asiatic countries from the extensive failures of rice crops."

Herein may be found an explanation of the sudden and complete destruction of the great tanks in the vicinity of the ruined cities of Anurádhapura and Pulastipoora, as well as of the more gradual but not less certain decay which overtook the numerous smaller irrigation works scattered throughout the length of the island ; in former instances the presence of hostile armies accounted for the fact, that the ruling power was unequal to the command of labour necessary for the timely repair of breaches in embankments : during our administration the abolition of *rajakaria* explains the dilapidation which everywhere took place in such works, gradually lessening the supply of water, and leading to deficient harvests in ordinary years, to famines of greater or less misery in seasons of scanty rain-fall. Accustomed to a stern but paternal despotism in all the ordinary affairs of village life, taught from earliest infancy to regard the sovereign power as the centre and mainspring of their every movement, the Singhalese, when released from the old time-honored necessity of compulsory combination for the common good, regarded the fatal gift with folded arms, in stolid helplessness.

The numerous records of the local Government dating from the years 1848 to 1864, teem with official recitals of suffering and disasters in outlying districts, arising from the disrepair of works for storing water against seasons of drought. It was shown in the reports of revenue officers at this period, that owing to the absence of combination amongst village cultivators and their ignorance of the proper course to be adopted in such emergencies, breaches in the embankments of tanks remained neglected, and that unless the executive interposed, the grain-producing powers of the country would be seriously impaired, the people impoverished, and the Government tithe of the grain tax considerably lessened. It was, moreover, pointed out that the failures of successive harvests, causing a want of sufficient food for the inhabitants, was a frequent source of sickness and mortality. In one of these reports, that from the revenue officer of the Kornegalle district of the North-West Province, we find the following significant passage referring to the consequences of the general neglect and disrepair of tanks :—"In seasons when the rains fail, there is not only no cultivation, but there is not sufficient water to support life, as proved in the year of drought 1860-1, when in the course of six months I obtained the names of eight thousand persons who had died from famine and consequent pestilence in this

district, and the accounts from other parts of the island were equally disastrous."

It was abundantly shown in all these reports that the means of irrigation in the absence of any substitute for *rajakaria*, had become totally inadequate to the necessities of the population of outlying districts, that not only was voluntary combination amongst them impossible, but their numbers and resources were so reduced by food scarcity and disease, as to place the necessary repairs beyond their power. Year after year representations to this effect were made to the Government by officers actuated by a deep sense of their obligation on behalf of people who had no other advocates. Year after year the cry for help went to the executive, in the moderate prayers for small money grants-in-aid of tank restoration, but always with a like result. These earnest appeals on behalf of an impoverished population were met with the stereotyped reply that the state of the public funds was such as to preclude the Government from proposing any money votes for works of irrigation. In the face of these constant refusals, of the reiterated plea of an impoverished treasury, we find that during the period under notice, namely, between the years 1848 and 1864, the surplus of the Ceylon revenue over expenditure, amounted in the aggregate to not less than £880 000. One of the revenue officers to whom we have alluded\* had the courage to address the Government in the following language:—"Unfortunately measures for the benefit of the natives have not hitherto met with that consideration by the Legislative Council to which they are entitled in return for the taxation they pay, and which is accorded to measures for the promotion of the interests of Europeans. It appears to be assumed while the English residents and European descendants are only about four thousand and the natives one million two hundred thousand,† that the whole amount of revenue available for public works should be devoted to affording facilities to the plantations and promoting the interests of the minority. . . . . Witness the eagerness with which measures for the apprehension of runaway coolies and legal ordinances for binding over the natives to the tender mercies of proctors, and similar measures were passed: while measures for the relief of cultivators from the oppression attendant on the system of levying the grain tax, were allowed to fall still-born. . . I make these remarks because I do not consider that the bulk of the people receive their fair share of consideration in proportion to the amount they

\* Mr. Mitford, Government Agent, Kornegalle. † Actually more than two millions.

contribute to the public revenue, and because the officials placed over them are their only representatives who are cognisant of their claims and requirements, and in a position to advocate their interests. My present object is to call the attention of Government to the neglected state of the tanks in this province and I may say throughout the low country."

Equally to the purpose is the following extract from the evidence of Mr. Twynam, Assistant Agent of the Manaar district, given to the Irrigation Committee of the Legislative Council in 1867 :—“In many cases the want of proper interference on the part of Government to enforce the ancient rules and customs as to the repair of tanks and water-courses, has obliged numerous cultivators in consequence of the obstinacy and indifference of a few, to leave their tanks and go to others. The consequence has been that many tanks which might have been kept up by a little management, have been allowed to go to ruin. The same thing is going on now, and will continue to go on until Government shall by some measure, at the same time simple and effective, enforce the ancient customs and oblige the proprietors of all occupied tanks to contribute their share of the expenses of repair and up-keep.”\*

It was not only from disasters to their grain crops that the people suffered: deficient rain-fall and ineffective water storage led to the disappearance of vegetation, and thus deprived the village herds of their wonted pasture. Scanty and impoverished herbage, added to the use of stagnant fetid water in the absence of the hill streams, induced outbreaks of murrain of unprecedented severity which in some seasons devastated the herds of entire districts, and it was a matter of frequent occurrence that, when after a prolonged drought, the hoped for rain descended, the villagers were without cattle capable of ploughing their fields. In an official report on cattle disease in Ceylon, it is said “The same causes which tend to lessen the produce of cultivated land have acted prejudicially on the pastures and herds of certain districts. The effects of disastrous seasons may be seen in the uncultivated fields and the deserted tanks in some localities, and in the chronic poverty of the people in others.” The report goes on to say “It is worthy of remark that the most serious mortality amongst cattle, has occurred in districts wherein droughts are of the greatest severity and the water supply and grazing the most scanty: we allude to the Seven Korales, in which thirty-three thousand cattle are said to have died of murrain in 1865, and the Badulla district in which the deaths from this disease in one year are reported as having amounted to twenty-two thousand.”

\* Report on Irrigation Works and Rice Cultivation : Ceylon, 1867.

Cattle disease had made its appearance in Ceylon during the early Singhalese period, but at rare intervals, and of a comparatively mild type. The same may be said of the occasional outbreak of this pest during the British period until about the year 1840, since which date the disease has made itself felt with more frequency and with greater severity. It was at this time that the rapid extension of the newly developed coffee enterprise in Ceylon led to a large importation of Indian cattle for purposes of transport: it is not improbable that the cattle pest may have been re-introduced by this means and carried into districts where it had been previously unknown. Native cattle-owners found the extension of coffee planting prejudicial to them by the denudation of hill sides previously covered by jungle, the consequent drying up of streams, and the loss of the pasturage which in times of drought was always found within the forests.

It was not until the year 1856, that the Government of Ceylon at that time administered by Sir Henry Wood, a ruler of statesman-like views, became so sensible of the necessity for active interference on behalf of grain cultivation, that an irrigation ordinance was enacted and the restoration commenced of some of the large tanks in the Batticaloa district. Some of those have proved successful, though scarcely financially so, owing to their excessive cost beyond the original estimates; whilst the ordinance which its framers hoped would have led to the restoration and utilisation of many smaller works, proved a failure from its disregard for native character and habits. The bill was simply permissive, hence the natives not only disregarded it, but looked upon it as a measure that was not intended to be permanent. The irrigation rules and orders to which their ancestors had paid implicit obedience, were of a compulsory character, and the villager of the present time failed to recognize permissive legislation as demanding any consideration. This inoperative ordinance was eventually replaced by a bill for the better regulation of paddy\* cultivation and the repair and up-keep of tanks and water-courses, containing stringent provisions more in accordance with the character of the people for whose benefit it was enacted. In the year 1867, a non-official member of the Legislature obtained a committee of enquiry into the condition of irrigation works and rice cultivation, the report of which led to some important results.

The following passage occurs in the evidence tendered to this committee by one of the revenue officers:—"In the present state of the country, and more especially in reference to the tax now levied on paddy cultivation, I believe it to be obligatory on the

---

\*Paddy is rice in the husk.

Government to render aid and assistance, at least so long as the tax is levied. Abolish the tax, and the obligation would perhaps cease." But the Government never contemplated the relinquishment of such a prolific source of revenue. The obligation has been accepted, though not in the liberal sense indicated by the witness in question. The committees on irrigation recognised the urgency of the cultivator's case and recommended the restoration of all works in or near centres of population: where the work was of small extent it was to be executed by gratuitous village labour, the Government providing without charge the scientific supervision necessary as well as all iron and stone work. Where the tank was of an extent to take it out of the list of village works, the Government provides the requisite funds, charging in return a water-rate according to the circumstances of each community, but in no case to exceed six shillings per annum for each acre of land irrigated. It was further recommended that a skilled officer, with a competent staff, be entrusted with the execution of these works, which it was not considered desirable to place in charge of the Public Works Department. The Government adopted the recommendations, but with some important modifications, which entirely changed their character: it consented to undertake the restoration of large tanks, but on condition that the amount so expended should be regarded as a loan to the cultivators to be repaid by them without interest, in ten annual instalments, a failure of any one of which was to be visited by seizure of the crop. An irrigation officer was appointed, but his efficiency was impaired by being attached to the Department of Public Works and placed under the orders of the Director, and an Irrigation Board. The restoration of tanks was made so far optional, that it was competent for the cultivators interested in them to decide by a majority of votes, whether such works should be undertaken; the decision of the majority was made binding on the minority. A number of tanks and water-courses were restored under the provisions of this ordinance, but it soon became apparent that, however liberal the latter might have been considered by the Government, they were not adapted to the circumstances of each case or to the means of the people. Land covered by an overgrowth of jungle could not be reclaimed and brought under rice crops without a considerable expenditure of time, toil, and money: it was found that when roots, seed and cattle were paid for, the cultivator was seldom in a condition to meet the first instalment to Government out of the proceeds of the first crop. Complications soon arose, added to which it was found that the work invariably cost more than the amount of the estimate, and when the people contrasted this state of things with the actions of their former native rulers, they came

to regard the new irrigation law with a distrust which, in some instances, ripened into dislike and opposition. These objections have, in some measure, been removed by succeeding amendments of the ordinance, which is, however, still capable of improvement.

On a recent occasion Lord Salisbury, in replying to an address from the Manchester Chamber of Commerce, said in reference to irrigation works in India, that one great difficulty involved in this question was to be found in the fact that, although the Government may provide the water, the cultivators will not take it on payment, a course which His Lordship attributed to torpor and suspicion of the motives of Government. The true explanation is to be found in their inability to pay; and had the Government of India adopted the course pursued in Ceylon of seeking the consent of all interested in an irrigation work previous to its commencement, this prolific source of failure might, probably, have been avoided.

There are not wanting those who consider that inasmuch as a tenth of paddy crops is levied by Government, some return for this should be made in the restoration of tanks without charge to the people; in support of this view the practice of the ancient sovereigns of Ceylon is cited, and comparison has been made with the system of grants-in-aid of the construction of roads for the use of planters. It is true the cultivators in olden times were not taxed for the construction of irrigation works, but they were compelled to give their unpaid labour to the work; and, though during this employment they were fed from the royal granaries, the actual value of their food was not more than the equivalent of a penny a day. With regard to the argument respecting aid to planters' roads through coffee districts, it should be remembered that such roads, though constructed in the interests of an important industry, are available for and used by the general public, whereas a tank or a water-course can be utilised by none others than the cultivators in its immediate vicinity.

In intimate relation with the question of irrigation is the paddy tax, or Government tithe of paddy crops, concerning which it would appear considerable misapprehension exists. Political economists are so much agreed upon the general impolicy of taxes on food, that it is not surprising to find the late Sir Emerson Tennent in his official report on Ceylon finance, in 1847, condemn the grain tax and the salt monopoly. But in this instance equally with the report of the commissioners of enquiry in 1833, those who condemned the island financial policy, were unable to suggest any other means by which the bulk of the people might be reached. If we examine the strictures passed on the paddy tax, we shall find that the objection is not so much to the impost as to the

mode in which it is levied, and herein lies the difference between the ancient and the modern systems. When Sir Emerson Tennent wrote in 1847, "The time has arrived when it has become the duty of Government to remove the *old* and vicious system of taxation," he had not ascertained the precise nature of the old system: he had been in the island but little more than twelve months, and moved by the impulses of a political economist, he regarded with repugnance a system which under British rule had become vicious through the intervention of the assessor and the renter, extortioners unknown under the ancient system. The mode in which the grain tax is levied may be briefly stated as follows: The tithes in each district are sold by auction to the highest bidders, and, in order to determine the amount to be offered for sale, a headman is employed to assess by personal inspection the extent of crop in each field. The power thus given to overstate the cultivator's liability to the Government, is made a means of enrichment by the unscrupulous assessor. But worse follows: the purchaser of the Government share or, as he is called, the renter is always a very shrewd person. "The headman of the village is generally in his interest, and the name of the Government paddy renter has a magic influence on Magistrates and Commissioners. It may be well imagined with what odds against him the ignorant paddy cultivator starts in this race. The ordinance enables the renter to create a regular circle of pit-falls round his victim, and with a little extra impulse, communicated by the headman, (in the majority of cases a secret partner of the renter) the ignorant paddy grower will inevitably fall into one of the traps set for him. The renter having the cultivator in his power is able to impose his own terms, and if nearly three or four times the legitimate share due to him is not paid down at once, he generally resorts to the police court as the criminal procedure therein serves his purpose better than the dilatory process of a civil suit. A false return of service of summons skilfully arranged between the renter and the headman, leads to a criminal warrant with all its terrors of arrest and imprisonment, and this usually ends with a settlement of the renter's demand in full, either by an immediate money payment or the granting of a bond, mortgaging perhaps, the very field which in process of time is seized and sold in execution."\* If the case is contested the cultivator is sure of defeat with the additional burthen of costs on both sides.

It is true the Government will accept a commutation of the paddy rents, and in certain districts where water is in good supply, this system is adopted, and the services of the renter are dispensed

---

\* Ludovic's History of Rice Cultivation, p. 134.

with ; but where the means of irrigation are scanty and the rain-fall uncertain, commutation is impracticable, by reason of the impossibility of determining the result of crops. Far better would it be if the present system of collection were abolished, and in its stead a general commutation introduced, or better still, a land tax which, if it included properties of every description, might be fixed at a most trifling amount per acre. The policy of levying a tax on the production of such a necessary article as rice, whilst other products, such as tobacco, cocoanuts, cinnamon, coffee, &c., enjoy immunity, is more than questionable and demands serious consideration.

Intimately connected with the development of agricultural industry is the construction of roads through the rural districts. It was this consideration, equally with reasons of a military nature, which induced Sir Edward Barnes, then Governor of Ceylon, to construct the great trunk road connecting Kandy, the mountain capital, with Colombo the seat of Government. This magnificent work, seventy-two miles in length, was completed in 1823, and within a few years exercised a marked influence on the internal trade of the country. The exports of coffee, then the exclusive produce of native gardens, rapidly increased, enabling the growers to obtain by barter articles of European production to which they had hitherto been strangers.

The creation of a separate department of government, charged with the construction of roads, gave an impetus to the opening up of the country, rendered necessary by the rapid extension of coffee-planting dating from the year 1838. This was, however, confined to the hill districts of the interior in which the new enterprise was located. In order to meet the requirements of native interests, especially in the maritime districts, and in connection with the main line of road to Kandy, a measure was submitted to the Legislature in 1847, by the Government of Lord Torrington, by which a general assessment was to be made of six days' labour per annum from every adult male for the construction and up-keep of branch roads, such assessment to be commutable at will by an equivalent money payment, the Government supplementing the amount by an equal vote from the general revenue of the colony. This proposed enactment was met by opposition in some quarters, where it was regarded as the first step towards a return to compulsory labour, and so persistently was this opposition carried on, so exaggerated were the rumours in connection with it circulated throughout the country, that the Kandyans of the interior, a timid and ill-informed race, influenced by designing priests and discontented headmen, showed signs of disaffection which before long ripened into open rebellion.

Although the outbreak was soon quelled, it caused considerable apprehension at the time; but the objectionable enactment which had been put forward as a substantial grievance, became law and has remained in 'active' and useful operation to the present time, and it may be said that this legislation has contributed more to the material prosperity of the country, than any other legal provision. The principal districts in the Western, Southern and Central Provinces are now covered by a network of roads which bring the produce of those localities within easy reach of the chief centres of demand, and give them a value they did not previously possess. The results are visible in the improved dwellings of the people, in the augmentation of their means, and in the better quality of their dress. The advantages derived from opening up an agricultural country by roads find ample illustrations in the impetus given to commerce, and especially to railway traffic. In India, the vast system of railways constructed under State guarantees, has entailed on the Government an annual contribution of a million and a half sterling to make up deficient income to the guaranteed amount. The Ceylon railway will have cost two millions and a quarter sterling, but so successful has it proved, that already the greater portion of the cost and interest has been paid off, and within a few years from the present time, the entire cost will have been liquidated, and the line will remain the unencumbered property of the colony, yielding a handsome contribution to the general revenue. There can be little doubt that, whilst in the case of the Indian railways the absence of success is explained by the want of minor roads to serve as feeders for traffic, the unexampled prosperity of the Ceylon line is due in a great measure to the fact, that every district, however remotely connected with the railway, has wheeled communication with it.

The introduction of railway communication in India and Ceylon, has not been without some drawback, in both countries: the first effect of the new system of inland transport was to throw out of employment a large number of cart-drivers, and grass-cutters, as well as some thousands of persons engaged in the occupations of shop-keepers, dealers, and keepers of cattle-stalls, along the main lines of roads now no longer used. In India these people were thrown back upon the land for occupation, helping to swell the already overgrown population dependant on a precarious cultivation for subsistence. In the absence of minor roads to any extent along the lines of Indian railways, the owners and drivers of carts found their business annihilated with no other field in which to ply their avocation. In Ceylon, on the contrary, large numbers of carts driven from the main road, were soon in active employment on the minor thoroughfares, which

served as feeders to the railway throughout its entire length ; whilst the increasing demand for cask timber by the coffee trade, presented occupation to a large number of former cart-drivers as axe-men, sawyers and cooperas.

Not less beneficial to native interests than irrigation and road legislation, has been the ordinance providing for the institution of "village councils," in conformity with the constitution and authority of the ancient *gansabawas*, save that they are presided over by a salaried native president. It had been notorious for some time, that the minor courts at out-stations, so far from being a boon to rural communities, were a source of considerable evil : the ever increasing number of proctors and petition-drawers at such courts, rendered a livelihood by these professions a matter of extreme difficulty. It became the habit, therefore, of many of these small practitioners to encourage litigation on the most trivial occasion, and for the most insignificant results. Suits were instituted between members of the same family when the small matter at issue could have been amicably arranged without difficulty : litigation was prolonged under various pretexts, often for an indefinite period, and frequently with ruinous results to both parties : witnesses were called away from their avocations to attend a distant court, often for many consecutive days : and it is beyond doubt, that criminal cases in the various courts of the island frequently had their origin in petty family suits which might have been arranged without litigation, but for the action of petition-drawers and proctors. The Government felt that this state of things was demoralising and calculated to impoverish the communities of rural districts. It resolved to check the growing evil by the only means which seemed likely to afford a complete and legitimate relief, namely, the re-establishment of "*gansabawas*" or village councils, which had worked so satisfactorily under the administration of native sovereigns. These bodies, the representatives of the rural communities by whom they were elected, were felt to be most fitting tribunals for the adjustment of disputes, for the arrangement of family feuds and for the framing and enforcement of rules and regulations in reference to tanks and water-courses, cattle trespass, fences, drains, bye-roads, and indeed all minor matters connected with the internal government of small communities. Petty offences and assaults were made amenable to these patriarchal courts, and the results, after a trial of a few years, have shown that the expectations of the promoters of this institution have been fully realised. Village councils may now be found in active operation throughout many districts of the island, and in every instance working satisfactorily. Already their action has lessened the work of small out-station law courts, and the effect of

this, must in the end, be favourable to the industry and well-being of the rural population.\*

There are, however, other objects within reach of these village councils. They might be made the media of communication between the Government and the governed. The evil of the system by which we rule Eastern races, in Ceylon as well as in India, is that legislation is formed with too little regard to the habits and customs of the people, and when put to a practical test, fails in its object. The frequent re-casting of Ceylon laws, as instanced in the Kandyan Marriage Ordinance, the Irrigation Ordinance, and some others, would have been avoided, had it been possible to have submitted drafts of enactments to village councils throughout the country. So much of the success of legislation for native interests depends on a regard for the special requirements and circumstances of different districts, to which the executive and legislative bodies are, to a great extent, strangers, that this reference would be of infinite value, not alone in perfecting legislation, but in inspiring the people with attachment to and confidence in our Government. So long as this link is wanting, successful government must remain an ever recurring difficulty. We may construct costly public works, extend educational establishments, and frame complicated ordinances, but until we have won the confidence of the population, we cannot hope to educate them, by which means alone we may hope to elevate their character. In Ceylon the poverty and timidity of the people, rather than their contentment, are guarantees for the tranquillity of the country, but this can scarcely be said of India, where it would be well if village councils were introduced as a means of affording occupation and tranquillity to rural communities.

There is one other subject of prominent importance—the employment of the people:—important because it bids fair to assume still larger proportions, and because of its intimate connection with the present educational movement, and with the internal government of the country. In Ceylon there are happily none of what are in India known as dangerous classes, for whom military or civil employment becomes a State necessity. The revenue service and the general public departments are as open to natives of the country as can be fairly expected: the legal, the judicial, the medical, the scientific, and the educational

---

	1873.	1874.
Cases instituted ...	7,938	23,936.
Amicably settled ...	1,414	4,618.
Decisions ...	4,450	12,543.
Criminal cases ...	1,984	5,857.
Appeals, confirmed...	96	177.
Ditto set aside ...	28	38

\* Recent returns of work transacted by Village Councils during the last two years show a considerable increase over former figures. They give the following results:—

departments, are all as free to natives as to Europeans, and if the people of the country be not found occupying posts in the revenue branches of the service, a reason for this absence may be found in the inferiority of their physique, disqualifying them for the discharge of laborious travelling duties. Amongst the lower orders of natives of Ceylon, the demoralisation of national character is a bar to their present advancement in the social scale. Duplicity and cunning have been, through successive generations, the weapons employed by them against the oppression and extortions of petty native headmen, assessors and renters, until these qualities have become a portion of their nature. The custom prevailing in Eastern countries from the most ancient times, of approaching a superior with a gift in the hand, has grown stronger by long usage, and during the rule of the Portuguese and Dutch whose employés were partly paid by fees and perquisites, the practice became a recognised usage. Under such circumstances bribery and corruption crept into every transaction of daily life, in commercial dealings under the name of *dustoor* or "commiss," in official and legal transactions in the form of presents. Not a petty appointment in any branch of the public service, not a post in any private establishment changes hands, but a consideration passes to some one connected with the be-stower of the place. Not a commercial transaction is completed without some emolument passing from both buyers and sellers to their underlings, who frequently close their careers in affluence. The law courts, the *cutcherries*, the headmen's homesteads, the portals of Government House, are infested by men who have learnt to regard every transaction in life as a matter that must be weighed against gold. So long as this evil is allowed to fester in the system, we cannot expect our administration to work satisfactorily, nor can the people be entrusted with a larger influence in public affairs than they now enjoy in the form of village councils, where happily there is neither time nor scope for the exercise of this baneful practice. Unfortunately, progress in education which should raise the *morale* of the people, has been most unsatisfactory, until within the last year or two. The system by which a high class education was imparted at a nominal charge to the pupils, has been recently abolished, and grants-in-aid are being appropriated to private and missionary institutions; but in regard to native elementary schools, very little has yet been done in the absence of properly qualified and sufficiently paid teachers, and of educational books adapted to the capacities of village scholars. Were the co-operation of village councils to be sought in regard to elementary education for rural communities, much good might be effected at a trifling cost; they might be induced to levy a local cess for schools

which Government could aid by supplies of books and general requisites, whilst the *pansala* or Buddhist schools attached to temples, of which there are large numbers throughout the country, might be economically and advantageously utilised. But to make any impression on the mass of the people, there is wanted a series of elementary school books in the native languages, a systematically graduated course of reading and instruction ranging from the beginning to the end of an ordinary village school career, judicious in the selection of subjects suited to the grasp of the learner, combined with simplicity of expression and an interesting mode of treatment. The Vernacular Tract Society has supplied a number of publications in Singhalese, but they are unsuited to the object in view, having regard to the exclusion of religious or doctrinal matter from Government school books.

But education alone cannot effectually elevate the character of any people, much less of Orientals; the Government must perform its own share of the work in Ceylon by strenuous efforts to abolish the demoralising practices of bribery, extortion and perjury. The former may be gradually eradicated by awarding a higher rate of salary to native headmen, by appointing none but members of high-caste families to places of trust and authority, and by extending to them more official recognition and social courtesy than they have hitherto received from the Governor and his Agents. The detestable crime of perjury must be dealt with more severely in the Courts and by public opinion.

The gradual extension of irrigation will effect much towards a larger employment of the labouring population of rural districts. But this will not suffice. The people must be taught to depend less upon one article of food than hitherto, in view of the difficulty, and in many instances the impossibility of securing sufficient water for its cultivation. Rice should be made to give place to such roots as manioc, sweet-potatoes, yams, &c., all of which may be brought to maturity with a rain-fall that would be totally inadequate for rice culture. The food-problem of the East will never be solved so long as rice remains the sole diet of the people.

Much has unquestionably been done in Ceylon to repair the errors of former administrations, some of which reforms might be introduced into India with advantage. How much more remains to be done has been set forth in this paper. The true condition of a country cannot always be judged by the annual official balance sheet. In the East, especially, the amount of specie in the Government treasury vaults forms no correct index of the material welfare of the tax-payers. Nor in the fair island of Ceylon can the casual observer judge truly the state of the country at large, by the outward signs of comfort and prosperity,

which meet him along the main lines of road or in the chief centres of industry. Far different is the condition of the people in the outlying districts of the Northern, North-Western and some other provinces, where poverty weighs down the people in a state of abject helplessness.

---

## ART. VI.—SOME SUGGESTIONS FOR UNIVERSITY REFORM IN INDIA.

### *Independent Section.*

THE results of the Calcutta University have been judged by various standards, and it is extremely discouraging to find that they have almost always been declared unsatisfactory. Whether the standard adopted was that of writing a few lines idiomatically in that language on which the greatest share of the student's time and attention had been bestowed, or of prosecuting any branch of knowledge into the higher and comparatively unexplored regions, the decision has almost been uniformly against this institution and its *alumni*. We do not assert that the judges were always competent or impartial, or that their decisions when they employed a test like the one we have first mentioned were always just or correct. It is a curious fact, and at the same time a very humiliating index of the general abilities and acquirements of those who usually sit in judgment on the graduates of the Calcutta University, that this is the standard which is most frequently adopted. It may certainly be answered the measure must correspond with the thing measured, and if it were true that the majority of Calcutta graduates cannot write correct English, this would be a perfectly sufficient answer. It is our conviction, however, that this standard is employed and an unmeasured torrent of abuse is poured on the heads of a few offending graduates, who no doubt richly deserve it, only to hide the utter want of a true standard, and of that reflection which alone can produce it, in the minds of those who assume the functions of a judge. We believe that Calcutta graduates, as a body, write English more correctly than any body of a similar number ever wrote in a foreign language.

But we deny that this in any measure demonstrates the success of the University. What we want Calcutta graduates to do is not merely to write English after a more or less correct standard, but to learn in some measure to think for themselves. We do not expect that every member of this large and continually increasing body should contribute to scientific or philosophic thought; but we maintain, that there is such a thing as the science of common life, and that those at least who lay a claim to have received the most liberal education that the country affords, should, when they finish their academical career, and go forth into "the world's broad field of battle," find themselves equipped with some consistent and unmistakeable principles in this same science of daily life.

This can only take place by a radical change in the course of training which the students undergo. The principle of the change we will enunciate in the words of John Stuart Mill. "If there is a first principle in intellectual education it is this—that the discipline which does good to the mind, is that in which the mind is active, not that in which the mind is passive." It will be observed that the class in reference to which this sentence was written, was that of the day-labourer and not that of the University graduate. The same principle is inculcated by another educationalist, Mr. Matthew Arnold, in different and somewhat vague phraseology, when he asserts that the best education is that which leads the student to "vital knowledge"; meaning by that expression a knowledge which will enable its possessor to assimilate and adapt it to circumstances, and will not lie dormant till it is forgotten and lost for ever. Such a knowledge can alone generate the principles of daily life which we have mentioned in the last paragraph. Those who have paid any attention to the educational literature of England, are no doubt aware that a knowledge of these principles is there deemed indispensable even in those who have received the most elementary education; and we are, therefore, not sure whether we are not taking too low a stand-point in contending that the graduates of the national University should be acquainted with, and be capable of, making practical use of these facts and principles.

There are, however, certain considerations which lead us to think that the principal difficulty we shall encounter will not consist in combatting a belief which may prevail in some quarters, that the science of common life is of too trivial and unimportant a character, to have any effect in deciding the course of studies in a University. A difficulty of much greater magnitude will arise from the inability of those to whom we intend chiefly to address these pages, to discern any connection, however slender, between the vague generalities which they will be likely to think of when they hear of the science of common life, and the subjects which they have been accustomed to consider as lying within the legitimate province of a University education. In order properly to meet this difficulty, we ought at once to explain what we mean by the science of common life. Like all other sciences this consists of a body of truths; but these are distinguished from other truths, as the name signifies, by their importance in the daily concerns of life. It may, however, be proper to observe that, what would be considered the science of daily life with reference to one class of society, will have little interest for members of another class. With regard to those whom we have specially in view, this science will consist of the broad truths of physiology (embracing the facts of human life), of hygiene

or health, public and private, including dietetics and other allied subjects, and of political, social, and commercial economy.

An acquaintance with the most recently discovered facts in these supremely important branches of human knowledge, a receptivity for such as are continually being discovered, and a conviction in their truth so overpowering as to render them the guiding principles of life, are what, in our opinion, should form the mental furniture of every man beginning life. But how far is this from being the case, is known to every one who has taken the trouble to glance through the course of study prescribed by the Calcutta University. To the best of our knowledge a fragment only of one of the several subjects we have mentioned, can be found in the very outskirts of the prescribed course, and is reached by only a small section of those who proceed to the highest degree conferred by the University. Such a state of things can be explained only in one of two ways. It may either be that after a thorough and rigorous examination of the merits of all the branches of human knowledge, those which now form the course have been considered pre-eminently important, and all others, including those the study of which we have advocated, have been jostled out of the field from the necessity of concentrating the student's attention on a certain limited number of subjects; or it may be that a course has been adopted that will tax the exertions and abilities of professors and students in the smallest degree.

One can very well understand the rivalry existing between the professors of different branches of knowledge in European countries. The controversy between classical scholars and scientific men with regard to the superior merits of their own subjects, has been of a long duration, and has been waged with much vigour. In a paper, however, on University Education in India, it is entirely out of place to refer to this controversy, seeing that so far is classical literature from being chargeable with the ousting of science from the Indian colleges, that it has itself gained no footing whatever. There is, of course, some time bestowed on the study of the classical languages of Asia, but it is so insignificant that no one has ever thought of explaining the low standard prescribed for science by a reference to it. As it does not appear that any one subject receives an undue share of attention, and also that none reaches further than a standard confessedly low, we are naturally and necessarily led to the conclusion that the latter of the two alternatives mentioned at the end of the last paragraph is the true one. We do not assert that the present meagre course is kept up by an ever-existing conviction of its lightness and triviality in the minds of those who arrange it. We will even assert that such a conviction may not once be

present in the minds of those engaged in educational work ; but we will assert that the course having been once arranged, and at the time considered suited to the capacities of Indian students, is still kept up, though it has in the meantime become utterly effete and unsuitable, by that apathy and want of reflection, which we must candidly declare to be the besetting sins of officers employed in educational work in India.

We are aware that the remarks we have just made will not conduce to our popularity ; but so important is an open declaration of one's convictions on a subject like national University education, that no fear of unpopularity will induce us to mince matters in this respect. Having been educated in India, and having afterwards enjoyed inestimable opportunities for comparing Indian and English educational work, we have imbibed a deep and overpowering conviction that much less is done during the years that an Indian youth passes at school and college, than would be under a better and somewhat more rational system. As the circumstances of the country and certain social customs which, however deplorable, cannot be done away with in a day, render it impossible, at least for years to come, that Indians, unless very exceptionally situated, should carry on their studies with any signal effect, outside the colleges ; it becomes the more incumbent on such as happen to think that there is room for improvement in the machinery at work within these institutions, openly and fearlessly to express their views. The question of education, it has been said, has been the battle-field and burial-ground of theories ; and it might have been added, also their consecrating throne. If some theories have been justly rejected after a very short hearing, and others have been found wanting when their merits have been rigidly scrutinised, there have also been others, which after enduring the brunt of battle, have taken triumphant possession of the public mind. We would fain hope that some at least of the theories that will be broached in the course of these pages, will, after a thorough discussion of their merits, which we trust will be vouchsafed to them, be allowed to have some effect on the course of Indian education.

We have already expressed our dissatisfaction with the amount of work done in Indian colleges, with reference to subjects not contained in the prescribed course. But we have also to take exception to what is done in the subjects which are taught. We will discuss this part of the question first ; because if we succeed in showing that all the subjects now comprised in the prescribed course, may be taught as well as they now are, or even better, without taking up all the student's time, as they apparently now do, we shall make out a *prima facie* case for the introduction of other subjects ; and it will then remain for us only to show how

those subjects could be taught ; that is, to indicate how the necessary professorial machinery could be provided.

In showing that more might be taught in each of the subjects which form the ordinary curriculum in Indian colleges, than is now done, several lines of argument can be adopted, and we will follow these out successively.

In the first place we ought to hear what the intelligent undergraduate has himself to say on this question. Leaving aside the convictions we entertained at the period of our undergraduate-ship, we can fairly appeal to an almost unanimous opinion expressed by a large body of undergraduates belonging to the Presidency College, with whom we recently had an opportunity of discussing the subject. It was evident from what they said, that the intelligent portion of each class could finish the two years' course in one year with the greatest ease. It is possible that the professors may entertain an opposite opinion ; and if any of them had paid much attention to the individual wants and capacities of particular students, and not merely to those of the class generally, such an opinion would be of the greatest authority. We have no doubt that the different courses now prescribed are fairly sufficient for the learning-powers of the classes taken as bodies, but we have as little doubt that the same courses can be thoroughly mastered by a fair proportion of the students, in something like half the time now devoted to them. Now if there is one system more deplorably pernicious than another, it is that which levels the intelligent with the stupid, and stunts and retards the progress of the former in order that the latter may keep up with them. If, indeed, it were true that the intelligent and the stupid must learn together, or one of them must go untaught, then the present system might be accepted as the lesser of two evils. But, as a perusal of these pages would show, intellectual food of varying richness can very easily be provided for intellectual stomachs of various strength, and that at no greater cost than what the present uniform system entails. We claim no originality, no abstruse research in discovering this system, which will no doubt appear marvellous to most Indian readers. It is at work all over the civilized world, and both its machinery and its results are so patent, that to use a common expression "those who run may read." It is only an apathy like that which presides over educational work in India, which could so long remain ignorant of its existence, or could so long persist in not sharing in its benefits.

In the secoud place, we will compare the amount of work done in an Indian and an English college. It is this argument on which we will lay the greatest stress, and it is therefore necessary that there should be no loophole left to assail it. We will proceed

to show that, taking young men of the same age, an infinitely greater amount of work is done in an institution like the University College in London, than in any college in India—we will take the Presidency College at Calcutta as being one of the best. There are only three causes which can produce this difference, *viz.*, difference in the efficiency of the systems employed, in the capacities of students, or in the amount of exertion they may be ready to undergo. As we believe that the first of these three is the real cause, we will at the outset dispose of the other two. The capacities of Indian students have been repeatedly declared to be in no way inferior to those of their English compeers, and as far as the period embraced in education is concerned, there is no reason to differ from this verdict. At a subsequent period of the student's life, indeed in the period immediately succeeding that spent in college, there may be a marked decline in the capacities of a young Indian, but as this deplorable result arises from well-ascertained and demonstrable causes, it in no way affects our present argument. The difference in the amount of exertion also, we are convinced, has no weakening effect on our argument, but is, if anything, in our favour. It is constantly asserted that Indian students are more industrious than English; and though we know the stories current in India about the marvellously small amount of study with which English students get up their work to be incorrect, still on the score of diligence there would be a balance in favour of Indian students. Having disposed of the only two circumstances which may be mistaken for the real cause, and shown that if they have any effect, it is only in the opposite direction, we can now assert that if there is a difference in the amount of work done, that difference can only arise from a difference in the efficiency of the teaching. And we will now proceed to show that there is a decided difference in the amount of work done.

Take for instance the subject of mathematics. A course extending over three years, or more correctly, divided into three classes, and comprising three hour-lectures a week in each course, together with some supplementary hours for exercises, is considered in the University College in London to be sufficient for the whole of pure mathematics; and a course of similar duration and character is devoted to mixed mathematics. Now a student with ordinary parts, fresh from school can, among his other studies, take one class in each department and may thus go over the whole of mathematics in three years; while, if he has special talents and aptitude for the subject, he can combine two of the pure mathematics classes, with one of the mixed, or *vice versa*, and thus abridge the duration of the whole. It will not require strong powers of language or of imagination to contrast this

with the state of things here. What does a Calcutta Bachelor of Arts learn of mathematics in his four-year course at the Presidency College? Most of my readers know the extent of this knowledge very well; and therefore instead of enumerating the scanty items, we will only say, that for ourselves, we felt very humble whenever we had to compare our acquirements, in this as well as in most other subjects, with those of any intelligent boy who had just left school. Now the B. A. course, as we have said, extends over four years, and if we are not mistaken, the students in most colleges in India devote a larger number of hours each week, to the mathematical part of their course, than that we have mentioned above.

What we have said with regard to mathematics applies with equal force to all other subjects, and with much greater force to some. What, for instance, is done in physical sciences in Indian colleges, need not be spoken of in the same breath with what is done in colleges in England, and will hardly bear comparison with what is done in the more advanced schools.

There is indeed one subject, the proficiency attained in which should form a crucial test of the efficiency of the teaching in Indian colleges; as a large portion of the student's time and attention is devoted to it. It is, indeed, not unfrequent for Indian educationalists to plume themselves on the fact that Calcutta graduates possess, in some cases, a more thorough and intimate acquaintance with English literature than the generality of young Englishmen. If by this last phrase are understood such as have merely gone through the ordinary classical or mathematical courses at Oxford or Cambridge, we have no reason to differ from this very satisfactory opinion. But we can hardly see the justice of comparing men who have gone through a laborious course on a particular subject, which has extended over years, with others who have paid no attention to it, when the comparison has special reference to their respective acquirements in that particular subject. A just comparison in this respect can only take place between Indian students, and such English ones as have regularly attended lectures in English literature, like those of Professor Henry Morley at the University College in London. If such a comparison were made, we are afraid, the vaunted superiority of Indian students in this respect will vanish and melt into thin air. There is, moreover, scarcely any unanimity with respect to this superiority; for, as we have had occasion to mention at the very outset, the sins of Indian graduates and undergraduates against English grammar and idiom are the frequent, not to say nauseously frequent, subject of animadversion among a certain class of Anglo-Indian journalists.

We believe we have succeeded in showing that there is room

for improvement in the educational work done in India, and we will now proceed to describe some of the measures, which we believe, rightly employed, would bring about a great change. The general spirit of all the measures we shall advocate can be shortly described thus—a greater choice and freedom will be given to the students, so that their movements may not be hampered and their progress retarded, by unnecessary and unreasonable restrictions. We may take one example—the minimum age prescribed by the Calcutta University for matriculation. We will for the sake of argument, admit that the University has a right to regulate the qualifications (with reference to age, as well as others) of those who aspire to the honours she confers; but we will at the same time assert that the exercise of this right, as it draws with it the absolute educational loss of a year or even of two years in that period of a student's life when he is most apt for educational purposes, is attended with the most disastrous consequences. Let the University, if she think proper, take every precaution that those whom she marks with her badges of honour, be not tainted with the "unpardonable crime of being youthful;" but let her not therefore ruin the career of every intelligent young man by inflicting a year of enforced laziness at a time when the mind is eager and active in the acquisition of knowledge. It is necessary in this respect prominently to point out the difference between England and India. In the former there are innumerable facilities for learning, outside the walls of colleges; efficient private tutors can very easily be had; and the pecuniary circumstances of the middle-classes of England allow a fair proportion of students the advantage of having recourse to them. In the latter, even if a young man is able to pay largely for private tuition, which is not frequently the case, he is, except in very rare circumstances, unable to get really sound and efficient tutors. The natural, but lamentable consequence of this want of private tutors, is this, that the schools and colleges being the only portals to knowledge, whenever a boy has the misfortune to possess more than the usual modicum of intelligence, he is condemned to do the same lessons twice and even sometimes thrice over, which to his quick-witted temperament must be specially tiresome and irritating, and which in due time must create in him, a distaste for study and a want of application, that he will very rarely get rid of afterwards.

Returning from this digression, we will proceed to describe the measures which, in our opinion, would improve the state of things now existing.

*First.*—The first, and one of the most important of these, has been somewhat faintly indicated in the course of the last paragraph. It is this; let every undergraduate, and we may also

include the boys in the higher forms of schools, attend as many classes as they like, and are able to go on with. Let it be the business of the school or the college to provide an extensive and nutritious dietary, but let those who sit at the table have perfect freedom to regale themselves with what best suits their palates. The inevitable result of following the opposite course, a result which is but too frequent and too patent, is this, that the guest goes unfed and is starved, either because his gorge rises at the flavour of the viands, or because what is provided is all too weak for his digestion and appetite. It is hardly necessary to put this allegory into literal language, and instead of doing so, we will go on to sketch out the new system. It would not be necessary to do this, if we were only addressing ourselves to such as have had any opportunities of examining English colleges, but the plan must be so very novel to ordinary Indian readers that full details will, we think, prove not a little acceptable. The colleges then, according to this system, instead of being divided into so many years, where young men of a 'size' are roughly grouped together, without any heed to their individual tastes and capacities, will consist of classes met together to attend the lectures on a particular subject; each course of such lectures, extending over one or more years according to the difficulty and extent of the subject. Thus, to take an example, instead of all who matriculate at the same time being formed into one class, there would be a set of classes for mathematics or for English literature, through which such students as take those subjects up, will pass in the course of several successive years. The system will be better explained by our copying out a portion of the routine of studies at the college we have so often mentioned, than merely by a lengthened description. We will only take such portion of the routine as refer to two subjects, English literature and mathematics; and no idea can therefore be formed of the extent of ground covered by the lectures, specially as what is here given is only a fragment of one of four or five different routines, each belonging to a separate faculty.

	8-9	9-10	10-11	11-12	12-1	1-2	2-3	3-4	4-5
Mon.	Pure M.ath. Junior.	P. M. Senior.	M. M. J.	M. M. S.	...	...	Eng. Com- position.	...	Early Eng.
Tues.	P. M. Exer.	P. M. Higher S.	M. M. E.	M. M. H. S.	...	...	First Eng. (Anglo- Saxon)	...	Particular author of Mod. times.
Wed.	Pure Math J.	P. M. S.	M. M. J.	M. M. S.	...	...	Particular Period of	...	.....
Thurs.	P. M. E.	P. M. H. S.	M. M. E.	M. M. H. S.	...	...	Mod. Eng. Particular Period	...	.....
Friday	Pure Math J.	P. M. S.	M. M. J.	M. M. S.	...	...	Eng. Com.	...	Particular author
Satur.	P. M. E.	P. M. H. S.	M. M. E.	M. M. H. S.	...	...	First Eng.	...	Early Eng. .....

This routine is given from memory, but it will be found substantially correct. It will be seen that no professor has to work more than two hours a day, and no student has to devote, under ordinary circumstances, more than six hours a week to any particular subject. We have taken two of the most extensive subjects comprised in the curriculum, and the routine shows, that each of pure and mixed mathematics may be very well and very easily managed by one professor, and that English literature, comprising in that phrase the literature of England from the earliest times to the present day, can be similarly entrusted to a single teacher. We need not point out how different this is from the way things are done in Indian colleges, but we shall have to advert to it when we turn to the pecuniary side of the question.

It will be remembered that the changes we are advocating will in no way interfere with the conditions under which students are allowed to appear in the university examinations. We do, indeed, plead for more frequent and more diversified examinations, but as this question is not fraught with consequences nearly so important as the one we are now discussing, and merely affects the right of one's affixing certain letters to his name, we can leave it aside for the present.

Together with this cardinal change, there would come various subsidiary ones. As the students will be at liberty to attend as many classes as they like, and as some would find it necessary to attend more classes than others, it would only be just that those who attend more classes should pay more than those who attend fewer. We need not enter into details about the amounts of fees for the different classes, but we may only say that they are to be so arranged that those who attend the same number of lectures as they do now, will have to pay in several sums, what they now pay at once. It may, of course, be very hard on quick-witted, but poor students, as they will have to pay more than their duller, and in some cases richer comrades; but still the evil will be less than that which exists at present, when the quick-witted students cannot satisfy their craving for more knowledge than the college supplies, or the University allows, either for love or money. There would be many other alterations necessary with regard to the hours of attendance at lectures, but these minor matters may very well be left for future consideration.

*Second.*—We have now shown a want, and have also described a theoretical remedy; and we will now indicate how the theory can be put into practice. If we were to confine the future course within the narrow limits that circumscribe the present, there would be no difficulty in this part of our work. We should simply have to prescribe, that the staffs of the colleges where the

professors work only for two hours in the day, should be reduced, and to ordain that such professors as are now over-worked, because they have to teach the whole of one subject, as is the case in most Mofussil colleges, should earn the leisure which they so well merit, and which they will, no doubt profitably employ. But it is very far from our wish that the future course should be so limited, and we, therefore, wish to see the number of professors very materially increased. As to the salaries of the new professors, they must be on a new system, for it is chimerical to hope, and unreasonable to wish, that the number of professors should be increased, apparently without any limit, when they are to receive salaries on the heavy scale now in vogue. In order also to give something like consistency and uniformity to the new system, it would be necessary to re-arrange the salaries of the existing professors. We do not possess the temerity to bring forward any scheme which would injuriously affect the pockets of those whom we most earnestly wish to carry along with us; and it will be seen that the professors now holding appointments, will be none the worse off, if our system received a trial, but on the other hand will have it in their own hands whether their position will not be materially bettered. The system we propose is this—that all professors ought to be paid partly by fixed salaries, and partly by the students' fees. As we have said, in arranging the details every care would be taken, that if each class retained its present strength, the new salary of each professor would be exactly equal to his old one. We are confident that as soon as the system is introduced, if it ever is introduced, there will be a thorough re-arrangement of the number of students in each class, and consequently some professors will be benefitted, while others will incur some loss. But this is a result, which we for ourselves will never deplore, and we venture to hope, that in an age when the "survival of the fittest" is the cardinal creed of the civilized world, it will nowhere prove very unacceptable. With regard to the new professors, the fixed portion of the salary will be arranged on a much humbler scale, and all that the University will do as an initiative, will be to draw up an extensive scheme of lectures leaving the chairs to be filled up in course of time.

This part of the subject looks very visionary, and we are aware that it is the least satisfactory part of a scheme which we consider perfectly feasible in every other respect. We do not, however, wish to shirk the difficulty, and we will, therefore, discuss the question in detail. It will be seen, by an attentive consideration of that part of this paper which relates to the arrangement of classes, that an ordinarily extensive subject can be dealt with very adequately by means of three or four lectures in the week. Now,

these lectures can be so arranged, that a person belonging to a profession or engaged in business, at the seat of the college or in its immediate neighbourhood, may deliver them without in any way losing sight of his professional duties or his business avocations. This is so evident a means of supplying educational wants where there is a scanty supply of regular professors, that it has already been adopted in one particular faculty all over the country. We need not say that we refer to law-professors, most of whom practise in the courts, at the same time that they lecture to their classes. The same thing happens also, to some extent, in medical colleges ; though, on account of the necessity of providing extensive and costly apparatus, such colleges cannot be scattered broadcast over the face of the country in the same way that law-classes are. It is surprising that an expedient, in itself so simple, and one that suggested itself so early in the cases of law and medicine, should never have been thought of with reference to any other department of knowledge.

There is at present no apparatus for teaching botany, as far as we are aware, anywhere within the precincts of Calcutta, and not, certainly, in the Presidency College. Now, if the system we are here advocating were introduced, some of the higher officials belonging to the Botanical Gardens could easily drive over to the Presidency College, and lecture to a large class there for an hour every morning during the season when specimens are to be had in abundance. From what we have lately seen of the Presidency College, such a class is sure to be very largely attended. And, as on the system previously explained, an attendance at the lecture will not necessitate the payment of the whole college fee, but only that for the particular class ; the lectures, it is not unlikely, would be attended by students of other colleges, and even by grown-up persons, who may learn to appreciate the pleasure of examining the manifold beauties and of watching the marvellous processes of the vegetable world. It will be remembered by those who know anything of English colleges, that this is the system universally adopted there. Professor Oliver, for instance, of University College, is the keeper of the Herbarium at Kew, and various others may be named who join similar duties to those of the professorial chair. The distinguished attainments of the officers of the Calcutta Botanical Gardens have been so often noticed, and so highly praised, and specimens might so easily be supplied from the Gardens to the class, that we cannot but view with surprise and regret the apathy which has failed to utilise such excellent material. Without pretending to fix a class-fee which would be deemed sufficient to compensate for the teacher's exertions, we may point out that the latter will be classed with what is known in political economy as "household industry" ; and, as such, can be

undertaken for a smaller remuneration than any other. The professor being already paid for his work at the Gardens, will consider what he gets at the Presidency College as so much pure gain, and will therefore be satisfied with less than he would otherwise require.

The Bengal Government has, at the time that we are writing this, sanctioned the payment of Rs. 5,000, and has promised more as occasions and opportunities arise, for the establishment of a Zoological Garden in the neighbourhood of Calcutta, with the declared purpose of fostering that love for natural history with which it accredits the natives of Bengal, by supplying an interesting collection of living specimens. We trust that this, as well as the treasures of the Asiatic Society's Museum, will not be allowed to lie barren of results, but that a professor will be appointed, who, by means of lectures, interspersed with visits to the living and the dead collections, may create a love for natural history, of which as yet, we are afraid, the natives of Bengal are perfectly innocent. As to the professor, we have no doubt that the expedient we have described in the last paragraph, will be as successful with reference to zoology as to botany. Very satisfactory lectures on the natural history and natural philosophy sciences are, indeed, now delivered at some one or other college; and if the class-fee system which we have already described were only introduced, and perfect liberty were accorded to the students of belonging to more than one college at the same time, the benefits of these lectures would be multiplied beyond description. Anatomy and physiology, for instance, need not, for the present, form subjects of lecture at the Presidency College, if the students are allowed to attend the lectures on those subjects at the Medical College.

We need not describe, at the same length, the methods which may be adopted with reference to other subjects. But our readers will find, on a little reflection, that various instruments lie ready at our hands which have not been so much as thought of. There are gentlemen engaged in mechanical and manufacturing pursuits, who will be found competent professors of the sciences which form the bases of those pursuits; and for the reasons assigned above, the remunerations they will be satisfied with, will not be very heavy, and will be, in the greater part, met by the students' fees. With reference to classical literature also, that is, the literature of Greece and Rome, there must be many clergymen and others whose erudition, acquired by years of laborious study, must be lying barren and fruitless, and who, we have no doubt, must be eager to impart it to others, if only a means were pointed out to them for doing so. In the same way, the modern languages of Europe and the literature they contain, may find competent, willing, and even enthusiastic expounders among the educated portion

of the communities speaking those languages, that are to be found in Calcutta and other large towns. At least one earnest German scholar, we think, may be found in the German community in Calcutta, who will be glad to lecture on the wonderful language and the marvellous literature he has the privilege of calling his own, not so much for money as for the love of the Fatherland, and from the consciousness of being the first to unfold the beauty and richness of the Teutonic mind to listening hundreds who previously possessed no conception of it, or at the best a very dim and hazy one. The same thing may be said of Frenchmen, Italians and others.

*Third.*—Having provided an extensive professorial staff, we will next describe the machinery we wish to set up for appointing these professors, and for generally supervising other matters connected with the University. These powers we should entrust in the hands of a body of graduates, who may either form an assembly distinct from the Senate and the Syndicate, or may, for the present, be incorporated with the latter. We are aware that various objections could be raised against this proposal, and we will therefore attempt to answer them one by one.

It may be said that the graduates are not fit for self-government. To this we can only answer that, if they are not, there is no one in the country who is. We can hardly imagine a stronger proof of the failure of the present University system than would be implied by a confession that the men who have presumably received the best education in the country are not capable of undertaking some functions of self-government. With reference to the special function we have assigned to them, that of appointing professors, they will, no doubt, for the present, feel somewhat helpless; and it is for this reason that we advise their incorporation with the Syndicate, though we are not aware that the members of this body are much better qualified in this respect. At any rate, we cannot think of a better measure to test the self-governing powers of the natives of India, under the most favorable circumstances.

There are two other objections against this part of our scheme which need be noticed here. They contradict each other, and, consequently, one only can have any validity. On the one hand it may be objected that there are so many graduates, and with so little training for acting in concert and with self-control, that an assembly in which they sat will be the scene of much confusion; and that many will become members merely for the name, without possessing any distinct notion of their functions, and will serve to make the confusion worse confounded. Against this a very simple and effective remedy can be proposed. Let the members be required to pay an annual fee in order to be allowed to keep their

## 140 *Some Suggestion for University Reform.*

names in the books of the University, and we may be quite sure that none but such as take a genuine and intelligent interest in the affairs of their *Alma Mater*, will come forward as aspirants for the honour of membership. On the other hand, it may be alleged that there will be very few who will take any interest in the affairs of the University. We are afraid that there is some probability of this being the case, but we do not think that that is any reason why those who take a real interest in the education of the country should be excluded from all participation in the measures for promoting it. As the new assembly will be incorporated, for the present, with the existing Syndicate, there will be no danger of matters being brought to a stand-still on account of the paucity or ignorance of its members or from any other cause.

BRAJENDRANATH DE, M.A., B.C.S,

---

## ART. VII.—THE EDUCATION OF THE INDIA N CIVIL SERVICE.

A PROPOSAL has recently been made by the University of Oxford, with regard to the training of selected candidates for the Indian Civil Service, which it is to be hoped will not be dismissed without a full discussion and consideration of all its advantages.

These proposals are contained in the following resolutions :—

1. That it is desirable to make arrangements enabling selected candidates for the Indian Civil Service to reside at the University.
2. That it is desirable to provide University teaching in certain branches of study specially required by the selected candidates.
3. That it is desirable to make arrangements which may bring the degree of B. A. within the reach of such candidates before they proceed to India.

It has been further resolved that the Secretary of State for India be requested to consider whether candidates could not be selected at an age which would allow a three years' course of study at the University before they are required to go to India, that is, at an earlier age than the one fixed at present.

To these proposals it has been objected that limiting the age of selection would not secure the desired result; that candidates who fail to obtain an appointment (that is, who failed to pass the final examination) would have wasted their time at the University; and finally, that it would not be practicable to limit the age and then to allow three years to pass afterwards before the departure of the selected candidates for India, on the bare chance that some of them with so much time on their hands would take advantage of the opportunity which Oxford is proposing to offer them.

The first objection is simply a matter of opinion, in which the Oxford authorities are more likely to be right than the *Times* which raises it. The second is one which exists under the present system; for, as it is, there are generally some who are rejected at the final examination, and find that their time has been spent more unprofitably even than it would have been at the University. The third objection assumes that attendance at the University would be optional, instead of being, as it surely would and ought to be, if the system is to bear any fruit, compulsory.

There is very little, if anything, to be said in favour of the present system by which candidates selected at the open competition are turned adrift to pursue their studies at their own sweet will for the next two years, with no one to direct or control them, and nothing to remind them of their position except the periodical

examinations at the end of every six months, and the "Notes of cases" which have to be sent in at specified dates. For one thing, it is not always a pleasant way of spending his time for the selected candidate. Very often he is a stranger in London, and has neither time nor opportunity for making acquaintances. Then, if he is studiously inclined, he devotes himself entirely to his work with the chance of injuring his health, and the certainty of acquiring some at least of the habits of a bookworm, which will not fit him for the active life he is destined for ; on the other hand, if he is idle he is exposed to the manifold temptations which London offers to a man with much time on his hands, for it must be remembered that many of the candidates are only 17 or 18 years of age when they pass. Even if he falls into the other extreme, the two years are generally a dull period of hard work with little to vary or lighten it. My own experience of the time of probation is that it is an exceedingly uncomfortable and profitless portion of existence.

The duties of an Indian Civilian are numerous and important, but their number and magnitude have been so often and so eloquently described already, that I need not go over them here. It is an established fact that the said Civilian is a Jack of all trades ; and surely something ought to be done to qualify him for becoming a master of as many as possible of them. In most positions, he requires a strong *physique* ; a capacity to go through any amount of hard work and discomfort ; a zeal and energy that never flag ; an almost Protean versatility ; a disposition to endure cheerfully the blessings of solitude ; strong judgment and prompt decision ; ability to read character, and a knowledge of the world, and tact which will enable him to make himself all things to all men. This, it must be confessed, is rather the ideal of a good Indian Officer than a description of the real article, and it is not to be expected that any but a few should come up to the ideal. By, however, adopting the proper means of preparing the raw material an approximation to it might be effected in very many cases.

There is another aspect besides the professional one (which has so often been dwelt on) in which the Indian Civilian ought to be looked at, and that is the social ; for the Civil Service ought to lead and give the tone to Indian Society. Without going so far as to say that that society is altogether imbecile, I am not ready to admit the intensely intellectual character claimed for it by some. It is very much like society of the same rank at home, except that in India there is less pretension, less striving after appearances, and less superficial varnish ; one of its great characteristics being a free and easy manner which is only too liable to degenerate into coarseness. When men get together by themselves, their conversation generally consists of three parts shop and one part scandal, or worse ; with women it

is three parts scandal and one part shop ; while in mixed society the conversation is two parts shop and two parts gossip and exceedingly small talk. The general tone of society has, no doubt, within the last fifty years or so been much raised, and, I was about to say, refined ; but refinement is not a quality which even at the present day can be predicated of it. It is capable of considerable improvement, which can be best effected by the influence of the best educated body of men in India. To take a decided lead in society, however, it is not enough for an individual or set of individuals to be highly educated only. Intellect alone will not suffice, but must be backed by energy and force of character, and above all by tact and knowledge of the world. And it is not the best way to secure these qualities to take a boy fresh from school or from 'coach,' and make him pass an examination in classics and mathematics, and then leave him to his own devices till he is sent out. He must be brought into constant intercourse with other men, so that he can observe their dispositions and ways of thought.

It has more than once occurred to me that the best way to secure this and other advantages would be to establish a college expressly for the selected candidates at one of the Universities, in which all would be obliged to attend from the time of passing the open competition till the final examination. The advantages of such a course are obvious, and in the first place the candidates would be under some discipline and control which are badly wanted for some of them. Then they would be brought into frequent communication with each other, and also with other members of the University, an association which would serve to smooth down angularities of disposition and manner, and remove that *mauvaise honte* which is so often a bar to success in society. They would have better opportunities for going in for the physical education which is so necessary. One great advantage arising from their association with each other would be that, from the time of entering the college, they would feel themselves to be members of the service, and would acquire that *esprit de corps* which is so often a useful stimulus to exertion. That spirit is sometimes denounced as mischievous and narrow-minded, and, of course, if it consists in an arrogant exclusiveness, a thanking God that we are not as other men, it is not to be commended ; or if it is that other kind, of which the words "honour among thieves" is an expression, it is not deserving of encouragement. But the *esprit de corps* which should animate the members of a fine old Service is a very different and far nobler feeling, and one which elevates and refines rather than contracts the minds which it animates. And such a spirit cannot be too warmly encouraged.

There would, of course, be objections raised to the proposal. One would be the great expense that must be incurred in starting such an institution. But the benefits to be secured would more than compensate for the outlay, which would only be an initial one, as the fees could be made to cover all current expenses. If the term of probation were extended to three years, there would always be over a hundred students on the college books, a very respectable number. Another objection might be that the place would be too expensive for the candidates, most of whom have nothing to live on beyond the allowance from Government; but I see no reason why it should not be quite as cheap or cheaper for them to live in college with a common table, as for each of them to live by himself. A 'chummary' of two men even is less expensive for each of them than it would be to live separately; the rent of the room in college might be fixed at as low a rate as possible, just high enough to provide against loss.

The locality of the college would also be a point requiring consideration. There is a good deal to be said in favour of having it in or near London; but I think the arguments in favour of having it at one of the Universities, as in Oxford, for example, are stronger. London of course is more accessible, and more central in one sense; it contains the Law Courts which have to be attended; and the best tuition in the modern Indian languages is to be had there; all very important advantages. Candidates, however, could easily go to London when they have to take their Notes of cases. It may be said that much time would be lost in doing so, especially as one cannot always be certain of getting suitable cases the first or even the second time one attends a court. This is partly owing to the fact that there is no proper accommodation for candidates at many of the courts, notably at the Central Criminal Court where so many weary hours have to be spent. I once lost a good case there simply because I couldn't get into the Court in time to hear the beginning of it; and I dare say many others have had the same experience. How many of us have bestowed the reverse of a blessing on the Under Sheriffs while we were left loafing about the corridors till they had accommodated their own friends in the best places, often to our utter exclusion. It is true that on passing the examination, candidates are presented with a large blue ticket of imposing appearance, which is said to be an *open sesame* to any of the courts; but it is as useless as a scrap of blank paper, and even the Policemen compassionately advise the presenter to put it up as "it ain't of no use." Arrangements ought to be made in every Court to provide candidates with at least as good accommodation as the newspaper

reporters have, so that they could be certain of getting a seat ; and it would not then be necessary to waste so many days in hunting after cases. It is only a short railway journey from Oxford to London, and a candidate could easily run up in the morning, spend the day in court, and return home in the evening. Indeed, it would not be necessary to go to London for all the cases, as many of them could be got at the Assizes and in the County Court.

Again, there is no reason why as good teaching should not be had at Oxford as in London. Some of the subjects prescribed are already taught there, and first-rate men could easily be got to teach all the others. With so many students the fees alone would make a tolerable income, quite worth the consideration of any of the gentlemen who give lessons in London in the Indian languages.

Another reason which may be called a sentimental one, but is certainly one of some force, is that it would be better for the new college to form part of an old and venerable University, with all its grand traditions and associations, than that it should stand altogether by itself. But one of the strongest arguments to my mind, is that, while in a London college, the candidates would have no society but their own ; at Oxford they would be thrown into the society of men of all sorts of dispositions and inclinations, and destined for very various paths in life ; and would have the chance of mixing with the best and ablest men of the younger generation in England. Such an association could not but be beneficial ; it would keep the young civilian mind from running too much in one groove, and would temper the *esprit de corps* sufficiently to prevent its becoming too exclusive.

Another point which requires consideration, is the course of study which should be followed. At present it includes law, (English Law of Evidence, Jurisprudence, and Indian Law), Political Economy, History and Geography of India, and the Indian languages, each candidate having to take up the two languages most common in the presidency he has selected. These languages, of course, must be learnt, and so far the present programme should be adhered to. In the department of law, the Jurisprudence and Law of Evidence are important and valuable studies, but some changes might be made in the Indian law. The text-books in the latter are the Civil, Criminal and Penal Codes, the Intestate and Testamentary Act, and Macnaughten's Hindu and Muhammadan law. It is not easy to see why the last named should be prescribed. An officer has not to administer the Hindu law till after he has spent many years in India, and it is of no use to him in his ordinary work. The same objection applies to the Testamentary Act. It is a difficult Act to get up sufficiently well to answer questions on, and so the study of it

takes up a lot of valuable time, which is wasted, as the act is of no use to any officer except a Judge, and under the present system a civilian may spend his whole service in the executive branch, so that he may never have to administer it. It is difficult to see any reason for this Act having been prescribed, except the one usually assigned, namely, that its author was the examiner in Indian law. The Indian law of evidence, on the other hand, is an Act of universal and daily application from the first day a young civilian sits on the bench and sentences Ram Chunder for slapping the face of Lutchman Singh. It ought to be substituted for the Testamentary Act, and the Hindu and Muhammadan law dispensed with.

The ignorance of every part of the History and Geography of India among Englishmen is so great and so distressing, that there is some reason in prescribing these subjects for special study; but surely it might be left to the discretion of the candidates. Any man who knew that his active life was to be spent in India, would naturally devote some time to learning something of its history and geography, even if he were not compelled to pass an examination therein.

Political Economy might also, with propriety, be eliminated from the programme. What has Political Economy to do with a country a large part of the revenue of which is derived from two Government monopolies, one of which is, as many people think, "an immoral traffic;" while the other is of one of the first necessities of life. This is a state of affairs which astonishes a griff fresh from the study of J.S. Mill and Ricardo, and throws all his ideas on the subject into confusion, as he has to begin the study of the science under quite a new set of circumstances, one which might make Professor Fawcett's hair stand on end and Adam Smith turn in his grave. Seriously, it is not a subject which need be specially studied.

The compulsory examinations would thus be confined to law and the Indian languages; and if the time of probation were extended to three years, the selected candidates would not have to work at such high pressure as at present, and would, besides, have time to keep up their usual studies to some extent, and go in for a degree. Two years spent on the study of Hindustani and Bengali are quite sufficient to undo the study of four years in Latin and Greek, unless these are still studied regularly.

There is a new subject which, perhaps, might be introduced into the programme with advantage. The idea is not my own, but was suggested by a district officer whose administrative ability, energy, and intimate acquaintance with the native character, would fit him admirably for the new professorship. His suggestion was to have a course of lectures on administrative work in India

delivered to the candidates by some retired Magistrate of mighty fame. They would include descriptions of the various kinds of work to be done, the emergencies that might arise, and practical hints on the best way of administering a district successfully. These lectures would form decidedly the most interesting part of the course, and would be a relief after some hours spent on the Penal Code. Possibly an examination might be held on the subjects lectured on ; problems might be stated, and the examinees would have to solve them each in his own way. For instance, a question might be put "Given a four-anna crop; how to feed a district with economy and efficiency ? "

W.

NOTE ON THE PRECEDING ARTICLE.  
BY THE EDITOR.

MOST of our Indian readers will be aware that we have at the present moment in our midst one of the most distinguished Orientalists of Europe, the Boden Professor of Sanskrit at Oxford, who has come to this country mainly for the purpose of ascertaining the public opinion of India on the proposals discussed in the foregoing pages. We cannot doubt but that the verdict will be strongly in favour of the Oxford scheme ; and we hope that those of our readers, who take an interest in the movement will do what they can to assist it both with counsel and with money. It will be seen from the prospectus, which we re-produce below, that communications may be addressed either to "The Boden Professor of Sanskrit, Oxford ;" or to "Professor Monier Williams, care of Messrs. King, King and Co., Bombay."

Our contributor W. has confined his attention mainly to the question of *founding a college* at Oxford for Civil Service probationers. It is obvious that, if once we have such a College, the Institute called for by Professor Monier Williams, and those who think with him, must necessarily follow, and indeed would doubtless be merged in it. But we would like to point out that the need for such an Institute remains, even if we do not get the College ; it is an Imperial necessity, and we hope that it will be recognised as such in all parts of the Empire.

To us here in India, perhaps the most interesting and valuable part of the scheme is that which provides for the requirements of 'home-going' Indian students. The writer of this note—as an Oxford man, and as an educational officer deeply interested in the welfare of those of our young men, who bravely face so many difficulties in order to improve their minds by a residence in England—has long wished that Oxford would hold out some inducements that might attract our Indian students and bring them under her benign influence : and the scheme under notice seems to promise well in this respect. One thing, however is wanting ; and the defect is a cardinal one, which we earnestly hope will be pressed on the attention of Professor Monier Williams, by the British Indian Association and other recognised organs of Indian public opinion. Some provision should be made—and we believe the University of Oxford would be willing to make it, if only urged to do so by Indian scholars—to enable Indian students to take their degrees *in their own classics*. The Classical examinations at Oxford, are well called examinations *in Literis*

*Humanioribus*, rather than in Greek and Latin ; and every Indian student ought to be allowed to take up Sanskrit or Arabic, to him the true *Litterae humaniores*, in lieu of the western classics. A beginning has already been made in this direction ; for Bábu Jogendranáth Sircar (son of our late revered and lamented Professor Peary Churn Sircar) last year matriculated as a Commoner of Balliol College after an examination in Sanskrit only. The Society of Balliol has thus recorded its opinion that Sanskrit stands to Indian students in the relation in which Greek and Latin stand to English students. We hope that this concession may prove to have been only the thin end of the wedge. We believe that the leaders of educated Native society in Bengal, would do well to ask Professor Monier Williams, to be the bearer of a formal requisition to the University of Oxford in their behalf, and to act as the exponent of their wishes on this point in Convocation.

---

*Proposal for the Founding of an Indian Institute at Oxford.*

The following resolutions were passed by the Congregation of the University of Oxford on May 13th, 1875 :—

1. That it is desirable to make arrangements enabling Selected Candidates for the Indian Civil Service to reside at the University.
2. That it is desirable to provide University teaching in certain branches of study especially required by the Selected Candidates.
3. That it is desirable to make arrangements which may bring the Degrees of B.A. within the reach of such Candidates before they proceed to India.

Since the publication of these resolutions steps have been taken by more than one College in Oxford with a view to promote in various ways the residence and training of selected Indian Candidates.

It may be hoped that, if the present system of educating the Civil Service of India is maintained, Oxford will become an effective and attractive training ground for this purpose ; and under any circumstances it may well become a place where all workers in the field of Indian knowledge may receive aid and encouragement. In that case a building and appliances will certainly be needed that shall stand to Indian studies in a relation similar to that borne by the Taylor Institution to modern European languages.

The principal object of such an Institution would be to form a centre of union, intercourse, inquiry, and instruction for all engaged in Indian studies. It would contain Lecture-rooms suited to the use of Professors of the Classical languages of India and of Teachers of the Indian Vernaculars—to be hereafter attached to it ; the teachers being paid either by the University or by separate endowments like that of the Boden Professorship. It might also contain a Library and Museum and might combine appliances for the promotion of Semitic studies, so as to become a nucleus of development for a complete Oriental School at Oxford.

It is believed that a sum of £20,000 would suffice for the erection of an Institute and the endowment of a Curator ; and application might be made to the University for a suitable site.

As an increasing number of the natives of India now frequent our Universities, it is thought that a scheme which will tend, especially to their advantage, is sure to meet with support in India.

The Boden Professor of Sanskrit (Mr. Monier Williams) hopes to visit India in the winter of this year with a view to the promotion of certain objects connected with the duties of his Chair; and intends submitting the proposal to some of the eminent natives with whom he is brought in contact. But before doing so he desires to ascertain whether the project is approved by those, who are most competent to judge of its utility, and by all who are most interested in the well-being of the Queen's Indian Empire.

The names of supporters having been collected in this country, and many of the Colleges of Oxford having undertaken to assist in the scheme, influential natives may confidently be expected to come forward with offers of aid, and the Indian Governments will probably, consent to render assistance in various ways.

It may be assumed that when an Indian Institute, with a Library and Museum, is once established at Oxford, contributions of books, MSS., and objects of interest, illustrating the ethnology, archaeology, mythology, geology &c., of India, will rapidly come in from natives, from old University men resident in India, and from all interested in making Oxford a centre of Oriental studies.

Should the proposed scheme come into operation, an opening may be made for its extension to other Eastern countries; in which case it may be found advisable to change the title to 'Indian and Oriental Institute.'

Communications with offers of aid (pecuniary or otherwise) may be addressed to the Boden Professor of Sanskrit, Oxford, or to Professor Monier Williams, care of Messrs. King, King & Co., Bombay.

Any sums of money that may be received will be invested in the names of three or four Trustees, of whom Lord Lawrence has consented to be one.

The names of those who (without binding themselves to all the above details) have signified to the Boden Professor their assent to the proposition that an Indian Institute ought to be founded at Oxford, are here appended.\*

His Royal Highness Prince Leopold, K. G.

His Grace the Archbishop of Canterbury.

His Grace the Archbishop of York.

The Right Hon. Earl of Carnarvon, D.C.L., High Steward of the University of Oxford, Secretary of State for the Colonies.

The Right Hon. Earl Stanhope, F.R.S. Hon. D.C.L., Oxon., Foreign Member of the Institute of France.

The Right Rev. the Bishop of Chester.

The Right Rev. the Bishop of Rochester.

The Right Rev. the Bishop of Exeter.

The Right Rev. the Bishop of St. David's.

The Right Rev. Bishop Claughton, Chaplain-General.

The Right Rev. Bishop MacDougall.

The Right Rev. the Bishop of Guildford.

The Right Rev. the Bishop of Brechin.

The Right Hon. Lord Lawrence., G.C.B., G.C.S.I.

The Right Hon. Lord Coleridge, Lord Chief Justice of the Common Pleas.

The Right Hon. Sir Stafford Northcote, Bart., M.P., Chancellor of the Exchequer, Hon. D.C.L. Oxon.

The Right Hon. Gathorne Hardy, M.P.

The Right Hon. J. R. Mowbray, M.P.

\* The order of precedence has not been followed in every case, the names having been received at different times.

The Right Hon. W. E. Gladstone, M.P., Hon. D.C.L. Oxon.  
The Right Hon. Sir Bartle Frere, Bart., G.C.S.I., K.C.B., Hon. D.C.L. Oxon., Member of the Indian Council.  
The Right Hon. Sir James Colvile.  
The Right Hon. Sir Lawrence Peel, Hon. D.C.L. Oxon.  
Sir Edward Colebrooke, Bart., M.P.  
Major-Gen<sup>r</sup>. Sir H. Rawlinson, K.C.B., F.R.S., Hon. D.C.L. Oxon., Member of the Indian Council.  
Sir George Campbell, K.C.S.I., M.P., Hon. D.C.L. Oxon.  
Sir Harry Verney, Bart., M.P.  
Sir Walter Elliot, K.C.S.I., late Member of Council at Madras.  
Sir Erskine Perry, Member of the Indian Council.  
W. S. Seton-Karr, late Foreign Secretary to the Government of India and Vice-Chancellor of the University of Calcutta.  
Robert N. Cust, late Member of the Legislative Council of the Viceroy of India.  
J. W. Dalrymple, late Commissioner of Burdwan.  
George Birdwood, M.D., India Office Museum.  
James Ferguson, F.R.S., Hon. D.C.L. Oxon.  
James Burgess, M.R.A.S., F.R.G.S., Archaeological Surveyor and Reporter to Government, Bombay.  
The Rev. the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Oxford.  
The Very Rev. the Dean of Christ Church.  
The Very Rev. the Dean of Rochester.  
The Very Rev. the Dean of Canterbury.  
The Rev. the Master of University College.  
The Rev. the Master of Balliol College.  
The Warden of Merton College, D.C.L.  
The Rev. the Rector of Exeter College.  
The Rev. the Provost of Oriel College.  
The Ven. the Provost of Queen's College.  
The Rev. the President of Magdalene College.  
The Rev. the President of Corpus Christi College.  
The Rev. the Warden of Wadham College.  
The Rev. the President of Trinity College.  
The Rev. the Provost of Worcester College.  
The Rev. the Warden of Keble College.  
Lieut.-Col. the Hon. W. E. Sackville West, M.A., Christ Church, Bursar of Keble College.  
The Rev. the Principal of St. Mary Hall.  
The Rev. J. B. Mozley, D.D., Regius Professor of Divinity.  
The Rev. E. B. Pusey, D.D., Regius Professor of Hebrew.  
The Rev. C. A. Heurtley, D.D., Margaret Professor of Divinity.  
The Rev. E. King, D.D., Regius Professor of Pastoral Theology.  
The Rev. W. Bright, D.D., Regius Professor of Ecclesiastical History.  
The Rev. H. P. Liddon, D.D., Ireland Professor of Exegesis.  
Henry Wentworth Acland, M.D., F.R.S., Regius Professor of Medicine, Hon. Student of Christ Church.  
Henry J. S. Smith, M.A., F.R.S., Savilian Professor of Geometry and Fellow of Corpus Christi College.  
The Rev. Bartholomew Price, M.A., F.R.S., Sedleian Professor of Natural Philosophy, Fellow of Pembroke College.  
The Rev. Sir Frederick A. Gore Ouseley, Bart., M.A., Mus. Doc., Professor of Music in the University of Oxford.  
Montagu Burrows, M.A., Chichele Professor of Modern History and Fellow of All Souls,

## 152 *The Education of the Indian Civil Service.*

The Rev. T. Fowler, M.A., Professor of Logic.

R. Bellamy Clifton, M.A., Professor of Experimental Philosophy.

The Rev. George Rawlinson, M.A., Camden Professor of Ancient History, Canon of Canterbury.

The Rev. Robert Gandell, M.A., Laudian Professor of Arabic.

J. O. Westwood, M.A., F.L.S., Hope Professor of Zoology, President of the Architectural and Historical Society of Oxford.

George Rolleston, D.M., Linacre Professor of Physiology.

Bonamy Price, M.A., Professor of Political Economy.

The Rev. E. T. Turner, M.A., Registrar of the University of Oxford.

D. B. Monro, M.A., vice-Provost of Oriel College.

The Rev. W. Kay, D.D., formerly Principal of Bishop's College, Calcutta.

The Rev. J. W. Burgon, B.D., Fellow of Oriel and Vicar of St. Mary the Virgin.

The Rev. A. J. Sayce, M.A., Fellow and Tutor of Queen's College.

The Rev. T. Vere Bayne, M.A., Senior Student and Censor of Ch. Ch.

Gyanendra Mohan Tagore, Barrister-at-Law.

---

ART. VIII.—INDIAN WISDOM.  
WITH A SKETCH OF INDIAN METAPHYSICS.

*Indian Wisdom : or Examples of the Religious, Philosophical, and Ethical Doctrines of the Hindus. With a Brief History of the Chief Departments of Sanskrit Literature, and some Account of the Past and Present Condition of India, Moral and Intellectual.* By Monier Williams, M.A., Boden Professor of Sanskrit in the University of Oxford : London ; W. H. Allen & Co.

**I**N this, his latest work, the Boden Professor undertakes an historical and critical survey of ancient Indian culture. It is a reproduction of some of his Oxford lectures, and is presented as an answer to an inquiry often addressed to him : Is it possible to obtain from any one book a good general idea of the character and contents of Sanskrit literature ?

The book is written for two classes of readers. To the student of Sanskrit, it marks out the field of his labours, partly tilled, partly unreclaimed jungle. To the reader whose interests are less specialised, it exhibits, as far as at present they can be exhibited, the shapes in which fancy, thought, and faith have clothed themselves in India. The author urges upon educated Englishmen an acquaintance with Indian literature, creeds, and institutions. “\* It is becoming more and more a duty for the nations of the world to study each other ; to inquire into and study each other’s systems of belief ; to avoid expressions of contempt in speaking of the earnest adherents of any creed ; and to seek diligently whether the principles and doctrines which guide their own faith and conduct, rest on the one true foundation or not.” Every one interested in the current beliefs of mankind should seek some knowledge of Brâhmanism, Buddhism, and Islâm. The materials for this study are already abundant.

Sanskrit studies will, we think, hardly engage at any time a wider sympathy in Europe than that they have already gained. Sanskrit literature represents a people passing from a rude to a rude stage of improvement, and there arrested. It shows us Aryan or semi-Aryan tribes struggling awhile to act and to know, but too soon yielding themselves wholly to the torpor of custom. There they have remained. Conventional faith and self-repression have never among them given place to independent inquiry, personal conviction, and individual self-exertion. Slaves to authority, they

---

\* Indian Wisdom, Introduction p. 35.

have never risen to the liberty of "the deep-sighted children of reason." So long, however, as man is the supreme study for man, every stage of human life will find its investigators; and a division of labour is as necessary in intellectual as in industrial construction. Some specialists there will always be to devote themselves to Indian literature, and to determine more and more precisely the place of India in the history of mankind. The building up of that history will be long and toilsome, and workmen of every kind may find work to do.

Many among us in India are deeply indebted to the counsels and instructions of Professor Monier Williams. It is with grateful memories of long discipleship that the writer of the present article proceeds upon his task, to offer a few remarks upon the professor's work, and to add an independent sketch of some of the forms of Indian speculation.

A preliminary distribution of the contents of Sanskrit literature, brought together from scattered passages in Indian Wisdom, will serve to show the range of the professor's expository labours. The first distinction to be attended to is that between Sruti, audition, revelation, and Smriti, recollection or tradition.

By Sruti we are to understand the Veda: " \* The divine *unwritten* knowledge, imagined to have issued like breath from the self-existent, and communicated to no single person, but to a whole class of men, called Rishis, or inspired sages. By them the knowledge thus apprehended was transmitted, not in writing, but through the ear, by constant oral repetition through a succession of teachers, who claimed as Brahmins to be its rightful recipients. This inspired knowledge, though its very essence was held to be mystically bound up with S'abda or 'articulate sound' thought to be eternal, was ultimately written down, but the writing and reading of it were not encouraged. It was even prohibited by the Brahmins, to whom alone all property in it belonged. Moreover, when at last, by its continual growth, it became too complex for mere oral transmission, then this Veda resolved itself, not into one single volume, but into a whole series of compositions, which had in reality been composed by a number of different poets and writers at different times during several centuries."

The Veda falls into three subdivisions: "(1) † Mantra, or prayer and praise embodied in texts and metrical hymns; (2) Brahmana, or ritualistic precept and illustration written in prose; (3) Upanishad, mystical or secret doctrine, appended to the aforesaid Brahmana in prose and occasional verse." The prayers, hymns, and invocations are " † com-

\* Indian Wisdom, p.p 7-8.

† Indian Wisdom, p. 9.

‡ Indian Wisdom, p. 9.

prised in five principal Samhitās or collections of Mantras called respectively Rik, Atharvan, Sāman, Taittiriya, and Vājasaneyin.”\* “Each of the Samhitās, or collections of Māntras, has its own Brāhmaṇas. Thus the Rig-veda has the Aitareya-Brāhmaṇa, and the Kausītaki (or Sāṅkhya-yāna,) Brāhmaṇa. The two collections of the Yajur-veda have the Taittiriya-Brāhmaṇa and the Sātapatha-brāhmaṇa, which last, belonging to the Vājasaneyi-samhitā, is perhaps one of the most complete and interesting of these productions. The Sāma-Veda has eight Brāhmaṇas, of which the best known are the Praudha or Pancha-vins'a, the Tāndya, and the Shad-vinsa. The Atharva-veda has also a Brāhmaṇa, called Go-patha.”† “The Upanishads lie at the root of what may be called, the philosophical side of Hinduism. Not only are they as much S'ruti, or revelation, as the Mantra and Brāhmaṇa, but they are practically the only Veda of all thoughtful Hindūs in the present day.”‡ “A list of about a hundred and fifty of these treatises has been given. These are appended to the Āranyakas—certain chapters of the Brāhmaṇas so awe-inspiring and obscure, that they were required to be read in the solitude of forests. Properly each Brāhmaṇa had its Āranyakas, but the mystical doctrines they contained were so mixed up with extraneous subjects, that the chapters called Upanishads appear to have been added with the object of investigating more definitively such problems as the origin of the universe, the nature of deity, the nature of the soul.” Another division of the Veda may now be noted.§ “It is said to possess two quite distinct branches.|| The first is called Karma-kānda, which, embracing both Mantra and Brāhmaṇa, is for that vast majority of persons who are unable to conceive of religion except as a process of laying up merit by external rites. For these the one God, though really without form, assumes various forms with the sole object of lowering himself to the level of

\* Indian Wisdom, p. 28.

† Indian Wisdom, p. 35.

‡ Indian Wisdom, p. 37.

§ Indian Wisdom, p. 36.

|| “The science of pronunciation and the other five Vedāṅgas are occupied with the explanation of the sense of the exceedingly recondite Veda. It is for this reason that the Atharvanikas in the Mundaka Upanishad pronounce them to belong to inferior science (*aparāvidyā*). “Two sciences indeed are to be known, as they that know the Veda declare a superior and an inferior science. Of these the Rig-veda, Yajur-veda,

the Sāma-veda, and the Atharva-veda, the phonetics, ritual, grammar, etymology, prosody, and astronomy, are the superior science. The superior science is that whereby that undecaying one is to be attained.” The Karma-kānda, together with the six Vedāṅgas, as being the source of knowledge of sacred observances which is instrumental only, are “the inferior science. The Upanishads are the superior science (*parāvidyā*), as being the source of the knowledge of absolute spirit, which is the highest end of man.” Sāyanāchārya. Rig-Veda, vol. 1, p. 34, edit. Max Müller.

human understandings. The second branch of the Veda, on the other hand, is called the Jñāna-kānda, and is reserved for the select few who are capable of the true knowledge."

The six philosophical systems form a division of Sanskrit literature which may be conveniently placed by itself between the S'ruti and Smṛiti. They sprang out of the Upanishads, which thus became \* "the basis of the enlightened faith of India." † "They (the systems), are sometimes called the six Sāstras or bodies of teaching, sometimes the Shad Dars'anas or six demonstrations. They are—(1) the Nyāya, founded by Gotama ; (2) the Vais'eshika, by Kanāda ; (3) the Sāṅkhya, by Kapila ; (4) the Yoga, by Patanjali ; (5) the Mimānsā, by Jaimini ; (6) the Vedānta, by Bādarāyana or Vyāsa." ‡ "We now pass from S'ruti and the six Dars'anas to the second great head of Sanskrit literature, called Smṛiti, recollection, or that which is remembered and handed down by tradition (as distinguished from audition.) This is believed to be founded on S'ruti, direct revelation, as its primary basis, but only possesses authority in so far as it is in harmony with such revealed truth. The very essence of Smṛiti is considered to be that it was delivered *memoriter* by human authors, and put into the form of human composition. In its widest acceptation Smṛiti may be said to include six principal subjects or departments, *viz.*, I. the six Vedāngas, limbs for supporting the Veda, or in other words, helps to aid the student in reading, understanding, and applying it to sacrificial rites : they are—(1) Kalpa, ceremonial directory, comprising rules relating to the Vedic ritual and the whole complicated process of sacrifices, which rules are called S'rāuta-sūtra, because they are Vedic and relate directly to the application of the Mantra and Brāhmaṇa portion of S'ruti, being especially guides to the Brāhmaṇas ; (2) S'ikshā, the science of pronunciation ; (3) Chandas, metre ; (4) Nirukta, exposition of difficult Vedic words ; (5) Vyākaranā, grammar ; (6) Jyotiṣa, astronomy, including arithmetic and mathematics, especially in connection with astrology. Of these Vedāngas 1. and 6. are for employing the Veda at sacrifices, 2. and 3. are for reading, 4. and 5. for understanding it. II. The Smārta-sūtra, a comprehensive term for such rules as do not relate to S'rāuta or Vedic ceremonies, which were usually on a grand scale and public in their character, but rather to religious acts of a private and personal kind, falling naturally under two divisions, *viz.*, (a.) family or domestic rites (*grihya*) performed at stated periods ; (b.) conventional usages and every-day practices, (*saṃyāchāra*) ; on which account these Smārta-sūtras must be

\* Goldstücker.

† Indian Wisdom, p. 48.

‡ Indian Wisdom, pp. 155—158.

divided into two classes, *a.* *Grihya-sūtra*, *b.* *Sāmāyicārīka-sūtra*. III. The *Dharma-sāstras* or Law-books, and especially the laws of *Manu* and other inspired law-givers—supposed to have grown out of the *Smārta-sūtras*. IV. The *Itihāsas* or legendary poems, under which head are placed as portions of *Smriti* the two great epic poems called \* *Rāmāyana* and *Mahā-bhārata*, and then, for convenience, as following and depending upon these, but not as properly *Smriti*, the artificial poems (*Kāvyas*) and erotic poems and the dramas, almost of all which in their subject matter are closely connected with the two great epics. V. The eighteen *Purānas*, or ancient legendary histories and traditions, with their train of eighteen inferior *Purānas* (*Upa-purāna*) and subsequent *Tantras*. VI. The *Niti-sāstras*, or ethical and didactic writings of all kinds, including collections of fables and moral precepts."

+ "There are also *Upa-vedas* or secondary *Vedas*, which, however, have little or no connection with either the *Veda* or *Smriti*. They are, (1) *Ayur-veda*, the science of life, or medicine, regarded as belonging to the *Atharva-veda*, and by some to the *Rig-veda*; (2) *Gandharva-veda*, the science of music, as a branch of the *Sāma-veda*; (3) *Dhanur-veda*, the science of archery or military art, connected with the *Yajur-veda*; (4) *Sthāpatya-veda*, the science of architecture, including the *Silpa-sāstra*."

We are now in a position to tabulate the contents of Sanskrit literature. The sub-divisions are carried only so far as may be convenient to the general reader.

Sanskrit Literature.	I. <i>Smriti</i> , Revelation, the <i>Veda</i> .	$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{Karmakānda, ceremonial portion.} \\ \text{Jnāna-kānda, spiritual portion.} \end{array} \right\} \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{a. Mantra.} \\ \text{b. Brāhmaṇa.} \\ \text{c. Upanishad.} \end{array} \right\}$		
		<i>a.</i>	<i>Nyāya.</i>	
		<i>b.</i>	<i>Vaises'hika.</i>	
	II. <i>Darsana</i> , the six systems.	<i>c.</i>	<i>Sāṅkhya.</i>	
		<i>d.</i>	<i>Yoga.</i>	
	III. <i>Smriti</i> , Tradition.	<i>e.</i>	<i>Pūrva-mīmāṁsā</i> or <i>Mīmāṁsā</i> .	
		<i>f.</i>	<i>Uttara-mīmāṁsā</i> or <i>Vedānta</i> .	
				$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{Kalpa, Sīkshā, Ch} \\ \text{handa, Nirukta-} \\ \text{Vyākāra, Jyoti-} \\ \text{sha.} \end{array} \right\}$
		1.	The <i>Vedāngas</i> .	
		2.	<i>Smārta-sūtra</i> .	$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{Grihya-sūtra, Sā} \\ \text{mayārīcharīka-} \\ \text{sūtra.} \end{array} \right\}$
		3.	<i>Dharma-Sāra</i> .	
		4.	<i>Itihāsa</i> .	$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{Rāmāyana, Mahā} \\ \text{bhārata.} \end{array} \right\}$
		5.	<i>Purānas</i> , <i>Upa-purānas</i> , <i>Tantras</i> .	
		6.	<i>Niti-sāstras</i> .	

\* The *Rāmāyana* is, strictly speaking, an *ākhyāna* or narrative. The classification above is for facility of

exposition.

† Indian Wisdom, p. 191.

From this general conspectus we turn to particulars. We shall direct our attention chiefly to the Darsanas or schools of speculation. These are to the European the most unfrequent- ed and uncultivated portion of the field of Indian literature. By a special survey of this we shall avoid a mere iteration of the synopsis and examples of Sanskrit literature as a whole, so excellently set out in the Boden Professor's work. We shall therefore independently, and from our own point of view, examine the second grand division in the scheme above, *viz.*, Indian metaphysics, and shall endeavour to present it in as novel and interesting a manner to the general reader as the nature of the matter admits. For this part of the present article we shall hold ourselves solely responsible, supplying our own materials and elaborating them in our own way. This is a department of Sanskrit study which, sterile and unpromising as it looks, may hereafter yield a new chapter to the history of philosophy, a picture of a rude, but not therefore uninteresting, portion of metaphysical disquisition. In the history of the progress of human intelligence no stage is without its special interest to the patient labourer. But first a few remarks on the Veda, its hymns, its commentaries, and its mystical treatises. This is a useful preliminary.

"The Vedic hymns are contained in five Samhitās or collections of Mantras. They are the work of a succession of poets, perhaps between\* 1,500 and 1,000 B. C. Of these the most ancient and important is the Rig-veda. It contains a thousand and seventeen hymns. Its rites were those of the Hotri priests. The subsequent growth of a laboured ritual necessitated a re-arrangement of the sacrificial texts. The Yajur-veda in both Samhitās, the Taittiriya and the Vājasaneyin, is a liturgy compiled from the hymns of the Rig-veda, for the rites of the Adhvaryu priests. The Sāma-veda is also a reproduction of verses from the Rig-veda, and notably from the eighth and ninth Mandalas, to be chanted by the Udgātri priests at those sacrifices in which the juice of the Soma or moon-plant formed the principal ingredient, the Jyotishtoma and others. The Samhitā of the Atharva-veda, together with extracts from the Rig-veda, contains many original hymns. It gives mystical formulas for rectifying errors in sacrificial rites, and incantations. These are recited either by the person interested or by the priest for him, for the restoration of health, prolongation of life, destruction of enemies, attainment of wealth or power, and other secular benefits. The Atharvan is

\* Colebrooke concluded from certain astronomical facts in a Vedic calendar, later than the Rig-veda, that the calendar was composed in the fourteenth century B C. An error of one or two hundred years in this computation is possible.

the latest of the Vedas, and is unmentioned in the earliest *Upanishads*. It is said to be unrecognised in the *Mānava-dharma-sāstra*,\* which often cites the three Vedas, *Trayam brahma sanātunam*. The hymns of the *Rig-veda* are the earliest memorials of the Aryan race, and describe a state of society of which there is no other literary record. They represent that stage of thought in which striking events, unpredictable to the rude spectator, are ascribed to quasi-human agencies. Such ascription is, of course, inevitable, till men learn little by little the fixed order and uniform sequence in the changes going on in the things around them. Till then the only† cause of motion is a volition like that of the spectator. He at least can image to himself no other. Stirring events press upon him for explanation, and the only interpretation at hand is anthropomorphic. Fire and rain, and wind, and storm, are all personal entities. Fire is the child of the fire-drills. The cheering and intoxicating juice of the moon-plant, giving new vigour to gods and men, is deified as *Soma*, the giver of good gifts. ‡ “The undeveloped intellect having constantly seen results produced by visible, tangible objects, infers that all results are so produced. In the mind of the primitive man every effect is believed to be due to a special worker, because special workers have been observed to precede effects in a multitude of instances. The laws of mental action necessitate that, as all known causes have presented themselves to him as personal agencies, all unknown causes must be conceived by him as of the same nature. A stone thrown by an unseen hand, a piece of wood that, when heated, bursts into flame, is at once assumed to be itself the acting power.”

§ “The Hindu of these hymns is essentially engrossed by the might of the elements. The powers which turn his awe into pious subjection and veneration are—Agni, the fire of the sun and lightning ; Indra, the bright cloudless firmament ; the Maruts or winds ; Sūrya, the sun ; Ushas, the dawn ; and various kindred manifestations of the luminous bodies, and nature in general. He invokes them, not as representations of a superior being, before whom the human soul confesses its humility ; not as superior beings themselves, which may reveal to his searching mind the mysteries of creation or eternity, but because he wants their assistance against enemies ;—because he wishes to obtain from them

\* In *Manu xi. 33*, however, we read of the revelations to Atharvan and Angiras. The voice is there declared to be the *Brahman's* weapon, with reference, *Kulīka-bhatta* the scholiast says, to the incantations against enemies in the *Atharva-veda*. This gives satisfaction to the inquisitive feelings, curiosity, anxious perplexity, speculative embarrassment of his own mind.” *Grōte : Plato*, vol 2. p. 182.

† *Herbert Spencer : Social Statics*, p. 330.

‡ *Goldstücke*.

† Cause is here taken *sensu latiori*,

“ That is a cause to each man, which

rain, food, cattle, health, and other worldly goods. He complains to them of his troubles, and reminds them of the wonderful deeds they performed of old, to coax them, as it were, into acquiescence and friendly help. He looks to them, not for his spiritual, but for his material welfare."

In later hymns the questions of the origin of the world, and of the real which lies beyond or under the apparent, rise into prominence. The unknown, the unmanifested, is still regarded as spiritual. In these hymns we find the germ of the absolute egoism of the *Upanishads* and the *Vedānta* :—

\* "In the beginning there was neither nought nor aught ;  
Then there was neither sky nor atmosphere above,  
What then enshrouded all this teeming universe ?  
In the receptacle of what was it contained ?  
Was it enveloped in the gulf profound of water ?  
Then there was neither death nor immortality ;  
Then there was neither day, nor night, nor light, nor darkness.  
Only the existent one breathed calmly, self-contained.  
Nought else than that there was, nought else, above, beyond."

The celebrated *Purusha-sūkta* is still more in the spirit of later Indian theology. It recognises the institution of caste :—

† "The embodied spirit has a thousand heads,  
A thousand eyes, a thousand feet, around  
On every side enveloping the earth,  
Yet filling space no larger than a span.  
He is himself this very universe,  
He is whatever is, has been, and shall be.  
He is the lord of immortality.  
All creatures are one-fourth of him, three-fourths  
Are that which is immortal in the sky ;  
From him, called *Purusha*, was born *Virāj*,  
And from *Virāj* was *Purusha* produced,  
Whom gods and holy men made their oblation.  
With *Purusha* as a victim they performed  
A sacrifice. When they divided him,  
How did they cut him up ? What was his mouth ?  
What were his arms ? And what his thighs and feet ?  
The *Brahman* was his mouth, the kingly soldier  
Was made his arms, the husbandman his thighs,  
The servile *Sudra* issued from his feet."

The questioning spirit thus awakened exerted itself in two directions : first, † in the construction of the *Brahmanas* or theological

\* Indian Wisdom, p. 22. *Rig-veda* x, 129. *Nāsad āśid no sād āśit*. This hymn is called the *Nāsadiya-sūkta*. Of the negation of existence and of non-existence as regards *Brahman* or the transcendent self, in the *Vedānta*; concerning which see below.

† Indian Wisdom, p. 24. *Rig-veda*

x, 90, *Yajur-veda* xxxi, 1—16, *Atharva-veda* xix. 6. The *Purusha-sūkta* is easily explicable in the language of the fully developed *Vedānta*, as by Sāyana.

‡ An orthodox Hindu of course regards all portions of the *Veda* as co-eternal.

commentaries. “\* Unsystematic prose compositions (the oldest which may have been written seven or eight centuries B. C.) intended to serve as ceremonial directories for the priests, prescribing rules for the employment of the Mantras at sacrifices, speculating as to the meaning and effect of certain verses and metres, and giving detailed explanations of the origin, import, and conduct of the sacrifices, with the occasional addition of controversial remarks and illustrations in the shape of legends and old stories.” Secondly, in the composition of the Upanishads or mystical treatises, treating of the emanation of the universe, the unity of existence, and the relation of personal to impersonal spirit.

In the Upanishads † “the human soul is of the same nature as the supreme or great soul : its ultimate destination is that of becoming re-united with the supreme soul, and the means of attaining that end is not the performance of sacrificial rites, but the comprehension of its own self and of the great soul. The doctrine which became, at a later period, the foundation of the creed of the educated—the doctrine that the supreme soul, or the (neuter) *Brahman* is the only reality, and that the world has a claim to notice only in so far as it emanated from this being, is already clearly laid down in these Upanishads, though the language in which it is expressed still addresses itself to the legendary and allegorical style which characterises the *Brāhmaṇa* portion of the *Vedas*. *The Upanishads became thus the basis of the enlightened faith of India.*”

“‡ There is one only Being who exists  
 Unmoved, yet moving swifter than the wind ;  
 Who far outstrips the senses, though as gods  
 They strive to reach him ; who, himself at rest,  
 Transcends the fleetest flight of other beings ;  
 Who, like the air, supports all vital action.  
 He moves, yet moves not ; he is far, yet near ;  
 He is within this universe, and yet  
 Outside this universe ; who e'er beholds  
 All living creatures as in him, and him—  
 The universal spirit,—as in all,  
 Henceforth regards no creature with contempt.  
 The man who understands that every creature  
 Exists in God alone, and thus perceives  
 The unity of being, has no grief  
 And no illusion.”

Another example, from the *Chhāndogya Upanishad*, as illustrative of the speculations which ripened into the systematic cos-

\* Indian Wisdom, p. 27.

† Goldstücker.

‡ Indian Wisdom, p. 11, from the  
 Is'a Upanishad.

mologies of the Dars'anas :—“ Existent only in the beginning was this, one only, without a second. \* Some indeed say, Non-existent only in the beginning was this, one only, without a second. Therefore from non-existence would existence proceed. But truly how should this be ? How should the existent proceed out of the non-existent ? In the beginning then existent only was this, one only, without a second. It desired : I would be many, I would be born. It evolved heat. The heat desired : I would be many, I would be born. It evolved water. The water desired : I would be many, I would be born. It evolved aliment. Therefore, wherever rain falls much aliment is produced. That deity desired : Entering these three divinities in a personal nature, † I shall severally educe name and form.”

Let us now pass to the systems or ontologies. It will much facilitate our inspection of these, if we carry with us to the inspection an acquaintance with certain principles which rule in all the Dars'anas alike. The first of these is transmigration.

Metempsychosis had been no article of belief among the first settlers in the Panjab. It appears indeed to be alien to the faith of the primitive Aryan race. It is not found in the ancient hymns of the Veda. The expectation of the early Indo-Aryau is rather to pass after death to the spirits of his forefathers, to dwell in bliss with Yama the regent of the dead. The belief in transmigration “ begins to appear, though not clearly defined, in the Brâhmanas, and is fully developed in the Upanishads, Dars'anas and Manu.” Among the Greeks the Pythagoreans appear to have derived the tenet from Egypt. Similarly the Indo-Aryans took it up, so far as we can judge, as they seem to have taken up the worship of S'iva, from the earlier and ruder races of India. “ † The sense of an absolute psychical distinction between man and beast, so prevalent in the civilised world, is hardly to be found among the lower races. Men to whom the cries of birds and beasts seem like human language, and their actions guided, as it were by human thought, logically enough allow the existence of souls to beasts, birds, and reptiles, as to men.” “ Plants partaking with animals the phenomena of life and death, health and sickness, not unnaturally have some kind of soul ascribed to them.”

All souls are eternal *ab ante* as well as *à post*. Had they begun to be, they might cease to be. It is only things composite that

\* The Buddhists affirm : *asad eva-dam agre āśit*, non-existent only was this in the beginning, in their doctrine of a universal void, Nihilism.

† *Nāma rūpe vyākaraṇī*, I shall

differentiate into name and form ; hence in the Vedânta *Brahman* illusorily conditioned by *avidyâ* becomes the *Nāma-rūpa-vyākaraṇī*.

† Tylor's Primitive Culture, vol. 1. p. 423, and p. 428.

are producible or discernible. Three degrees of extension are recognised, atomic, intermediate, infinite. Souls are not atomic : were they so they could not be sentient throughout the bodies they inform. They are not of intermediate extension : that belongs only to things composite. They are not co-extensive with any given body : \* if they were, how could they tenant a succession of bodies, an ant, a man, an elephant ? Souls therefore are infinite. They are neither generable nor destructible, and are all equally ubiquitous.

The bodies and conditions of transmigrating souls are according to its works good or evil in antecedent states from time without beginning. The merits and demerits and the embodiments are from eternity. Seed from plant, and plant from seed : but who shall assign priority to either ? From such fruition of merits, so long as soul is implicated with body, there is no escape. *Avaśyam evu bhuktavyam yut kritam karma subhās'ubham.* † The soul in its migrations from body to body is accompanied by a tenuous frame. Recompense of works from all eternity, is the Indian solution of the origin of evil. The procession of merits and retributions has flowed on from everlasting, *labitur et labetur in omne volubilis ævum.* The sequence is uniform, ultimate, inexplicable as a natural law, and apart from all intelligent intervention from without.

This implication of soul with bodies vegetable, animal, human, ultra-human, and divine, is the source of all misery. In all its stages the embodied spirit tastes little but pain, sickness, death, and severance from all that it fain would cling to. Even in the highest embodiments there is disparity and its consequent sense of insufficiency, and there is the certainty of their expiry upon the exhaustion of the merits which procured them. Paradises and places of torment are only stages in the endless journey. “ † Many thousands of Indras and of gods in æon after æon have passed away with time, for time is hard to pass beyond.”

This repeated embodiment of souls results from merits, merits from activity, activity from desires and aversions, desires and aversions from identifying the soul with that which is not soul, with

\* *Vedānta-paribhāshā*, p. 3.

† Cf. Tylor's *Primitive Culture*, vol. 2, p. 21. “ The soul as recognised in the philosophy of the lower races, may be defined as an ethereal surviving being, conceptions of which preceded and led up to the more transcendental theory of the immortal and immortal soul, which forms part of the theology of higher nations. That this soul should be

looked on as surviving beyond death is a matter scarcely needing elaborate argument. Plain experience is there to teach it to every savage ; his friend or his enemy is dead, yet still in a dream or open vision he sees the special form which is to his philosophy a real objective being carrying personality as it carries likeness.”

† *Gauda-pāda : Sāṅkhya-kārikā-bhāshya*, v. 2.

the body, the senses, the intellect. It must be remembered that the Indian philosophers, according to their maxim that the eternal unchangeable, allow no modification sensitive, cognitive, or exertive, to the soul. Such modifications belong to the senses and the common sensory ; or at most are separable attributes which may fall away from it without affecting its nature. When any soul recognises itself as the soul, as neither acting nor suffering, as something transcending all manifestation, the desires cease. Thereupon all activity ceases, and the revolution of births for that soul comes to an end. It no longer looks at the modifications of which it was once the witness. It enters into a state of isolation or pure indetermination. This is its final liberation or emancipation.

The highest end of man is liberation, escape from transmigration, retraction into undifferented being. And the instrument of liberation is philosophy.

The object world exists as a scene for the fruition of merits by embodied souls. According to the law \* *Gigni de nihilo nihil, in nihilum nil posse reverti*, all that now is under this or that form has existed for ever under this or that other form. *Omnia mutantur, nihil interit*. The object world is thus co-eternal with souls. It is not an intelligent, but a blind and fatal construction by, or according to, the merit of souls from all eternity. From it souls can be disengaged only by recognising † their real and transcendent nature.

The system most generally accepted and most consonant with the Upanishads is the Vedānta. The Vedānta is also called the Uttara-mīmāṃsā or later investigation, to distinguish from the Pūrva-mīmāṃsā, or former investigation, of Jaimini. It is sometimes also called the Aupanishadīmīmāṃsā. It will be remembered that the Veda was divided into two great departments, the Karma-kānda, or ceremonial portion, which comprises the Mantras and Brāhmaṇas, and is conversant about works and merits ; and the Jñāna-kānda, or spiritual portion, contained in the Upanishads, teaching the unity and the transcendent nature of soul. The Pūrva-mīmāṃsā discusses the Karma-kānda. It is not, properly speaking, a system of philosophy, even in the wide sense in which the other Dars'anas may be so styled, but an inquiry into sacred prescription, *dharma-jijñāsā*. † " Hence it consists chiefly of a critical commentary on the Brāhmaṇa or ritual portion of the Veda in its connection with the Mantras, the interpretation given being an exposition of the obvious literal sense, and not of

\* *Nāsato vidyate bhāvo nābhāvo vidy-  
ate satah.* to an intellect previously purified by  
good works.

† Such recognition is competent only † Indian Wisdom, p. 109.

any supposed occult meaning underlying the text, as in the Upanishads and Vedānta." As preliminary to its exegetic, however, the Pūrvamīmānsā treats of method. The most celebrated dogma of the Mīmānsakas is the eternity of articulate sound, *s'abda*. As eternal the Veda is not of personal authorship: its authority is something ultimate and inscrutable. The matters which it sets out are co-eternal with it. The gods which it celebrates exist but nominally, as articulate sounds. The differences in the object world, and in the conditions of embodied spirits, are, as in the rest of the systems, ascribed to the efficacy of works from all eternity.

The Uttaramīmānsā or Vedānta is conversant about the Jñānakānda or spiritual portion of the Veda, and is an inquiry about absolute entity (*brahma-jijnāsā*), a discussion of the *ens realissimum*, of the one unmanifested which underlies the many and the manifested. It does not supersede a knowledge of the Karma-kānda, or ceremonial portion, which it pre-supposes as necessary to the purification of intellect expected in an aspirant to liberation through spiritual knowledge, from transmigration and its inevitable miseries. The Uttara memansa is also called Brahma-memansa.

By a necessity of thought beyond or underneath all relative or dependent being, we all of us—whether we attend to it or not, whether we affirm or deny that we do so—do and must posit an irrelative and independent existence. The existence thus posited, as lying beyond all limitations or predication, is for us a purely negative idea. The attempt to think it is inevitable, and the failure in that attempt is inevitable likewise. We reach the limits of the finite, the relative, the known, and the knowable; and the infinite, the absolute, the unknown, and the unknowable, lies around us.

What is this mysterious metaphysical all, logical nothing, that is for ever engaging and eluding our search? The Vedāntin tells us it is self, impersonal self, the transcendent Ego, the universal soul, *Brahman*. *Brahman*, the existent, intelligence, beatitude. *Brahman*, neither knowing nor known, neither subject nor object, but knowledge itself. Knowledge,\* beyond the relation of subject and object,† objectless intelligence, self-luminous, illuminating or manifesting all that seems to be known. "‡ This self is the absolute, nought before it, nor after it, nor within it, nor without it." It is § "eternally pure, intelligent and free." || "From it

\* *Jnātri-jneya-bhāvātirikta.*

† *Chhāndogya* Upanishad.

† *Nityam nirvishayam jnānam,*

§ *Nitya-s'udha-buddha-mukta.*

Sankarāchārya: *Upadesa-Sahasri*, v. 78. and *Pada-yojanikā* in loco. See *manasā eaha*.  
also v. 73.

•

words turn back with the mind, not reaching it." \* "The eternal supreme Brahman is neither existent, nor non-existent:" not existent in the sense that nothing can be predicated of it, the *nons ens logicum*; and yet supremely existent as the one self-existent, the *ens per se subsistens*. Intelligent, as a mass of objectless cognition, as making to seem all that seems to be. Beatitude, not as enjoying happiness, but as happiness itself: for "† Who could breathe, who breathe forth, if this expanse were not bliss ?

If an impersonal self be the sum of all, how is it that you and I, all sentient and seemingly personal existences, are immersed in an object world, there to pass into manifestation after manifestation ? What is this object world ? It is, says the Vedāntin, an illusion, illusorily superposed (*adhyasta, adhyāropita*) by itself on that sole and secondless one. ‡ Blueness is not in the sky, though it seem to us to be there ; nor does this shifting phantasmagoria really lie above the real. The world around us can be said to exist only as the water of a mirage, the silver seen on the shell of the pearl-oyster, the snake that one thridding the evening shades may see in a piece of rope, the twilight of which the owl is conscious in the blaze of day. We seem to act and move, as the trees on the river-bank seem to glide by us as we lie listlessly in a boat floating down the stream. All § our life with its joys and sorrows is but a waking dream. There is but one real that lies below or beyond all that appears to be.

" || All are but parts of one stupendous whole,  
Whose body Nature is, and God the soul ;  
That changed through all, and yet in all the same ;  
Great in the earth as in the ethereal frame ;  
Warms in the sun, refreshes in the breeze,  
Glow in the stars, and blossoms in the trees ;  
Lives through all life, extends through all extent ;  
Spreads undivided, operates unspent.  
Breathes in our soul, informs our mortal part,  
As full, as perfect, in a hair as heart ;  
As full, as perfect, in vile man that mourns  
As the rapt seraph that adores and burns :  
To him no high, no low, no great, no small ;  
He fills, he bounds, connects, and equals all."

Illusion, *avidyā, māyā*, neither explicable as entity nor as non-entity, is from everlasting. It is through the illusory concomitance

\* *Anādimat param brahma na sat tan nāśad uchyate* : Bhagavadgītā. On which Śāṅkarāchārya remarks, *Na sat, sabdajanya-pratīti-vishayam nāśītyrahūpah*, not existent, that is, no object of knowledge producible by words. The same phrase *na sat* is explained in Rāma-tīrtha's *Pada-yojanikā* as *na pratyaksha-yogyam*, not cognisable by perception.

† *Ko hy evānyāt, kah prānyāt yad esha ākāsa ānando na syāt.*

‡ These are all Vedāntin similes

§ *Pada-yojanikā* : *Sāṃśāraḥ jāgrat-svapna-lakṣaṇaḥ.*

|| Pope: *Essay on Man*, Epistle I. 267

of this illusion that the impersonal self becomes the personal self. Illusorily associated with this or that organism, nutritive, respiratory, sensitive, intelligent, active, wrapped in it as in a wrapper (*kosha*) permeating it and interpenetrating it as fire permeates and interpenetrates a red-hot lump of iron,—the one self passes, or rather seems to pass, into multitudinous personalities, so as to illusorily underlie and irradiate, or give manifestation to, both them and the objects by which they are surrounded. Hence there exists conventionally (*vyavāhāratah*), in every-day experience, an ever-changing universe of things stationary and in movement, inorganic and organic, inert and lifeless masses, vegetables, animals, men, and gods, with their several environments sphere above sphere. From the transcendent self, overspread with illusion, the Vedāntins declare the whole world, with all the sentient creatures in it to be an illusory emanation, *vivarta*:

\* “ *Hinc pecudes, armenta, viros, genus omne ferarum,  
Quemque sibi tenues nascentem arcessere vitas;  
Scilicet hoc reddi deinde ac resoluta referri  
Omnia.*”

It is only as illusorily overspread with illusion, and associated with or reflected into all sentient and intelligent organisms, that the transcendent self becomes the evolver, sustainer, and retractor of the universe, creating diversely name and form. *Māyopahitam chaitanyam parames'varah*. All the predicates applied to him are applicable strictly to the illusory accompaniment only. Apart from illusion self is impersonal, and nothing can be intelligibly predicated of it. It is the one thing that truly is. It neither acts nor suffers; neither knows nor is known; neither is bound nor is liberated. It is knowledge itself, self-luminous, making to appear all that does appear, *svayam-prakāsa, survāvabhāsaku*.

How then this experience, this action and passion and cognition of our daily life? It is all, the Vedāntin replies, a fiction of that illusion which has imagined itself to be, and which projects the spheres in which transmigrating souls have been reaping the fruits of their merits and demerits, from all eternity. This transmigratory existence is defined as the experience of sentiency occasioned by bodies, organs, and their objects. It proceeds so long as the soul implicated in illusion identifies itself with the body, the senses, the vital breath, the intellect. So long as this identification lasts, desire, aversion, activity, merit, re-embodiment are inevitable. † “ Death after death he undergoes who looks on this as manifold.”

\* Virgil : Georgics IV. 223. *nāneva pas'yati.*

† *Mrityoh sa mrityum eti ya iha*

The action, passion, and cognition which seem to belong to self, are only modifications of the internal sensory, *antahkarana*. This internal or common sensory is a complexus of four organs, the intellect, and the egoising, the determinant and the memorial organs. The common sensory is sometimes collectively designated intellect, *buddhi*. It is in itself as unconscious as a stock or stone, *juda*. Only as irradiated by the-light of pure intelligence, of the self-luminous self, can the intellect energise in its functions of discriminating, creating personality, determining, and recovering past impressions. The transcendent or impersonal self, the universal spirit, is "the fountainlight of all our day," "the master-light of all our seeing." It is the light of lights beyond the darkness. It neither knows nor is known. It appears to become a witness, that is to become a personal and conscious being, only when reflected upon or associated with the unconscious, illusion-created intellect. To the intellect alone belong all actions, passions, cognitions and volitions.

Like all other unconscious things the intellect or common sensory is an emanation from illusion. Self, the one, universal soul, reflected into or seemingly limited to the intellect is the individual and personal self. *Antahkarana-vachchhinnam chaitunyaṁ sa jīvah*. It is from this association and from this alone, that soul seems to act and to suffer, and to go through all the miseries of transmigration. What shall deliver it? The cessation of desire and aversion, consequent upon the cessation of illusory identification of self with not-self. Transmigration comes to an end upon the rise of true knowledge, the knowledge of self as undifferented. Even this knowledge itself, this last and highest of cognitions, is a modification of intellect, which shall pass away as the soul returns to its isolation, or retires into its state of pure indetermination. Liberation is achieved by knowledge. *Jnāna-sādhano mokshah*.

Illusion is that of which the object world, and of which all the *per se* unconscious, active and cognitive organs are made. But what is it? It is, says the Vedāntin, something which has been from everlasting, not to be explained as entity or as non-entity. It consists of the three *primordia rerum* of the Indian philosophers, the triple cord that binds the soul, the three factors of experience,\* pleasure, pain, and indifference, objectified. It is like objects apart from subjects in Ferrier's idealism, "something more than nothing, and less than anything." This statement is still unintelligible: a Vedāntin would tell us that the unintelligible cannot be intelligibly expressed. In fact, we have

---

\* *Sattva-rajastamānsisu=kha-dukka-mohāḥ*.

come face to face with something ultimate and inscrutable. Such is the way in which the Vedāntin struggles to express the relation of co-existence between *Ens* and *Fientia*. Of illusion, imagined by illusion, and consisting of pleasure, pain, and indifference, our environment is made. It is a waking dream that melts away on the rise of true knowledge, on the recognition of the unity of all personal souls in the one and only transcendent and impersonal self.

This illusion, illusorily overspread upon the one real, has two powers, the enveloping, by which it conceals the impersonal or unmanifested from the personal and manifested self; and the projective, by which it illusorily superposes upon the impersonal self the object world. The first emanation is space or ether, *akāś'a*, which falsely appears to overlie the one transcendent self, as blueness falsely appears to overlie the firmament. From ether emanates air, from air fire, from fire water, from water earth, by successive condensations, each latter element containing certain portions of each former element. Earth, the latest evolution, thus contains in itself portions of all the other elements. This progressive emanation of the elements is technically called quintuplication, *panchi-karana*. From these elements in their imperceptible, and in their perceptible manifestations, proceed the bodies tenuous and gross, in which the soul is infolded as in a wrapper. The aggregate of tenuous forms is the supreme being manifested in relation to the world. The aggregate of gross bodies is the gross body of the deity. God is the transcendent self illusorily embodied in the forms of all sentient creatures.

Such is the world through which the soul must pass from birth to birth, so long as it identifies itself with the body, the senses, and the intellect. It is a mere phantasmagoria. Brahman, the transcendent self, alone has real existence. The world has for the uninstructed a conventional existence, or a being sufficient for the affairs of common life: for him that has reached true knowledge its existence is merely apparent, a waking dream, an illusion-projected illusion.\* The serpent for which the rope is mistaken, has for the instructed and uninstructed alike, a merely apparent existence. All other things are purely† chimerical, as the blossoms of the sky.

The individual soul or personal self, is the transcendent self as

\* This is called *Māyā-vāda*, the doctrine of illusion. Vījuana-bhikshu in the Sāṅkhya-pravachana-bhāshya affirms that the *Māyā-vādinah* or illusionists, are *prachchhanna baudhāḥ*, crypto-Buddhists.

† Chimerical things are such as enumerated in the nonsensical coup-

let: *Esho bandhyā-suto yāti kha-pushpa-krita-s'ekharah.*

*Mriga-trishnā jula-snato naras'rīn-gadhanurdharah*, Yonder goes the son of a barren mother, crowned with a garland of sky-flowers, fresh from bathing in a mirage, armed with a bow made of men's horns.

imaginarily conditioned by or reflected into this or that internal sensory or intellect. In perception the internal sensory sallies forth through one or other of the organs of sense to the object, and is modified into the form of the object. Occupying the same place with the object, the self underlying the internal sensory becomes one with the self underlying the object. The internal sensory is thus illuminated in the form of the object. In inference the internal sensory does not thus issue out, the object not being in contiguity to any of the organs of sense. Besides perception and inference the Vedāntins maintain that there are four other instruments of knowledge, *pramāṇa*; recognition through similarity, verbal communication, necessary implication, and absence of observation.

On the rise of true knowledge liberation from further transmigration ensues. All merits save those that determine the present embodiment of the aspirant are consumed in the fire of knowledge. At death his personal self recedes into the one undifferenced, the universal and impersonal self, as a river flows into the sea. Not that the personal was ever other than the impersonal self, but that it appeared to be other.

“ \*The soul declares its own condition thus—  
 I am distinct from body ; I am free  
 From birth, old age, infirmity, and death.  
 I have no senses ; I have no connection  
 With sound, or sight, or objects of sensation.  
 I am distinct from mind, and so exempt  
 From passion, pride, aversion, fear and pain.  
 I have no qualities, I am without  
 Activity, and destitute of option,  
 Changeless, eternal, formless, without taint,  
 For ever free, for ever without stain.  
 I, like the boundless ether, permeate  
 The universe within, without, abiding  
 Always, for ever similar in all,  
 Perfect, immovable, without affection,  
 Existence, knowledge, undivided bliss,  
 Without a second, one supreme am I.  
 The perfect consciousness that ‘ I am Brahma’  
 Removes the false appearances projected  
 By ignorance, just as elixir sickness.  
 The universal soul knows no distinction  
 Of knower, knowledge, object to be known.  
 Rather it is enlightened through itself  
 And its own essence, which is simple knowledge.”

It will not be forgotten that the interest of Indian metaphysics is purely historical. The true analogue of the Indian systematists are the pre-Socratic philosophers of the Hellenic world. With

---

\* Indian Wisdom, p. 121, from S'ankarāchārya's *Atma-bodha*.

reference to the Vedāntins let us glance at the Eleatics. “\*I say Xenophanes did not hold that there was *no* sensible world. He held, however, that it had no reality, no reality in itself, but only a reality in and for the mind of man, which reality was, in fact, no reality at all. It was a mere subjective phenomenon, and possessed no such truth as that which reason compelled us to attribute to the permanent one, which, according to Xenophanes, was God. His tenets on this point may be illustrated as follows :— Suppose that the sun is shining on the sea and that his light is broken by the waves into a multitude of lesser lights, of all colours and of all forms ; and suppose that the sea is conscious, conscious of this multitude of lights, this diversity of shifting colours, this plurality of dancing forms ; would this consciousness contain, or represent, the truth, the real ? Certainly it would not. The objectively true, the real in itself, is in this case the sun in the heavens, the one permanent, the persistent in colour and form. Its diversified appearance in the sea, the dispersion of its light in a myriad colours and a myriad forms, is nothing, and represents nothing which substantially exists, but is only something which exists phenomenally, that is, unsubstantially and unreally, in the sea. Take away the sea and these various reflections no longer are. This dancing play of lights is a truth only for the sea, not a truth for the land ; there the light falls differently ; therefore it is not a universal truth, and nothing in strict philosophy being admitted as true which is not universally true, it is § not, strictly speaking, a truth at all.”

But have we not also in the Vedānta a dim foreshadowing, the rude forecast of rude ages, of the Fichtean philosophy ? There an unknown force or plurality of forces, the one transcendent Ego passes by limitations into the multitudinous personal Egos of the time-and-space world ; the time-and-space world being also a manifestation of the transcendent Ego, to limit or determine the cognitions and activities of the Egos many and manifested. ||“The divine life as alone the finite mind can conceive it, is self-forming, self-representing, will, clothed to the mortal eye with multitudinous, sensuous forms, flowing through me, and through the whole immeasurable universe, here streaming through my veins and muscles,—there, pouring its abundance into the tree, the flower, the grass. The dead, heavy mass of inert matter, which did but

\* Ferrier’s Lectures and Remains. p. 86.

† The *sea* here of course stands for the mind of man cp. the Vedāntin definition *antahkarane prativim-bitam chaitanyum sa jivah*, the impersonal intelligence reflected upon the internal sensory is the personal self.

‡ For other than human intelligences.

§ The Vedāntin would say: it is *Vyāvahārika* not *pāramārthika*.

|| Lewes : History of Philosophy vol. 2, p. 508. The passage is recast from Fichte : Destination of Man Bk. iii.

fill up nature, has disappeared, and, in its stead, there rushes by the bright everlasting flood of life and power, from its infinite source.

"The Eternal Will is the Creator of the world, as He is the creator of the finite reason. Those who will insist that the world must have been created out of a mass of inert matter, which must always remain inert and lifeless, like a vessel made by human hands, know neither the world nor Him. The infinite reason alone exists in Himself—the finite in Him ; in our minds alone has He created a world, or at least that by and through which it becomes manifested to us. In His light we behold the light and all that it reveals. Great, living Will, whom no words can name, and whom no conception can embrace ! Well may I lift up my thoughts to Thee, for I can think only in Thee. In Thee, the incomprehensible, does my own existence and that of the world become comprehensible to me ; all the problems of being are solved, and the most perfect harmony reigns. I veil my face before Thee, and lay my finger on my lips."

\* "Generation after generation takes to itself the form of a body ; and forth issuing from Cimmerian night, on heaven's mission, APPEARS. What force and fire is in each, he expends ; one grinding in the mill of industry ; one hunter-like climbing the giddy Alpine heights of science ; one madly dashed in pieces on the rocks of strife, in war with his fellow :—and then the heaven-sent is recalled ; his earthly vesture falls away, and soon even to sense becomes a vanished shadow. Thus like some wild-flaming, wild-thundering train of heaven's artillery, does this mysterious MANKIND thunder and flame, in long-drawn, quick-succeeding grandeur, through the unknown deep. Thus like a God-created, fire-breathing spirit-host, we emerge from the inane ; haste stormfully across the astonished earth ; then plunge again into the inane. Earth's mountains are levelled, and her seas filled up in our passage : can the earth, which is but dead and a vision, resist spirits which have reality and are alive ? On the hardest adamant some foot-print of us is stamped in ; the last rear of the host will read traces of the earliest van. But whence ?—O, Heaven, whither ? Sense knows not ; faith knows not ; only that it is through mystery to mystery, from God and to God.

"We are such stuff  
As dreams are made of, and our little life  
Is rounded with a sleep."

From the Vedānta we pass to the Sāṅkhya. As opposed to the Vedānta, the two great tenets of this school are the reality of the object world, and the plurality of transcendent souls or selves. With the Sāṅkhyas, as with the Vedāntins, all trans-

migrational experience consists of three factors, purity, passion, and darkness, that is, pleasure, pain, and indifference. With the Sāṅkhyas, as with the Vedāntins, all sensitive, cognitive, and exertive modifications are abstracted from the soul, and assigned to a *per se* unconscious intellect which forms part of the object world. Effects pre-exist in their causes, things are identical with the sum of their modes, and the modes of an effect are latent modes of the cause from which it emanates. Intellect then, existing under, and identified with, the modes pleasure, pain, and indifference, has to be refunded into something of which pleasure, pain, and indifference, are modes as yet unmanifested. Pleasure, pain, and indifference are supposed to reside not in the conscious mind, but in the thing pleasurable, painful, or indifferent. They are projected outwards, and become modes of the environment or transmigratory sphere of souls. The emanative first cause, from which all objects issue, is therefore as-yet-unmanifested pleasure, pain, and indifference; pleasure, pain, and indifference in a state of rest, no one rising above another. It is by the rise and fall of these its ultimate ingredients that all the differences in the object world or sphere of fruition of merits by souls is constituted.

In the Sāṅkhya system it is from the egoising principle, *ahankāra* the function of which is the delusive identification of self with not-self, that the subtle elements, the organs of sense and action, and the cogitant organ *manas*, emanate. The gross elements proceed from the subtle elements. The egoising principle emanates from intellect, *buddhi*, and intellect from pleasure, pain, and indifference in a state of equipoise. These three *primordia* in this state of equivalence are the *prakṛiti*, *āpx̄i* or emanative first cause, of all things that make up the environment of transmigrating souls. As binding the soul to mundane experiences these three *primordia* are called the three cords, *trayo gunāḥ, traig-unityam*. The *principium* is a complexus of the three *primordia*.

This *prakṛiti* of the Sāṅkhyas is sometimes identified with the *māyā* or *avidyā*, the illusion, of the Vedāntins. The language, indeed, generally of the Sāṅkhyas readily lends itself to the expression of the doctrines of the Vedānta, and is employed for that purpose throughout the Bhagavad-gīta. Like the *φύσις* of Aristotle, *prakṛiti* energises towards its end unconsciously. The end towards which *prakṛiti* operates is the bondage and liberation, that is, the implication in, and extrication from phenomena, of the transcendent soul, *puruṣa*. \*\* The unconscious

\* Sāṅkhya-tattva-kaunudi, ch. 57. or *opifex adificatorque mundi deus*, This doctrine is *nirīśvara-vāda*, the such as the Yoga and the Naiyāyikas doctrine that there is no supreme propound. constructive intelligence, Demiurgus

is seen operating relatively to an end : \*the unconscious milk of the cow, for example, energises towards the growth of the calf. It is in this manner that the emanative first cause acts with a view to the liberation of the transcendent spirits. Let not any one urge that this argument is irrelevant, the activity of the milk being determined by the superintendence of a supreme constructive intelligence, *Is'vara*. For, as we see in our every-day life, the activities of intelligent beings are marks either of self-interest or of beneficence. But as we must deny both self-interest and beneficence in regard to the origin of the universe, we must deny that creation had for its antecedent the activity of an intelligence. A creator who already has all that he can desire, can have no interest or purpose in creating. Nor could his creative energy proceed from beneficence. Before creation there could be no misery, there being no experience of senses, bodies, and objects, by living creatures. What is there, then that the divine compassion could desire to extricate them from ? It may be said, perhaps, that a divine providence may be supposed, if we suppose the creator to look upon the sufferings of souls subsequent to the creation. This hypothesis implies a logical circle which it would be difficult to explain away ; the creation proceeding from the divine tenderness, and the divine tenderness from the creation. Again, a Demiurgus actuated by beneficence would not create sentient beings under disparate conditions, but in a state of co-equal happiness. But disparity of conditions, we hear some one say, proceeds from disparity of foregone merits ? Why then, away, say we, with this superintendence of merits and their fruits by a supreme intelligence. The blind and fatal operation of the efficacy of works, apart from any such imaginary superintendence, is a better hypothesis ; it being readily supposable that there would be no misery at all, did not bodies, the senses, and their objects, come into being as the products of that efficacy. Now the activity of our *principium* is determined neither by any self-interest of its own, nor by any kind of beneficence."

The arguments of this passage are directed against the *Is'vara*, or creative spirit, omniscient and omnipotent, of the Yoga, and are equally applicable against the *Is'vara* of the *Naiyāyikas*, who puts together and puts asunder the atomic aggregates which

\* " We not only see that the architect's plan determined the arrangement of materials in the house, but we see why it must have done so, because the materials have no spontaneous tendency to group themselves into houses ; that not being a recognised property of bricks, mortar, wood, and glass. But what we

know of organic materials is that they have this spontaneous tendency to arrange themselves in definite forms ; precisely, as we see chemical substances arranging themselves in definite forms, without the intervention of any extra-chemical agency." Lewes : History of Philosophy. Introduction, p. LXXXV.

make up the object world, or sphere of fruition of merits, for innumerable other souls co-eternal, uncreate, and omnipresent, but of finite power and knowledge.

Nothing, it may be remarked in passing, can be more erroneous than to identify the Demiurgus of the *Naiyāyikas* with the mystery of the personal absolute, the God of western theology. Nor can anything be more unreasonable than to censure, as some pietistic writers have done, the *Vedāntins*, *Sāṅkhyas* and other Indian systematists, for not having risen to this conception. Belief in a personal absolute is certainly not to be reached by the way of reason. A God so reached would be a mere figment of the human phantasy. Indian philosophy must undergo, as that of Greece has undergone, a cold and passionless scrutiny, before any judgment can be passed upon it. Unscientific is usually uncharitable theology.

The *āpxi* of the *Sāṅkhyas*, then, tends spontaneously towards the implication and extrication of souls. All knowing, and doing, and suffering belong properly to the internal sensory, or as perhaps we might call it, the immanent or phenomenal Ego, not to the transcendent self, *purusha*. This internal sensory so called as being within the body, is a complexus of three principles, intellect, and the egoising and cogitant principles. It is in itself unconscious. It is by the reflection upon it of that *purusha* or transcendent self, that its objects are illuminated, that is, presented to consciousness. In perception the object is reflected or mirrored upon the organs of sense, the organs of sense in the intellect, and the intellect with the images upon it is mirrored in the conscious, that is, self-luminous and illuminant, *purusha*. Intellect thus reflected upon the transcendent self is overshadowed by, that is, apparently identified with, the transcendent self, and thus becomes luminous. It is by this illusive identification of the transcendent self with the intellect or immanent mind, that the conditions of the phenomenal, appear to be conditions of the extra-phenomenal or transcendent, soul, and that the *purusha* or transcendent soul appears to know, to feel, to act, and to suffer.

“\*In truth, no spirit or transcendent Ego is bound, nor does any transmigrate, nor is any liberated. It is the emanative principle alone that, in connection with a plurality of spirits, is bound, passes from body to body, and is loosed. Bondage, liberation, and metempsychosis are only indirectly predicated of the transcendent self, as the victory and defeat of his servants are indirectly predicated of a king, when we say that the king has won a battle or suffered a defeat.” “† The bondage of the transcendent self is

\* *Sāṅkhyā-tattva-kaumudi*, ch. 62. nātha Tarkavāchaspati's note on *Sāṅkhyā-tattva-kaumudi*, p. 143.

unreal as being a relation to the emanative principle resting upon erroneous identification. Transmigration or transition through successive states of being is rooted in this relation ; and exemption from further embodiments follows upon realisation of the truth by suppression of the desires and passions." \*On the rise of discriminative knowledge, *viveka-khyāti*, the spirit no longer identified with the intellect, is isolated or liberated ; passes, that is, into a state of pure indetermination.

Such in outline is the system of the Sāṅkhyas. Let us look at the system in conflict with the Vedānta, for the overthrow of the Vedāntin doctrine of illusory emanation, *vivarta-vāda*. " The illusory emanation from the really existent, which existent is incapable of † sublation in time past, present and future, and which as absolute is unmodifiable, is something different from any kind of modification, is a fiction of illusion as to self, and is terminable by knowledge of self ; any other description of it is indirect or metaphorical. The whole creation, then, as it rises into being, is an illusory emanation, not a reality, not the existent. It is not actually possessed of a real existence, but has only such a kind of being as makes possible the occurrences of our every-day life. Every one knows that on seeing the shell of the pearl-oyster there may arise a cognition of silver. This silver is actually presented in perception. We are *conscious* of its presentation. Now the cause of an act of perception is the presence of an object to the organ of sense ; so that silver elsewhere situated cannot be the object of this perception, not being present to the organ of vision. It cannot be replied that silver formerly presented is represented by the imagination, and that the shell is mistaken for it, for if we admitted that the cognition of silver upon the shell was one of the reproductive imagination, we should have to deny that there is the consciousness of a presentation. There is not the mere reinstatement of silver seen before : to say so would be to gainsay the testimony of consciousness. We are thus constrained to suppose as the only tenable hypothesis, that unreal silver is *produced* upon the shell. The emanative cause out of which it emanates is illusion relative to the shell, and the image of silver retained from former experience must be looked upon only as a concurrent condition of its production. The illusory superposition is in this example the presentation of the unreal silver as identical with the shell. The existence of the shell, so far forth as a fact of every-day life, is not in the smallest degree affected by the silver thus

\* *Vivekakhyāti-paryantam jneyam prakṛiti-cheṣṭitam.*

† Translated from Pandit Tārā-nātha's note on pp. 83 sqq

‡ The termination by knowledge of that which has been illusorily produced, is in the technology of the Vedāntins called its sublation, *bādhā*.

unreality produced. It is in the same way that all objects are produced, being illusorily superposed upon the transcendent, unmodifiable, self, when overspread with illusion. Illusion is the *materia ex quid*, and representative images merely concurrent conditions. The jars and other concrete things under discussion are in this manner illusorily superposed upon the real, presented as identical with the real and yet removable by knowledge of the real, as the unreal silver is sublated by recognition of the shell presented as a shell and nothing else. The illusorily superposed is, as we have said before, an object of immediate perception. But unless an unreal thing were actually produced, there could be in these instances no percept. Such unreal production or emanation must be upheld, as the basis of our theory of illusory presentation. That such things are terminable by, that is cease upon, the rise of knowledge, is inferrible from their falsity: they may be sublated, as the unreal silver is sublated by a knowledge of the shell.

"Though in this doctrine of illusory emanations it is held that effects are identical with their causes, objects are considered to be unreal, the cognitions of concretes being conversant only about what is illusorily superposed upon the real. It is gathered that the cognitions of concrete things relate to the illusorily superposed being, like the cognition of silver upon the shell, not conversant with anything that has permanence. It is furthermore concluded that whatever is thus illusorily superposed is unreal, as terminable by knowledge: in other words, it is non-existent. The hypothesis, then, of illusory emanations is untenable, as it would land us in the contradiction of an identity between the existent and the non-existent. Again, falsity is terminability by knowledge. But how can water-pots and such like concrete things be shown to be fictitiously overlaid upon the real? The falsity of the silver is, of course, notorious enough, there being in regard to that the sublative cognition, this is not silver. But we never find any sublation to prove the falsity of the jar and the rest, and there is therefore no proof of their falsity. Again, what is called the revelation of non-duality does not abolish the concretes of the object world. It is meant to carry another meaning, and it also is thus no proof of their falsity."

Such is a specimen of the work of \* "the disputatious schoolmen of India." Both Vedāntin and Sāṅkhya appeal to S'ruti, the unquestionable authority of Vedic revelation, and like our own controversialists.

† "After long labour lost and time's expense,  
Both grant the words, and quarrel for the sense."

\* Colebrooke.

† Dryden: *The Hind and Panther.*

The Yoga of Patanjali differs from the Sāṅkhya in the recognition of a Demiurgus or creative spirit, Isvara, who arranges the objects which form the sphere of transmigratory experience, for the fruition of other co- eternal spirits according to the merits and demerits accruing to them from their apparent connection with such sphere from all eternity. It also lays down rules for the disengagement of the soul from its environment, in great detail. "In fact the aim of the Yoga is to teach the means by which the human soul may attain to complete union with the supreme soul." "It appears to be a mere contrivance for getting rid of all thought, or at least for concentrating the mind with the utmost intensity upon nothing in particular. It is a strange compound of mental and bodily exercises, consisting in unnatural restraint, forced and painful postures, twisting and contortions of the limbs, suppressions of the breath, and utter absence of mind."

The Nyāya and Vais'eshika for the most part differ from each other rather in method and arrangement than in object-matter. The highest end of man is release from metempsychosis. This is to be effected by such an examination and distribution of the contents of the universe as may fully mark off self from all that is not self. The first distribution, following the Vais'eshikas, is into seven predicaments, *padārtha*, viz., substance, accident, action, generality, individuality, co-inherence, and nonentity. Reality, *sattā*, belongs to the first three categories, substance, accident, and action. The substances, or bases of accidents and actions are earth, water, light, air, the soniferous element or ether, time, space, self, and the internal sensory. Earth, water and light are eternal in their ultimate particles, and transitory in the mass. They assume the forms of sensibles, sense-organs, and bodies. Ether, time, space, and self, are infinite and ubiquitous. The internal sensory is atomic as to extension. The accidents or qualities are twenty-four, colour, taste, smell, tangibility, numbers, extensions, separateness, conjunction, disjunction, priority, posteriority, gravity, fluidity, viscosity, sounds, cognitions, pleasures, pains, desires, aversions, volitions, merits, demerits, and self-restitution.

The Nyāya and Vais'eshika discuss method at great length. The Nyāya recognises four instruments of science, *pramākarana*, *pramāṇa*. These are perception, inference, comparison, and communication. The Vais'eshikas, like the Sāṅhyas subsume comparison under inference; they also deny verbal communication as an independent instrument of cognition. Inference is defined as \* a cognition to which the knowledge of invariable concomitances is instrumental, or as † a cognition generable by

\* *Vyāptijñāna-karanakum jñānam.*

† *Parāmaraśa-janyam jñānam.*

a mediate judgment. \* This mediate judgment, *parāmars'a*, is a recognition that there is in the subject of the question, *paksha*, an attribute characterised by a pervasion, *vyāpti*. In other words, the subject of the question has a property universally accompanied by something else, *viz.*, by that which is to be proved (or disproved) of it, by the *sādhya*, or predicate of the conclusion. The universally attended attribute or condition is the middle-term or argument, *sādhana*, *hetu*. To take the constant example of the *Naiyāikas*: This mountain is fiery because it smokes, and whatever smokes is fiery, as a kitchen hearth. Here the *parāmars'a*, or preliminary mediate judgment, is the judgment that the mountain has fire-attended smoke. The *paksha*, or subject of the question and of the conclusion is the mountain. The *hetu*, argument or mark of concomitance, is smoke, which is recognised as residing in the mountain. The smoke is invariably attended, *vyāpta*, by fire, which is the thing to be proved, or that which is predicated in the conclusion, the *sādhya*. The *vyāpti*, pervasion, or invariable concomitance is that of fire with smoke: whatever smokes is fiery. The *vyāpti* is in fact the lemma, sumption, or major premiss of the Aristotelian syllogism.

The process by which the *vyāpti* is reached is *vyāpti-graha*, the ascertainment of a concomitance, generalisation from experience, or induction. The invariable concomitance is defined as an unconditional attendance of that which is to be proved upon the argument, a connection where there is no (possibly unfulfilled) ulterior condition, *upādhi*. Fire always accompanies smoke, but smoke does not always accompany fire, for the universal rule, there is smoke wherever there is fire, requires the addition of a further condition, *upādhi*, *viz.*, moist fuel, which may or may not be realised. † Invariable concomitance may also be defined as residence of the thing to be proved in the same things with that which proves it. In pointing out the necessity of avoiding an *upādhi* in arriving at a universal rule, the Indian logicians incidentally warn us that the 'a' proposition is not simply convertible, but convertible only by limitation, *per accidens*. The *upādhi* is, in fact, the accident or limitation, which prevents the simple conversion of a universal affirmative proposition.

‡ Induction is defined as the determination of unconditional and of conditional concomitances. Arguments, middle-terms, marks, or signs of concomitances, are of three kinds. These are: firstly, the inclusive and exclusive mark or indication *anvayi-vyatireki-hetu*, which points out the presence of the *probandum*,

\* *Vyāpti-vis'ishta-pakshadharmaṭā-* *notæ est nota rei ipsius.*  
*jñānam parāmars'uh.* the syllogis- *+ Vyāpaku-sāmānādhikaranyancha*  
 tic axiom, *Prædicatum prædicati est* *vyāptik.*  
*prædicatum etiam subjecti, or Nota* *+ Sāhacharya-vyabhichāra-niyama.*

or *sādhyā*, in the subject and in congruent instances, *sapaksha*, and its absence in conflictive instances, *vipaksha*. Smoke, for example is invariably accompanied by fire, as in a kitchen hearth, and the absence of fire by the absence of smoke, as in a pool. In this generalisation the culinary hearth is the congruent instance, *sapaksha*, and the pool is the conflictive instance, *vipaksha*. This first method of induction is that which in European methodology is called the joint method of agreement and difference. \* "If two or more instances in which the phenomenon occurs have only one circumstance in common, while two or more instances in which it does not occur have nothing in common save the absence of that circumstance; the circumstance in which alone the two sets of instances differ, is the effect, or the cause, or an indispensable part of the cause, of the phenomenon." Secondly, the purely inclusive mark, *kevalānvayi-hetu*, where nothing is excluded, because there is nothing from which the *probandum* could be absent. Thus: All that is knowable is nameable. Here there is nothing of which nameableness could be denied. Thirdly, the purely exclusive mark, where the predicate of the conclusion exists in no other instances than in the subject of the question. Thus: Smell is a sign of earthiness. For smell, according to the *Naiyāyikas*, resides only in earth and things earthly.

Generalisations are also divided into inclusive concomitances, *anvayi-vyāpti*, as fiery because smoky; and exclusive concomitances *vyatireki-vyāpti*, as smokeless because fireless.

According to one mode of interpreting their aphorisms the *Naiyāya* and *Vaiśeṣhika* admit a Demiurgus or creative spirit, such as we have seen in a former passage denied by the *Sāṅkhya*.

With the *Naiyāyikas* and *Vaiśeṣhikas* the soul or self on the attainment of knowledge is disengaged from qualities and actions, and remains a purely unqualified and inactive substance. It passes into a state of pure indetermination.

Such in brief outline are the *Dars'anas* or six principal structures of Indian speculation. Free thought may to some degree have been exerted in their original production; but, once produced, they were transmitted without farther inquiry, as the work of all-seeing authors. Subsequent Indian speculation has therefore proved nothing higher than commentator reproduction and disputation, a barren scholasticism. All the systems alike recognise the authority of Vedic revelation as something ultimate and inscrutable, and all alike recognise the institution of caste. Authoritative custom has in India ruled in the schools as well as in the masses.

\* J. S. Mill: System of Logic edition, vol. 1. p. 435. Bain's Logic, Ratiocinative and Inductive, seventh vol. 2, p. 61.

Side by side with the six systems grew up the religious and metaphysical speculations of the Buddhists and the Jainas. These appear to have originated amongst the military and agricultural classes, the Kshatriyas and the Vaisyas. "It is true that in Hindustan, if not in the peninsula of India likewise, the Jainas are all of one caste : but this is accounted for by the admission of their adversaries, Kumārila Bhatta and others, who affirm that they are misguided Kshatriyas, Hindus of the second or military tribe : they call themselves Vaisyas. On renouncing the heresies of the Jaina sect, they take their place among orthodox Hindus, as belonging to a particular caste Kshatriya or Vaisya."

Repudiating the institution of caste and the authority of the Veda, the Buddhists reduced the instruments of science to two, perception and inference. The recognition in the Darsanas of verbal communication was intended to give to Vedic knowledge a status co-ordinate with presentation and illation.

They then proceeded to deny that there was anything but a sphere of fruition of merits and demerits by transmigrating souls. These souls are identical with the intellect or phenomenal mind of the systematists, so many series of states of consciousness, so many streams of impressions and ideas or residues of impressions. The objects surrounding these phenomenal souls are also purely phenomenal : so many groups of sensations. \* All things are momentary or fluxional, ever shifting and fleeting like the colours of a cloud, seeming to exist only in that they enable apparent souls to overtake apparent ends. As with the Heracleiteans, so with the Buddhists. † *μεταπίπτει πάντα χρήματα καὶ οὐδὲ μένει* "‡ A thing never rests at all in any of the changing states into which it is thrown. It is in the state and out of it in a shorter time than any calculus can measure. In fact, the universe and all that it contains are undergoing a continuous change in which there is no pause ; and therefore, since pause or rest is necessary to the conception of being, the universe cannot be said to be in a state of being or fixedness, but in a continually fluxional condition, to be a process, a becoming, that is, something always changing, and no one of its changes enduring or stopping during any appreciable interval of time." § Suppose yourself gazing on a gorgeous sunset. The whole western heavens are glowing with roseate hues. But you are aware that within half an hour all these glorious tints will have faded away into a dull ashen grey. You see them even now melting away

\* This tenet is called *Sarva-kshanti-katva-vada* the doctrine of the momentariness of all things, the doctrine of a universal flux.

† Plato : Cratylus, p. 439 E.

‡ Ferrier : *Lectures and Remains*, vol. 1. p. 116.

§ Ferrier : *Lectures and Remains*, vol. 1. p. 119. cf. *Sarva-darsana-sangraha*, ch 2.

before your eyes, although your eyes cannot place before you the conclusion which your reason draws. And what conclusion is that? That conclusion is that you never, even for the shortest time that can be named or conceived, see any abiding colour, any colour which truly is. Within the millionth part of a second the whole glory of the painted heavens has undergone an incalculable series of mutations. Before any one colour has had time to be that colour, it has melted into another colour, and that other colour has in like manner melted into a third before it has attained to any degree of fixedness or duration. The eye indeed seems to arrest the fleeting pageant, and to give it some continuance. But the senses, says Heracleitus, are very indifferent witnesses of the truth. Reason refuses to lay an arrestment on any part of the fleeting scene, or to declare that it is, because in the very act of being, it is not; it has given place to something else. It is a series of fleeting colours, no one of which is, because each of them continually vanishes in another."

So again, all things are individual or self-characterised, *sva-lakshana*. There are no universals, that one and the same nature should exist simultaneously in a plurality of subjects.

So again, all things are pain and pain alone. " \* That all transmigratory experience is pain and pain alone is the common verdict of the founders of all the schools or Darsanas; otherwise they would not be found striving to put a stop to it, and concerning themselves about the method of bringing it to an end."

So, lastly, all things are void and void alone. The whole universe is but so many " † bundles of baseless appearances." † There is no substratum to the internal, no substratum to the external series of phenomena. Nothing exists, or rather appears to exist, except a stream without beginning and without intermission, of sensations and the ideal residues of sensations. The source of the stream is ideation, a power of giving rise to such and such sensations in such and such threads of consciousness or purely phenomenal selves, *ālaya-vijnāna*.

By looking at the world from these four points of view, all ideas or residues of impressions will come to an end, and extinction of the soul, its lapse into the void, will ensue. Utter annihilation is the highest end of aspiration.

For a last look at Indian metaphysics let us see the Sāṅkhyas striving to refute the sensationalism of the Vijnāna-vādin Buddhists. " § There is according to the sensationalists but one thing, viz. sensation in its modes of pleasure, pain, and indifference. There is nothing other than, or external to, this, and to which as

\* *Saṅga-darsana-saṅgraha*, ch. 2.

† This tenet is the *Sarva-sānya-*

† Sir W. Hamilton: *Lectures, vāda*, the doctrine of a universal void, vol. 1, p. 294, of the nihilism of Hume. or nihilism.

their substratum, pleasure, pain, and indifference should pertain as attributes. The doctrine of these sensationalists is as follows :— The presentments of a dream, of hallucination, of a mirage, of a piece of rope mistaken for a snake, and of the airy fabrics of a reverie, arise without the presence of any outward *thing*, and take the form of subject and object. The cognitions of things perceived in our waking state, as equally presentations, must be held to arise without any outward thing and to take on the form of subject and object. The diversity of impressions proceeds from diversity of ideas ; there existing no outward thing. In the hypothesis of a genesis of impressions from ideas and ideas from impressions, as of plants from seeds and seeds from plants, there is no contradiction ; for to transmigratory experience there has been no beginning. Every one allows that in dreaming, hallucination, and suchlike states, the cognitions are differenced by ideation, without the intervention of any external thing. The difference is that the Buddhists take this to be the case also in our waking consciousness. The difference in our experiences by which, according to their several objects, one cognition is that of a post, another that of a jar, another that of a piece of cloth, cannot be accounted for without allowing its proper form to each of the cognitions. It must be granted then, that the cognition is assimilated as to form to its object. But grant that cognitions differ as to form one from another, and all that goes on in our daily life is sufficiently accounted for. The hypothesis of reality in things becomes otiose. According to the Buddhist statement, blue and the sensation of blue, as simultaneous in cognition, are co-identical : there is no difference between the sensible and the sensation. Withhold the one, and you withhold the other, from consciousness. Determinate cognitions, then, in this, that, and the other, form, are possible, in the absence of all outward realities.

" This doctrine is refuted as follows :—Object differs from subject, qua object, as a water-jar differs from the \* light of the lamp by which it is lighted or brought into manifestation. In the face of such a proof of duality of subject and object no argument for their identity can stand. Again, if the sensible thing be nothing but the sensation, the sensation is modification of the intellect. But a separate intellect being allotted to each Purusha or transcendent self, it will follow the objects vary for each individual. How, then, can a number of spectators at the same time watch the gesticulations of one and the same dancing-girl ? But that

§ Translated from Pandit Tārāmatha Tarkavāchaspati's note on Sāṅkhya-tattvakaumudi, p. 58.

\* It must be carefully borne in mind that the only cognition allowed

to the transcendent self in the Vedānta and Sāṅkhya schemes, is a self-luminousness and illumination of objects, *svatah prakāśakatvam, sarvāvabhāśakatvā*.

they do so, is proved by the fact that they afterwards talk to one another about those gesticulations. Though, therefore, it be true that all that goes on in daily life could be sufficiently explained according to the hypothesis of identity between sensibles and sentients; yet there cannot be an absence of outward things, inasmuch as that would imply that there were different objects for each individual mind."

A. E. GOUGH.

---

## ART. IX.—THE 'NINE ISLANDS' OF THE MALAYS.

1. *Vocabulary of Dialects spoken in the Nicobar and Andaman Isles. With a short account of the Natives, their customs and habits; and of previous attempts at Colonization.* 2nd Edition. By F. A. de Röepstorff. Calcutta. 1875.
2. *Selections from the Records of the Government of India. Home Department.* Vol. LXXVII. Calcutta. 1870.

**I**N the present day when philological research is pursued with an activity unprecedented in the history of mankind, all contributions to the general store of knowledge, even from the most remote corners of the globe, are welcomed and garnered with the keenest avidity. In the study of the languages of the Eastern World a mine of illimitable ore would seem as yet to have yielded up only its topmost strata.

Although the term 'Nine Islands' (or *Sambillangs*) cannot, perhaps, be correctly applied to the group which, consisting of eight larger and twelve smaller islands, forms our latest acquired possession in the Bay of Bengal, it is that by which the chain or Archipelago now called the 'Nicobars' has ever been known to the Malays, the earliest pioneers of comparative civilization in these seas, of whose advance any traces have been found to exist\*.

Long ere the adventurous Portuguese under Albuquerque had braved the dangers of these waters, the Malayan races of Sumatra had extended their conquests to the opposite Peninsula and the southern part of what is now known as the Malayan Archipelago. Indeed, the earliest portion of the 12th century seems to have been marked by a decidedly aggressive advance of this race, which made itself felt even in the remotest portions of those intricate clusters of islands.

To whatever extent internecine strife, combined with other causes, may have later subdivided the original Malayan race in the Archipelago, and however the admixture of alien blood may have subsequently modified the earlier types, it is impossible to doubt that the true Malay may correctly be included in the Asiatic races having originally a continental origin.

Wallace, † who for eight years travelled in the Malayan Archipelago and enjoyed facilities of ethnological observation of the contrasts of races now located there, such as have, it is believed,

---

\* Horsburgh's East Indian Directory—Vol. ii. 1836.      Russell Wallace. London, Macmillan & Co. 1869.

† *The Malay Archipelago.*—Alfred

never before or since been accorded to any European traveller, has arrived at the conviction (which, though opposed to that of Humboldt and Pritchard, seems strongly supported by the evidence he adduces) that the whole of the peoples of the Malayan Archipelago and Polynesia may be classified under one or other of two distinct types, either as Malays or Papuans; and to the former of these races there seems no reason to doubt the inhabitants of the Nicobar Islands belong, or at least have a very decided and marked affinity.

In his interesting record of travels, in fact, he includes the Nicobars with the Indo-Malay group of islands, which also comprises Singapore and the Malay Peninsula, Borneo, Java, and Sumatra—Tenasserim, and the Nicobar Islands forming the western limit in his division of the Malayan Archipelago.

Of the admixture of races, which, for the past six centuries, has been taking place in these seas, some idea may be formed from the history of our possessions in the adjacent Straits Settlements; whence the Malays of Sumatra, in the early part of the 12th century, drove out the aboriginal tribes, (the Jacoons, the Bumns, Mautras, Samangs and Karians) of whom some traces still exist, although their numbers have been much reduced, and they are probably slowly becoming extinct.

The Malays, who had retained possession of Singapore, one of their first conquests, until about A. D. 1252, were in that year forced to relinquish it as it was taken from them by the Javanes. They appear then to have moved forward to Malacca, of which, however, their possession was destined to be scarcely more permanent, for in 1512, it was seized upon by the Portuguese, (under Albuquerque), who retained it until the beginning of the 17th century.

The Malays, thus themselves again pressed forward, drove the aborigines yet further inland before them, and settled in Johore, where their numbers very rapidly increased.

It will thus be seen that Malacca had passed from the possession of the aboriginal heritors of the soil to that of the Malays, who were in their turn succeeded by the Portuguese. The latter, however, were destined to be themselves supplanted by the Dutch in 1610, who again were succeeded by the English, from 1795 to 1818, the Dutch resuming possession in the latter year\* only to re-surrender it to the British Government in 1825, under the terms of the treaty with Holland of the previous year.

How completely the aboriginal races have been now ousted from the soil and have been supplanted by other races may be gathered from the fact that in the whole of our Straits Settlements including Malacca, Province Wellesley, Penang and

---

\* Under the treaty of 1817.

Singapore, they number about 900, as compared with an alien population estimated at nearly 300,000; whilst in the interior fastnesses to which they have retired, their entire race scarcely now counts 8,000 members. Of the population thus estimated at 300,000, however, the Malays, who are constantly increasing, number nearly one half, whilst the other moiety is composed of about 100,000 Chinese, 37,000 natives of India, (mostly Klings from the Madras coasts, and Bengalis from Calcutta) and of other Asiatics, (such as Arabs, Burmese, Parsees, Siamese, &c.) to the extent of about 10,000.\*

That considerable confusion of dialects should result from the advent of such an admixture of races will not be a matter of surprise; and Wallace's work gives a vocabulary of no less than 57 distinct languages not including common Malay and Javanese, which he found in use amongst the Islanders of the Southern portion of the Malayan Archipelago.

There can be little doubt but that under such circumstances as have been enumerated, the Malayan language would itself be largely affected by the introduction of words borrowed both from the aboriginal dialects and from other nations with whom enforced contact had later been induced, and that the result would inevitably be a revolution as complete as that undergone by the language of the Aryan race after their settlement in India.

Nor would the language alone be affected; religions, manners, customs, and traditions would all equally be widely influenced; and that such was indeed the case in regard to religion is evidenced by the fact of the conversion of a large portion of the Malayan race to Islamism about the 13th century.

In parts of the islands of Bali and Lombok, and some other isolated cases mentioned by Wallace, the inhabitants appear certainly to have embraced the Brâhmanical faith; but these are exceptional cases and the religion of the masses may be said to be distinctly Muhammadan.

After eliminating the aboriginal savage Malayan races, such as the Dyaks of Borneo, the Battaks of Sumatra, the Jakuns and others of the Malay Peninsula, and the semi-civilized Moluccan Malays, Wallace divides the remaining races into four distinct divisions, the Malays proper, the Javanese, the Bugis and the Tagalas. It is with the former of these that he would class the inhabitants of the Nicobars.

The evidence adduced by De Röepstorff's vocabulary, and by the Government records above quoted, although it tends to throw some doubt upon the acceptance too hastily of such a generic

---

\* These statistics are taken from *India*, by John Cameron. London.  
"Our Tropical Possessions in Malay- Smith, Elder & Co.

classification, is far from proving its incorrectness, and on the contrary, there is every reason to assume its accuracy. Although there is ample evidence to shew that many of the Nicobarese, more particularly those of the Southern Islands, speak the Malay language or dialects of it ; the islanders appear to have no script of their own, nor have they in any of the islands become converts to the Muhammadan religion as is the case with the Malays inhabiting the Malay Peninsula, Sumatra and the coast of Borneo. The latter, indeed, also write in the Arabic character, of which the Nicobarese are shewn to be profoundly ignorant.

Their language, itself a most degraded jargon, as at present spoken, differs somewhat at almost each of the islands of the group, despite the proximity of the latter to each other ; yet, throughout all, the distinctly recognizable Malayan characteristics of physique and type undoubtedly prevail. In character intensely idle, sluggish and undemonstrative, the copper skin and hairless face, the black straight hair, the small well-formed nose, black eyes, depressed brows, prominent cheek bones and uniform stature, all proclaim Malayan affinity and origin, though possibly to some extent modified by the *interningling of foreign blood*. Both tradition and evidence alike point to a distinct aboriginal race, remnants of which are yet to be found in the Great-Nicobar Island ; and though the state of semi-civilization of the present tenants of the soil is yet very low and far beneath that which has been attained by the Malayan race elsewhere, it is an indisputable fact that civilization with this race is not indigenous but is the result of contact with more civilized races, of the full advantages of which the comparatively isolated position of the Nicobar Islands may possibly have deprived the present inhabitants.

Whether the aboriginal race of the Nicobar Islands, whose possession was probably disturbed by Malayan invasion, bore any affinity to the Andaman races of squat, sable Negritos, woolly haired and of dwarfish stature, has yet to be ascertained.

It does not seem unreasonable to assume that the history of the Nicobar Islands may have been but that of the similar neighbouring groups of the southern portion of the Archipelago, which have passed under Malayan subjugation during the past six centuries. In fact the proximity of the Nicobars to Sumatra would tend strongly to confirm this view.\* That slight differences of dialect should exist has already been shewn to be both possible and probable, having regard to the numerous varieties of languages

\* The Revd. Père Chopard, 1844, too the Malay language is very extensively, or rather universally known. writes : "In the islands of the south it strikes me that there is some mixture of Malay blood ; in those parts

spoken throughout the Archipelago by races whose affinity and Malayan origin is placed beyond question.

The language of the Malays proper has already been given, whilst that of the Javanese and Bugis, equally Malays proper, is again wholly distinct. Wallace has shewn, after years of patient local investigation, that whilst the Malays proper generally write in the Arabic character, the Javanese have their own distinct scripts, that of the Bugis being again totally distinct from either of the above islanders. Where, therefore, so many extraneous influences have been brought to bear upon a language, it is impossible to arrive at any decided convictions as to the family to which it originally belonged, until the path has been carefully re-traced step by step to its original starting point.

To such a study as that indicated, Mr. de Röepstorff's work, will be a valuable contribution, as his vocabulary includes all that is yet known of the language of the race now existing in the Nicobars. There is, however, much yet remaining to be done in testing how far the words now given are associations or combinations of the same radical and fundamental elements, or derivations from the roots of the earliest Malayan forms of speech which are known to philologists, later influenced and modified as they have probably been, and as is ever the case with "living streams of speech," subjected through centuries to such dilutions as must have inevitably here taken place under local influences and in the absence of any script.

It seems then far from improbable that an aboriginal race did exist and gave place to the Malays in the Nicobars, and may have corresponded closely with the savage inhabitants of the adjoining Andaman isles to which the Malayan conquests and occupation have never extended. It has been already said that of this race the largest island of the group, the Great Nicobar, still retains living traces. By the coast population these people are termed *orang-utangs* or forest-men, and are considered as wild, inferior, uncivilized, indigenous savages of a wholly different race to themselves. They are described as being in the habit of wandering about perfectly naked, sleeping on trees, existing upon lizards, snakes, fruits and roots in the thickets of a dense forest, and of their ultimate fate there can be but little doubt.

It is certainly not a little strange that the Jacoon aborigines of the Malay Peninsula, driven back into their forest fastnesses, and now found only in the Province of Malacca from Mount Ophir to the coast, should be equally termed *orang-utangs* by the Malays, should build their huts in the trees,\* have woolly hair and sable skins, and much resemble in appearance the descriptions

of this primitive race, whilst both should appear to bear so close an affinity to the Andamanese races.

From the Papuan races of the Pacific, the Negritos of the Andamans and Philippines, and the Semangs of the Malay Peninsula, differ even more decidedly than from the Malays.

In stature alone the Papuans surpass the Malayan\* and equal the European races, whilst the Negrito races mentioned are all of dwarfish, stunted stature, varying from four-feet six to eight inches only in height. Other distinct indications, moreover, to which our space will not permit of reference, would seem to distinctly disprove for the latter any direct possible Papuan affinity.

The subject is, however, one of great interest, as of the eventual extirpation of these aboriginal tribes there can be little doubt. Do not the histories of the advance of the Portuguese in the West Indies, of the Spaniards in America, of the Dutch in Africa, of the English in Tasmania, all tell the same inevitable tale? In more recent times the Maoris of New Zealand have been slowly dying out, and are now reduced to about 3,000 in number in the Southern island, and to about 37,000 in the whole of the Northern, scattered over an area of 45,156 square miles.† Nor has our recent acquisition of the Fiji islands proved more fortunate for the inhabitants, 50,000 of whom have been swept away at one swoop by a visitation of measles said to have been imported by one of our English vessels.

In the volumes before us there is little bearing upon the aboriginal races of the Nicobars, though sufficient to establish the fact of their existence, which all the earlier writers indeed affirm.

In a geographical sketch of the Nicobars,‡ published in 1849, Dr. Rink of the Royal Danish corvette *Galathea*, refers to these savages thus: 'The Nicobarians always spoke of them with contempt, and ridiculed their savage mode of life. They said that they sleep on trees, run through the jungle like cats, buy knives from the coast inhabitants for bundles of rotanz, but generally run away before men, or live at enmity with them. They are said to be armed with wooden spears and understand magic arts. The habitations which we met on our trip up the river belonged to these people. That these people are the original inhabitants of the island is probable, but whether they belong to the Negro race it was not possible to make out from the confused accounts of the Nicobarians. It is known that in Ceylon, in Sumatra, and the Malayan Peninsula, there dwell similar wild tribes different from the inhabitants of the coast, and the same thing occurs here,

\* Wallace states by as much as 8 inches. Edition by the late Dr. Stoliczka. The 'Galathea' visited the Nicobars

† *The Times*—May 18th, 1875.— 1845-46.

‡ Translated from the German

'in that one of the islands which is the largest, and which contains the smallest number of coast inhabitants.'

The Rev. D. Rosen, a Danish missionary, who remained at the Nicobars from 1831 to 1834, also referring to this inland people says: 'The Nicobarians do, however, not seem to be the aborigines of these islands. In the interior of the Great Nicobar there is said to exist a savage people, which probably is of greater antiquity than the other. The Nicobarians consider themselves very much superior to these savages, whom they compare to monkeys. They say that they wear no clothes, have no houses, live like animals in the dense jungles, fear the sight of other human beings, and never come out of their hiding-places except in search of food.'

The tribe is termed Shobængs in Mr. de Röepstorff's work, but upon what authority, is not apparent. It is, however, sincerely to be hoped that efforts may yet be made to obtain further information regarding this strange people, of whom so little has yet been gleaned.

Let us now, however, leave this race, to consider the present tenants of the soil, to whose customs and habits Mr. de Röepstorff has devoted several pages of his work. Steeped in the grossest ignorance and superstition, wholly destitute of all religious belief, they would make even nature appalling by superstitions of every description of malevolent fiend.

It has often been said that "fear working on ignorance evokes "the fetish, whence by a natural development arises the God;" but such has certainly been far from the case as yet in these Islands, as the conception of a Supreme Being as an object of worship or even of love or reverence has yet to be initiated or elaborated, the minds of the race not yet having attained that development which will allow of psychological conceptions or of a recognition of mind or soul as distinct from the body.

The old primitive fears of elemental agencies are here as yet in full force, nature-gods being regarded however but as evil-spirits.

'All nations have their omens drear,  
'Their legends wild of woe and fear;'

But with the Nicobarans the records before us shew that this is carried to an excess which influences every action of their lives, and is almost incredible.

It has been urged by the advocates of internationalism that religion stifles the intelligence; but if the comparison of the Nicobarese with other Malayan races who have embraced Islamism be permitted, there can be little doubt that the assertion would scarcely be here borne out, or that the verdict, as regards

superior intelligence, would be otherwise than favorable to the possessors of a creed.

As we have ourselves so long ceased to recognize the visible manifestations of an evil principle or the working of demons in natural phenomena, we cannot but read with considerable amusement of whole villages turning out upon the occasion of an eclipse of the sun to drive off with spears and gongs the evil spirits engaged in devouring that luminary; yet there is little room for doubt that the Greek philosophers, and the Jews generally at the beginning of our era, both held the belief that the sun, moon, and stars, were living entities; and there are in fact many of the old cosmical theories of the Fathers which find repetition here and accord strangely with the superstitions of the Nicobarean race. \* All sickness and disease is attributed to the influence and action of devils, and demoniacal possession is firmly credited. In storms and tempests the direct agency of the evil spirits is considered to be most clearly recognizable. It is held that these do not occur from material disturbance, but are distinctly traceable to the anger of demons and evil spirits, whilst the whole village will turn out and march round its boundaries beating gongs merely to divert the approach of a threatening storm.†

It is of course assumed that the injury of the human race in every possible way is the special province and delight of these myriad demons. Above all the spirits of the wicked dead are feared as the most malicious, whilst the exorcism of evil-spirits (*Iwi* or *Hivi*) from the sick is one of the principal functions of the Manloene or priests.

“Fell furies of the realms of night  
Who rule the dead”—

are indeed those most feared and dreaded of all the comprehensive category of demons; and no Nicobarean would venture to enter a burial ground alone or at night.

\* “Nous ne voulons plus de religion, car les religions étouffent l'intelligence.” Discours par Eugène Dupont, (Expounder of Internationalism) à la clôture du Congrès de Bruxelles. Sept. 3rd 1868.

† In an Extract of a letter from Père Faure, S. J. (one of the two priests massacred at the Nicobars in 1711) addressed to Père de la Boesse, S. J., and dated 17th January 1711 published at Toulouse in 1810, (“Lettres Edifiantes et Curieuses”) it is asserted that the Nicobarese worship the Moon, but this is unconfirmed by any later authority.

“Tout ce que j'ai pu connaitre

de la Religion des Nicobarins, c'est qu'ils adorent la Lune, et qu'ils craignent les Démons, dont ils ont quelque grossière idée.

De Röepstorff however (p. 9.) states that they attribute mystical powers to the sun and moon—

“and at certain stages of the moon they will work, at others not.”

It would seem far from impossible that if this be so, there might yet be traced some earlier traditions of ideal nature-gods similar to the oldest and most primitive simple form of the Aryan faith as depicted in the *Vedas*.

Before a house is built the priest must consecrate the site by the exorcism of the demons tenanting it; and if a new canoe be but launched, the priest with fire must first compel the imps to quit it, ere it is fit to proceed to sea. A Nicobarese will not bathe alone, and will not cross a jungle carrying a box, will not use a nail in the construction of his house, and will not throw overboard at sea the shell of a cocoa-nut, will not eat pork and turtle at the same meal, and will not touch spirits or tobacco for some time after the death of a relative. In fact, it may almost be said that there is scarcely an action of his daily life in which he has not ever present before him the dread of offending one or other of these malignant powers.

Perhaps, however, of all ceremonies, that described as the deportation and expulsion of troublesome demons from a village is the most singular.

It is thus described by De Röepstorff. "The priests who have "not eaten for a long time beforehand, but by constant potations "and mysterious ceremonies have brought themselves up to a "certain excited pitch, then commence their conjurations. They "are daubed over the face with red paint and rubbed with oil "over the body. In deep bass voices they sing a doleful dirge "and rush wildly about. On the beach lies a small model of a "boat adorned with garlands made of fresh leaves. The priests "want to catch hold of the spirits; they coax, scold, abuse and "rush after their invisible antagonists. During this part of the "feast the women howl worse than ever, and it is not to be "wondered at if the spirits give in. At last it comes to a "hand to hand fight, and after great trouble the *Iwi* is safely "brought on board and seated on the skiff. Young men in "boats then tow the craft out so far that it will not, led by "tide and wind, return to their village and there set it adrift, "and then return to the feast." Often, it is recorded by other writers, a screen is erected on the beach to shut out the evil spirits' view of the village, lest they should return. Whole cargoes of these fiends are often deported in this manner. Of all, the worst catastrophe is deemed to be that the devils thus launched at the mercy of the waves, should succeed in re-effecting a landing on any other shore in the vicinity of any other village. This they will immediately enter, and their last end is probably worse than their first; for the arrival of their frail skiff is the signal of, and is deemed a sufficient pretext for, an immediate raid upon the village which has thus transferred such troublesome and unwelcome members.

As might be anticipated the priests are proficient sorcerers, and are much addicted to charms, incantations, exorcisms and the magic art. It is sufficient that a witch should dream of the death of any

person for it to at once result ; and many lives are said to have been sacrificed to gratify the private vengeance of the priests upon the most trifling accusations of witchcraft.

When it is considered, however, that our English laws against witchcraft were abolished so recently as 1736, whilst a witch was burnt to death at Guernsey in 1747, some allowance may be made for the ready and credulous belief in supernatural intervention in mundane affairs of a race so deeply steeped in superstition as is the Nicobarean ; nor must it be forgotten that, in one year alone, 500 witches suffered death by fire at Geneva, whilst stringent laws were enacted in England on the subject of witchcraft so recently as the reigns of our Henry VIII, Elizabeth and James I.\*

Writing upon the subject of demoniacal possession and its supposed cure by means of exorcism and invocations, the author of a recent work † very lucidly points out, that even the advent of Christianity itself introduced no change, for it merely shared the prevailing national (Jewish) superstition and belief of the time regarding it, changing nothing but the form of exorcism ; and that not only in fact did Christianity inherit the long prevailing superstition current before the Christian era, but transmitted it intact to succeeding ages.

Indeed, mysterious powers of exorcism of demons and evil spirits were claimed and are said to have been exercised by clergymen of the Church of England so recently as 150 years since only, when the Rev. J. Ruddle, Prebendary of Exeter, obtained his " Faculty" from Bishop Leth Ward of Exeter, and exorcised a female spirit in the early dawn‡, one of the canons of 1604 forbidding any minister to attempt to cast out devils without the express license of the Bishop.

Unlike the English Sprites or Fairies, it is held by the Nicobarese impossible that their spirits should work other than evil works, and the *Ivis* rather resemble the *Dacine-Shi* of the Scottish Highlanders, or the malevolent Scandinavian *Duergar* with their legitimate successors the *Deons* or *Trows*, who are specially powerful at midnight, with whom Sir Walter Scott's works have made us familiar. The superstitious fear of one Highlander, indeed, is repeatedly and prominently referred to by Scott, as in Rokeby :—

Nor think to village swains alone  
Are these unearthly terrors known,

\* An amusing instance of this is cited by Cox in his "Sabbath laws and Sabbath duties" so recently as November 1608. The proprietors of salmon fishings in Aberdeen were summoned before the Sessions in that town and solemnly rebuked for salmon fishing on the Sabbath—The

cause of an earthquake, which had visited the city, being declared distinctly traceable to this custom.

† Supernatural Religion—Longmans Green and Co. 1874. London.

‡ Glimpses of the Supernatural. Rev. F. G. Lee. London. King and Co. 1875.

For not to rank or sex confined  
Is this vainague of the mind :  
Hearts firm as steel, as marble hard,  
'Gainst faith and love and pity barr'd,  
Have quaked like aspen leaves in May  
Beneath its universal sway—

and again in *Marmion* in the introduction to the sixth canto—

The Highlander whose red claymore  
The battle turned on Maida's shore,  
Will on a Friday morn look pale,  
If ask'd to tell a fairy tale.  
He fears the vengeful elfin king,  
Who leaves that day his grassy ring ;  
Invisible to human ken  
He walks among the sons of men—

Nor is it to the Highlanders of Scotland alone that such superstitions have hitherto been confined. The history of the middle ages teems with illusions which have but recently been dispelled by the steady progress of the enlightened study of the natural sciences.—

“ Scarce a year passes without some discovery being made in these sciences, which, as with the touch of a magician's wand, ‘ shivers to atoms theories formerly deemed unassailable;’ and our ideas of the display of supernatural power, of which natural phenomena have hitherto been deemed certain manifestations, may be said to have, within the past century, undergone a complete revolution.

As recently pointed out in one of a series of magazine articles upon *Natural Religion*, nature, in the middle ages, “ had been ‘ made not merely a dead thing, but a disgusting and hideous thing by superstitions of imps, witches and demons.’ ”\*

In his “ *History of the Goths, Swedes and Vandals* ” published in London in 1658, *Olaus Magnus*† tells us of the force ‘ conjurers and witches have in en chaining the elements enchanted by them or others that they may exceed or fall short of their natural order;’ and adds, the extreme land of north Finland and Lapland ‘ was so taught witchcraft formerly in heathenish times as if they had this cursed art from Zoroastres the Persian, though other inhabitants of the sea-coasts are said to be bewitched with the same madness, for they exercise this devilish art, of all the arts of the world, to admiration, and in this or other such like mischief they commonly agree.’ ”

From the volumes before us it is clear that the practice of this “ devilish art ” has extended to the Nicobar Islands, where

\* *Macmillan's*, July 1875.

W. Scott.

† Quoted in “ *The Pirate*, ” Sir.

it is still in full force, the elements being held to be completely within the control of the priests.

The Revd. Père Barbe asserts\* that "the Nicobareans have such a high opinion of the Europeans, that to them they attribute the creation of their Islands, and they think it depends on them to give fine weather, nice breezes, &c.; they are convinced that the Minloven (Priests) can cure every disease, make people sick, and also deprive them of life. Should any one be suspected of causing death, the villagers would immediately kill him; this has been the case several times."

He further tells how on one occasion the rain being somewhat retarded (the missionaries being themselves, as priests, regarded as having full control of the elements) his life and that of his brother missionaries were threatened unless rain fell during the night. Fortunately this occurred, and the priests were most cordially thanked for their intervention by the villagers. It is told by Olaus of Ericus† King of Sweden, that he was second to none of his time in the magical arts, and that "he was so familiar with the evil spirits, which he exceedingly adored, that which way soever he turned his cap, the wind would presently blow that way. From this occasion he was sur-named 'Windy Cap.'

Père Barbe narrates that to the priests the Nicobarese have always attributed a somewhat similar power, and quotes an instance of an occasion of a trip in one of their canoes, when the crew, being dissatisfied with the breeze, had begged the missionary traveller for a little more; whilst on the wind which subsequently rose exceeding their immediate requirements, they again prayed the 'Senhor Padre' to abstain from further increasing it or the boat would be capsized.

The Finlanders, from the account given by *Olaus*, undoubtedly turned the practice of their assumed powers to a somewhat profitable account; for he states that they were wont 'among other errors of gentilisme, to sell winds to merchants who were stopt on their coasts by contrary weather; and when they had their price, they knit 3 magical knots, not like to the laws of Cassius, bound up with a thong, and they gave them to the merchants, observing that rule, that when they unloosed the first, they should have a good gale of wind, when the second a stronger wind, but when they untied the third, they should have such cruel tempests that they should not be able to look out of the forecastle to avoid the rocks, nor move a foot to pull down the sails, nor stand at the helm to govern the ship'; and he adds, probably for the benefit of the sceptical in such matters, 'they made an un-

\* Notice of the Nicobar Islands. 1846. + Historia de Gentibus Septentrionalibus, Romæ, 1555.

'happy trial of the truth of it who denied that there was any such power in these knots.'

It is deemed scarcely probable that the revenues of the Moravian Mission were much augmented from similar sources.

Let us now endeavour to form an estimate of the character of the race, than which nothing would at first sight appear more difficult, to judge from the diversity of opinion expressed in these records.

Speaking, more particularly of the races of the Southern Islands, De Roëpstorff thus describes them.—"They are the most honest, "upright and good-natured people that I know of;" and again, "their truthfulness, honesty, good humour and politeness, industry and diligence, I had ample occasion to observe."

As the British occupation of the Islands is of so recent a date as 6 years since and is officially deemed to have been rendered necessary in consequence of fearful atrocities and of the frequent commission of murders of the crews of vessels visiting these shores, it is quite apparent either that the inhabitants had previously been seriously maligned or that the present view of their character is based upon too favourable an estimate of it.

In a letter addressed to the Government of India two years prior to the occupation of the Islands, which forms a portion of the "official correspondence" ultimately leading to possession 'being taken of the Nicobars by H. M. Indian Government" (pp. 264-320) this passage occurs:—

"There is no doubt that it has been for years past the custom "of these Nicobareans to make frequent prey of vessels touching "at their shores, and the reason why these atrocities have not "earlier come to our knowledge is, that they have invariably acted "upon the old maxim that dead men tell no tales, and butchered "all who fell into their power; and, after plundering the vessel, "scuttled her in deep water;" &c.

There is, moreover, ample evidence afforded by these records of the destruction of a *Chulia* Brig in 1833; of the Captain, officers, pilot and crew of a whaler vessel in 1839; of the crew of the "Mary" (1844); of the murder of Captain Law and many of the crew of another vessel in the same year; and, in 1866, of the crew of the "Futteh Islam," as well as of other well-authenticated cases, placing it beyond doubt that, as a race, the Nicobarese are of most piratical habits when occasion offers. The visits of H. M. Ships *Tenasserim*, *Wanderer*, *Wasp*, have each but elicited some further confirmation of this view.

The Chief Commissioner of British Burmah (Letter No. 52 P., 22 March 1867) speaks of this "pirate horde;" and there seems to be but little doubt upon the evidence adduced that this is the more correct view of their character, although possibly no doubt it may fairly be conceded that the presence of an English settle-

ment in their midst may have, during the past few years, done much to keep in check propensities which previously the Islanders were enabled to indulge without much fear of punitive measures of retribution being adopted against them.

Writing in 1856, the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal appears to have taken a view of the position which certainly commends itself to the intelligence in the light of more recent events. For the purpose which is mainly in view in the re-agitation of this question, the mere establishment of a penal colony at one extremity of one island would be inadequate, nor would any thing short of entire domination prevent the evils which now occur from the savage and unbridled ferocity of the present inhabitants. On the other hand, there is good reason to suppose that the occupation of these islands would bring many positive advantages, while their supposed unhealthiness would probably not be found more lasting than that of the coast and islands of Arracan.

That our occupation of Camorta has deterred many a piratical attack upon vessels in the immediate vicinity of our settlement, there is every reason to confidently believe and assert, and it has doubtless exercised some influence upon the islands in the vicinity ; but that it has wholly and radically changed the naturally savage and ferocious temperament of the island races within six years seems scarcely credible, when it is remembered how slight has been our contact with them, and that our little penal colony is placed in a remote and isolated corner of one of the southern islands of the group—without means of communication with any of the more distant isles, with which, as a matter of fact, communication is not maintained.

The ordinary character of the Malayan races as elsewhere met with is too well known to need description here ; but it must further always be remembered that elsewhere our contact is with the same race in a more advanced stage of civilization, and after it has been subjected to the influences of conversion to the Muhammadan faith ; whilst the savages with whom we have here to deal are rather such as were the Malayan races when first described by Nicolo Conti\* in 1430 A.D., or by Barbosa† two centuries later.

\* Nicolo Conti describes the Malayan race of Java and Sumatra thus :—“The inhabitants exceed every other people in cruelty. They regard killing a man as a mere jest, nor is any punishment allotted for such a deed. If any one purchases a new sword and wish to try it, he will thrust it into the heart of the first person he meets: the passers by examine the wound and praise

the skill of the person who inflicted it, if he thrust in the weapon direct.”

† Barbosa, who encountered the race at Malacca in 1660, says of them :—“They are a people of great ingenuity, very subtle in their dealings, very malicious, great deceivers, seldom speaking the truth, prepared to do all manner of wickedness, and ready to sacrifice their lives !” (Wallace.)

As usual with the Malayan races, the invariable answer of the Nicobarese to the missionaries, when charged by them with any atrocious crime, has been the assertion of temporary demoniacal possession rendering them wholly irresponsible for their actions. "The devil entered me and I did not know what I was doing" being all that could be elicited in any case as to the motives for any specially criminal act. Some interesting particulars of cases of Malayan crime are given by Dr. Chevers, in his work on Medical Jurisprudence, who also quotes Stavorinus' voyage to the East Indies, and other early writers upon their terrible well-known practice of Running Amuk. There seems, in fact, to be throughout all the earlier records but one unanimous opinion expressed in regard to the natural savage ferocity of disposition of the earlier type of this race, with which that of the Nicobarese would seem so closely allied. Where for many years the race has been restrained by extraneous influences, as in the Car Nicobar island, which the records shew to have been of all the most visited by trading vessels of other nations, the natural ferocity has decidedly undergone a very marked change for the better; though even here many of the old distinctive traits are still perceptible, and have yet to be eliminated by more intimate contact with superior civilization.

Voltaire and Robespierre both held that "if there was no Deity "it would be necessary for man to create one;" but this is scarcely the case with mental organizations of so low a stamp as are those of the savage Nicobarese races at present. All previous missionary efforts would seem to have been futile and entirely thrown away, and it is indeed difficult to understand how it can well be otherwise until the minds of the people have been educated up to a point which will allow of the idea or realization of the existence of a Being superior to man, of which they are at present wholly unable to grasp even the conception, not having in their language a word capable of expressing the idea at present. Theirs is indeed a sordid, squalid, debased struggle for mere existence, with few requirements and of very limited desires:

Their level life is but a smouldering fire  
Unquench'd by want, unfann'd by strong desire :  
Unfit for raptures, or, if aptures cheer,  
On some high festival of once a year,  
In wild excess the vulgar breast takes fire,  
Till, buried in debauch, the bliss expire.

The debauches, however, in which the Nicobarese are wont to indulge are of far more frequent occurrence than contemplated by Goldsmith in these lines.

The fermented juice of the cocoa-palm furnishes them with a never-failing supply of stimulant, whilst white arrack from Penang

is now largely imported. Under no circumstances do they appear to drink water, ordinarily habitually slaking their thirst with the fresh juice of the young, unripe cocoa-nut.

It would appear to be no uncommon sight to see whole villages intoxicated, both men and women reduced to a state of helpless imbecility and prostrated by drink, the debauch sometimes lasting several days, requiring but the slightest pretext whether of birth, marriage or death amongst the community, even a change of the moon sufficing for its institution.

The Revd. Père Barbe (1846) describes the Nicobareans as a race as "lazy and inactive, cowardly, treacherous and drunken"; and adds, "not a single year has passed without hearing of some vessels or boats being lost". But as no one suspected the islanders to be capable of piracy the loss was always attributed either to bad weather or the incapacity of the captains. It is but a few years since Government has been convinced that the Nicobareans, although destitute of real courage and bravery, have been guilty of the greatest crimes, in murdering peaceful people who could not suspect that the natives, whose appearance is so simple and timid, would ever conceive and dare to execute such treacherous designs. There is very little doubt now that a great part of the vessels which were supposed to be lost in the Bay have been cut off and plundered by the natives of these islands, and their crews there found a watery grave!

It is certainly somewhat strange that, having apparently no hesitation in committing most cowardly piratical murders of this description, it yet should be considered necessary for the priest to bless the spoil before its partition, with a view to keep off the spirits of the murdered owners; yet the evidence distinctly shews that this practice is invariably resorted to. Of the indolent character of these savages there is ample proof in the volumes before us. Haëusel, Rink, Fontana, and other writers refer repeatedly to the apathy and stolid sluggishness of the race.

Fontana remarks that 'Their indolence is not to be equalled by any other people of the East.' Rink mentions that 'their gait and all their movements are sluggish and heavy, their look indicates a high degree of phlegm and indolence, and their speech is snorting and heavy; ' and further, that 'their chief art and chief science, as well as industry, are concentrated in the *dolce far niente*: whilst Haëusel states that 'they are of so indolent a turn that even talking seems a trouble to them, and as long as they can express by signs what they mean they are unwilling to open their mouths.'

This impassive, slow, undemonstrative, indolent disposition has been shewn by Wallace to be specially characteristic of the Malay-an races.

Although there can be little doubt that the Nicobars were visited by English vessels as early as the beginning of the 17th century, almost the earliest records here traceable appear to be those of the first Danish occupation of 1756.

Prior to this, however, two French missionaries, Pères Faure and Bonnet had, in 1711, taken up their residence on the islands where they were cruelly massacred by the inhabitants.\*

Some two centuries since, the wildest stories regarding the tropical races of the East Indies, then so little known, were those most readily credited in Europe; and even the Bard of Avon in "the Tempest" tells us of 'dew-lapped mountaineers' and 'men whose heads stood in their breasts' for whose existence many were only too ready to vouch.

\* 'When we were boys  
Who would believe that there were mountaineers  
Dew-lapped like bulls, whose throats had hanging at them  
Wallets of flesh? Or that there were such men  
Whose heads stood in their breasts? Which now we find  
Each putter-out on five for one, will bring us  
Good warrant of !'

The Nicobarese, however, like Goldsmith's savage, were long credited with the possession of tails; an assertion also frequently made in regard to the Jacoons of the Malayan Peninsula.

'O! there the natives are a dreadful race! :  
The men have tails! The women paint the face'.

The Swedish traveller Keoping, who visited the Nicobars in 1647, the account of whose voyage was reprinted at Stockholm by Silvium in 1743, narrates having seen at these islands a race of men with tails like cats which they moved in a similar manner, and it was not until the visit of Nicholas Fontana in 1778 ‡ that this illusion was entirely dispelled.

It was then found that the natives were in the habit of wearing a long, narrow strip of cloth about 4 inches in width, made of the bark of a tree, (Cestus) tightly drawn round their waist and between their thighs, allowing one extremity to hang down behind. Being otherwise wholly destitute of clothing, this singular appendage had no doubt been mistaken for a tail.

An instance of somewhat similar credulity narrated by Wallace may be cited in regard to the birds of these seas. Amongst the

\* *Lettres edifiantes et curieuses.* Toulouse, 1810

† *Prologue to Zobeide.*

‡ *Journal of the voyage of the Imperial ships Joseph and Theresia to the new Austrian Colonies in Asia and Africa, addressed by Nicolaus*

*Fontana, late Ship's Surgeon, to Herr Brambilla, Surgeon to the Emperor, Protochyrurgus of the Army, &c. Translated from the Italian manuscript, by Joseph Eyerle, 1782. Leipzig. "in der Buchhandlung der Gelehrten."*

earliest articles of barter in the Southern Archipelago, appear to have been the skins of the "Birds of Paradise" or as they were then called by the Portuguese traders the Birds of the Sun (*Passaros de Sol*).

As these were cured by the natives, who invariably removed the feet and wings, and were never seen in life, it was assumed that they were both footless and wingless\*; and, writing in 1598, *John van Linschoten* asserts that 'they live in the air, always 'turning towards the sun and never lighting on the earth until 'they die'—which was long fully credited in Europe.

Wonderful, indeed, are the treasures of these seas,† and pages might be filled with interesting accounts of the beautiful marine shells, fish, birds and insects of these isles.

Of the scenery, it would be futile to attempt a description; 'such beauty, varying in the light of living nature, cannot be 'pourtrayed by words.' Seen in the summer months the smaller islands appear to float "wave-encircled" upon the bosom of the deep blue crystal water; and indeed it is only such descriptions as those of Scott which can even attempt to do justice to such a scene, whether viewed "when the midnight moon should "lave her forehead in the silver wave," or when "gleaming with "the setting sun the landscape has the appearance of being but "one burnished sheet of living gold."

The wanderer's eye could barely view  
The summer heaven's delicious blue;  
So wondrous wild, the whole might seem  
The scenery of a fairy dream.

Here, however, the thoughts of men have yet to be "widened with the process of the suns." The squalid, sordid, savage shews no signs of being included in "the one increasing purpose," and lingers long in the earliest dawn of civilization.

"Man seems the only growth that dwindles here." Whatever the future may have in store for these islanders it can scarcely fail to be preferable to their past.

The settlement amongst them of European races has not as yet been fraught with any marked changes either in their culture or modes of life, except, perhaps, that the stimulus given to their propensity for strong drink, or for any and every description of stimulant, has been fostered by the increased facilities for trade, induced by the presence and assumed protection of a foreign settlement upon their islands—advantage being taken

---

\* The largest species was in 1760 almost entirely supported by the sale named by *Linnaeus* the *Paradisea* in Europe of the collections made by *Apoda* or Footless Bird of paradise. the Brethren.

† The Maravian mission or long

by the Burmese and Malayan traders from Penang and the Tenasserim Coast, of the known fondness of the islanders for strong drink, to import and sell profitably large quantities of arrack of a very inferior quality. Whether or not this will much affect the future of the race it is yet difficult to determine; but to the fondness of the—race for powerful stimulants the sterility of the females is by many writers attributed, and there can be no doubt that it has a perceptible influence also on the longevity of the males, very few of whom appear to attain to more than middle age.

There are, however, many other causes which may equally influence any increase of population. Some will not admit of reference; but when it is stated that the comparative paucity of women leads to a very frequent change of husbands, it being optional with the female to insist upon a divorce at any time as a matter of right, merely in consequence of an avowed preference for any other member of the village community, it is not difficult to realize that there must be many influences brought to bear upon the advance of numbers in a future generation, which cannot be computed by statistics would be applicable to other races. Sterility, being regarded as a disgrace, always forms a sufficient excuse for the dismissal of a husband: and a case is cited by Père Barbe of the divorce of nine successive spouses by one female from this cause.

Further, if twins are born, one is strangled and three children are considered quite a large family. The women are inclined to be extremely corpulent, and are equally with the men addicted to strong drunks and to the constant chewing of betel-nut.

Already sufficiently hideous, they consider that they add to their attractions by shaving the hair of their heads and removing their eye-brows.

Space will not, however, admit of our dealing further with the manners and customs of these races, although much interesting matter yet remains untouched, and we can only refer those interested in the subject to the volumes themselves from which we quote.

In many of their ceremonies, more particularly that of the burial of the dead, it is thought not improbable that the customs observed will be later found to have been adopted rather from the aboriginal races of the islands than from the original Malayan observances—though perhaps in a somewhat modified form.

Some of the practices observed, in fact, are believed to be identical with the ceremonies still in vogue amongst the indigenous aborigines of the Andamans, such as those followed in the burial and subsequent exhuming of the dead, when the corpse is dismembered; though whilst with the Andamanese the bones are

divided, with the Nicobareans they are again consigned to the earth.

There are in fact here narrated many singular customs which are certainly deserving of a closer study, and which might afford important evidences of the origin of the race: such are piercing of the ears with large holes, the shaving of the eyebrows and of the women's heads, the flattening and compression of the skull (resorted to with their children in infancy), the fact that they do not cut their nails, their singular method of fastening their only garment (a narrow strip of cloth 4-inches wide), and various distinct traits of character which often afford the most certain guides and characteristics of races.

The earlier efforts at the colonization of these islands have hitherto from various causes proved abortive.

In 1756, the Danish Asiatic Company made a first attempt, and several pages of the volumes before us are devoted to an interesting record of the trials and sufferings of the early settlers, who in this case, however, had soon to seek safety in flight.

In 1768, a settlement of Moravian Brethren at Camorta\* was attempted, and for 19 years was, it is said, maintained; wholly without success, however, as regarded the conversion of any of the inhabitants, not a single conversion being reported as achieved.

In 1778, an Austrian occupation, connected with Boltz's expedition to the East, temporarily took place, but was not destined to be of long continuance. From 1787 to 1807 a small guard on behalf of the Danish Government appears to have remained on the islands, which were taken possession of by England in the latter year, only to be re-ceded to Denmark seven years later, the Danes making a further and last attempt at colonization in 1831; and it was not, in fact, until 1848 that the Danes may be said to have finally wholly relinquished their claims upon the Nicobars.

The English re-occupation dates but from six years since, as has been already stated.

It is not difficult to conjecture, and will probably readily be conceded, that occupations like the present one can have but little permanent effect either in ameliorating the condition of the inhabitants, or in exercising a lasting influence upon the progressive advance of the race in civilization.

In a penal colony it is not always expedient or desirable to encourage the extension of too friendly relations with the resident population beyond certain limits; and restrictions are of necessity imposed, which act as serious barriers to such intercourse as is

---

\* Called Sampieri in Mr. Haëusel's MSS., and Sombreiro in the French charts.●

desirable, and would, under other circumstances, be fostered and encouraged.

Further, the isolated position of our settlement upon one of the southern and more sparsely populated islands, of the group, and the absence of any certain means of communication with any of the other islands, render it improbable that our influence for good has yet been either widely diffused or of a lasting character.

Dr. F. Von Hochstetter, in his valuable report,\* has shown that it is with the islands to the north that trade is now mainly carried on.

These have by far the larger proportion of cocoa-palms, and from the Car-Nicobar alone some three million nuts are now annually exported, whilst the whole of the other islands contribute together but two million more. Of all the islands of the Nicobars, in fact, this, perhaps, would appear the best suited for projects of colonization and settlement, for a variety of reasons connected with the climate, soil, population, &c. This point, however, is wholly beyond the scope of the present article.

Edible birds' nests, ambergris, tortoise-shell and trepang† (*Biche-de-mer*) also all form exports from the Nicobars, but as yet in inconsiderable quantities; the attention of the Nicobarese being mainly directed to their wealth of nuts, of which the annual yield is estimated at from 10 to 15 millions, the local consumption and waste being, however, very considerable.

It seems probable that the total number of inhabitants of the islands now number some 5,000, though the means of arriving at any strictly accurate computation are not readily obtainable.

Assuming these numbers to be correct, it will be apparent, our direct contact with the race being confined to the limits of our settlement in the small island of Nancowry, as shewn, that it will be long ere our influence can make itself really felt throughout the more distant yet far more thickly populated islands of the north, which appear so much more deserving of our attention on every account, if our tenure of the island group has for its object the attainment of any other desideratum than the simple suppression of piracy in the harbour of Camorta.

In former years, one of the great barriers to intercourse with the race has undoubtedly been the language, but this may be said to have practically ceased to be the case.

The natives have themselves a special facility for acquiring foreign languages. In the Car-Nicobar, English is now fairly understood by many of those who are brought in contact with English ship Captains.

---

\* Contributions to the Geology and Islands—Austrian Frigate *Novara*.  
Physical Geography of the Nicobar † *Holothuria Edulis*.

Mr. de Roëpstorff, indeed, states that the history of trade in the islands can almost be told from the variety of languages spoken. The oldest inhabitants yet speak "the corrupted Portuguese" "that still lingers in the East. Middle aged men speak very often a bad sailor English, the young men south and east speak Burmese, the boys a little Hindustani. All talk Malay and their own language."

From the letters of the missionaries it appears that their conversations with the natives were mainly carried on in what is termed 'Bastard Portuguese'; and the records before us seem to show traces of the introduction of numerous words of continental Asiatic origin, how acquired it is difficult to trace. One fact, however, seems clear, namely, that a knowledge of Malay would now allow of comparatively free communications with all the islands of the group.

The service rendered by such works as that of Mr. de Roëpstorff is considerable. However degraded may be the jargon or the customs of such semi-civilized savages as those whom he depicts, there can be no doubt but that whatever tends to increase our general knowledge of the manners and traditions of races, at a time when they are first passing that primitive savage stage when their whole faculties are concentrated on simply procuring the necessary means of daily subsistence, is to be sedulously gleaned and cordially welcomed, if we would ever desire to attain to a fuller knowledge of the great work of Nature in the destruction of the races which is yet ever going on before us.

Science moves, but slowly, slowly, creeping on from point to point.

Every contribution of the nature of this work, tending to assist in furnishing trustworthy data, ultimately to further and aid such advance, cannot, therefore, but prove of the greatest service and find ready acceptance.

No one who has visited these isles can ever efface from memory their perfect scenery, equaling that of the most beautiful inland sea; yet, on the other hand, it is equally impossible when viewing them to fail to recall to mind how often they have been the scene of piratical treachery and cold-blooded violence of the most appalling description:—

So brilliant was the landward view  
 The ocean so serene,  
 Each puny wave in diamonds rolled  
 O'er the calm deep, where lines of gold  
 With azure strove and green.  
 The hill, the vale, the tree, the tower,  
 Glowed with the tints of evening's hour,  
 The beach was silver sheen;  
 The wind breathed soft as lover's sigh  
 And oft renewed, seemed oft to die,

With breathless pause between.  
O ! who, with speech of war and woes  
Would wish to break the soft repose  
Of such enchanting scene !

Yet, it would not be doing justice to the subject were these pages closed without due prominence being given to the relentless ferocity of the islanders, in the cases to which reference is made in the Government records before us.

It is most strange that the fear of the return of the spirits of the dead, so firmly believed in by all the westward Malays, and which we have shown to influence so largely the life of this people should have failed to exercise a deterrent effect in regard to the commission of piratical murders on these shores. Although fully prepared to make every allowance for cases in which provocation may have been given, the instances in which this motive has allowedly been wholly absent, are but too well authenticated, mere cupidity being apparently a sufficient incentive, accounting for several of the cases of which the records before us bear testimony.

Many of the certificates of good conduct granted by Captains of vessels visiting these coasts are said to conclude with this advice :—

“Whoever wishes to keep on friendly terms with the “natives, must not take liberties with their women, nor shoot “their fowls and pigs in the jungle.” And it is very possible that, had this excellent admonition been more closely attended to, the reputation of the Islanders would not have suffered to the extent it undoubtedly has by the violence of their retaliatory proceedings.

The dwellers of sea coasts have, in many parts of the world, acquired an unpleasant notoriety by their treatment of shipwrecked mariners, and the case of Zetland may be instanced where, at a former period, the inhuman superstition was undoubtedly current, that were you to bring a drowning man to life again he would inevitably do you some capital injury.

Here, however, the evidence would seem to place it beyond doubt, that the course has too often been to disarm suspicion by the affection of sincere friendliness, and to seize a favourable opportunity for a sudden combined murderous attack upon a defenceless crew, whenever the opportunity offered of carrying such scheme into execution without much risk of detection.

However willing we may be to make allowances for a race whose morality is at so low an ebb that it is deemed sufficient exculpation of the most heinous crimes to refer their commission to the influence of demoniacal possession, we cannot put down these volumes without experiencing a certain sense of relief in the thought that if little else has yet been achieved, at least the

demon of cupidity has at length been subjected to a fitting restraint by the presence of our settlements in these waters, however little contact with a more advanced civilization may yet have otherwise exercised a perceptible influence over this savage race.

W. B. BIRCH.

ART. X.—THE NINE-LAKH CHAIN: OR, THE MARO FEUD.  
BEING THE FIRST PORTION OF  
*The Lay of Alha.*

FYTTE IV.

THE buildings rang when Udan sang,  
So sweetly did he trill ;  
Kushla the Queen behind a screen,  
Through the casement gazed her fill.

“ Tell me the truth,” in wrath she cried,  
“ Whom hast thou hither led ?  
This port of pride, these chests full wide,  
Is that a Jogi’s tread ?

“ Their legs that slope like lions’ loins,  
The fire that lights their eye ;  
Tell me the truth, or, slave, in sooth,  
This hour shall see thee die.”

“ Lady, thou knowst not,” Udan cried,  
“ The tale we have to tell ;  
An orphan I from mine infancy,  
When my sire in battle fell.

“ A widow lone was my mother left,  
And the dearth fell black on the land ;  
Her children at length, of hope bereft,  
She sold to a Jogi band.

“ If God hath given us bodies fair,  
That fairness can we hide ?”  
“ Where got ye, then, those quilts so rare,  
Those rubies, and gems of pride ?”

“ In Jaychand’s court at Kanauj to sing  
We stayed as we came from Bengal ;  
And we pleased the King that a gay gold ring  
He gave and these quilts withal.”

Quoth Kushla, “ if your tale be true,  
As true it well may be,  
The arts the Jogis taught to you  
We pray you let us see.”

Then danced the rider of Bendula  
 And charmed them with his grace ;  
 Then Malkhan's strain was raised to gain  
 All hearers in the place.

Then Dhewa played and the Saiyid old,  
 And Udan's flute did sound :  
 Then Alha struck his lyre of gold  
 And rapt all senses round.

They brought them stools of the teak wood made ;  
 They sat before the Queen ;  
 "Now tell your story," Kushla said,  
 "And what your lives have been."

"Whither now do ye take your way ?  
 What country saw you born ?  
 And what ill fates, O Jogis, say,  
 Has thus your young heads shorn ?"

Then Udan spake with sweet-toned wit,  
 "From far Bengal came we,"  
 In Gorakhpur\* our hut we quit,  
 The Hardwār† Fair to see.

"And when we have bathed at holy Hardwār,  
 To Hinglaj† must we wend ;  
 To Setband§ thence the road is far,  
 But there must our journey end.

"Now lacking coin for our daily meat,  
 Have we passed through the city here,"  
 She joined her hands, "I touch your feet,"  
 I hold you lief and dear.

"I will send for my son, Karingha Rai,  
 He shall stand and serve you best ;  
 I will call my daughter, Bijaisin, nigh,  
 She shall stand and fan your rest.

"Bide here the four dull months of rain,  
 World wanderers though ye are ;  
 And I'll load with wealth full many a wain,  
 When ye start for holy Hardwār."

\* South of Nipal between Oudh and Bihar.      † On the sea coast beyond the Indus.

‡ The place where the Ganges breaks through the Siwalik range to enter the plain country ; a place of pilgrimage for immense crowds at the Fair times.

§ The Bridge of Sita, our Adam's Bridge, the chain of rocks between the South of India and Ceylon.

Quoth Malkhan, "O Queen in this I ween,  
Thy sense is gone astray ;  
To-morrow must Jogis take the road.  
If they beg at thy gate to-day.

" Waters that flow and Jogis that go.  
What power can make them stay ?  
Bring forth the alms thy bounty gives ;  
And let us wend our way.

" On before did our master go :  
We follow him as we may ;  
We gather the ashes his path that show ;  
He will not brook delay."

" O Jogis, would you a royal throne ?  
I have thrones at my command ;  
Or seek ye lovely brides to own ?  
I can dower a maiden's hand."

The flame flashed high in Malkhan's eye ;  
In words of wrath he spake,  
" A sinful word our ears have heard ;  
Our vow wouldst have us break. ?

" We hunger not for a kingly throne ;  
And what do we to wed ?  
Bairagi's sons the world disown,  
And the pilgrim's pathway tread."

Up rose they all in haste to go ;  
She caught their feet to stay ;  
" O wait ye yet till my alms I get ;  
Nor empty wend your way."

She sent for platters all of gold ;  
With pearls she filled them free ;  
All to the Jogis in alms she told,  
Said " lives it will last you three."

Then Udan feigned himself a fool,  
A handful he took to smell ;  
" Such fruit, O Queen, I have never seen ;  
What tree may bear them, tell."

" O God, were these for Jogis made ?"  
She clasped her hands in thought,  
" No fruit of tree I give," she said,  
" They are pearls from the ocean brought."

He strewed the pearls on the palace floor,  
 And thus did Udan say,  
 " Pearls and jewels if hence we bore.  
 Robbers would bar our way.

" If thou wouldest grant us a worthy sign  
 That we thy favour gain,  
 Queen Malhna's bounty then be thine,  
 She gave a nine-lakh chain."

" A nine-lakh chain will I bestow  
 When ye have danced for me ;  
 Go call my daughter to the show  
 The joy of her life 'twill be."

Up Rupa climbed stair after stair,  
 She reached the topmost tower : -  
 And there she woke Bijaisin fair  
 Was sleeping in her bower.

She joined her hands " The Queen doth call ;  
 Come down, my bonnibel ;  
 Here have we Jogis from Bengal,  
 So fair no words can tell."

Up and rose Bijaisin fair,  
 Her betel case in hand ;  
 Down then came she stair by stair  
 And before the Queen did stand.

Five leaves of betel had she rolled  
 Ere to the court she came ;  
 The roll she gave to Udan bold,  
 And soon he chewed the same.

She turned and looked on Udan's face,  
 She gazed with sidelong glance ;  
 Love's sudden dart pierced Udan's heart,  
 And down he sank in trance.

Then she on the ground too sank in a swoon ;  
 It troubled and angered the Queen ;  
 " He Jogi is none but a king's wanton son,  
 Who the face of my child has seen."

" Go hasten hither, Karingha my son,  
 And hold the gate meanwhile ;  
 In the mill of stone will I crush them each one,  
 Who hath entered my palace by guile.'

“ If our youngest die,” did **Malkhan** cry,  
 “ Thy palace shall burn to the ground.”  
 “ What ailed him then,” quoth the **Queen** again,  
 “ That he fell in such sudden swound?”

Quoth **Dhewa** then, with ready wit,  
 “ The roll from thy daughter came ;  
 If bitter drugs she mingled in it,  
 For the fainting hers the blame.”

Now **Udan** came to himself and rose,  
 Up rose the princess eke ;  
 And straight she hied to her mother’s side,  
 Who spoke and smoothed her cheek.

“ From the bitter drug did the **Jogi** faint,  
 But wherfore thou as well ?”  
 “ O mother ! their beauty no words can paint ;  
 As I gazed from the stair I fell.”

Now the women of **Maro** town  
 To sec the dances crowd ;  
 Young and fair were the maidens there,  
 And each to each spoke loud—

“ How blest is she to whom fate,” quoth one,  
 “ Such goodly sons did give !”  
 “ Nay rather, if **Jogi** became such son,  
 What mother could bear to live ?”

“ Or let me ever unwed remain,  
 Or have husband like **Udan** here,”  
 “ Is it **Rama** who walks the earth again,  
 Or **Krishna** to maidens dear ?”

“ Were **Udan** my husband, how blest my lot ;  
 I would sit and fan his face ;  
 Like **Vishnu**’s heaven would seem our cot :”  
 Thus a spell was on all the place.

Some gave silver and some gave gold,  
 Or the pearls on their necks that lay ;  
 Queen **Kushla** fain gave the nine-lakh chain ;  
 So the **Jogis** went their way.

Fast through the courts did the princess hie,  
 And by the lattice stand ;  
 And, as the **Jogis** five went by,  
 She caught young **Udan**’s hand.

Him into her secret bower she led,  
 On the jewelled couch set down;  
 "So thou to take me with guile," she said,  
 "Art come from Mahoba town?

"Karingha the prince I will call anon,  
 Who will tear thy limbs apart;  
 I know thee, Rani Devi's son,  
 And Udan named thou art."

"O Lady Bijma," Udan cried,  
 "Thy sense is strayed I trow;  
 There are many like me; the world is wide;  
 Like Udan many also.

"Where hast thou seen me? Lady, say."  
 " 'Twas at Sironj,"\* she said;  
 "For I was called to the marriage day  
 When Mahil's son was wed.

"And thou didst with Abhai the bridegroom ride,  
 And Bendula thee bare:  
 Thou didst stand 'neath the canopy by my side,  
 And a purple turban wear.

"And thou didst jostle me in the press  
 That my bodice was rent also:  
 'Twas in that place I saw thy face,  
 And well thy name I know.

"Now am I tending† a holy tree,  
 And every Sunday fast:  
 If Udan my husband may not be,  
 Let me die a maid at last."

"What can withstand thine eyes?" he laughed,  
 "Udan in sooth they see;  
 If I sing for my bread and have shaven my head,  
 It is all for the sake of thee."

"If so, shall I send for the priest?" she said,  
 "The marriage pole to rear,  
 And teach us the seven‡ rounds to tread  
 In the seven storied tower here?"

\* A town of Malwa.

buildings.

† To water a fig tree, banyan or pipal, is still considered an act of merit, and no gardener likes to uproot the troublesome seedlings which spring up in the crevices of

‡ For the bride and bridegroom to walk seven times hand in hand to round the consecrated pole is an essential part of a Rajput wedding.

“ O lady, where are thy senses now ?  
 Should I wed thee like a thief ?  
 With sword in hand will I vow my vow,  
 As becomes a Rajput chief.

“ When the marriage cups shall with blood run o'er  
 In a sword-play fair to see ;  
 When the marriage pole shall be smeared with gore,  
 Shall our bridal in Maro be.

“ But, if in truth thou dost love me now,  
 The secrets of Marò say ;  
 I must wreak my father and hold my vow,  
 And the rounds will we tread that day.”

“ First swear thy truth on Ganga's tide,  
 If the secrets thou wouldest know ;”  
 He thrust his hand his quilt inside,  
 And drew out his sword from below.

“ If I prove false to my plighted word,  
 And wed thee not, sweet flower,  
 Upon me turn then my good sword,  
 And this false heart devour.”

“ Fort Lohagarh\* is a right strong fort,  
 So go not there to fight ;  
 Jambay the King there holds his court,  
 And who can withstand his might ?

“ And go not down to Jhansi town,  
 Where dwells Karingha Rai ;  
 And try not the power of the twelve-doored tower  
 Where Suraj my brother doth lie :

“ But plant your guns from th' acacia grove,  
 If victory ye would know.†”

“ Now give me leave to part, my love,  
 For Alha waits below.”

Bijaisin joined her hands and said,  
 “ O be not in haste to go :  
 Rest on the bed which here I spread,  
 While I stand and fan thee so.”

\* That is, the Iron Fort.

† The bride's duty is to her husband from the moment of plighting her faith, and her family are forgot-

ten thenceforth. This explains the apparent treason of the heroines of many of these ballads.

“ Princess, such words should not be said ;  
 Bear absence patiently :  
 Should I set my foot on a maiden’s bed,  
 I had broken my Rajputi.”

So Udan left Bijaisin fair ;  
 He would no longer wait :  
 Down then came he stair by stair,  
 Until he reached the gate :

---

FYTTE V.

Now Alha stood in the roadway near,  
 And thus did to Malkhan say :  
 “ If I be robbed in the palace here,  
 And my brother be stolen away,

“ What in Mahoba town shall I tell ?  
 Or what bring to Malhna instead ?”

With that came Udan and clasped him well,  
 And Alha laughed and said,

“ Now tell me, I pray, what made thee stay  
 So long in the seven-storied tower ?”

“ King Jambay’s daughter knew me well  
 And led me to her bower.

“ And she has made me swear an oath  
 To wed her, on Ganga’s tide ;  
 And I have plighted to her my troth  
 That she shall be my bride.

“ And all the secrets of Maro town  
 Hath Bijma told to me.”

But Alha heard him with a frown :  
 “ Say not such words,” quoth he.

“ From our foeman’s line we will take no spouse,  
 And Bijma we will not wed :  
 When she thinks of her kin and her father’s house,  
 She will slay thee in thy bed.”

“ O hush, my brother,” Malkhan said,  
 “ Revenge is all our part ;  
 We have no thought the maid to wed,  
 We must quench the fire of our heart.”

Now forth together went all the five,  
I wis they did not wait ;  
To Lohagarh they came belive  
Beside the massy gate.

The three deep moats with water filled ;  
Above, vast guns to fire ;  
Quoth Alha, " Strong their forts they build,  
How shall we wreak our sire ? "

" Brother, take heart," dark Udan replied,  
" From God all favours be."  
Then loud at the gate like beggars they cried,  
Till the porter took his key.

" Whence come ye ? Whither go ? " he spake ;  
Quoth Malkhan " Hear and know ;  
From the eastern land our way we take,  
And on to Hardwar we go.

" But now have we turned to thy city here,  
For the coin in our belts is spent."  
Then he flung the gate wide and they passed inside,  
And up to the court they went.

Right thronged was the court of the Maro King,  
Scant room for seats they gat :  
Shield on shield did frequent ring  
Where the Kshatris like lions sat.

Dancers danced for all to behold,  
Girls and boys they vied ;  
Jambay sat on his throne of gold ;  
Huge chauris waved beside.

Kariya sat on the right of the King,  
His drawn sword on his knee ;  
Udan sang till the roofs did ring,  
So skilled a voice had he.

Raja Jambay turned his eye,  
And gazed upon the band ;  
He bade a messenger call them nigh  
Before his face to stand.

But when they stood to greet the King,  
Their left hands raised they all :  
Right angry was he at their ill-greeting,  
Bade lash them from the hall.

“ Speak not so bigh,” cried Udan bold,

“ Our right hands Rama praise ;

The hands with which our beads are told  
To thee we may not raise.”

“ Now tell me, Jegis,” quoth the King,

“ If master true you taught,

Whence got ye each his gay gold ring,  
His quilt with gems inwrought ?”

“ To beg our bread,” brave Malkhan said,

“ We in Kanauj did sing ;

And we gained in that place from the Raja’s grace  
Both quilt and gay gold ring.”

“ And if your words ye do not feign,

And true they well may be,

Where got ye the purple turban stain  
On your foreheads so plain to see ?”

“ From Kanauj we went down to Mahoba town,

And danced in the Raja’s hall ;

And the flute I bear, I gained it there  
As a gift from the King Parmal.

“ There Alha and Udan, two brethren dwell,

They do not fear to die ;

They gave us turbans and plumes as well,”  
So Udau made reply.

“ Our tents on the lake side kept they there

The four dull months of rain ;

Four months our heads their turbans ware,  
And so do the marks remain.”

“ And if the truth is what ye say,

As truth it well may be,

Show us your Jogi’s art this day,  
Your skill we fain would see.”

Then did Udan dance and the Jegis sing ;

Right glad was the Baghel Rai :

They were bidden to sit before the King  
On stools of teak-wood high.

“ Whence come ye, Jegis ? whither go ?”

“ To Hinglaj from Bengal.”

Turbans on each did the King bestow  
And plumes of price withal.

" If ye, O Jogis, here abide,  
     I'll serve you every day."

" O Raja " Malkhan straight replied,  
     " Now hear the words I say.

" Waters that flow and Jogis that go,  
     What power can make them stay ?  
 To-day we wait before thy gate ;  
     To-morrow wend our way."

" O King, through Kashi\* as we came,"  
     So Udan 'gan to tell,  
 " Of Lakha the dancer we heard the fame,  
     Who in thy court doth dwell.

" Fain would we now her dancing see,  
     That we are to Maro come."  
 Then Jambay sent, and forth came she  
     While a Brijman† beat the drum.

To the sound of the tabour and castanet  
     She danced before them all ;  
 And so she came where the Jogis were set,  
     As she circled round the hall.

Quoth Udan, " the nine-lakh chain bestow :  
     In our house she was dwelling long."

Quoth Alha, " if Jambay the chain should know,  
     He would bind thee in prison strong."

The counsel he got he heeded not ;  
     He cast her the chain to wear ;  
 It was Devi's sons then well she wot,  
     Were sitting disguised there.

She signed with her eye to bid them fly,  
     Lest Jambay should them slay ;  
 " Methinks, O dancer," Udan said,  
     " Thy sense is gone astray."

" Twelve years though thou hast in Maro spent,  
     Thou shalt see Mahoba again,"  
 So the Jogis rose, to the gate they went  
     And their way to Pachpera‡ have ta'en.

She hid the chain within her breast,  
     As she danced toward the door ;  
 A gust from the west blew back her vest  
     As she passed the King before.

\* Benares.

Mathura (Muttra.)

† A man of the country round

‡ The five trees.

Out flashed the chain, the nine-lakh chain,  
 And Jambay marked it well.  
 "The Mahoba chain whence didst thou gain ?  
 I bid thee, dancer, tell."

She joined her hands, "my lord forgive ;  
 'Twas the Jogis gave it me :  
 Twelve years within thy court I live,  
 Yet never such chain did see."

Then Jambay the King was so adread,  
 To think what might befall ;  
 "Go, Kariya, fetch the chain," he said,  
 "Where it lies in the painted hall."

Up Kariya rose, and in haste he goes,  
 The Mahoba chain to bring ;  
 His long boots creaked as on he strode.  
 And the shield on his back did ring.

Up Kushla rose her son to greet,  
 And by the door did stand ;  
 She took a fan of blossoms sweet,  
 And Kariya's face she fanned.

"What wouldst thou of me, dear son ?" said she :  
 He joined his hands and spake ;  
 "Oh mother give the Mahoba chain,  
 Which I to the King must take."

Then Kushla the Queen was sore adread,  
 And she trembled her body through :  
 "The necklace thread is broken ;" she said,  
 "I am having it strung anew."

"Be it broken or be it marred,  
 To give thou must not fail ;"  
 "I have done, my son, what should not be done,  
 And how shall I tell the tale ?

"There came five Jogis from Bengal ;  
 To them I gave the chain."

Up Kariya rose and left the hall,  
 And ran to the court again.

King Jambay sat on his golden throne,  
 And Kariya loud 'gan cry ;  
 "These Jogis are none but each a King's son  
 Come hither the land to spy.

“ They have learnt the secrets of every house,  
 They have taken the nine-lakh chain.”  
 “ Go quickly nor fail them hither to hale,\*  
 And bring those Jogis again.

With sword and shield forth Kariya went,  
 To Pachpera came speedily ;  
 “ Rajas, take tent,† the King hath sent,  
 So up and back with me.”  
 “ Our master, Kariya,” Malkhan said,  
 “ On us the word did lay,  
 Till we see his face, we must not trace  
 One step of a backward way.”

He drew his long sword from his waist,  
 And an angry man was he ;  
 “ One foot on your forward way be placed,  
 And I hew you in pieces three.”  
 “ Then Uday Singh waxed wood‡ and wroth,  
 And his sword from his quilt he drew ;  
 And Malkhan and Dhewa marked him both,  
 And their broad swords grasped they too.  
 And all the five with swords belive §  
 On Kariya set and cry,  
 “ No Jogis we, we will Maro raze,  
 And make it a pool for aye.”

These are the chief of Mahoba’s sons ”  
 Thought Kariya, sooth to tell ;  
 And, if in their face I keep my place,  
 I may bid my life farewell,”

So back he strode his homeward road,  
 He joined his hands and spake ;  
 “ Bairagi ‘tis none but Dasraj son  
 So do not, O Sire, mistake,”

King Jambay heard and turned his eye,  
 And Suraj his son did call ;  
 “ Let none of the men of Mahoba fly,  
 But seize and bind them all.”

To camp went Suraj, the drummer he called,  
 Gave betel || and ring to wear ;  
 And he bade him array without delay  
 The armies of Maro there.

\* Drag.

† Heed.

‡ Mad.

§ Immediately.  
 || As a pledge to bind him to fulfil the task.

## FYTTE VI.

Now the five to their camp from Pachpera went ;  
 Little they lingered, I wot ;  
 Then straight they came to Devi's tent,  
 And up in haste she got.

A censer\* of gold in hand she took,  
 And lighted the lamps all round :  
 The censer o'er every head she shook,  
 Then set it upon the ground.

She thalsed them well, " now dear ones, tell  
 Of Maro town the tale."

" I, mother, will tell whate'er befell,"  
 Quoth Udan, " without fail.

" We have been all through Kushla's hall,  
 Gained the nine-lakh necklace there ;  
 And mother, thy chain I gave again  
 To Lakha the dancer to wear."

Said Udan bold to Dhewa then,  
 " Come brother, a ford to seek."

Then they went to the ghâ† of the washermen,  
 And loud they 'gan to speak.

" Fast westward doth your Narmada§ flow ;  
 Now show us the passage we pray."  
 " Four fields below ye can rightly go,"  
 Then soon the ford found they.

The twain did into the water wade,  
 The stream but reached their waist ;  
 Bamboos with strips of cloth displayed  
 They cut and careful placed.

To Alha's tent then straight they went,  
 And Udan bowed and said,  
 " Kos full twelve is the wood's extent,  
 And dark it throws its shade.

" No foot can pass through in order due,  
 And how shall horsemen go ?"  
 " Then hither Chandan the woodman call,  
 And nine hundred woodmen moe.||

\* A ceremony of welcome.

river.

† Embraced.

§ Narbaddâ.

‡ Steps or passage down to the

|| More.

“ Bid them hew the wood with their axes good,  
 That the army through may go ;  
 But here and there a tree to spare  
 For the wounded to rest below.”

Nine hundred axes rang in the wood,  
 They hewed with might and main  
 Till where the acacia forest stood  
 Was now an open plain,

To Tondapur ran a messenger then,  
 Where the prince Anupi lay ;  
 “ The Mahoba Raja with all his men  
 Is hewing the forest away.

Anupi in wrath for the drummer sent,  
 Gave bracelets of gold to wear,  
 “ Now beat on the drum, let the army come,  
 And quickly let each prepare.”

Then messengers hurried through lane and street,  
 Headmen were summoning ward by ward ;  
 They leapt to their feet at the first drum beat,  
 And saddled their steeds for Maro’s lord.

To stirrup they sprang at the second drum beat,  
 Swinging the head-stalls the troopers came ;  
 At the third drum beat they were all complete,  
 And ranged their ranks for the Maro name.

Some rode in nalkis\*, some rode in palkis,  
 Some of them rode in the elephant wain ;  
 Oxen white in the cars were dight,†  
 And stirred the red dust over the plain.

They choose their steeds, good colours and breeds,  
 Under the saddles the saddle-cloths fold ;  
 Golden buckles on silken girths,  
 Stirrups of silver and bits of gold.

He next to the master of elephants passed,  
 Gave bracelets of gold to wear ;  
 Of each good caste like hillocks vast  
 He bade him straight prepare.

Of each good caste he brought them past,  
 In goodly length did the beasts defile ;  
 A velvet pad each tusker had,  
 And the foot sank deep in the crimson pile.

\* Forms of litters

† Ready.

Canopies silver and pinnacles gold,  
 Bound with cord of a silken string ;  
 Warriors four did each howda hold,  
 Ready to fight for the Maro king.

And then for the captain of guns he sent,  
 Gave bracelets of gold to wear :  
 And he bade him bring for the Maro king  
 The heaviest cannon there.

Culverin, bombard and falconet,  
 Heavy of metal, heavy of ball,  
 Each on his carriage was duly set,  
 And they moved like the wind before them all.

The wheels did groan, and rattled the gun ;  
 Loud clattered the bolts of vermillion hue ;  
 Or ever the beat of the drum was done,  
 The troops of Anupi were all in view.

Then he asked for a jar from the Ganga stream ;  
 And bathed in the gateway there ;  
 And down he sat on a silken mat,  
 And he sent for sandal rare.

In a golden cup he ground it up,  
 And his forehead and arms he dyed ;  
 But first he spoke the name of Ganeh.\*  
 And on Rama duly cried.

He girt his waist with a silken band,  
 No time be lost, I wot ;  
 Knives and swords all ready to hand,  
 As a champion stark, he got.

And on his right side his dagger well-tried,  
 'Twas carved with a lion's face ;  
 And his spear did wield, and rhinoceros' shield,  
 On his stout left arm did place.

He rode his red steed, and at his right side.  
 Rode Todar Mal his gray :  
 There were thirty thousand horsemen tried  
 With Anupi rode that day.

The horses set forth, and their necks they arched,  
 As they heard the war drum sound ;  
 With prance and caracole on they marched,  
 Till they came to the battle ground.

---

\* Or Ganesh, the God invoked at the commencement of all undertakings.

With the rider of Bendula there they met,  
Who spurred before his line ;  
And Dhewa eke on Mānurtha set,  
Was noting\* every sign.

From ten fields off shouted Jambay's son,  
" Whence come ye ? whither go ?  
And who of the earth is that mighty one  
Has laid my forest low ? "

" I am Udan, a servant of King Parmal,  
Who reigns in Mahoba town ;  
To make way for my men did the forest fall,  
For we are to Maro boune."

" Now hearken, Udan, my counsel heed,  
And back to Mahoba go."

" Then give me Papiha, my father's steed,  
And the nine-lakh chain also.

" Pachswad the strong, and Lakha the sweet,  
And Bijnā, thy sister, to wed ;  
And yield moreover in tribute meet  
The Raja Jambay's head."

Then Raja Anupi, wroth was he,  
Like a coal was his red eye-ball ;  
" Let none of the men of Mahoba flee,  
Seize horses and cattle and all.

" The heaviest guns on their carriages bring  
And fire on the low-bred hound."

Then cannon were loaded and rammers did ring  
And matches were lighted around.

The bullets did rattle, the cannon did roar,  
The arrows whistled and flew ;  
The rockets hissed as their way they tore,  
And the smoke hid all from view.

None yielded a jot nor left the spot,  
As he was true Rajput born ;  
Till bows grew slack and guns waxed hot  
And the archers' hands were torn.

They left the cannon they could not work,  
And dashed the missiles by :  
With lance and spear they faced more near,  
And the javelins fast 'gan fly.

He was the astrologer of the party.

And no Rajput would yield a foot  
 When he stood his foe before,  
 Till spears were broken and shafts were bent ;  
 And the howdas swam in gore.

Then every warrior bared his blade,  
 And line rushed in on line ;  
 I wis a goodly play they played,  
 Drawn out for furlongs nine.

Footmen and footmen there were set,  
 Horsemen againt horsemen ride :  
 Tusk to tusk the elephants met,  
 Howda by howda's side.

Full many a fair young soldier then  
 His blood on the broadsword shed ;  
 At every step were wounded men,  
 A horse or an elephant dead.

Like a red, red river\* the blood did run,  
 With turbans for lotus gay,  
 For tortoise and snake there were shield and gun,  
 And mantles for weeds that sway.

Then some did groan for sire or son,  
 Or wife to be widowed soon,  
 Or mother old, who has left her none,  
 To give the funeral boont†.

O water than gold was more precious then,  
 And none could be found that day :  
 Of Anupi's thirty thousand men  
 One half on the greensward lay.

At length they broke from the trenches and fled,  
 The coward and eke the brave ;  
 Down each ravine run swordsmen keen,  
 If only their life to save.

“ These are wolves,” they cried, “ from Mahoba side  
 Are loosed on the Maro power,  
 Of sheep and of goats they seek no prey,  
 But the flesh of men devour.

“ We will quit the service of King Jambay,  
 And as woodmen earn our bread.”  
 When Anupi saw his warriors fly,  
 To Udan he spurred and said :

\* Such a simile as this is a great favourite with the Hindu bards.      † The funeral rites can only be performed properly by a son.

“ O man of Mahoba, Dasraj’s son ;  
Enough has thy valour wrought ;  
Go back content with the deeds thou hast done,  
Nor lose thy life for nought.

“ The sun and the stars may cease to burn,  
The earth may live her sphere ;  
But, cut Udan asunder, he will not turn,  
Ere he wreak\* his father here.”

His eyes flashed fire, “ if fight we must,  
Then let the die be thrown ;  
Why should our servants bite the dust,  
When the quarrel is all our own.?

“ The war game I and thou will play,  
Till only one see light.”  
Quoth Udan, “ Ay, and so I say,  
Let us have our fill of fight.”

“ Strike, chief of Mahoba, first in place.”  
Quoth Udan, “ Nay, not so :  
There never was knight in all our race  
Who first would strike the blow.

“ Deal then, Anupi, deal thy blow,  
Yet know thy death is near.”  
Then straight Anupi seized his bow,  
Its bolt outweighed a seer.†

A four-pointed arrow he fixed in the string,  
He fitted the notch aright ;  
Twanging loudly the cord did ring,  
For he drew the bow with might.

But Udan turned his horse to the right,  
So God preserved him there ;  
Then Anupi grasped a javelin light,  
And poised it high in air.

He marked when Udan was not ware,  
Then straight his javelin cast ;  
But the horse Rasbendul leapt in air,  
And the dart beneath him passed.

“ Sure a fast on Sundays King Parmal made,  
Or thy mother kept fast also ;  
Some holy work hath been thine aid,  
That twice thou hast ‘scaped my blow.

---

\* Avenge.

† Two pounds.

“ Yet be warned in time and turn to thy place,”  
 Then a light laugh laughed he ;  
 “ Were I to turn back from my foeman’s face,  
 I had broken my Rajputi.

“ Thou hast stricken twice, now make it thrice,  
 Do all that is in thy power ;  
 Or, when thou art sitting in paradise,  
 Thou wilt grieve thou hadst lost thine hour.”

From his waist-belt then he drew his brand,  
 He struck at his face a stroke :  
 But the targe was lifted in Udan’s left hand,  
 And the sword of Anupi broke.

When only the heft\* in his hand was left,  
 He wist his death was near :  
 “ I have hewn down elephants with this sword,  
 But how it hath failed me here.”

“ Now,” Udan cried, “ Anupi, hold,  
 And take mine answer free ;  
 Three blows have I tholed† of thine well told,  
 Now bear thou one from me.”

He struck his spurs, he drew his sword,  
 He called on Gunpat’s‡ name ;  
 The sun he adored and the feet of his lord,  
 And so to Anupi came.

The rhinoceros’ shield the good blade rove :  
 And the velvet padding withal ;  
 Anupi’s shoulder to chine he clove,  
 And his weapons clashed in his fall.

Now Todar Mal stood there beside,  
 And he came spurring in ;  
 “ Ho, Udan, guard thy life,” he cried,  
 “ For hence thou shall not win.”

He whirled his mace, but Udan bent  
 And clasped the neck of his horse ;  
 Clattering it went to the ground, and spent  
 In empty air its force.

\* Handle.

lord of Ganas-bands of demigods or  
Genu.

† Endured.

‡ A name of Ganesh. Both signify

His sword from his belt he quickly drew,  
At his head a stroke let fly ;  
But on Udan's targe it to pieces flew,  
Then he deemed that death was nigh.

Then Udan spurred ; with the boss of his shield  
He thrust him to the ground ;  
Quickly Udan leapt to the field  
And fast his arms he bound.

“ Ho, Dhewa,” he cries “ a worthy prize,  
So guard him with all our power,”  
Then Dhewa is gone to the acacia wood,  
And he to the twelve-doored tower

#### FYTTE VII.

To the twelve-doored tower, where Suraj dwelt ;  
There rode a messenger wight ;  
He drew the chain and the camel knelt,  
And slowly he down did light.

Seven paces off he joined his hands,  
“ What sleep ? Art sleeping yet ?  
When the forest is hewn by Mahoba bands,  
And ruin thy house doth threat.

“ Todar Mal is a prisoner ta’cn,  
And—woe betide the day !—  
Anupi lies slain on the battle plain,  
Till thou bear his body away.”

Like a man distraught was Suraj then,  
Gave bangles of gold anon ;  
Bade the messenger summon the Maro men.  
To do their harness on.

There was shouting of criers by streets and lanes,  
There was arming on every side ;  
There was strapping of horse-cloths and swinging of reins  
And tightening of girths that tide.

There was mounting of troopers good at needs,  
For Maro bound to ride ;  
There was champing of bits and prancing of steeds  
And curveting in paces tried.

At the first drum-beat they saddle their steeds,  
 At the second their arms they don ;  
 At the third they follow where Suraj leads,  
 And the banners of red move on.

“ Your bones are compact with the Baghel salt \*  
 Then who, my friends, dare flee?  
 Whose footsteps back from the field, the fault  
 Will be marring his Rajputi.”

“ A step on the field we will not yield,  
 Though they hew us in pieces,” they cried :  
 And the Muslims took their oath on the Book  
 The Hindus by the Ganga tide.

O it was a gallant sight that day  
 To see the army ride ;  
 With sticks of gold did the drum-boys play,  
 Flutes, trumpets and conchs beside.

The bards with song, as they marched along,  
 Roused the warriors’ hearts the while ;  
 Before them all went the horse, Haryal ;  
 So Suraj rode a mile.

“ Who has killed my koil, † my wild goshawk ?”  
 Like a lion he roared amain ;  
 “ What Kshatri stood at the acacia wood.? ”  
 And who has Anupi slain?”

When Udan heard, in haste he spurred ;  
 “ My mother a lion bare ;  
 O son of the Baghel, hear my word,  
 My heart‡ is shaggy with hair.

“ I am the son of Devi the Queen,  
 And Uday Singh am hight§ ;  
 It was I who hewed the acacia wood,  
 And Anupi I slew in fight.

“ Deem me no weakling as those who erst  
 Before thine arms took flight ;  
 Within nine days will I Maro raze  
 And a pool will I make its site.”

\* The eating of which binds to nightingale.  
 faithful service. † A supposed characteristic of the  
 ‡ The Indian cuckoo, but in poet- brave.  
 ry it almost takes the place of the § Called.

“ Let none of the men of Mahoba go ;  
Let none unwounded fly.”

There was priming of cannon and bending of bow  
As Suraj in wrath did cry.

But first he onward pressed his horse.

By Anupi he lighted down ;

He raised in his arms his brother’s corse  
And sent it to Maro town.

“ Now blow,” he cried, “ these caitiffs away,”

Then matches were lighted fast ;

The smoke spread high and darkened the sky,  
And arrows went whizzing past.

Afar did the gunner begin, I wot,

And then the arquebusier ;

And arrows were shot as they nearer got.  
And next the dart and spear.

But bright, bright swords were deeply dyed,

As line on line was set ;

And last the cruel daggers were plied,  
As in deadly gripe they met.

Elephants trunk with trunk enlaced,

With their hooks the drivers fought,

Howda by howda so close was placed,  
The blows were with daggers wrought.

Swords well plied on every side

Rang in the war smith’s play ;

Brother on brother dropped and died,  
Friend on friend that day.

Coats of mail did nothing avail,

Such wounds the wearers bore :

Princes, whose hurts were not to death,  
Rose to the fight once more.

Of all that marched with Suraj then

Half on the field did lie ;

Udan spurred amidst his men  
And loudly gan to cry.

“ O servants none, but brothers of mine,

With you is mine honor bound ;

Whose foot goes back from the foremost line,  
Seven ages his name is drowned.

“ Creatures on earth full many have birth,  
 But rare are the births\* of men ;  
 O use this hour, for the wilted† flower  
 Cannot join to its tree again.

“ In coming days with songs and lays  
 Shall this battle day be spoken,  
 And armlets of gold shall to each be told  
 When Dasraj’s death is broken.‡

“ If man must die, why die in our bed  
 A prey to crow and kite ?  
 While the name and the fame of the battle dead  
 Shall be sung by bard and knight.”

Then on the men of Mahoba pressed,  
 And hardy strokes they laid ;  
 There blew no wind from east or west  
 While that game of swords was played.  
 Full soon the corse of man or horse  
 At every step was cast,  
 And like heaps of dung in the farmer’s field  
 Lay the bodies of elephants vast.

At Udan’s attack did Maro give back,  
 Nor noble nor hind could stay ;  
 When Suraj saw, to the front he spurred  
 And to Udan loud ’gan say.

“ Why waste thy strength on a servant crew  
 When I or thou must fall ? ”  
 And Udan was nothing loath thereto,  
 Bade sheath their weapons all.

“ Strike then, bold Udan, strike thou first.”  
 Quoth Udan, “ Nay, not so : ”  
 There never was man in Mahoba nurst  
 Would strike the foremost blow.

“ Strike thou the first, or in paradise  
 Thou wilt mourn thy wasted day.”  
 Then Suraj drew his strong bow thrice,  
 The bolt a seer did weigh.

The arrow, as the bowstring rang,  
 At Udan’s face did fly,  
 From left to right his courser sprang,  
 The shaft went whizzing by.

\* That is the turn in the cycle of transmigration.      † Withered.

‡ Avenged.

A weighty dart then Suraj grasped,  
He struck with careful aim ;  
But Udan the neck of Rasbendul clasped,  
So harmlessly down it came.

“ Now mark, Banaphar Rai, my word,  
Twice hast thou scaped my blow,  
Be warned in time ere I deal the third,  
And home to Mahoba go.”

“ Now hear the terms that Udan saith,  
Prince Suraj, laughing he cried ;  
“ Nought else will I take, come life, come death,  
By my father and Ganga’s tide.

“ King Jambay’s head, and thy sister to wed,  
And Papiha the courser fleet,  
And Pachsawad strong, and the nine-lakh chain,  
And Lakha the dancer sweet.

Then Suraj waxed wood and his eyes grew red  
And his sword from his belt he drew :  
He rushed and struck at Udan’s head,  
But the shield snapped the blade in two.

When only the heft in his hand was left,  
He wist his death drew near.  
“ This blade in my hand has elephants cleft,  
But now it has failed me here.”

Then on Maniya,\* fair Mahoba’s ward,  
And the World Mother Udan cried ;  
And he called on God and he drew his sword  
And he charged on the right-ward side.

The flowers of silver went rattling down,  
As he rove the rhinoceros shield ;  
The head he cleft both face and crown,  
And the armour rang on the field.

Astonished were all who saw the fall  
Of Maro’s chief that day :  
At once they broke, they scattered like smoke,  
So the army melted away.

---

(To be concluded.)

---

\* The tutelary goddess.

## ART. XI.—MR. EDWIN ARNOLD'S *GITAGOVINDA*.

*The Indian Song of Songs. From the Sanskrit of the Gitagovinda of Jayadeva. With other Oriental Poems.* By Edwin Arnold, M.A., F.R.G.S., of University College, Oxford; Formerly Principal of the Poona College, and Fellow of the University of Bombay. London: Trübner and Co. 1875.

**I**N concluding our notice of Mr. Wheeler's admirable *History of India* in the last number of this *Review*, we took occasion to compliment Mr. Trübner on the variety and the excellence of his Oriental publications. Since the date of our writing, however, that eminent publishing house has excelled itself; and we have at this moment on our library table a large number of its works, great and small, many of which are of the highest literary value, and nearly all demand from the Indian Reviewer something more than a mere passing welcome.

Mr. Edwin Arnold's charming rendering of Jayadeva's luscious pastoral, though slighter in bulk and lighter in subject than most of the volumes before us, demands our first attention. The popular author of *Griselda and other Poems* is a poet of no mean power; and his genius has never found a more congenial task than in reproducing for English readers the most famous and the sweetest of all Sanskrit idylls. Many of our readers are doubtless familiar with the *Gitagovinda* in its original form; and they will all allow that it has lost nothing, either in the melody of its versification or in the grace and tenderness of its sentiments, by its transformation under Mr. Arnold's hands. We have no hesitation in saying that we have seldom read any poetry, translated or original, so glowing with the warmest and tenderest passion, and at the same time so perfectly refined and graceful, as this most delightful little pastoral.

The allegorical meaning of the poem is thus explained by Mr. Arnold:—"Under the form of Krishna, an incarnation of the God Vishnoo, the human soul is displayed in its relations alternately with earthly and celestial beauty. Krishna, at once human and divine, is first seen attracted by the pleasures of the senses (personified by the shepherdess in the wood), and wasting his affections upon the delights of their illusory world. Radha, the spirit of intellectual and moral beauty, comes to free him from this error, by enkindling in his heart a desire for her own surpassing loveliness of form and character; and, under the parable of a human passion, too glowingly depicted by the Indian poet for exact transcription, the gradual emancipation of Krishna from sensuous

distraction, and his union with Radha in a high and spiritualised happiness, are portrayed."

It is most interesting to compare this Aryan allegory with its Semitic analogue in the Bible ; we get the same glowing imagery in both, the same vivid descriptions of material beauty, the same tenderness and depth of passion. There is a higher religious tone and a loftier morality in the Biblical lyric, as we should expect (putting aside for the nonce all questions of inspiration and the like) from its Hebrew origin ; whilst the intellectual grace and the refinement of the *Gitagovinda* are truly Aryan, and almost Hellenic, in their "sweetness and light." Mr. Arnold has well brought out this point. Rādhā, in his artistic rendering, is indeed "the spirit of intellectual and moral beauty," radiant, fascinating, and angelic ; and yet of a beauty altogether different from that of the spotless dove, the Rose of Sharon, the Lily of the valleys.

The *Gitagovinda* was written for music, and musical directions are prefixed to many portions of it. Mr. Arnold, who was formerly a distinguished member of the Bombay Education Department, is fortunately well acquainted with Hindoo music ; and this knowledge has enabled him not only to vary his metres so as to harmonise with the original accompaniments, but also to give his readers (in the preface) a valuable account of the general subject in a popular form :—

"There existed an elaborate science of melody among the ancient Indians, although like the Greeks, they understood little or nothing of harmony. The distinguishing feature of Hindoo airs was and still is, an extremely fine gradation of notes ; the semitone could be accurately divided into demi-semitones by the ear and voice of a practised "Gundharb" or "Goonee." This even now imparts a delicacy to the otherwise monotonous temple-singing, which all musicians would recognise ; and they might find in such treatises as the "Sungeet Durpun," "Ragavibodha," and "Rāg-mala," or "Chaplet of Melodies," complete and curious explanations of the Hindoo orchestra. In that fantastic system, the old Aryan composers established six *ragas*, or divine fundamental airs, having each five wives or *raginees*, and each of these producing eight melodious children ; so that the orthodox repertory contained two hundred and forty separate songs. These songs had their fixed occasion, subject, and season, all to be reverently observed ; otherwise the deity presiding over each was not thought likely to attend, and give perfect effect to the music. These lyric divinities are personified and described in such works as the "Ratnamala :" thus "Gurjjari"—a melody frequently indicated here by Jayadeva—is presented as a feminine minstrel of engaging mien, dressed in yellow bodice and red *saree*, richly bedecked with jewels, and enthroned in a golden swing, as the third wife of the *Rāga Megh*. Musical science was divided into seven branches—*Surudhyaya* or sol-fa-ing, *rag* or melody, *tal* or time, *nrit* or rhythmical dancing, *aurth* or poetry, *bhar* or expression, and *hust* answering to method, "touch." The gamut contained seven notes singularly named—*Su* was *suru*, the scream of the peacock ; *ri* was *rikhub*, the cry of the parrot ; *gu* was *gundhur*, the bleat of the sheep ; *mu* was *mudhum* the call of the crane ; *pu* stood for *punchum*, and the note of the Koil ; *dhu* for *dhyout* the neigh

of the horse ; and *ni* for *nikhad*, the trumpeting of the elephant. Endless subtleties characterised their musical terms—thus *tal*, or “time,” is a word made up of the first letter from *tand*, the dance of Mahadeo, and *las*, the dance of Parvati, his consort ; but these are mere etymological niceties, characteristic of the hard language in which one single word may be written in a hundred and eight ways. Enough has been said to show, from sources which are perhaps somewhat out of general reach, that a special accompaniment of music was prescribed for the “*Gita Govinda*” when composed, which, could it be recovered, would add immensely to the interest of the Sanskrit Canticle ; and indeed, even at present, any competent inquirer into the existing melodies of India, popular and sacred, might be rewarded by many exquisite airs worth the ear of European *maestri* themselves. The Indians of to-day have still their *dhoorpuds*, or heroic ballads ; their *kheals*, *ghusuls*, and *rekhtahs*, love-songs of Mogul derivation, their *dadras* and *nukas*, serenades of Hindoo origin ; the *tuppah*, hummed by Hindi and Punjabi camel-drivers ; the *terana*, or “song without words ;” the *palna*, or cradle-song ; the *sohla*, or marriage-strain ; the *stooti*, or eulogistic chants : and the *zikri*, which are hymns of morality. Probably among these some echoes of the antique melodies of Jayadeva may be preserved ; at any rate, such a list—and it might be largely extended—shows that Indian music well merits professional study.

The Jewish poet wrote : “ My beloved is mine and I am his ; he feedeth among the lilies ... I sought him whom my soul loveth ; I sought him, but I found him not ... The watchmen that go about the city, found me ; to whom I said, saw ye him whom my soul loveth ? ... Awake, O north wind ; and come, thou south ; blow upon my garden that the spices thereof may flow out. Let my beloved come into his garden and eat his pleasant fruits.” We may compare this with the following :—

“ Krishna, till thou come unto her, faint she lies with love and fear ;  
 Even the jewels of her necklace seem a load too great to bear.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, all the sandal and the flowers  
 Vex her with their pure perfection though they grow in heavenly bowers.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, fair albeit those bowers may be,  
 Passion burns her, and love's fire fevers her for lack of thee.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, those divine lids, dark and tender,  
 Droop like lotus-leaves in rain-storms, dashed and heavy in their splendour.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, that rose couch which she hath spread  
 Saddens with its empty place, its double pillow for one head.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, from her palms she will not lift  
 The dark face hidden deep within them like the moon in cloudy rift.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, angel though she be, thy Love  
 Sighs and suffers, waits and watches—joyless 'mid those joys above.  
 Krishna, till thou come unto her, with the comfort of thy kiss  
 Deeper than thy loss, O Krishna ! must be loss of Radha's bliss.  
 Krishna, while thou didst forget her—her, thy life, thy gentle fate—  
 Wonderful her waiting was, her pity sweet, her patience great.  
 Krishna, come ! 'tis grief untold to grieve her—shame to let her sigh ;  
 Come, for she is sick with love, and thou her only remedy.”

This is a fair specimen of Mr. Arnold's melodious versification, and in elegance of diction is not unworthy to be placed side by side with the beautiful passage quoted above from the Bible poem. Not less beautiful, though naturally less tender and more

sprightly, is the description of Krishna's dallings in the forest, with which the first *Sarga* commences.

"I know where Krishna tarries in these early days of Spring,  
When every wind from warm Malay brings fragrance on its wing ;  
Brings fragrance stolen far away from thickets of the clove,  
In jungles where the bees hum and the koil flutes her love ;  
He dances with the dancers, of a merry morrice one,  
All in the budding Spring-time, for 'tis sad to be alone.  
I know how Krishna passes these hours of blue and gold,  
When parted lovers sigh to meet, and greet, and closely hold  
Hand fast in hand ; and every branch upon the Vakul-tree  
Droops downward with a hundred blooms, in every bloom a bee ;  
He is dancing with the dancers to a laughter-moving tone,  
In the soft awakening Spring-time when 'tis hard to live alone.  
Where Kroona-flowers, that open at a lover's lightest tread,  
Break, and, for shame at what they hear, from white blush modest red ;  
And all the spears on all the boughs of all the Ketuk-glades,  
Seem ready darts to pierce the hearts of wandering youths and maids ;  
'Tis there thy Krishna dances till the merry drum is done,  
All in the sunny Spring-time, when who can live alone ?  
Where the breaking-forth of blossom on the yellow Keshra-sprays  
Dazzles like Kama's sceptre, whom all the world obeys ;  
And patal-buds fill drowsy bees from pink delicious bowls,  
As Kama's nectared goblet steeps in languor human souls ;  
There he dances with the dancers, and of Radha thinketh none,  
All in the warm new Spring-tide, when none will live alone.  
Where the breath of waving Madhvi pours incense through the grove,  
And silken Mogras lull the sense with essences of love,—  
The silken-soft pale Mogra, whose perfume fine and faint  
Can melt the coldness of a maid, the sternness of a saint—  
There dances with those dancers thine other self, thine own,  
All in the languorous Spring-time, when none will live alone. {bloom  
Where—as if warm lips touched sealed eyes and waked them—all the  
Opens upon the mangoes to feel the sunshine come ;  
And Atiukutas wind their arms of softest green about,  
Clasping the stems, while calm and clear great Jumna spreadeth out ;  
There dances and there laughs thy love with damsels many a one,  
In the rosy days of Spring-time, for he will not live alone.

Jayadeva is believed to have written in Burdwan (or, according to some, in Tirkhút) about the middle of the twelfth century. We can therefore hardly be surprised if some of his love-pictures are drawn in colours too glowing for Mr. Arnold's delicate pencil ; and the English reader who is acquainted with the original poem will not regret the loss of the twelfth and concluding *Sarga*, which Mr. Arnold has wisely omitted. And indeed, from a dramatic point of view, this canto seems to be somewhat superfluous. After the description of Krishna's penitence for his faithlessness in the second *Sarga*, and that of the various incidents of his subsequent probation in the third to the ninth, the tenth and eleventh *sargas*, entitled respectively, *Krishna in Paradise* and *The Union of Radha and Krishna*, seem to form a natural conclusion to the idyll.

Four shorter poems, all of great beauty, conclude this charming

little volume. Of these, the spirited strain put into the mouth of a Panjabî minstrel, and entitled *The Rajpoot Wife*, is perhaps the best. The story is not an uncommon one. The Ranee Neila is determined to avenge the death of her husband ; and treats his Muhammadan slayer much as Judith treated Holofernes.

Then all before the Muslims afame with lawless wine,  
Entered the Ranee Neila, in grace and face divine ;  
And all before the Muslims, wagging their goatish chins.  
The Rajpoot Princess set her to the bee-dance that begins,  
‘ If my love loved me . . . .’

From his finger Shureef loosed an Ormuz pearl,  
“ By the Prophst,” quoth he, “ tis a winsome girl ! ”

Never opened after unto gaze or glance  
Eyes that saw a Rajpoot dance a shameful dance ;  
For the kiss she gave him was his first and last—  
Kiss of dagger, driven to his heart, and past.  
At her feet he swallowed, choked with wicked blood ;  
In his breast the katar quivered where it stood.  
At the hilt his fingers vainly—wildly—try,  
Then they stiffen feeble ;—die ! thou slayer, die !

*King Saladin*, *The Rajah's Ride*, and *The Caliph's Draught*, are hardly, if at all, inferior to the spirited poem from which we have taken these vigorous lines. The Indian Education Service, which has already given such distinguished names as those of Sir Alexander Grant and Professor Cowell to English prose literature, may well be proud of having produced a poet of the order to which Mr. Arnold belongs. We believe that the *Indian Song of Songs* will be more and more highly appreciated as it becomes better known ; and confidently predict for its author no ignoble place in the roll of the poets of the present century.—E. L.

## CRITICAL NOTICES.

### 1.—VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

*Mrinmayí*: Sequel to *Kapálakundalá*. By Dámodar Mukhopádhyáy. Calcutta. New Sanskrit Press. 1874.

THE *Kapálakundalá* of Babu Bankim Chandra ended in a mournful strain. The heroine fell into deep water, the hero plunged after her, and the happy scenes on which the reader's interest had so long been riveted were at once at an end. This is the very thing which an Indian reader does not like. Tragedy may raise sublime emotions, stir up the inmost passions of the heart, and bring forth tears of sorrow from the most hard-hearted of human beings, and an Indian, no exception to the rule, may also be moved to a very great extent; but, a native of the tropical regions, his naturally warm imagination is seldom, if ever, pleased with such scenes. A story that ends unhappily is generally at a discount in his market. He always loves what rhetoricians call *poetic justice*. He likes to see wickedness punished, virtue rewarded, and his hero attain his wishes and desires. To take a familiar example. The *Krishna-Kumárá* of Mr. M. M. Datta, though unquestionably one of the best plays in the Bengali language, is less talked of by the natives than the *Lílávati* of Dínabandhu Mitra, simply because the former is a tragedy, and the latter ends in the hero obtaining the best of wives, immense wealth, and plenty of friends.

The *Kapálakundalá* of Babu Bankim Chandra left the readers to mourn over the fates of the hero and heroine as best they could; the book before us will be a great relief to their heavy hearts. The present story commences with Navakumárá pensively settled in his home after he was brought out of the water by Kápálíka,—pensive because of the melancholy fate of his beloved one, and because his former spouse had been making overtures to regain his affections, though he had every reason to dislike her as the cause of Mrinmayí's death. Time, however, cures every malady; and a sense of the wrongs which Padmávati had suffered at his hands, and which had tended in a great measure to lead her astray from the path of virtue, at last induces him to offer her a place in his affections,—she, too, having bitterly repented the past. Chance brings him to the death-bed of his mortal foe the Kápálíka, who, in a few indistinct sounds tells him about his dear Mrinmayí being still alive. Hope, an architect above

rules, builds a pyramid upon a point,—revives in full force in our hero's bosom, and sets him on the track of his beloved. *Mrinmayí* had been picked up on an islet in the Hugli by a gentleman named *Rámdás Roy*, who had brought her up as his own daughter. To him *Navakumár* repairs, but is informed that the benevolent gentleman had gone on a pilgrimage accompanied by his wife and our heroine. He follows them to *Trivení*, and there the happy and long wished for meeting takes place. *Umápati* marries *Muktakeshí*, and it turns out that this lady is the sister of our heroine.

It is likely that the reader who expects the soothing grace and the quiet humour of the *Kapálakundalá* in this work will be somewhat disappointed ; but, on the whole, the book is a very good one. Written in a temperate tone, it is entirely free from the vulgarisms which disfigure many of our Bengali novels. The style is chaste and elegant, and the book interspersed with disquisitions on various subjects,—many of them very thoughtful and original. The characters are almost all such as we should expect to find them in real life ; and throughout, the book seems to be a faithful picture of Bengali society three centuries ago, unmixed as it was then with the conventionalisms that have crept into it now-a-days. The first meeting of *Umápati* with *Muktakeshí*, his love at first sight, and his courtship, are truly interesting, but their meeting after *Umápati*'s miraculous rescue from the hands of the robbers, is still more affecting.

But every work of man has its defects ; and this book, too, is not without its vulnerable points. *Padmávatí alias Lutfunnissa* is a queer character. At an early age she had been married to our hero, and had been living with her parents when they adopted the Moslem faith. *Navakumár* could not, as a Hindu, take his outcaste wife into his family, and she had therefore remained with her father till she was eighteen, when falling a victim to her evil passions, she fell from the path of rectitude and entered *Jahángír*'s harem. There she remained leading a life of vice, till accident brought her into contact with our hero ; and all of a sudden, her entire nature underwent a complete change. Remorse gained the upper-hand of her evil propensities, and she became deeply penitent. As already noticed, she regains her place in her husband's affections ; but soon after that is accomplished she again repairs to, and seeks an interview with, *Jahángír*. All this is unnatural and in bad taste.

But this is not all. After her return from Delhi, *Padmávatí* falls dangerously ill, and desires to see the Emperor. Agreeably to her request he comes down to visit her on her death-bed. The interviews that take place first between the Emperor and the lady,

and next between him and our hero, are so much opposed to the preconceived notions of a Bengali, and his sense of delicacy and decorum, that we hardly know how to speak of this incident. What virtuous Bengali lady will feel any interest in the penitent invalid when she hears her addressing the Emperor as পদ্মাবতী ? In fine, for our own part we have no sympathy with Padmávati. However accomplished a lady she may be, whatever the number of her virtues, and however repentant for past errors, she is sure to receive a cold reception from every Bengali lady who reads this book.

There are many other blemishes in the work ; but they are minor ones. Generally speaking, the book gave us much pleasure, and we have no hesitation in recommending it to our readers, and in advising the author to continue his exertions and give us some more readable additions to elegant Bengali literature.

---

*Anuvíkshana : or the Microscope :—a Monthly Magazine of Hygiene, Practice of Medicine, and other Topics Part I, No. 1.* Edited by Harish Chandra Sarmá. Calcutta, Anuvíkshana Press : Srávan 1282.

“ **T**HE preservation of health, the practice of medicine, and other sciences related to it ; the causes of the decline of the Hindu race, and their remedy ; the existing evils of household arrangements, and the means by which they can be cured ; and the shortest way to introduce science into the affairs of our every-day life, will form the principal subjects of discussion in this journal.” Such, in the Editor’s own words, is the aim of the present publication, and the beginning is a pamphlet of 32 octavo pages printed in clear small type, and written in an elegant and intelligible style ;—the bulk to be increased, as we are assured, if its utility is duly appreciated, and its publication encouraged. For our own part we should be the very last to discourage a Magazine which seeks to do real good to “ degenerate ” Bengal by tendering its valuable advice at a cheap rate. We may safely say that no Bengali household should be without a copy.

The present number contains, in addition to the introduction, some really instructive articles on “ *Chikitsá*,” “ The cause of the decline of India,” “ *Digestion*,” &c. It is moreover a pleasure to us to see that on a comparative view of the efficacy of the several modes of cure prevalent over the civilized world, the author has yielded the palm to the Hindu mode in many respects. Several Bengali scholars of repute have promised to write for the Magazine, and the Editor, too, is a man of known abilities ; we wish it every success.

*Lalitā Sundari.* By Adharlāl Sen. New Bengal Press, Calcutta : Samvat 1931.

*Menkā.* By Adharlāl Sen. New Bengal Press, Calcutta : Samvat, 1931.

THESE are two elegant little poems. Bābu Adharlāl Sen writes in a style that shows evident marks of thought and cultivation. A distinguished graduate of the Calcutta University, he has well and wisely devoted his talents to the improvement of the literature of his own country ; and in this field we confidently predict for him a highly successful career. The sentiments breathed in the poems before us are such as befit a gentleman and a scholar—refined and tender ; the language is chaste and well-chosen ; and the versification, though not always perfect, is generally smooth and agreeable. We shall look with interest for further contributions to Bengāli literature from the Bābu's accomplished pen.

WE are reluctantly compelled to postpone, until our next issue, the notices of many vernacular works that have been sent to us during the quarter.

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE.

*A Comparative Grammar of the Dravidian or South-Indian Family of Languages.* By the Rev. Robert Caldwell, D. D., LL. D., Honorary Member of the Royal Asiatic Society, Fellow of the University of Madras, Missionary of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel at Edeyengoody, Tinnevelly, Southern India. Second Edition ; Revised and Enlarged. London : Trübner & Co. 1875.

THE appearance of a revised and enlarged edition of this standard work, now so long out of print, is an event of such literary importance as to constitute an era in the history of Indian Literature. Dr. Caldwell's *magnum opus* was for many years the only book of high scientific value in Indian philology ; to it we still have to turn for everything connected with the Dravidian languages, and it is the most trustworthy authority for every point concerning the Dravidian peoples, their languages and history. For these purposes of reference the second edition before us is enriched with a full table of contents and an excellent index, together with paradigms of nouns, numerals, pronouns, verbs, &c.—a fairly complete apparatus for the use both of the casual enquirer and of the regular student.

Besides Tamil, Telugu, Malayalam and Canarese, the ordinarily recognised Dravidian tongues, Dr. Caldwell includes two others, Tulu and Kudagu or Coorg, in his list of "cultivated" Dravidian

dialects ; whilst he enumerates six "uncultivated" idioms, and is even inclined to include a seventh, the Brahui of Kelat in Beluchistan, as containing a strong Dravidian element. Many of our readers in Bengal will be surprised to find in Dr. Caldwell's list the Rájmaháli dialect of the Mâleys in the Rájmahall Hills, and the speech of the Oraons of Chatia Nagpur : yet the evidence on which these are called Dravidian seems little less clear than that on which the other four "jungly" dialects—the Tuda and Kota of the Nilgiris, the Gond of the Central Provinces, and the Khand of Orissa—are included in the same list. Dr. Caldwell's Introductory chapters give the fullest and most interesting account of these peoples and of their history, and this part of his work will be read with delight by Orientalists. The more purely philological chapters will not come home to so large a circle of readers ; but they contain a mine of philological wealth which will well repay the diligent student.

The book is brought out in Mr. Trübner's usual style, and is altogether admirable in its get-up.

---

*A Comparative Grammar of the Modern Aryan Languages of India : to wit, Hindi, Panjabî, Sindhi, Gujarâti, Marâthi, Oriyâ, and Bangâlî.* By John Beames, Bengal Civil Service. Fellow of the University of Calcutta, Member of the Royal Asiatic Society, the German Oriental Society, etc., etc. Vol. II, The Noun and Pronoun. London : Trübner & Co., 1875.

**A** NOTHER instalment of Mr. Beames' great philological work has appeared, and has been received with the interest naturally attaching to a work of so much importance. We must content ourselves, in this place with merely noting the fact of its publication by Messrs. Trübner & Co., reserving all critical discussion of its merits until the completion of the work.

---

*A Dictionary of the Pâli Language.* By Robert Cæsar Childers, late of the Ceylon Civil Service, Professor of Pali and Buddhist Literature at University College, London ; Honorary Member of the Ceylon Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society. London : Trübner & Co., 1875.

*The Jâtaka, together with its Commentary.* For the first time published in the original Pâli. By V. Fausböll, and translated by R. C. Childers. Text, Vol. I., Part I. London : Trübner and Co., 1875.

**T**Hese two works, like the two preceding ones, we owe to the enterprise of Messrs. Trübner & Co.; and it is not a little creditable to that firm that they should be willing to publish

works of this nature, of which the sale must necessarily be extremely limited.

Mr. Childers' *Dictionary* is the first attempt, as far as we are aware, that has ever been made in Pali lexicography. It will doubtless be found useful by a small (but we believe rapidly increasing) band of Pali students; but for the general reader, a great deal of novel and interesting information about Pali literature—and, incidentally, about Buddhist history—is to be found in the Introduction. Mr. Childers' dissertation represents the most recent discoveries in this interesting field of research; and must henceforward be the standard work on the subject. The book is dedicated to Dr. Reinhold Rost.

The *Jātaka* is a standard work in Pali literature, and consists of tales of the anterior births of Gautama Buddha. The Pali is here transliterated into the Roman character. The work is to be completed in five volumes, or ten parts of about thirty sheets; and it is hoped that one part will be published yearly.

*On the establishment in connection with the India Museum and Library of an Indian Institute for Lecture, Enquiry, and Teaching; its influence on the promotion of Oriental studies in England, on the progress of higher education among the Natives of India, and on the Training of Candidates for the Civil Service of India.* By J. Forbes Watson, M.A., M.D., LL.D., &c.: Reporter on the Products of India, and Director of the India Museum. London: W. H. Allen & Co., 1875.

**T**HIS pamphlet is a reprint of a paper read before the Oriental Congress of last year. The arguments in favour of establishing an Indian Institute in London, are put forward by Dr. Forbes Watson with great force and clearness. He strengthens his position by carefully pointing out (in a *Note* attached to the pamphlet), that his scheme is in no way a rival to the similar one at Oxford, which has already virtually attained success. Each Institute, the Oxford and the London, will have advantages peculiar to itself; and both are required if all these advantages are to be enjoyed. Dr. Forbes Watson allows that, for the particular purpose of training the Indian Civil Service probationers, the Oxford Institute will offer more advantages than the London one. He says: "It is expected that such a training would be superior to that now obtained, *although it might not offer all the advantages which would result from the combination of Indian studies with residence at one of our great Universities, nor those which would be obtained from the establishment of a special residential College.*" But on the other hand, for the general student of Indian subjects, the proximity of

the India Museum and Library in its new form, will give the London Institute very great advantages. Dr. Watson's paper insists on "the important part which a well-organised India Museum and Library will take in the efficient working of the Institute, by supplying it with materials for study, and with illustrations for the lectures. The arrangement of the India Museum, according to the plans sketched in the paper, is now in progress; and it is intended shortly to make a commencement with the lectures. In order to ensure the complete development of the scheme of the Institute, Dr. Watson informs us it will in the end be requisite to obtain assistance from the public, both in India and in England. The pamphlet explains very fully the objects of the Institute and the present position of the movement. It shows that the objects of such an Institute should be, to "promote Indian scholarship in all its branches, and not only to extend political and commercial knowledge of India in England, but likewise, by showing the connection of Indian studies with the main currents of modern thought, to enlist on behalf of India the sympathies of that large class of the cultured public which is not personally interested in that country, nor is reached by any movement having direct political or commercial ends in view." The leading idea of the Institute is that, as the India Museum and Library will contain classified materials referring to the whole of India's past and present condition, there should be established chairs for lecture and enquiry for the purpose of securing the systematic utilization of these materials. We cordially agree with Dr. Watson in this, and wish him every success in carrying out his scheme.

---

*How to speak and write English.* By Major W. R. M. Holroyd, B.S.C., Director of Public Instruction, Panjâb. For the use of Natives of India: English-Urdu Edition; Lahore, 1875.

**T**HIS admirable little book, priced at ten annas—and a still cheaper edition is now promised—is, we believe, the only one in existence that attempts to teach the natives of this country English on really rational and scientific principles. We are very glad indeed to hear that Major Holroyd is preparing an English-Bengali edition, and we trust he will follow these up by editions suited to all the various provinces of India. Used as an exercise-book, from which exercises should be written at least once or twice a day, and accompanied by the use of a judiciously-graduated series of English Readings, we believe that this little book will do much to take away the reproach which has been hitherto attached to the teaching of English in this country. Beginning with such simple phrases as, "His dish," "In it," "It is"—every

*Critical Notices.*

phrase being repeated over and over again in every conceivable form—the first part which is now before us leads up the scholar to difficult sentences such as "Must I not have been with you on that day?" There is appended also an admirable set of exercises for translation from English into the vernacular. We hope to see Major Holroyd's books introduced into every school in the country.



